EAST-WEST CENTER REVIEW

Volume Two ● Number Three

EAST-WEST CENTER REVIEW

Volume Two ● Number Three

February 1966

A publication of the East-West Center Grantees' Association

EAST-WEST CENTER REVIEW

Volume Two ● Number Three

February 1966

Cover photograph of Hale Manoa by Mr. R. Wenkam, Honolulu.

CONTENTS

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

MR. JOHN ARBUCKLE was born and educated in Scotland. After emigrating to Canada in 1953, he took post-graduate work at the University of Alberta. He received his M.A. (linguistics) in 1961, specializing in German Dialectology. His doctorate work has been done at Cornell in the field of South Asia Linguistics. He spent 1964-65 in India as a National Defense Education Act Fellow.

MR. ICK-WHAN LEE was graduated from Seoul National University in 1958. He has worked for the Social Science Research Institute, Yonsei University, in Seoul. He is presently an East-West Center grantee studying in the Political Science Dept. of the University of Hawaii.

MRS. NANCY ARAPOFF did her undergraduate work at the University of California at Santa Barbara. She came to the University of Hawaii as an East-West Center grantee and received her M.A. in Teaching English as a Second Language in 1963. She is presently an instructor at the English Language Institute of the University of Hawaii.

DR. BUENAVENTURA VILLANUEVA works in the Local Government Section, Public Administration Branch, Bureau of Technical Assistance Operations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, United Nations, New York. The opinions expressed in his article are his own and do not necessarily reflect those of the United Nations.

EAST AND WEST: A STUDY IN RELATED CULTURAL SYMBOLISM

By John Arbuckle

Ever since Rudyard Kipling's Ballad of East and West, it has been considered axiomatic that an eternal gulf separated East and West. My own -- admittedly limited -- experience in the East did not bear out the truth of the axiom, and I now propose to examine the question in the light of such literary, historical or religious materials as are readily accessible in translation.

The hymns of the Rig-Veda can be compared with the Homeric hymns, and even, to the Hebrew psalms -- in form and inspiration if not in content.[1] The early Sanskrit literature has the same manifold system of gods and goddesses great and small that evokes from St. Augustine his monumental refutation of polytheism "The City of God." The sacrifice of first-fruits, the four-month sacrifice, and the animal-sacrifices that we find prescribed in the Vedas have their parallels in Leviticus and Numbers.[2] The Laws of Manu correspond to the Law of Moses, though the former enter into detail which is only to be found in later Rabbinical literature. Exact rules are given governing the operation of gambling houses, in one of the minor law-books.[3]

Indo-Aryan theology no doubt appears chaotic, and the gods unstable -- rising and falling in prestige with the passing of time; the same is true of Greece and Persia.[4] The multifarious-ness of gods, that is to say, of local cults, in Rome has already been referred to. In India, Varuna (Ouranos) is replaced by India, in Persia by Ahura Mazda, and in Greece by Zeus. One would like to say that comparing the Vedas with the Pentateuch, what marks the latter off completely from the former is that in the Mosaic literature God is uncompromisingly One.

> You shall destroy all the spots at which the
> nations whom you dispossess worshipped their
> gods, on high mountains, on hills, and under
> any leafy tree; you must demolish their altars,
> break their obelisks, burn up their sacred poles,

and cut down· the carved images of their gods,
·wiping their very name from the spot... You
shall not do as· we are ·doing here today, every
man pleasing himself... No, when you cross the
Jordan... then to the sacred spot which the
Eternal your God chooses as the seat of his
presence, shall you bring all that I bid you...
Beware of sacrificing your burnt-offerings at
any sacred spot you see; at the sacred spot
which the Eternal chooses in one of your clans,
there you shall sacrifice your burnt-offerings...
You must not eat at home your tithe of corn
or wine or oil or the firstlings of your herd
and flock, nor anything you have vowed, nor
anything you offer voluntarily, nor your con-
tributions; you must eat them before the Eternal
your God at·the sacred spot which the Eternal
your God chooses, both you and your son and
your daughter, your male slave and your female
slave, and the Levite who belongs'to your house-
hold, rejoicing before the Eternal your God
over all the fruit of your labour. Beware of
neglecting the Levite, all the days of your life
upon this land.[5]

The passage is somewhat repetitious, but the redundancy
helps to make the meaning clear. The centralizing tendency is
obvious, whether or not the words are written in retrospect.
In ancient India, on the other hand, not God, but the gods held
sway.

The soma-drinking gods of India live very much like the
nectar-drinking gods of Greece or the mead-drinking gods of the
Germans. Indra is the noble warrior, Agni the priest, Varuna
and Mitra the enforcers of law and order, Rudra the destroyer
-- not much here in common with the Old Testament's ONE GOD
the national commander-in-chief, the stern but loving father
of his sometimes wayward children who demands of them not only
obedience, but also their undivided love. Still, without going
beyond the Pentateuch and the Vedas, though the theologies do
differ greatly, much remains that is common to both: the Levites
are a priestly caste with strong traditions, who with the

2

authority of the ruler administer the law and conduct the sac-
rifices, tend the ark of the Covenant -- later to become the
Temple -- and its altar, preside over the "sacrificial year"
(now known as the "liturgical year"), aid the householder in
his sacred duties, and generally act as intermediary between
God and His people, to keep the latter in a constant state of
cleanliness before God.

In India, of course, there was no single temple -- no
destruction of the Temple, no restoration of the Temple. On
the theoretical plane, Brahmanism tended towards a doctrine of
the One universal Atman,[6] but the doctrine was never imposed
systematically, and there was even a counteracting tendency to-
wards Isvara -- a personal god like that of the Psalms or the
New Testament. Brahmanism did become, as we shall see, a state
religion, but the ruthless and uncomprehending eradication of
local cults that result in "Judaism" has no parallel in India.

Already in the Upanishads (circa 800 B.C.) there is a
trend away from sacrificial ritual as being of supreme impor-
tance. By this time the Vedic hymns, though still quoted with
respect, are no longer treated literally, but rather allegori-
cally -- sometimes even ironically. Sacrifice can be abandoned
in favor of knowledge.[7] This same tendency is very much to the
fore in the prophetic line -- one might almost say, tradition --
in Judaism, which, when produced, would include Christ and
Mohammed. Of course, the "knowledge" referred to in the Upan-
ishads is a special variety of spiritual knowledge, gained by
austerity for the purpose of liberation from the bonds of matter.
This turns up in our second century Church history as "gnosis,"
the point of departure of a number of heresies, but never com-
pletely eliminated.[8] If it had been, would any monastic dis-
cipline have remained?

In spite of the Upanishads, ritual sacrifice remained in
India -- for the benefit of the people, it is said. We have
the same ambivalence in Christianity -- a return to ritualism
around 400 A.D., with frequent protests in favor of the ethical
and mystical -- the greatest of which we know under the name of
Protestantism. The Roman intellectuals too, distinguished be-
tween the natural religion of the philosophers on the one hand,
and the civil religion of the city on the other. The latter was
carried out by the sacerdotal authorities, was centered around
the temples, and was designed to satisfy the populace.[9]

3

The ancient writings of East and West reflect a state of affairs that sometimes can only be guessed at, because of the very uniqueness of the documents and the scarcity of supporting evidence. Even so, we have found points of similarity -- an undercurrent of sacrificial religion, a belief in greater or lesser gods, in sin and the need of purification, the dedication of a priestly caste as intermediaries, the definition of doctrine with regard to religious and social conduct, and the refinement of doctrine, no doubt by means of scholarly debate, leading to the development of philosophical systems that are handed on in schools from one generation to the next either as revelation or tradition. It will not surprise us, therefore, that in later, strictly historical times, parallels between Indian and European cultures abound.

Buddhism blossoms forth from Hinduism somewhat as Christianity does out of Judaism; and the similarity is more than superficial. For both Hinduism and Judaism as religions were inseparable from their social and institutional framework, while Buddhism and Christianity were new departures, having in the first instance no priesthood, but only disciple-apostles, who propagated the "way" or the "message." Buddhism, as well as Jainism, its immediate predecessor, has regularly been represented as opposed to Brahminical authority; and Jesus' troubles with the priestly authority at Jerusalem, ending in his death, are too well known to need repeating. Personally, Jesus resembles Gautama in some ways. Both are characterized by their practical wisdom. This moderation is evident in the kind of discipline required of their followers. Neither laid down a rigorous code of conduct, but rather emphasized a "golden mean," and Jesus' command, "Love one another" corresponds to the Buddha's doctrine of "metta," which means "solidarity." Jesus' disciples did not fast, and the Buddha's disciples meditated after a light repast. Again, in their treatment of the opposition, both Jesus and the Buddha show the same wise moderation. They never allowed themselves to be drawn into hair-splitting arguments with their opponents; nor did they endeavor to explain the unknowable, i.e. to construct a complete philosophical system.

The period of Indian colonial expansion, during which Indian civilization was exported, lasted for over a thousand years. The great empire of the Sailendra dynasty covered the whole of

Malaysia. It was Buddhist. In the ninth century A.D. there
arose the Cambodian empire, which lasted for 400 years. Its
capital, Angkor the Magnificent, with its population of a
million, was said to be more splendid than the Rome of the
Caesars. At first the influence was Hindu, but later it was a
variety of Buddhism -- Mahayana -- that was tolerant of the
pockets of Hinduism which remained, e.g. Bali. In this colonial
movement, there could not be maintained the orthodox Hindu's
preoccupation with ritual purity embodied in caste-rules, food-
rules and religious devotions. For the Buddha these things did
not count:

> I lay no wood, brahmin, for fires on altars.
> Only within burneth the fire I kindle.
> Ever my fire burns: ever tense and ardent.
> I, Arahant, work out the life that's holy
> . . . . the heart's the altar,
> The fire thereon, this is man's self, well-tamed.
>   (Samyutta I169)

The same release from the weight of the Law with its con-
cern for ritual purity is skilfully defended by Paul, especially
in his epistle to the Romans:

> But now we are done with the Law, we have died
> to what once held us, so that we can serve in a
> new way, not under the written code as of old,
> but in the Spirit.   (Romans VII 6)

The slackening of food-rules is illustrated vividly in Peter's
dream, in which God told him to rise and eat of the unclean food
let down from heaven: God is above the Law of Moses, and can
cleanse what Moses has pronounced as unclean. Peter and Paul
were, of course, the apostles to the Gentiles.[10]
    It was not the purpose of this paper to trace influences
to their source in either the East or the West, but rather to
indicate points of similarity in the contents of both cultures,
however these similarities might have arisen, either as a re-
sult of intercourse or of parallel development. It should how-
ever be noted that there was, undisputedly, contact over a long
period of time between East and West, from 323 B.C. onwards at

least -- this being the date of the death of Alexander at Baby-
lon.. That there were cultural relations during this period is
evident from the account left by Megasthenes, Greek ambassador
to Chandragupta, a member of the Maurya dynasty which ruled in
North India over an empire very much like that of the Seleucids
in Anatolia. Historians talk of an Indo-Greek Bactrian kingdom
extending from Kabul to the Punjab; its king, Menander, appears
in Buddhist literature as Melinda, who asks philosophical ques-
tions and sought instruction.

Upanishad doctrine had tended to depersonalize the deity,
and Buddhism and Jainism, which arose out of it, were more re-
ligious philosophies than new religions. But an opposing ten-
dency, no doubt always present, takes shape in the concept of
Isvara, (God as a person), and makes itself felt in the form of
Vishnuism. This theistic reaction finds expression in a new
literature, the Ramayana and the Mahabharata. Vishnu is in-
separably tied to his incarnations *(avatars)*, Rama and Krishna.

The Mahabharata, consisting of 90,000 couplets, i.e. seven
times the size of the Iliad and Odyssey put together, treats of
the doings of god-born heroes like the heroes of Homer; the
rivalry between Arjuna and Karna parallels that between Achiles
and Hector in the Iliad. The Ramayana has religious as well as
literary value; it is significant that in the early versions
Rama appears as wholly human, but as time passes he comes to be
accepted as the descent of a Divine Being in human guise *(avatar)*
-- an idea that is present in popular religion as early as the
second century B.C., and appears as a vital element in the lib-
eral branch of Buddhism which is most tolerant of Hindu elements
-- *Mahayana*. The importance in Christian dogma of the Trinity
is an indication of the importance of the heresies it was de-
signed to combat: one of these represented the divine incar-
nation in Christ as a purely visionary illusion -- *docetic* in-
carnation. Such is the succession of incarnations *(bodhisvattas)*
that the cosmic Buddha-spirit adopts, in order to come to the
aid of suffering mankind. In all this a parallel could be drawn
with the Maccabean heroic literature of the Apocrypha in which
the saviour is historial or legendary, and the Messianic lit-
erature of the immediate pre-Christian period in which the
saviour has become a divine image.

Because of its importance in modern times, since national
enthusiasm ranks it with the New Testament, the Bhagavadgita

deserves special mention. It is a section of the Mahabharata, in which Arjuna, about to give battle, hesitates to slay his own kin; his bow slips from his hand, he stops his chariot, and sinks back into his seat, dejected, between the two armies. His charioteer, Hrishikesa, turns out to be Bhagava, Krishna Vasudeva, who is an *avatar* of Vishnu the kindly God. The human incarnation is forgotten and it is the Divine Lord who speaks, in the following terms:

> He who places his actions on Brahma, who abandons
> attachment, and thus acts, is not stained by sin,
> and is like a lotus leaf unstained by water.

This means that the ordinary daily life in the world, if there is the necessary detachment of spirit, can be good and adequate in itself; there is no need to go into the cloister or jungle in order to be virtuous and pious. At the same time, there is very much in evidence the concept of a personal Lord and Master, to whom loving devotion is due:

> Have thy mind on Me, be devoted to Me... They who
> worship this righteous immortal teaching as I have
> uttered it, full of faith, making Me their supreme
> object, they to Me are surpassingly dear.

This mixture of emotional devotion and philosophical detachment creates a moral climate that would be familiar to the friend and follower of Jesus Christ, who is in the world but not of it. Nor are the monastic rules of the Christian communities that have existed from early Christian times different in essence from such precepts as these:

> For him who is trained in food and recreation,
> whose activities are trained in performing ac-
> tions, who is trained in sleeping and waking,
> Yoga becomes a destroyer of pain; and,

> Thus ever training his self, the Yogi with mind
> restrained attains to peace, to the highest
> Nirvana, which exists in Me.11

The parallels, in the above quotations from the Gita, with Roman
stoicism on the one hand, and, on the other, with the sayings
of Jesus below, are perfectly plain to see if we are not repel-
led and misled by the terminology of Yogi (which has ludicrous
connotations for the products of European humanism):

> All has been handed over to me by the Father:
> and no-one knows the Son except the Father -- nor
> does any-one know the Father except the Son, and
> he to whom the Son chooses to reveal Him. Come
> to me, all ye labouring and burdened, and I will
> refresh you. Take my yoke upon you and learn from
> me, for I am gentle and humble in heart, and you
> will find your souls refreshed; and my yoke is
> kindly and my burden light. (Matt. xi 27-30)

> He who loves father or mother more than me is not
> worthy of me;... he who will not take his cross
> and follow after me is not worthy of me.
> (Matt. x 37, 38)

Krishnaism is the most popular form of Vishnu worship, per-
haps because it fuses two traditions, that of the Gita and that
of the Puranas. Krishna has been described as a kind of Zara-
thustra with the attributes of Pan attached. Archaeological
investigation at Muttra, for a time under the rule of Menander,
and later a center of Krishna worship, has yielded Greek statuary
connected with Dionysus. A parallel can safely be drawn be-
tween Krishna and the Gopis, and Dionysus and the Maenads. This
is the origin of that sensual and erotic element in Hinduism
which is by no means absent from Christian Europe, where anti-
nomian heresies keep on reappearing throughout Church history.[12]
Vaisnavism, as described by Alberuni around 1030 A.D., re-
jected the idea of sacrifices, and made emotion the basis of
salvation. Most worship takes the form of offerings of flowers
and hymns. The liturgy consists of a selection of 602 out of
four thousand verses edited for daily worship -- rousing the
god in the morning and attending on him during the day. This
is very reminiscent of Egyptian temple worship, and something
of it subsists in some branches of the Christian Church to this
day. For instance the image of the Virgin may be dressed in

8

different clothes for different occasions. Moreover, since
the first Pentecost, emotionalism has been an important feature
of Christian devotion.[13]

It is significant that the most terrifying, the most de-
structive, and altogether the most powerful god of Hinduism is
at the same time the representative of pure austerity as prac-
ticed by the godlike magicians of legend. "Siva" means "pro-
pitious:" like the Greek Furies (Erinyes), renamed euphemisti-
cally "The Kindly Ones" (Eumenides), he is given a name designed
to placate him. Siva is the "life-force" personified. He be-
comes associated with the uncanny, and he is reverenced as "the
One who is in the fall of the leaf, the Threatener, the Slayer,
the Afflictor." The Creator is also the Destroyer. No doubt
his consorts, Kali who demands bloody sacrifices, and Sakti who
stands for fertility, are themselves personified aspects of
the god himself. However, in the South, there was a modifica-
tion of the terrifying aspects of Siva-worship. By 1000 A.D.,
a collection of Saivite religious poems were in existence, in-
cluding one -- the Tiruvacagam -- which has been described by
Sir Charles Eliot as the finest devotional poem that India has
produced. Man is treated in it somewhat like a lap-dog -- for
sport (lila).

As we approach the medieval period, it is possible to see
not only movements but individual instigators and promoters of
movements which in antiquity would have appeared to us as having
mythological origins. Now we see men, dominant figures, no
doubt moulded by, but at the same time re-moulding the thought
of their times. After what has been said up to now, it will not
be surprising to discover that such men are grappling with the
same problems as the great men of science, philosophy, religion
and art that we read of in our own European or American histor-
ies.

Sankara (788-828), a Brahmin of Cochin, Travancore, con-
centrated a career packed with activity into the thirty-two
years of his life. A curious mixture, part scholar and philoso-
pher, part agnostic, part mystic, part poet and saint, yet a com-
petent organizer and practical reformer, he travelled over the
whole of India "arguing, debating, reasoning, convincing, and
filling everyone with a part of his own passion and tremendous
vitality."[14] He wrote commentaries of the Hindu Scriptures, as
well as popular hymns; he founded ten religious orders in imi-

tation of the Buddhists -- the very first to be founded within
Brahminism -- of which four are still flourishing to this day;
he also established four great monasteries (maths), one at each
of the four corners of India. As a person, Sankara reminds us
of such a reformer as John Wesley. His movement has an exact
parallel in the Counter-Revolution within the Catholic Church,
led by St. Ignatious of Loyola. As a theologian, he is compared
to Meister Eckhart by Rudolf Otto. His teaching is the purest
Vedanta philosophy, i.e. one single Absolute Reality (kevala
Advaita), outside of which nothing genuinely exists; what we
see is an illusion. Only by true knowledge, can we find sal-
vation and deliverance from the deceptions in which we are en-
tangled. Sankara helped to put an end to Buddhism in India.
Finally, as a philosopher, Sankara's mentalism is the same as
that of the character Philonous who represents Berkeley in *The
Dialogues of Hylas and Philonous,* by the Irish philosopher
George Berkeley (1685-1753). At least, it can be said that the
two men were struggling with the same problem and arrived at
similar conclusions.[15]

Ramanuja (1055-1137) was born near Madras, studied Saivism
as a youth but changed to Vishnuism. He visited North India,
according to tradition stayed for some time in Kashmir, went
to Mysore, and died in Srinagar where his tomb and shrine re-
ceive veneration.[16] He also was a founder of religious orders
and monasteries. He allowed members of his orders to marry,
so that eighty-nine of the abbotships became hereditary. (No
doubt the seven hundred monasteries he is supposed to have left
behind him is an exaggeration). He is famous for his intense
opposition to Sankara:

> This entire teaching ... is nothing but a web
> of false reasoning, scoffing at every logical
> distinction .. His understanding must have been
> disturbed by illusory imagination arising from
> the sins he has committed in previous births ...[17]
> He who knows the right relation of things, as
> they appear in passages of the Scriptures,
> logically taken, as they are given in perception,
> and as they arise from all other sources of
> knowledge, must reject such foolish doctrines.[18]

Ramanuja's own theistic doctrine is remarkably close to Christ-
ian doctrine, but, although he accepts the absolute reality of
the world, he does not conceive it as being led progressively
towards perfection, but as being in turn created, maintained,
dissolved by God: there is no transfiguration -- only endless
repetition; the world arises from the sport (lila) or surplus
energy of God: it is not necessary to him for his self-realiza-
tion, nor does he sacrifice himself to redeem it. If such ideas
appear to us in the West somewhat grotesque because of their
strangeness, this is because they have been excluded from our
view by Christian dogma, but they were by no means unfamiliar
to the Fathers who elaborated this very dogma. Saint Augustine,
in his defense of the Christian creation in Book XII of *The City
of God*, goes to great pains to combat the notion of a cyclical
creation, as well as the notion that the world is co-eternal
with God.

Ramanuja's commentaries on the Upanishads support his in-
terpretation of them -- one which can be summed up in the phrase,
"qualified duality" (vista-dvaita) -- and they provided the
intellectual basis for a movement, both Vaisnavist and Saivist,
which stressed the partial separatedness of the soul from God.
This question is of importance for the doctrine of Grace, which
has been a decisive point at issue both in Indian and European
theology. Ramanuja's followers have split into two schools in
the North and the South: the one known as Vadagalais stresses
the freedom of the will, saying that the soul lays hold of God;
the other, the Tengalais, stresses the necessary prevenience of
grace. The two equivalent schools of thought are represented
in European tradition by the synergism of St. John Cassian on
the one hand, and the doctrine of grace of St. Augustine on the
other, revived by Calvin and Jansenists.[19]

During the Islamic period, a new set of reformers arose,
who preached a compromise between Hinduism and Islam. Such was
Ramanand, who converted Kabir the Moslem weaver; he started the
Ramat movement, which had a profound influence in the fifteenth
and sixteenth centuries, starting as it did with twelve dis-
ciples, including a raja, an untouchable, as well as Brahmins.
With the Ramat, the use of the vernacular spread from the South
to the North as a medium for poetic expression of devotion
(bhakti) in the form of hymns, the favorite literary genre of
the period. Luther's movement made a similar use of hymns in

the vernacular, to such an extent that the people were said to
have sung themselves into heresy. As a protest against the anti-
nomian licentiousness of a sect founded by a Vaisnavist Brahmin,
Vallabha (b. 1470), another Vaisnavist Brahmin, Swami Narayana,
founded a temple and a large monastery at Ahmedabad in 1780.
The community of monks -- about 300 -- and the sect, watched by
a celibate clergy, are still in existence. As a method of
dealing with antinomian excesses due to doctrinal emphasis on
pantheism, the protest of Swami Narayana compares favorably with
our treatment of Adamites, Familists, Ranters, and so on, with
fire and the sword of excommunication.[20]

Chaitanya (b. 1485) is another Krishnaite revivalist like
Vallabha. He introduced music, dancing, and swaying of the body
as an accompaniment to devotional exercises, song-services
(bhajans) last for hours on end. Similar tendencies were evi-
dent in the Moody and Sankey revival at the end of last century
in England, and can still be found in more or less modified form,
in the United States.

Tulsi Das (b. 1532) re-wrote the Ramayana of Valmiki al-
most as a new and original work, emphasizing the *avatar*-motif.
Here is an English version of one quatrain:

> Seers and sages, saints and hermits, fix on Him
> their reverent gaze,
> And in faint and trembling accents, Holy Scriptures
> hymns His praise.
> He, the omnipresent spirit, Lord of heaven and earth
> and hell,
> To redeem His people freely has vouchsafed with men
> to dwell.

During the British period, Raja Ram Mohan Roy (b. 1772) grew
up in mixed Hindu and Moslem culture. He rebelled against the
myths of the Puranas, and set out to learn about world religions.
He first of all had to learn English, Greek, Latin and Hebrew
in order to study the relevant works in the original tongues,
and thus became the first scholar of importance in Comparative
Religion, a subject which was to appeal to an increasing number
of Indian thinkers since that time. He was the founder of a
small but influential movement known as Brahmo-Samaj, which was
to be the meeting-ground of Hindus, Moslems, Parsees, and Christians

-- on the lines of Unitarian worship that he knew from having
attended the Unitarian chapel in Calcutta. His successor,
Keshab Chunder Sen, more critical of foreign influences, said
in a lecture in 1879:

> Why should Hindus go to England to learn Jesus
> Christ? Is not Christ's native land nearer to
> India than to England? Are not Jesus and his
> apostles and immediate followers more akin to
> Indian nationality than Englishmen?

Another successor, Pratap Chandra Mazoomdar, in his book *The
Oriental Christ,* says:

> When we speak of an Eastern Christ we speak of
> the incarnation of unbounded love and grace, and
> when we speak of the Western Christ, we speak of
> the incarnation of theology, formalism, ethical
> and physical force. Christ, we know, is neither
> of the East nor of the West, but men have local-
> ized what God meant to be universal.

To Albert Schweitzer's accusation that the West is world-
affirming and the East is world-renouncing, which is the theme
of his book, *Indian Thought and its Development,* the Indian
poet Rabindranath Tagore had already replied in his Harvard
lectures published under the title of *Attainment* (Sadhana) in
1913 -- the year he received the Nobel Prize for literature.
He wants mankind "to belong to God with their souls, and yet to
serve him actively in the world."

Passing over the towering figure of Gandhi, whose career
is well known, and who is perhaps as much a product of nineteenth
century *fin de siecle* neo-Romanticism as of Hinduism, we should
not forget Ramakrishna (Gadadhar Chatterji). It was Ramakrishna
who said that *bhakti* should be practiced by each man in his own
way, i.e. within his own sect or denomination. "Every religion
becomes true, when he who believes in it dedicates himself to
the love of God and the service of his fellow-men." It was his
pupil Vivekananda (Narendranath Datta, 1862-1902) who founded
the Ramakrishna Mission which has done valuable work among the
poor and sick of India after the fashion of our Salvation Army.

Two other men show the Western observer (I still use the term for what it is worth) that the kind of devotion that produces an Albert Schweitzer is active in modern India. Both had reached the top of their profession, Swami Ram Tirath as a professor of mathematics and Justice Ranade as Judge of the High Court, before withdrawing from public employment to devote themselves to religious work. It was Ranade who founded the society known as *Prarthana Samaj* which is slanted largely towards social service.

East meets West in the person of S. Radhakrishnan, who spent much of his life teaching philosophy at Oxford, and whose *Eastern Religion and Western Thought* provides the self-satisfied product of an exclusive "Western" education with a good look at his own cultural heritage as seen from the point of view of someone he would consider to be an outsider. The experience can be healthy.

We have thus seen many similarities in the cultural histories of East and West. The two streams do not run in separate valleys, but resemble rather two outlets of a delta, carrying their share of water from the same parent river, sometimes silting up, sometimes flowing free, always shifting their beds, now merging into one single stream, now separating. If any general comparative statements are sought, it could be said that our Western culture is based on the Graeco-Roman and Hebrew-Christian inheritance. If anyone in the West is asked what makes "us in the West" different, he will no doubt point to our material progress resulting from that upsurge of the spirit of human enterprise called the Renaissance. If he is further asked for the origins of the Renaissance, he will point to Greece -- in which men's minds soared freely in search of truth -- in spite of the economic slavery of some. Now India still retains that free-searching spirit -- asceticism is only one aspect of it -- and retains it in spite of the caste system. It is the Indians, with their great "varieties of religious experience," that see us as entangled in the bonds of tradition, formalism and theology. Our attitude to the Hindus is much like the attitude of the orthodox Maccabean to the Greeks. These people not only worshiped an abomination of abominations, but even exposed their bodies in their games stadia! The Jews would rather die than slip into such depraved practices. The Hindu caste system -- and no doubt the ancient Greek also --

is an economic expedient that somehow does not chain the spirit. Our economic body is "democratic," we say proudly. If Karl Marx were alive, he would probably comment: "Democracy: that is to say, a state of permanent internal economic warfare which makes for spectacular results somewhat resembling the struggles of a sick animal;" but is our SPIRIT not in danger of losing altitude, just as Macedonian and then Roman discipline supplanted Greek liberty?[21]

NOTES

[1]"Varuna hear this call of mine: be gracious unto us this day,

Longing for help I cry to thee.

Thou, O wise god, art lord of all, thou art the king of earth and heaven;

Hear, as thou goest on thy way." Rig-Vedic hymn I, 25, to Varuna, Nicol Macnicol, *Hindu Scriptures*, London, 1948.

"I will declare the manly deeds of Indra, the first that he achieved, the thunder-wielder.

He slew the dragon, then disclosed the waters..." I, 32, same collection.

C.f. the following extract from the Homeric hymn to the Delian Apollo:

"I will remember and not be unmindful of Apollo, the One who strikes from afar, before whom the gods tremble in

the house of Zeus, when He draws near..." A.C. Bouquet, *Sacred Books of the World*, London, 1959.

[2]See A. B. Keith, *The Religion and Philosophy of the Veda and Upanishads*, London, 1925, pp. 321-325. C.f. W. Robertson Smith, *Religion of the Semites*, New York, 1959, passim.

[3]Georg Buhler, *The Laws of Manu*, Oxford, 1886. In the Manu code, gambling is forbidden, but in the Brihaspati law-book, it is permitted provided that the King receives a share of every stake; see Julius Jolly, *Minor-Law Books*, Oxford, 1889. For Rabbinical legislation see e.g. *Talmud, Baba Kama.*

15

[4]The relative importance of a god depends on the extent of his cult. To see how a god gains territory, see, for instance, how a local snake cult is transformed into the Olympian Zeus by means of the transitional stage Zeus-Melilichios -- Zeus in the form of a snake, an example of the superposition of cults (Jane E. Harrison, *Prolegomena to the Study of Greek Religion*, Cambridge, 1903).

[5]See Deuteronomy, Ch. 12, from which I have quoted a number of selections. Note that although there is a Levite in each household, the Levites were a clan (or caste?) professionally responsible for all religious duties connected with the Ark of the Covenant under the supervision only of Aaron and his sons -- presumably the High Priest (Numbers Ch. 18).

[6]This reaching beyond the conception of individual immortal powers or gods is to be found in the last part of the Song of Creation, Hymns from the Rigveda X 129:
"Who verily knows and who can here declare it, whence it
was born and whence comes this creation?
The gods are later than this world's production. Who
knows, then, whence it first came into being?
He, the first origin of this creation, whether he formed
it all or did not form it,
Whose eye controls this world in highest heaven, he verily
knows it, or perhaps he knows it not." (Nicol Macnicol,
Hindu Scriptures, London, 1948, p. 37).

[7]"Unsteady, verily, are these boats of the eighteen sacri-
ficial forms which are said to be inferior karma. The
deluded who delight in this as leading to good, fall again
into old age and death ... Abiding in the midst of ignor-
ance, wise in their own esteem, thinking themselves to be
learned, fools, afflicted with troubles, go about like
blind men led by one who is himself blind ... The immature,
living manifoldly in ignorance ... Since those who perform
rituals do not understand (the truth) because of attach-
ment, therefore they sink down, wretched ... These deluded
men, regarding sacrifices and works of merits as most im-
portant, do not know any other good ... But those who
practice austerity and faith in the forest, the tranquil

16

knowers who live the life of a mendicant, depart freed from
sin, through the door of the sun to where dwells the im-
mortal imperishable person."
(Extract from the Mundaka Upanishad I, 2.)
"Now, next, the *Udgitha* of the dogs ... Just as the priests.
when they are about to chant with the bahishpavanana hymn
of praise, move along, joined to one another, so did the
dogs move along. Then they sat down together and made the
noise 'him'. (Sanskrit, 'him'). They sang, 'Aum, let us
eat, Aum, let us drink, Aum, may the god Varuna, Praja-
pati and Savitr bring food here. Aum."
(Extract from the Chandogya Upanishad, I, 12). See S. Radhar-
krishnan, *The Principal Upanishads*, London, 1953, in the Muir-
head Library of Philosophy, ed. H.D. Lewis.

[8]See "gnosis" in Ronald Knox, *Enthusiasm*, Oxford, 1950, or
in any encyclopedia such as the *Catholic Encyclopedia*.

[9]It was Varro who first made this threefold distinction,
extracting myth and ritual from religion leaving only the golden
core for the intellectual. Saint Augustine gives a useful sum-
mary of his argument in *The City of God*, VI, 5. (Modern Library
edition, New York, 1950, pp. 190-191).

[10]For Peter's dream, see Acts of the Apostles, X, 9-16. Note
that Paul preached only where Jewish colonies were already es-
tablished (the *Diaspora*), and it is possibly because he was
willing to ease up on such things as food rules that he stole
so many of their gentile proselytes from the Jewish congrega-
tions, e.g. at Thessalonica,
"where some were persuaded and threw in their lot with
Paul and Silas, including a host of devout Greeks and a
large number of the leading women,"
after Paul had been preaching for three weeks in the synagogue;
naturally, "the Jews were roused to jealousy ..." Acts XVII for
the meaning of the term 'devout' in this context, and for the
Jewish view of Paul's activities, see Joseph Kausner, *From Jesus
to Paul*, New York, 1943, especially p. 48 and p. 353, where he
discusses the "God-fearing" proselytes.

[11]These extracts from the Bhagavad-Gita, and many other similar

17

passages can be found in *The Song of God* (translated by Swami Prabhavananda and Cristopher Isherwood, with an introduction by Aldous Huxley), London, 1947. The passages quoted are on pp. 71, 128, 131, and 82 -- in that order.

[12]The Doukhobors in Canada have frequently been provoked by repressive civil authorities into a show of "naked force:" they parade through the streets with no clothes on. See also Note 19; and the 1959-60 Survey sponsored by the Canadian Govt., conducted by Dr. Gordon Hirabayashi, Dept. of Sociology, University of Alberta.

[13]The Dominion Bureau of Statistics confirms that in ten years the membership of the Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada has reached almost 144,000, an increase of 51.2 percent, according to Antony Ferry in a report entitled "Oh, sing it, you precious Pentecostal People!" *Maclean's*, Nov., 1962.

"This not only exceeds the rate of growth of any other denomination, but it took place in a decade when some of the conservative established churches were experiencing a decreased rate of growth."

[14]The quotation occurs without reference in A.C. Bouquet (*Hinduism*, London, 1948, p. 97) to whom much of the Hindu material in what follows is due.

[15]A couple of limericks, one by Ronald Knox, and quoted in Bertrand Russell, *History of Western Philosophy*, London, 1947, neatly present the problem:

"There was a young man who said, God
Must think it exceedingly odd
If he finds that this tree
Continues to be
When there's no-one about in the quad."

REPLY

Dear Sir:
Your astonishment's odd:
I am always about in the quad.
And that's why the tree
Will continue to be,

                 Since observed by
                               Yours faithfully,
                               GOD.

[16]Regrettably, we have no time to delve further into the question of pilgrimage, another manifestation of religious feeling shared by India and Europe.

[17]A Freudian criticism!?

[18]That we can have no real knowledge of this world was the opinion of sceptics and Pyrrhonists, e.g. Montaigne. Pascal fought this notion in the same terms as Ramanuja's criticism of Sankara:

    "Nous savons que nous ne revons point; quelque impuissance
    ou nous soyons de le prouver par raison, cette impuissance
    ne conclut autre chose que la faiblesse de notre raison,
    mais non pas l'incertitude de toutes nos connaissances,
    comme ils (les sceptiques) le pretendent." (Pensees, 1670).

[19]"Synergism" means "co-operation", corresponding on the spiritual plane to the dictum, God helps those that help themselves.

  [20]"But the Turlupins, according our authors, were a 'savage
    and brutal sect' extirpated thirty years before in Savoy,
    where they had taken refuge after being expelled from
    France; they were credited with gross indecencies ... It
    was in 1421 that Zizka, the Hussite general, found it nec-
    essary to liquidate his over-ardent followers, the Adamites.
    And the Turlupins, exactly as the Adamites were accused,
    of going naked and of advocating complete promiscuity."

[21]As for the sick animal, it is doubtful whether the powerful drugs of Doctor Benito or the sharp knife of Veterinary Joe can provide anything but temporary relief of the symptoms.

MOTIVATIONS OF THE STUDENT MOVEMENT IN KOREA

By Ick-whan Lee

The Problem

The process of political socialization of youth has at-
tracted the increasing attention of scholars concerned with
the problem of the stable development of a political system.
Easton and Hess once said that " ... if a system is to main-
tain itself, it must take steps to weld its members into a
cohesive or integrated political unit."[1] This requirement would
obviously be universal, regardless of the degree of development
of the political system. In principle, at least, both "devel-
oped" and "underdeveloped" countries share the same question of
how to weld its youth into an integrated political unit. In
any society, student demonstrations, marches, and other deviant
social actions necessitate deliberate consideration by the
decision-makers. Yet, students in underdeveloped countries
occupy a more important role in national politics than those in
developed countries because their actions usually tend to ser-
iously disrupt the stability of the political system.

This is particularly the case with my country Korea, which
is "notorious" for its frequent student demonstrations through-
out the world. Many foreign observers have made comments on
the student demonstrations and their effects on politics, with
very gloomy perspectives. According to my impressions, however,
few of them have successfully depicted the real features of the
demonstrations. Their interpretations seem to center around
the effects of the demonstrations, and, to a certain extent, to
represent their own viewpoint, or more specifically, the view-
point of their government's foreign policy.[2] They have made no
sincere attempt to understand the causes of the demonstrations
or the very feelings and prospects the student demonstrators
hold about their country's future and their own life expectations.

In this paper, I am going to explore some crude, yet real,
motivations which lead the students to "undesirable" anomic

participations. However, I do not myself advocate here the
students' objectives. Nor do I believe that their demonstra-
tions are profitable for the future of my country. Rather, I
am of the opinion that such undemocratic practices should some-
how be stopped either by the government's persuasion or by the
conscious efforts of the students themselves. What interests
me is the very facts which I believe exist in the Korean situa-
tion and the students' minds. I should admit, therefore, that
I may make some arbitrary judgments or wrong interpretations,
prejudiced by my own personal experiences.

Basic Motives

In a sense, students have in themselves some basic traits
which make them easily stimulated to rush out to the street.
First, as young men they have youth's natural spirit of resistance
and burning passion for justice. Thus they constitute a gener-
ation that can best express dissatisfaction with the unpleasant
realities of their society. Next, as the most educated element
of their society they are well aware of the spiritual values of
democracy, and have developed the spirit of criticism of estab-
lished social systems. Finally, since they are more closely
integrated than any other group in the society, they can easily
unite and mobilize in large numbers to make demonstrations.
Students are therefore very sensitive to the political,
social and economic conditions of their country. Thus, when
the society becomes clamorous over a controversial issue, such
as the illegitimate management of the national election in 1960,
they can easily doubt the legitimacy of the existing political
regime, and come out to the street. As can be found in recent
Korean history, social and political practices, allegedly be-
lieved to be illegitimate by the students, have provided them
with plausible motivations for their actions.
These general motives for student demonstrations – students'
inherent qualities and the situational discrepancies – do not,
however, adequately explain the reasons for their frequent po-
litical actions. They only constitute the conditions under
which student demonstrations may take place. These conditions
always exist in any society. Yet, in some societies, student
movements are not so intense and frequent as in Korea. Why?

Economic Frustration

The first and the most important motive seems to be the economic frustration the Korean students experience both during and after their academic lives.

Needless to say, economic discontent or frustration is generally believed to be the basic factor that threatens the stability of a system. However, economic poverty and economic discontent are two different things, and the poverty itself does not necessarily bring social turbulence. As we can easily see, many poor countries, whose annual per capita income reaches no more than fifty dollars, enjoy a fairly high degree of political stability. In my view, this is because in those countries poverty does not contradict the "expectations" of the people. In this connection, it may be assumed that a combination of poverty and conflicting expectation is one of the major causes for the instability of a system. At the same time, I assume that education constitutes, among other things, a major source of expectation. So, education, particularly the university level, has been the cradle of social disturbance.

Historically, the Korean people have paid particular attention to the education of their children. Throughout their history, they have respected the pen more than the sword, and thus the literary people occupied higher positions in the governmental structure. Being a higher government official in a traditional and autocratic society meant far more than it would in a modern democratic society, since such a position directly determined the economic status of one's whole family. When a member of a family became an official, all of his family was able to benefit from his high status. Even now, this status system still plays an important role in various aspects of Korean life; the people show particular respect and preference for the "official" and the "public," and passing the government examination, called the Higher Civil Service Examination, is viewed as the most preferable goal for the younger generation. Most Korean girls wish to marry those who have successfully passed the exam.

The empahsis on education was even more stressed during the Japanese colonial period when the Korean people painfully felt inferior in knowledge as well as in national strength. Many young men went to foreign countries, especially to Japan

22

at the cost of their nationalistic feeling, solely to gain more knowledge. The Korean maxim, "Knowledge is power" originated from this feeling during this period.

After Korea gained independence, a compulsory educational system was adopted, and the government, recognizing the importance of education in its national development and beset by the shortage of educated personnel, put particular emphasis on educational policy. The educational budget in present day Korea ranks third, coming after the military and economic planning budgets. The literacy rate reaches over seventy per cent in Korea, which is known as a poor, and highly underdeveloped country.

This unusual concern with education on the part of Korean parents, however, has not been accompanied with appropriate economic progress. Korea's annual per capita income is not more than ninety dollars, and economic growth is very slow. If we compare Korea in terms of wealth and education with a country such as Turkey, which is being modernized at a moderate pace, we can clearly see an unbalanced development of Korean society.

Table I

	Population (1963)	Literacy Rate (1960)	Number of University Students (1961)	Per Capita Income
Korea	24,289,241	70.6 %	136,008	$ 90 (1963)
Turkey	27,754,820	38.1 %	73,560	$171 (1960)

The number of University Students versus Per Capita Income in Korea testifies to the far more unfavorable economic conditions of the Korean university students as compared to Turkey. This would seem to indicate that a conflict between poverty and expectations in Korean society, might result in desparate economic frustration or discontent among Korean students.

At the same time, this table indicates that Korean parents are sacrificing their livelihood, to a certain extent, in order to educate their children, and, conversely, Korean students are attending universities and colleges, placing too heavy a burden on their parents' shoulders. It is a common saying in contem-

23

porary Korea that when the son enters the university, the parents sell their farmland and in the second year they sell their cattle, and in the third year their house. This is not a mere joke, but a real problem. Many Korean students, if not the majority, are poor and they cannot help worrying about their livelihood.[3] They have to make money for themselves, but there is a severe scarcity of available jobs. Newspaper information columns are full of students' entreaties for tutoring positions.

Then, why do the parents send their children to school, sacrificing their livelihood? To parents, education of their children is the only hope and possibility of escape from their present wretched conditions. Unfortunately, their expectations usually end in frustration because of the scarcity of available jobs. Government statistics show that forty-four thousand college graduates had no jobs as of 1964, and in 1963 only forty-nine per cent of the male college graduates could find jobs while seventeen per cent could not.[4] (The rest are presumably recruited by the army.) Thus, Korean students are confronted with hard-pressing challenges which directly obstruct their study, and inevitably cast a gloomy prospect upon their future careers.

Under these conditions, students may well feel very serious frustrations not only about their own country's future, but also about their own individual status. These frustrations constitute a definite motive which can lead the students to negative social actions when they are not provided with proper outlets or channels of communication through which they can solve their frustrated energies, and when there exist great political and social issues which they believe to be unjust.

One more thing I would like to point out here is the fact that the economically frustrated among the university students, although they do not constitute the majority, tend to perform a leading role in the students' social actions. In my own memory and experience, the most active students were from the rural areas and small towns, or, in short from the lower economic classes. I have no adequate statistics for this. But, a study concerned with the April Student Uprising in 1960 implicitly reveals that there is a positive relationship between the students' economic conditions and their political action.

MOTIVATIONS OF THE STUDENT MOVEMENT IN KOREA

Table II[5]

Parents's Occupation	Participants in 1960 Uprising		Non-participant in 1960 Uprising	
Agriculture	37	(58.7%)	34	(39.5%)
Business	14	(22.2%)	28	(32.6%)
Manufacturing & Professional	5	(7.9%)	7	(8.1%)
Clerical & Crafts	7	(11.2%)	17	(19.8%)
	63	(100%)	86	(100%)

As indicated above, the percentage of participating students of agricultural origin (58.7) is greater than that of non-participants from the same origin (39.5), while the percentage of participating students from business families (22.2) is less than that of the non-participants from the same category (32.6). If we somewhat arbitrarily assume that agricultural families are poor and business families rich, we can state that students of poor economic origin participated in the uprising more actively than those from rich origin.

This tendency, which only slightly appeared in the 1960 uprising, seems to have accelerated as the demonstrations have become more political and nationalistic.

Value Problems

Family Values

Social change in Korean society has exerted a significant influence on the minds of the youth. Social change brings uncertainty and discontent, undermines the authority of the older generation, and leaves youth with a need as well as a justification for finding new norms to supplant the old. Korean students, however, have only denied the old values, without creating a set of alternative values. In other words, they are still in a "transitional" stage where uncertainty and psychological tensions prevail.

Some changing features in the family value system are revealed in the following research.

Table III[6]

Pros and Cons to Marriage of a Widow

Marriage of	For	Against	Other	No Response
Widows with children	31%	58%	2%	9%
Widows with no children	94%	2%	0	4%

The majority of the students (94%) approved the widow's remarriage if she has no children. In view of the traditional value that remarriage of a widow is most immoral this seems to be a tremendous change. However, (58%) of the students still oppose the remarriage. As the researcher pointed out, "this is an indication that the traditional family values of the Orient are still lingering."[7] Because they are still lingering, not definitely fixed, some psychological anxieties may predominate in the minds of the youth.

The Sense of Mission

Korean students also have inherited a spiritual legacy which makes them feel responsible for the destiny of their nation. This legacy seems to have originated in both the home and the school and from the over-identification of the students themselves with their elders who had courageously fought Japanese colonialism.

Korean parents and teachers, who grew up during the period of national crisis and disgrace, often tend to plant in their children's minds what they had wanted to do and to be. Thus, before they educate their children to become future citizens, they urge them to become leaders who will do valuable things for the nation. In the process of education, pupils incessantly hear about great leaders of the nation, and such maxims as, "Be better than others," "Be a great leader, ruler, but not a humble subject," or "To become a leader, you must never care about trifling things such as money, girls, home, etc." Indoctrinated in this way, students themselves come, very unconsciously, to find pleasure in talking about heroes or combat

26

leaders, and in their conversation they usually identify them-
selves with these people. It is a common phenomenon in present
day Korea for a child, when asked about his future goal, to an-
swer "I will be president." This tendency can also be found
in the attitudes of the university students. Research work on
students' values, proved that most students' prime ambition was
to become a national leader.[8]

In a sense, this ambitious mind of the Korean younger gen-
eration forecasts a very bright future. However, it must not
be overlooked that this ambitiousness often results in too
much concern over political affairs, and in some cases develops
into street demonstrations.

The heroes the students have heard about were needed in
emergent Korea, but not in a peaceful democracy. They identify
themselves with the national leaders or revolutionaries during
a time when, unfortunately, the political community is reluctant
to tolerate such "immodest" elements, because democracy can be
developed only in a climate of modest, humble citizenry. Be-
cause of this, the Korean students experience a contradiction
between what they have imagined and what their society needs.
This kind of contradiction seems to occur in other underdeveloped
countries which have passed through colonial rule and a struggle
for independence. The following is one example of this. "In
1956, U Nu addressed students at the university and beseeched
them to withdraw from politics and return to their books; from
the same platform one of the grand old men of Burmese politics,
Kodaw Humaing, fiercely insisted that the political struggle
was not over and that students must never forget their revolu-
tionary traditions so well exemplified in the past by U Nu him-
self."[9]

In this respect, it is no exaggeration to say that Korean
students, through imagining themselves still in a revolutionary
period, and overidentifying themselves with heroes of an inde-
pendence movement, may show too much concern over the political
and social realities of their country.

Political Values

Easton and Hess divide the political system into three
levels: community, regime and government. And they say that
if there is a consensus on the levels of community and regime,

27

a cleavage in the level of government does not exert a great dan-
ger to the political system.[10] This means that a consensus on
the levels of community and regime (political norms of democracy)
basically hinges upon the feasibility of a democratic political
system. Then, what is the Korean students' attitude toward the
political regime in this sense? Research exposes a very gloomy
conclusion.

Table V[11]

(Suitability of Western Democracy In Korea [in percentage])

Suitable: 14%   Unsuitable: 86%

Reasons for Suitability	Responses
For modernization of Korea	6%
Respect of personal freedom	2
Because it is an ideal system	4
Groundwork has been laid, though for a short period of time	2
	14%

Reasons for Unsuitability	Responses
Not ready to adopt it	40%
Cultural difference between the East and the West	30
Strong control necessary to check excessive freedom	6
Inconsistency between theory and practice	7
Other or no responses	3
	86%

As shown above, (86%) of the interviewed university students
think that Western democracy is not suitable for Korea. First
of all, they maintain that Korea is not fully prepared for the
assimilation of Western democracy. Secondly, (30%) see an in-
compatible cultural difference between the East and the West.
This in general indicates that there is no consensus on the

level of regime among the Korean university students.

Since 1945, Korea has upheld Western democracy as a political ideology in opposition to communism with the assistance and guidance of the United States. This, however, led to a dictatorship under the Syngman Rhee government. Later under the Chang Myon government, it led to an unruly and licentious situation, precipitating the outbreak of a military coup d'etat. In view of this brief history, and the present political situation in Korea, it is only natural that the students should draw such conclusions.

However, this does not mean that the students distrust the ideals of democracy, or that they prefer an authoritarian type of political system. Their uprising in 1960, which toppled the authoritarian government of Syngman Rhee, eloquently belies this conclusion. In the above research, only six per cent maintained that strong control was more suitable in Korea and the rest had other reasons.

But, the problem here is not the hope they might have one, but that most students express strong doubts about the possibility of a democratic development. In my opinion, democracy always needs democratic processes and procedures. Suspension of the democratic process, even if it is temporary, infallibly creates authoritarian personalities who are incompatible with democracy. In this connection, it can be said that the Korean students' uncertainty toward the democratic regime or norms might induce them to overlook the necessity to maintain democratic processes and procedures.

Lack of Communication

The lack of communication between the government and the students adds to the complexity of the students' role in politics. The governments of Korea have shared an uncreative and, sometimes, negative approach to their young critics. No sincere attempt has been made at allowing the students some channel of expression within the political system. The governments have rather tried to mobilize students for their own political purposes.

However, the students themselves should have assumed part of the responsibility of forming a truly representative self-government which could function as medium of communication between the government and students. They failed for two main

reasons: the limited social relations among the students, and the general indifference of the mass of students toward their own self-government.

The basic social relationship among the students is based on what is called a "particularistic" criteria. Ten or more individuals, tied with one another according to very particular criteria such as high school lineage, locality, or personal traits, form cliques and factions, internally cohesive but externally exclusive. Some students who are not in any one of such groupings often feel alienated and solitary, and try to find a group in which they can enjoy psychological security. This system can exert ill consequences when activities of a broader scope are involved. In campus politics,[12] for instance, these self-seeking factions usually support and follow their group leader. Here, factionalism and corruption may prevail, and sometimes the game fully mirrors the Korean political world. Under these conditions, as an American friend rightly observed, forming some kind of a permanent organization, something that could evolve into an institution with an identity of its own, appears quite difficult.[13]

This may give the impression that Korean students, predominated by the "particularistic" criterion, are all bound to be involved in factionalism, corruption, or disunity. This is not true. The majority of the students, I would say, are honest and try to make objective judgments, particularly when they are engaged in formal activities. Although they may be affected by the "particularistic" criteria of which traditional Korean culture is a result, it must not be overlooked that they have also been taught "not to confuse public with private matters." This distinction between private and public is also one of the norms which regulate the behavior of every member, including the student, in Korean society. This point seems somewhat contradictory. But, all cultures in the world are mixed up on this point, and every one in any society acts according to conflicting norms.

What matters here, however, is that the honest majority of students has tended to remain aloof from the dishonest world of campus politics. Instead, they have been active in voicing their opinions through informal discussion groups, and non-governmental activities. Thus, most of the student demonstrations have been initiated and led by informal groups and leaders

without a close link to the student self-government. In extreme cases, student government staffs are regarded as government informants.

Without forming a truly representative student self-government, communication between the government and students is hardly feasible. This lack of communication inevitably accentuates misunderstanding and hostility between the government and students.

Summary

First of all, the Korean student undergoes serious economic hardship in his everyday life. This hardship not only hinders his study, but also makes him feel frustrated and dislocated. But, his frustration is far more intense and serious than a non-students' because he has developed through his education "expectations" about his country's future as well as his own future goals. Furthermore, since he is well aware of the political and social framework of his society, he considers such difficulty to be directly connected with the political system as a whole. Thus, he often comes to doubt the legitimacy of the existing system.

Secondly, the rapid change in Korean society has created a conflict between the old and the emerging norms. The student who opposes the old norms often meets moral criticism from the old generation. Yet, since he has no alternative norms, he cannot accept the criticism in a tolerant and constructive manner. Thus he feels uprooted and alienated, and often thinks that the old generation, including the existing politicians, is reactionary, and is not prepared to accept their opinions.

Thirdly, in the process of maturity, the student develops a sense of mission. When he is involved in social actions, he usually thinks that he is acting for the cause of national welfare or in accordance with his mission in life. He hates to be viewed as an ordinary person. He prefers to take part in unusual actions in which he can find a meaning, and in his action he often identifies himself with a historical personality.

Fourthly, the Korean student holds a pessimistic view on the possibility for democracy. His pessimistic view itself can exert a bad effect on the democratic development of Korean society.

Fifthly, the student has no proper channel of communication

with the government through which he can solve his doubts and
develop a sense of participation in a normal way. This absense
of communication is a result of the negative attitude of the
government toward students and failure to form a truly repre-
sentative student organ. In any case, this lack accentuates
the discord between the government and the student.

NOTES

[1]David Easton and Robert D. Hess, "Youth and the Political
System," *Culture and Social Character*, ed., Seymour M. Lipset
and Leo Lowenthal, 1962, p. 227.

[2]George F. Kennan's article in the September 1964 issue of
Foreign Affairs presents a good case for this. In the same
issue, a Korean scholar criticizes the American foreign policy
that often ignores the indigenous problems facing the related
country.

[3]A pilot study on the Korean students' values reveals that
livelihood is the major source of their uneasiness (15%). Next
to it, they worry about the political and economic instability
of their country (14%). Hong, Sung-chick, "The Students'
Values," *KOREA: A Pattern of Political Development*, ed. by
C.I. Eugene Kim, 1964, p. 72.

[4]Annual Survey of Education 1963, Ministry of Education,
Republic of Korea, p. 269.

[5]C. I. Eugene Kim and Kim Ke-soo, "The April 1960 Student
Movement," *KOREA: A Pattern of Political Development*, 1964,
p. 53.

[6]Hong Sung-chick, *op. cit.*, p. 64.

[7]*Ibid.*

[8]Hong Sung-chick, *op. cit.*, p. 73.

32

[9]Joseph Fischer, "Universities and the Political Process in Southeast Asia," *Pacific Affairs*, Spring, 1963, p. 5.

[10]David Easton and Robert D. Hess, *op. cit.*, p. 229.

[11]Hong Sung-chick, *op. cit.*, p. 65.

[12]About the student politics, see William A. Douglas, "Korean Students and Politics," *Asian Survey*, Vol. III, No. 12, Dec. 1963, pp. 584-595.

[13]Thomas F. Rokjer, "Student Political Action in Korea," p. 6, Term paper submitted to Asian-American Seminar 600.

PEARL BUCK'S PROBLEM WITH TIME IN THE "GOOD EARTH" TRILOGY: IT'S EFFECTS ON REALISM AND OBJECTIVITY

By Nancy Arapoff

When *The Good Earth* first appeared in 1931, it was widely
acclaimed for its realism and objectivity;[1] these qualities were
clearly lacking amid the exotica which characterized previous
books on the Orient. Certainly *The Good Earth*, as well as
Sons and *A House Divided*, cannot be termed exotic. Neither,
however, can they be considered realistic; for, despite Mrs.
Buck's considerable attention to small details which tend to
give realism to individual scenes, her inability to deal with
time results in a confused and distorted over-all picture of
China. Mrs. Buck has herself admitted to a poor sense of the
relationship of events in time,[2] and this inadequacy, on a purely
technical level, is readily apparent in the trilogy. However,
the technical difficulties are but symptoms of a greater dis-
order: Mrs. Buck appears reluctant to envision twentieth cen-
tury China as a dynamic nation entering a modern era. Instead,
she clings to an idealization, a China tradition-bound and
static, a China in which time is irrelevant. Mrs. Buck's con-
fusion with events in time, then, which destroys the realism of
her novels, is symptomatic of a reluctance to accept the fact
that modern times have come to China, and results in her version
of a China where change produces evil, where the only good peo-
ple are those who cling to tradition. Such a picture can hardly
be called realistic or objective.

The Technical Problem with time and its effect on Realism

Throughout the trilogy, Mrs. Buck describes her characters
in great detail--their faces, their clothing, their surroundings,
their actions. O-Lan, when Wang Lung first sees her, "...had a
square, honest face, a short, broad nose with large black nos-
trils, and her mouth was wide as a gash in her face. Her eyes

were small and of a somewhat dull black in color, and were
filled with some sadness that was not clearly expressed."[3]
Later O-Lan tells Wang Lung how she will dress their son when
she takes him back to the House of Hwang to show to the old
mistress: "I shall have a red coat on him and red-flowered
trousers, and on his head a hat with a small gilded Buddha sewn
on the front and on his feet tiger-faced shoes."[4] Their small,
three-roomed house is described after a bountiful harvest: "From
the rafters of the thatched roof hung strings and strings of
dried onions and garlic, and about the middle room and in the
old man's room and in their own room were mats made of reeds and
twisted into the shapes of great jars and these were filled full
of wheat and rice."[5] Awaiting the New Year they "...stayed in
the house and while the woman mended and sewed he took his rakes
of split bamboo and examined them, and where the string was
broken he wove a new string made of hemp he grew himself, and
where a prong was broken out he drove in cleverly a new bit of
bamboo."[6]

In such a manner, Pearl Buck attempts to give an accurate
and tangible picture of China, and she is consistent in her
characterizations--O-Lan remains dull-eyed and plodding through-
out *The Good Earth,* Wang the Tiger is, in *Sons,* always the
brooding, black-browed ascetic, and Yuan, in *A House Divided,*
is ever the silent dissenter. Unfortunately, however, Mrs.
Buck does not achieve this same consistency in her treatment of
time. Her characters age by leaps and bounds or grow younger
with the years. Brothers and sisters born a year apart suddenly
become several years removed. Events which take several years
age the characters but few. The fact that Mrs. Buck is careful
to include the ages of her characters in their descriptions, and
to chronicle events in terms of how many "moons" or years they
consumed, makes more noticeable the discrepancies in time and
less realistic the total effect.

In *The Good Earth,* O-Lan gives birth to three children
within three years after her marriage (the first child "...could
almost sit alone..." before his first month birthday).[7] Following
the third birth, a summer of drought brings famine in the autumn,
and at this time O-Lan becomes pregnant again. Within three
months (early in the winter) she gives birth to a full-sized
baby.[8]

The family then goes south to escape the famine. Here the

35

second son is reprimanded for having stolen a piece of meat.
He says, "I took it--it is mine, this meat. When the butcher
looked the other way after he had sliced it off from the big
piece upon the counter, I ran under an old woman's arm who had
come to buy it and I seized it and ran into an alley and hid in
a dry water jar at a back gate until Elder Brother came."[9] This
is a remarkable speech for a child so young--he was born no
more than a year and a half before.

The family goes back to their land in the spring following
the summer of drought and after the autumn harvest O-Lan again
gives birth--to twins.[10] The five living children of Wang Lung,
then, are spaced within three years, the oldest being three, the
next two, the girl just over one, and the twins newly-born.

Five years pass, and at the end of this time the two older
sons are taken out of the fields and put in school. The oldest,
who was three five years ago is now said to be twelve[11] having
aged nine years in five years' time. In another three years
he is seen as "nearly eighteen" and is betrothed.[12]

Wang Lung soon sends this boy south and betroths the young-
est girl, who is said to be ten years old.[13] Born three years
after her oldest brother, she is now eight years younger than
he.

Two years later, O-Lan, who should be thirty-five,[14] is "...
past the middle span of her years..."[15] and she dies. The oldest
son is now wed and his wife has a child within the year, shortly
after Wang Lung buys some slaves to do the housework, among them
the seven-year-old Pear Blossom.[16]

The second son is wed by this time, and within the next
five years Wang Lung has four grandsons and three granddaughters.[17]
Another year goes by, making seven since the first son was wed;
however now the oldest grandson is almost ten.[18] Wang Lung is
close to sixty-five years old,[19] which means that he would have
to have been forty-three when he was wed (only twenty-two years
have been accounted for since his wedding).

The third son is now supposed to be eighteen,[20] although
twenty years have gone by since his birth. He has become a
great many years younger than his oldest brother who has been
wed since age twenty and now has a child of ten. This youngest
son is attracted to Pear Blossom who is now eighteen,[21] having
aged eleven years in the seven years since she was bought as a
slave. He goes away, leaving his two older brothers to produce

a total of eleven grandsons and eight granddaughters[22] within
the few years left in Wang Lung's life. And so ends *The Good
Earth*.

Sons begins with the death of Wang Lung. The third son,
Wang the Tiger, is called from his post as a soldier to attend
his father's funeral, and at that time asks his two brothers to
give him any sons they have over seventeen years of age to be
his proteges, for he intends to become a warlord. The oldest
brother, Wang the Landlord, agrees to give up his second son,
rather than his first, who is the chief heir. The second brother,
Wang the Merchant, also gives his second child, as his first is
a girl.[23]

At this time Wang the Landlord is said to have six children
by his first wife (two of whom are dead) and one by his concu-
bine. Wang the Merchant has five children, three sons in the
middle, the oldest and youngest being girls.[24] This is most
curious considering that the total number of grandchildren (in-
cluding the two dead ones) is now but twelve, while in *The Good
Earth*, before Wang Lung's death, there were nineteen.

A year later, the age of the oldest son is said to be forty-
five.[25] (The Fool is "nearly forty"[26] although she should be
forty-three since she was born two years after Wang the Landlord).
Since Wang the Landlord was married at twenty and had a son with-
in the year, his oldest son should then be twenty-four, but he is
soon found to be "nearly nineteen."[27]

Later there is reference to a fourth son of Wang the Land-
lord and then of a thirteen-year-old daughter who is the youngest
child of the first wife.[28] The first wife was said to have had
six children, four living and two dead, but there are now five
living children--four sons and a daughter.

Wang the Merchant's family also seems to have expanded.
The oldest son has gone with Wang the Tiger, the next two are
said to be clerks, and a fourth son of twelve is being appren-
ticed.[29] Wang the Merchant, a short time before, had but three
sons (and two daughters).

Three years after the death of Wang Lung, Wang the Tiger
marries, and within a year has two children by his two wives.[30]
Yuan, his son, then becomes a focal figure in the novel and,
since his age is carefully and accurately chronicled, discre-
pancies in the ages of other characters becomes apparent. For
instance, when Yuan is nearly ten years old, the Tiger's nephew

(son of the second Wang), who has been with his uncle for at
least fourteen years (he began right after Wang Lung's death),
is betrothed and wed, for "...he was now nearly twenty-four
and troubled often with his desires."[31] Since he was supposed
to be seventeen when he went with the Tiger, he should be thirty-
one by this time. And when Yuan is almost thirteen, Wang the
Landlord's oldest son who was said to be nineteen before Yuan
was born, is now supposed to be twenty-eight,[32] thus aging only
nine years in thirteen. Next, we are told that when Yuan is
fifteen his father is fifty,[33] and Wang the Landlord is sixty-
three (for he was forty-five right after his father's death
eighteen years before). The two men who were born within three
years of each other in *The Good Earth* are now thirteen years
apart.

   A House Divided continues the story of Yuan, who at age
nineteen goes to a "southern city" to visit his half-sister
Ai-Lan, who was born about the same time as he. There he visits
with his oldest uncle's family, all of whom have moved to the
modern city. Wang the Landlord's fourth son, who appeared
briefly in *Sons* as a thirteen-year-old boy a year or two be-
fore Yuan was conceived is now called Sheng[34] and seems to be
considered a contemporary of Yuan's despite their difference in
age--at least the two are now in school together. There also
has appeared another son, called Meng, who might be a son of
the concubine (this is not clear--none of the second wife's
children are ever mentioned although she was producing children
regularly in *Sons*). He is sixteen[35] which makes him rather
young to have anything in common with a thirty-four-old brother,
although the book implies they are close.

   Just before the twenty-year-old Yuan goes to the United
States for schooling, he meets Mei-Ling, who is twelve or thir-
teen.[36] He is gone six years and comes back, happily enough,
as a twenty-six-year-old.[37] Mei-Ling is now twenty, which puts
her age ahead only a year or two,[38] but Ai-Lang has lost three
years. She is now twenty-three, although she had, a few pages
before, been said to have been born within a few months of Yuan.[39]
On the other hand, the oldest cousin, who in *Sons* was fifteen
years older than Yuan when he was married, is now forty-six,[40]
which means he gained five years. Here ends the trilogy.

   That Mrs. Buck did not intentionally make these distortions
seems rather obvious. Certainly an intentional lack of consis-

tency in time would serve no purpose and would not be in keeping
with her often meticulous detail and accuracy in scene. But it
would appear that, to Mrs. Buck, time is not important; it is
merely another irrelevant detail in an over-all picture; it
simply does not matter in ageless China. Possibly this atti-
tude is governed by a wish that China need never change, that
it remain forever the old culture she has so admired. Possibly
Mrs. Buck would like to believe that time, so inexorable in
its process of aging and changing all that it touches, can be
controlled or stopped or disregarded. Whatever the reason for
these distortions, the result is incredulity on the part of
any careful reader. In real life women are always pregnant
for nine months, brothers and sisters remain the same number of
years apart, and one year ages everyone one year. A world where
these rules do not apply cannot be a real one.

The Thematic Problem with time and its effect on Objectivity

Just as Mrs. Buck tends not to recognize time as relevant
to her plot, so too she appears incapable of accepting it as
inescapable in her theme. Just as her distortion of time in
the plot destroys realism, so too her resistance to changes
which are wrought by time destroys objectivity.
Born in 1892, Mrs. Buck was raised in pre-revolutionary
China and early developed great admiration for the Chinese peo-
ple, particularly for the peasant, who to her was "...the most
real, the closest to life, to birth, and death, to laughter and
weeping."[41] She was in China during the long period of up-
heaval after 1911, a revolutionary era different in character
from the ones which had always preceded the accession of a new
emperor and the founding of a new dynasty. Other uprisings
had done little to disturb China's centuries-old tradition.
But this revolution was a real one, involving drastic change,
wholesale abondonment of old values and unqualified acceptance
of new ones. Much of China was in chaos; the old, secure order
was gone.
Mrs. Buck reacted to this. She had seen, from the doubly
moralistic viewpoint that only a bi-cultural, Christian-Confu-
cian upbringing could afford, the ugliness that change could
cause, and she reacted. To her all change became bad, and the
preservation of traditional ways became the only salvation for

humanity. This is the theme of the *Good Earth* trilogy. It can
hardly be called objective. Provocative, perhaps; nostalgic,
certainly; but never objective; never rational. For who in
the twentieth century can deny that times bring change and that
outmoded traditions crumble? Who can seriously believe that
the clock can be turned back and the dead past revived? And
yet this is precisely what Mrs. Buck advocates. Instead of
accepting the inevitability of a changing China and attempting
to find some positive good in it, she stubbornly asserts that
the forces of change must be combated and the old way of life
saved. Mrs. Buck, it seems, is still living in the nineteenth
century.

The peasant is her culture hero. In him lies the preserva-
tion of the old values. Living close to the soil, to the life-
giving source he has the vitality and the vigor to endure, to
keep the old system going.

> Moving together in a perfect rhythm, without a word,
> hour after hour, he fell into a union with her
> which took the pain from his labor. He had no
> articulate thought of anything; there was only this
> perfect sympathy of movement, of turning this earth
> of theirs over and over to the sun, this earth
> which formed their home, and fed their bodies and
> made their gods. The earth lay rich and dark, and
> fell apart lightly under the points of their hoes.
> Sometimes they turned up a bit of brick, a splinter
> of wood. It was nothing. Some time, in some age,
> bodies of men and women had been buried there,
> houses had stood there, had fallen, and gone back
> into the earth, their bodies also. Each had his
> turn at this earth. They worked on, moving to-
> gether--together--producing the fruit of this
> earth--speechless in their movement together.[42]

Wang Lung and O-Lan are the ideal peasants. Bound closely
to the soil, they are also bound closely to tradition. They
worship the earth gods, they revere their elders, they believe
in evil spirits. Life, to them, is real and vital if not always
easy: they must contend with the forces of nature--droughts,
floods, locusts--which bring famine. They must endure the ravages

of robbers and warlords. But as long as they have their land,
their life, they endure.

The earthen hut, Wang Lung's home, remains throughout the
trilogy a symbol of this "peasant-earth-life syndrome." Here
it is that Wang Lung was born and lived his early happy years.
Here his children were born and his father and wife died. When
Lotus comes to live with Wang Lung, she does not live in the
earthern hut. A special wing is built on for her with an ad-
joining courtyard containing a man-made fish pond and some orna-
mental goldfish. Lotus and her entourage are never a part of
the peasant-earth-life syndrome.

After Wang Lung's death, the sod hut, having been left
empty when the family moved to the city, is occupied by Pear
Blossom. She can live close to the soil, close to life, because
Mrs. Buck implies, although she is not a peasant, she is close
to tradition, she knows how to love. Daughter and wife (she
refers to Wang Lung as both father and lord), mother and friend
(she cares for the Fool and has become the sole confidante of
the hunchbacked third son of Wang the Landlord) she exemplifies
traditional Confucian ideals in her varied relationships.

In *A House Divided,* Yuan is drawn to this hut, which serves
him as a womb in which he hides after he has left the revolu-
tionary movement. But he cannot stay there long, we are made to
feel, because he is not a peasant, nor does he know how to love.
Raised in a militant, unaffectionate home, he has been given
a war lord's training. After he has gone to foreign schools,
and learned agricultural techniques, has talked to farmers, and
learned how to wield a hoe, still he cannot live there. He
still is not a peasant, and he still cannot love. Not until
he does find love, and a woman, who like himself, reveres tra-
dition, can he return to the earthen hut. Symbolically enough,
the trilogy ends as it begins, in the earthen hut of Wang Lung,
with a marriage about to take place.

In *The Good Earth*, this hut does seem to encompass the
life and reality of old China and becomes increasingly devital-
ized. But in the two later books, which deal with revolutionary
China, the hut becomes, rather, a place to escape from more
complex responsibilities. Pear Blossom is afraid, she has no
desire to experience more than she has already seen. Her re-
treat to the hut is an escape from further social experience.
And with her are two who are societal misfits--the Fool and the

Hunchback. Neither is capable of independent existence, of
facing life; both, for different reasons, are escaping from
society. And Yuan's visits to the hut are both essentially
escapes. The first time, he is forced to go there because
he cannot make a moral choice between joining the revolutionary
forces and fight against his father, or casting his lot with his
father against his student friends. He flees to the hut to
avoid either commitment. His later returns there again in an
effort to avoid facing the realities that his life in the city
thrusts upon him.

So while Mrs. Buck attempts to show how life should and can
be lived in strife-torn China, she is by using the hut as a
symbol, showing instead a way of escaping it, of turning the
clock back to the time of Wang Lung, to the time before the West
and the twentieth century came to China. She fails to be objec-
tive, describing not what is but what she wishes could be.

Mrs. Buck lacks objectivity, too, in her characterizations
of the peasants. They are almost without exception hard-working,
economical, vigorous, and prolific. Wang Lung and O-Lan cer-
tainly possess these attributes, and so too do the later pea-
sants. The wife of Wang the Merchant, a displaced country wo-
man, is described through *The Good Earth, Sons,* and *A House
Divided,* as "hearty" and "frugal." The second wife of Wang
the Landlord, also a country woman, is endlessly "warm-hearted,"
"generous," and "fruitful." Wang the Tiger's second wife, also
from the country, is "good-natured" at all times. The shelf-
toothed farmer and his "hard-working" wife, who seem to be rein-
carnations of Wang Lung and O-Lan (they have purchased some of
Wang Lung's land in *A House Divided* and are busily working them-
selves up in the same way Wang Lung did earlier), are "boister-
ous," "cheerful," "industrious," and "fruitful." The farmer
whom Yuan talks to several times is "generous" and "hard-working."

Too, Mrs. Buck's peasants are caught in an insoluble dilemma:
if they are "good" peasants (not like Wang Lung's uncle, for
instance) they are hard-working and economical, but if they are
hard-working and economical, they are in danger of losing their
heritage, of being drawn from the soil, from life. Wang Lung's
estrangement from his land is an inevitable result of the in-
crease in his wealth. The more land he acquires, the less nec-
essary or possible it is for him to work on it. The less he
works on it, the less contact with life he has. In effect,

42

Wang Lung's reward for hard work is death. Mrs. Buck seems not to realize this. She wants her peasants to be "good" but she cannot allow them to "get ahead," to rise above a subsistence standard of living. She places them, therefore, in a world where thrift and hard work are best rewarded by more hard work, where to be allowed merely to endure is the greatest privilege of all.

While the hero of the trilogy, then, is the peasant, the villain is the non-peasant. As we have already seen, Mrs. Buck finds danger in the separation of man and soil. It seems to result only in demoralization and death. As Wang Lung's vital connection with the earth is slowly severed he becomes slowly less human. O-Lan, who represents the earth's vitality and fecundity, no longer appeals to him. He takes a concubine who is the opposite--she is weak, artificial and sterile. He becomes less closely bound to tradition also--he no longer believes exuberantly in the generosity of the earth gods but angrily curses them for their incompetence in allowing floods and famines to happen. Later he moves out of the earthen house and into town, rarely going to see his land. Surrounded by a bickering family, he sits in the sun and dozes and waits for death.

Wang Lung's family, in *Sons,* is much more distant from the earth then Wang Lung. The two older sons live in town and visit their land only to collect rents and supervise the weighing of grain. Wang the Landlord is a soft and fat lecher whose wife nags him continually. He tries to assuage his loneliness and feelings of incompetence through drunken orgies while his wife prays. Wang the Merchant is sly and greedy but stronger then his brother because he is not totally estranged from the earth: he has some interest in crops (for monetary reasons) and is married to a country woman (who is industrious and frugal).

Wang the Tiger, having as a youth been forced into farming against his will, seeks to control the earth which once controlled him, and to gain mastery over the emotions which once were his master. But he is not satisfied with his control over a huge amount of land or with his mastery over his son. He wants something more, but he doesn't know what. Mrs. Buck clearly shows that what Wang the Tiger lacks is the capacity for love and the reason he does not have this capacity is because he is unable to endure. Unlike the peasant, he seeks to control his

destiny, to make his life in the way he wants it. To Mrs. Buck
this is a fatal error. One must not question why things are the
way they are, one must not try to change them, one must endure.
Through this endurance come the rewards--love, happiness, and
fulfillment. Wang the Tiger's struggles to make his own life
away from the soil are foredoomed.

The third generation of Wangs, yet further from the soil,
are yet more unhappy. A new dimension has been added to their
corruption. Not only are they ineffectual and often debauched,
but they are Western-educated. The greatest threat of all lies
in the influence of the West, Mrs. Buck seems to say. Perhaps
the reason she has so adamantly refused to allow her peasants
to leave the soil is for fear they might be exposed to a Western
education. She seems tolerant of the traditional Confucian ed-
ucation, which serves to strengthen the old societal structure,
but Western education is a different matter. It brings change
and must therefore be resisted.

The third generation Wangs live in a large coastal city,
totally separated from the peasant's life. They go to Western-
oriented schools, wear Western dress and have adopted many
Western customs. Ai-Lan, Yuan's liberated sister, serves as
an example of what Mrs. Buck seems to think will happen if
young women give up traditional ways. She goes to dances un-
chaperoned, she insists on choosing her own husband, and she
asserts that the husband she chooses will not have other wives.
She becomes pregnant and has to get married; her husband is un-
faithful to her; she is totally irresponsible and amoral, leaving
her child with her mother to raise so that she will not be ham-
pered in her gay night club existence.

Not only is Mrs. Buck afraid that Western influence will
lead to sexual relations outside of marriage, but also to mis-
cegenation, which to her is the ultimate in evil. Yuan, spokes-
man for Mrs. Buck and the status quo in *A House Divided,* is
utterly repelled, sickened by the idea of any kind of physical
contact between races. His cousin Sheng, who goes to America
with him, finds Caucasian women pleasant. Yuan is scandalized
by this. When Mary, his constant companion for almost a year,
kisses him, he literally becomes nauseous. "We are of two
bloods," he thinks.

That the East and the West cannot mix is demonstrated in
another way by Mrs. Buck. Yuan takes back to China with him a

special kind of wheat which grows much higher than the Chinese
varieties. But, planted in Chinese soil, the wheat will not
grow, although in the next field the short sturdy native wheat
thrives. Too, Yuan finds that his American training in agri-
-culture cannot be put to use in China. And Meng, his younger
cousin, a revolutionist whose activities are directed largely
toward educating and helping the poor (through means found use-
ful in the West), appears ineffectual and slightly absurd. So,
the third generation Wangs, despite the advantages of education
and of the freedom that wealth allows are totally incapable of
coping with their world: they have given up tradition. To
Mrs. Buck this is the worst thing that can happen to China.

Yuan is the only Wang who gains the heroic status of the
peasant. For, although he has been exposed to Western ways
(even Mrs. Buck has to admit that a modern Chinese cannot avoid
such exposure) he chooses the old values. When he wants to
wed, he asks his mother to act as an intermediary, despite the
fact that all his friends have long since given up such a prac-
tice. His predilection for the traditional life is seen in his
irresistible attraction to the soil. Despite all environmental
influences which should have driven him further away, as were
his cousins, he seems always to be drawn once more to the land,
and to tradition. He is attracted to Mei-Ling because, like
him, she is throughly Eastern. The triolgy ends with Yuan's
words: "We two--we two--we need not be afraid of anything."
Meaning, it would appear, that these two young people, in a
country where "dangerous" new beliefs are drifting around them,
can together withstand them. They need not be afraid.

Objectivity is a relative matter. No literature presents
a photographic likeness of the world; indeed there would be no
purpose in writing graphic likeness of the world; indeed there
would be no purpose in writing anything--newspaper article,
history, or short story--which did not attempt to interpret
reality in some way. However, Pearl Buck's interpretation is
most subjective. Her portrayal of all peasants as good and all
non-peasants as evil is certainly biased. Her finding the
effects of Western influences entirely detrimental and the tra-
ditional ways of life entirely beneficial also lacks the honesty
with which she has been credited. Certainly this lack is con-
nected with her difficulty in recalling time intervals; her dis-
tortion of time realities indicates her inability or reluctance

to admit that time is a force which has changed and will continue to change the old China of her youth.

NOTES

[1]See for example Malcolm Cowley, "Wang Lung's Family," *New Republic* (May 10, 1939), pp. 24-25; H. S. Canby, "*The Good Earth* Pearl Buck, and the Nobel Prize," *Saturday Review of Literature* (November 19, 1938), p. 86; Nancy Evans "A Review of *The Good Earth*," *Bookman* (May, 1931), pp. 324-325; Eda Lou Walton, "Another Epic of the Soil," *Nation* (May 13, 1931), p. 646; "*The Good Earth*, a Review," *Outlook and Independent* (March 18, 1931); p. 497-498. Younghill Kang appears to be the only dissenter. In his article entitled "China is Different" in The *New Republic* for July 1, 1931 (p. 186) he protests that Mrs. Buck's view of China is indeed distorted. However, in a note following his article the editor is quick to voice disagreement. The only reason Kang can make such a criticism he says, is because the realism of her novel is an accepted fact.

[2]*My Several Worlds*, New York, 1954, p. 64.

[3]*The Good Earth*, New York, 1931, p. 17.

[4]*Ibid.*, p. 29.

[5]*Ibid.*, p. 36.

[6]*Ibid.*, p. 38.

[7]*Ibid.*, p. 37.

[8]*Ibid.*, p. 69.

[9]*Ibid.*, p. 96.

[10]*Ibid.*, p. 137.

[11]*Ibid.*, p. 140.

[12]*Ibid.*, p. 207.

[13]*Ibid.*, p. 216.

[14]She was twenty when wed and only fifteen years have elapsed since then.

[15]*The Good Earth*, p. 221.

[16]*Ibid.*, p. 247.

[17]*Ibid.*, p. 277.

[18]*Ibid.*, p. 291.

[19]*Ibid.*, p. 291.

[20]*Ibid.*, p. 298.

[21]*Ibid.*, p. 298.

[22]*Ibid.*, p. 308.

[23]*Sons*, New York, 1932, p. 68.

[24]*Ibid.*, p. 68.

[25]*Ibid.*, p. 90.

[26]*Ibid.*, p. 99.

[27]*Ibid.*, p. 137.

[28]*Ibid.*, p. 363.

[29]*Ibid.*, p. 366.

[30]*Ibid.*, p. 347.

[31]*Ibid.*, p. 396.

[32]*Ibid.*, p. 399.

[33]*Ibid.*, p. 456.

[34]*A House Divided*, New York, p. 49.

[35]*Ibid.*, p. 51.

[36]*Ibid.*, p. 87.

[37]*Ibid.*, p. 137.

[38]*Ibid.*, p. 226.

[39]*Ibid.*, p. 182.

[40]*Ibid.*, p. 233.

[41]*My Several Worlds*, p. 146.

[42]*The Good Earth*, p. 26.

LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN THE CONTEXT
OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
By Dr. Buenaventura Villanueva

This paper was prepared for the International
Development Seminar held at the East-West Center,
Honolulu, from August 9, 1965 - September 3, 1965.

INTRODUCTION

There is ample evidence of a heightened role of local govern-
ment in community development programmes.[1] This role is seen
as supportive of such programmes and as the terminus of the pro-
cess of institution building for community development.

There are, however, certain specific requirements of com-
munity development that impinge on local government and condi-
tion the configuration of its role in community development.
Assuming the universality of the United Nations definition of
community development, these requirements include:[2]

1. Immediacy of action at the people's level;

2. Politicization of development functions to capture
   the dynamic of popular involvement and support, and
   to infuse broader national responsibility into such
   functions;

3. Coordination of functions supportive of community
   development; and

4. Integration of local community development activi-
   ties and the mainstream of national development.

The implications of these requirements on local government
are far-reaching and may involve substantial questions affecting
its structure, functions, and interrelationships with other
levels of government. These questions revolve around the following

49

points which will be separately analyzed in the succeeding sections:

1. Rationalization of the distribution of powers and responsibility for development, and the formulation of adequate working relationships among levels of government, in order to achieve immediacy of action at the people's level;

2. Formulation of effective ways of politicizing local government; and

3. Coordination of the development activities of, and affecting, local government, and the integration of these with national development plans.

RATIONALIZATION OF DISTRIBUTION OF POWERS AND RESPONSIBILITIES

This subject seems moot and is at the core of moves to transfer in various ways governmental powers from the center to the periphery and vice versa. The motivations for such transfers of powers vary from country to country in response to diverse circumstances ranging from political ideology to pragmatic administrative considerations. But two generalizations which seemingly have been taken as convenient rules of thumb are apparent from most designs for power transfers. The first generalization is the rule that local government and national government must perform functions that each is in the best position to perform; the second is that local government must perform functions that are local in character.

It is obvious that these rules of thumb are too vague to be consistently sources of objectives guides in deciding on the patterns transfers of government power should take. The first neither provides clear guidelines for determining which types of functions are best performed at either national or local level, nor indicates definitive standards for acceptable performance. The second rule does not seem to be clear either, as no bases are given for designating any given function as local or national. The actual pattern of distribution of power between local and national governments in consequence differs from one country to another, even where similar rules of thumb

50

are operative in them.[3]

Variables Affecting Decentralization

Transfers of government power frequently envisioned in community development programmes are those that start from the center and proceed outward. This phenomenon probably springs from the somewhat common experience where local units of government, due to the lack of appropriate authority to act, are unable to provide the programme with a viable institutional base. In consequence, many a community development enthusiast finds it relatively easy to demand decentralization of government authority, and tempting to condemn forms of decentralization that inhibit optimum performance of the programme.

To many practitioners in community development and local government administration, the forces that impel various forms and degrees of decentralization are probably very difficult to comprehend, and may well explain the ease with which decentralization is demanded or the lack of it condemned. It is therefore helpful to analyze the nature of these forces. What are they?

First, the ideology associated with local government is crucial. In the Philippines, India, and Pakistan local government is unabashedly viewed as a principal instrument for democratizing the society. The popular election of local councils and similar representative organs is promoted, and in the Philippines nationals who are illiterate and/or between the ages of eighteen to twenty-one -- those who are otherwise disqualified to vote under the provisions of the Constitution -- are allowed to participate in the deliberations of the barrio assembly.[4] In Yugoslavia local government is seen somewhat as an instrument to facilitate the "withering away of the state" and to enhance people's control of the means of production and the political life of the society.[5] Conceptually, local government may also be seen elsewhere as generative of forces that provide the antithesis of accepted ideologies, and is therefore shunned.

Second, the inertia of a history and tradition of centralization in governmental activities may inhibit significant decentralization of central powers to local units. The reluctance to decentralize may be simply a passive dislike for change, or it may be a deep concern for, and aversion to, whatever are

51

conceived as consequences of decentralization. Whatever the
motivation, however, the intertia of history and tradition may
be a reinforcing element if not a force in itself in marshalling
arguments for continued concentration of authority in the na-
tional government.

   A third variable is the nature of prevailing convictions
regarding the ability of local government to support administra-
tively and materially public services consequent to decentral-
ization. The desire to transfer government powers outward from
the center may be genuine yet inhibited by the presumed absence
of skills in administration among local units of government.
Expressions of lack of confidence in the ability of local coun-
cils to govern effectively due to their parochialism, excessive
political partisanship, insensitiveness to notions of political
responsibility, administrative illiteracy, and other adverse
characteristics alluded to local government are not at all
uncommon, and are utilized to substantiate minimal or no grants
of decentralized authority to local units.

   At times the reluctance to decentralize is based on the
inability of local government to put up fiscal resources to
support additional responsibilities for public functions. Given
a central government which has preempted the major sources of
revenue and which for various reasons is itself hard pressed
to look for vastly expanded resources to support existing and
anticipated functions, the burden is indeed heavy on the genius
of local government to locate and tap other sources of revenue.
Inconclusive relationships that are often dictated by this cir-
cumstance may very well result in no significant decentraliza-
tion at all.

   A fourth variable is somewhat related to the third. The
ability of the central government to meet the requirements of
overall development thrust on it by modernization may well de-
termine the patterns of power transfers and relationships that
will be desired. The magnitude of these requirements may in-
deed be both so disconcerting and sobering to advocates of cen-
tralism that the need for partnership with other entities in
the task of development may well be realized. It is not strange
that community development practitioners have often depicted
local government units as worthy partners in the development
enterprise.

   Fifth, the nature and degree of decentralization may be

affected by its impact on local and/or national party politics
and notions of national unity. In most countries the institu-
tionalization of political power in parties and party machinery
may likely not have been based on correct anticipations of
the currently increased roles of local government in develop-
ment and the consequent potentialities of the situation for
significantly altering the political status quo. It is there-
fore understandable when decentralization is viewed as conducive
to the emergence of rival political forces that would challenge
the supremacy of the existing political party structure. Fail-
ure to coopt such newly emergent political forces may inspire
measures to suppress them simply by refusing to decentralize.
In a number of countries, for example, local government has
somehow been identified with the political party in opposition
to the one in control of the central government, and consequently
the latter seems unwilling to consider measures to improve and
strengthen local government.

The reluctance to decentralize is traceable at times to
fears of the supposedly centrifugal tendencies of the process
of decentralization. Newly independent countries that have
yet to establish a truly viable national identity frequently
express reservations to decentralization on the ground that it
might jeopardize national unity. These countries would accept
decentralization in principle, but would grant it only after
national power will have been consolidated and national unity
assured. This is possibly the reason why the literature on
local government in developing countries explicitly cite and
emphasize the role of local government in promoting national
unity.[6]

As in many other endeavors, the interplay of the personal
propensities of the principal leaders associated with both
central and local governments will condition the nature of de-
centralization.

In the Philippines where the tradition of centralization
considerably colors the current state of central-local relations,
many local government executives are known to have exercised in
fact a considerable degree of discretion and independence in
the administration of local functions. In India the personal-
ities and prestige of national leaders which were brought to
bear on the panchayati raj programme no doubt were major elements
in the success of that programme. The factors involved in the

complex which makes possible these somewhat deviant performances are diverse, but the personalities of the local executives as they interact with those in the national government constitute an important one.

The seventh variable is the confidence of the national government in its administrative mechanisms of control over local government. These mechanisms may include among others, approval of budgets of local authorities, approval of the creation or abolition of each individual post in the local manning table, provision for continuing inspectorial facilities, fiscal audit, and even the membership of the local council. To the extent that the central government is convinced of the adequacy of these and other control devices, it will grant varying degrees of self-government and discretionary authority to local units.

The foregoing control devices are by definition essentially negative in approach. They are therefore deplored in many countries, especially those that have attained relatively more advanced political development, and in their place, centrally developed standards of performance are offered for the guidance of local government in such fields as recruitment, promotion, training, and discipline of staff; budgeting techniques; tax administration; central purchasing and stores facilities; and techniques in several specific aspects of organization and methods.

The technical nature of a function, including its adaptability to various forms of area administration, is still another variable which will condition the pattern of its decentralization. It is obvious, for example, that national interests including that of security, may rule out total withdrawal by the central government from such fields like postal, telegraphic and communications facilities, transportation, and control of dissident activities. The peculiar area requirement of malaria or schistosomiasis control, a programme of regional irrigation or broad development projects, or school administration at various levels are likewise similar conditioning factors.

Intergovernmental Relationships

Any specific design of decentralization will be a product of the interactions among the variables mentioned and possibly

others as well. And as touched upon in the description of each
variable, the ensuing relationships among different levels of
government concerned will likewise be so conditioned. The re-
sult is probably diversity in decentralization designs and cen-
tral-local relations consistent with differences in circumstances
from country to country. As seen earlier, a classification of
existing patterns was made in United Nations, *Decentralization
for National and Local Development.*[7]

   Conceptually, there are two broad patterns which underlie
must actual arrangements. The first is virtually a situation
where authority and responsibility for development functions
are substantially devolved at once to local government with a
hope that performance would improve in time through practice.
Under the panchayati raj programme in India local authorities
with the possible exception of zila parishads in some states,
plan and implement all development programmes affecting their
respective jurisdictions.[8] Some countries in Latin America, sim-
ilarly, grant substantial autonomy to their municipalities, even
to the extent of guaranteeing such autonomy in national constitutions.[9]

   The second broad pattern is a phased programme of transfer
of authority and responsibility accompanied by a measured relax-
ation of central government control. In the Sudan, for example,
the following arrangements are provided corresponding to five
specified stages of development, vis:[10]

   "(1) A local government inspector exercising local
        government powers without an independent budget,
        his revenue and expenditure being carried on the
        Province Council Budget. This stage is now ap-
        plicable in two council areas only;

   (2) A local government inspector operating an in-
        dependent budget and appointing a council to
        advise him on the discharge of his functions;

   (3) A local government inspector who delegates his
        powers to a council with the consent of the
        Minister of Local Government but who has the
        power to veto any decision which is contrary to
        public interests;

(4) A local government council with full powers estab-
lished by warrant by the Council of Ministers but
with an appointed chairman;

(5) A council which has full powers and which elects
its own chairman."

In the Philippines, although current powers enjoyed by local
government units are reportedly still inadequate, the transfer
of powers from central to local units show a roughly similar
pattern.[11]

POLITICIZATION OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT

As stated above, community development demands of local
government a greater sensitivity to the local political environ-
ment. One motivation is the practical need to seek, through
local government, new and potentially extensive manpower and
other material resources for development. It is thought that
where the citizenry is actively involved in development acti-
ities, the resources sought might more easily be secured. The
other motivation may be political especially where community
development programmes are used as instruments for guiding the
society into given political molds and where local government
is viewed as a convenient enabling tool. Most programmes per-
haps incorporate both goals, but whether one or the other is
given relative preeminence is not clear.

Politicization of local government takes many forms, and
is directed at both the local authority councils and officers.
Among the most common are the following:

1. Reservation of seats in the local governing council
for certain groups. In India some seats in the
local councils of the panchayati raj programme
are reserved for women and other scheduled ethnic
groups. In Western Nigeria some of the traditional
chiefs are made permanent members of, and others
are elected by their peers to, the local council.
These are presumably means of insuring that cer-
tain groups bring their presence to bear on, and
influence courses of action taken by local repre-

sentative structures. They probably indicate
dissatisfaction with conventional representative
institutions which otherwise would have failed
to provide for the expression of the interests
of these groups.

2. Appointive and ex-officio memberships in local
   councils. The intention in this case is the dual
   one of influencing the decisions of the elective
   members of council through the technical and poli-
   tical guidance provided by the appointive and
   ex-officio members, and of exposing the latter to
   the political environment of local government to
   sensitize them to the nature and ramifications of
   local politics. Thus, in the UAR the field tech-
   nicians of the different ministries at the village,
   town, and province levels are made ex-officio mem-
   bers of the respective councils, while others serve
   as appointive members upon selection by the Min-
   istry of Local Government.[12]

In some states of India, the district collector is ex-officio
chairman of the zila parishad,[13] and in the early stages of
the development of the Sudanese local council the local govern-
ment inspector, a national official, plays a dominant role,
while in the province council field representatives of national
ministries and departments enjoy full-fledged memberships.[14]

3. Direct participation of the people in some aspects
   of administration. The idea here is to provide for
   a means of popular control of bureaucratic action.
   Taxpayers' organizations and municipal research
   bureaus in the United States immediately come to
   mind as good examples. In Yugoslavia, the econmic
   enterprises provide vehicles for direct management
   of group affairs by the citizens, and in the Phil-
   ippines the members of the barrio assembly are
   required by law to meet at least once a year to
   review the accomplishments and activities of the
   barrio council in development.

4. Political party representation in the local councils. The National Union, the organization solely sanctioned by the UAR Government in lieu of political parties, gets to have some of its members "who have specific qualifications and would be useful to the local council" appointed to this body.[15] In Yugoslavia, the Socialist Alliance of Working People and the League of Communists so infuse the electoral system that most elected members of the commune assemblies ar are members of both.[16] It is thus that the activities of the local council are sought to be directed towards goals with which the political party is identified.

5. Financial and other administrative measures. The alignment provided by certain administrative measures, and subtle pressures for conformity exerted through managed fiscal grants, are also used to influence decisions of local councils. Thus, community development projects determined through community deliberations are subsidized by the national government in many countries either financially in the form of grants, or administratively in the form of technical services by officials hired by the government. In some parts of India, Government grants are reportedly used to encourage village panchayats to reach unanimous decisions on community development issues, although the practice could conceivably "depoliticize" the activities concerned as well. Administrative arrangements for national government scrutiny of local estimates, as well as general inspectorial facilities, could be used to ensure recognition of community consensus in planning and executing community development programmes.

COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION

It will be recalled that coordination and integration are matters that are central to community development plans. For

purposes of this section, coordination involves relating to each other different efforts or activities directed at development so that duplication is avoided and the totality of the resources in use brought to bear on the overall needs of development. It means properly alerting officials concerned so that they do not build roads in areas that will be flooded to make way for power and irrigation projects; indiscriminately sink wells of fixed specifications where information on water tables held by another agency is not known; advocate deep plowing to suit centrally designed plows irrespective of the depth of top soil in the locality; or erect health centers without ascertaining the capacity of the health agency concerned to service them. There are other similar examples of failure to coordinate with rather dismal consequences, but those cited would suffice to illustrate the point.

The need for coordination in community development has fundamental implications in the structure of local government. Perhaps the best illustration of this is the transformation of the Indian structure for rural community development into a vast system of local government institutions where programme-wise, the development officer assumes a primary role. The block development officer, for example, is typically the generalist administrator who superintends virtually all activities in the panchayat samiti area that are being undertaken in the name of development. In the process the old local government structures have been superceded and the panchayats have generally been transformed into local government units with comprehensive governmental powers.[17]

The basic structure of local government in the Philippines has not been changed by the assumption of responsibility for community development. There the administrative impotence of the local government executive is recognized[18] and a coordinating council composed of technical officers, political officials, and lay members has been set up to provide the coordinating element in community development. Voluntary action is seen as a major component in the workings of the councils, and moral suasion and consensus the prime sources of sanctions. The hope is that by bringing the individuals concerned in community development into face-to-face situations, they would inform each other of their respective interests, activities, and problems, and would consequently pave the way for the mutual appreciation of roles

all round, and eventually some cooperation and coordination. The
success of many provincial and municipal community development
councils in the Philippines despite serious administrative ob-
stacles is indicative of the potentialities of the voluntary
and consensual committee in bringing about coordination in com-
munity development.

The responsibility for coordination of activities in com-
munity development may rest with a specific technical officer
who may be given the required administrative authority for the
purpose. This officer may be one of the local technicians who
happens to perform functions that locally are considered stra-
tegic because they affect and/or ramify into other functions.
Thus, where community development programmes involve substantial
construction of infra-structures such as roads, school houses,
health centers, and the like, the local engineer may actually
wield or be given leadership in coordination. Where financing
is a central element in the programme, the local treasurer may
assume a dominant posture. And where the planning function is
considered locally to be crucial to community development,
either the planning officer or the community development officer
may be given the responsibility for coordination. The distin-
guishing features of this device are the explicitness with which
the location of responsibility for coordination is defined, and
the authority that invariably is allowed the coordinator to
carry out this responsibility. Consensus and moral suasion
are not necessarily discarded, but these assume secondary roles,
compared to formal authority to coordinate.

Integration, as used in this section, is different from
coordination in that it involves adjusting the configuration of
local development activities to the goals and patterns of na-
tional development schemes and vice versa. It means influencing
community development activities at both national and local
levels so that they reflect each other's needs without jeopar-
dizing the distinctive requirements of development of either
one. Integration viewed in this way somewhat involves a sym-
biotic process of give and take, and promotes full expression
of local community propensities and needs.

The problem of integration has its own peculiar administra-
tive implications, including the setting up of machinery to
ensure symbiosis in national and local planning for development,
and financial and political measures to sustain such symbiotic

relationship. Thus, in India national, social and economic plans are reportedly rooted in programmes that initially emerge out of expressions of need by village panchayats, and successively consolidated and refined at panchayat samiti, zila parishad, and state levels. The whole process, of course, is supposed to be oriented around both national and local goals and values. In the Philippines the intention to involve local government in national planning has always been expressed, and in Thailand the role of local government in the planning and implementation of social and economic development is reportedly assured. Elsewhere there appears at least latent recognition of the need for some kind of machinery to bring about the mutual integration of plans and activities of national and local governments in development.

Formal administrative machinery for integration may be supplemented by financial measures. These include specific grants to stimulate certain activities that contribute to overall development; e.g., construction of feeder roads and multiple purpose community centers and the maintenance of certain functions such as health and sanitation.

Political measures may also be harnessed to facilitate integration. In countries where local council members are partly appointed and/or ex-officio, the concommitant selections process may be so structured to favor individuals of desirable political persuasions. In countries where local government executives are elective, the political party structure and operations may be geared towards the same end. By these means, the goals and patterns of social and economic development at the national level are projected significantly to local plans and activities.

SOME QUESTIONS

The variety of responses demonstrated by local government in various countries to the demands of community development are inspiring, yet often baffling because of the multiplicity and complexity of considerations that are associated with them. Efforts to obtain relatively simple descriptions of the rationale for given responses are often inadequate, and frequently hedged in between assumed conditions and other value considerations. Yet, practitioners in community development and local government demand simple prescriptions for simply stated problems. How,

for instance, should local councils be constituted? What rela-
tionship is proper between councilors and local government of-
ficers? What should local government do in community develop-
ment? How and in what things should local officers and councils
be trained? How should local government react to one-party
political structure? What administrative structures would work
best under the peculiar characteristics of local culture?

The quest for answers to these and similar other questions
would probably require at least two major tasks. The first is
the intensive investigation of the distinctive circumstances
that motivate special arrangements for the redistribution of
government powers and responsibilities, for coordination and
integration of functions, and the politicization of local govern-
ment. This task will likewise require projections on the feasi-
bility of transplantation and utilization of these arrangements
in different culture media with a view to providing practical
guidelines to other countries.

The second major task is the determination of the substan-
tive bounds of community development. It would seem that this
task would be necessary in order to determine what specific as-
pects should properly be institutionalized in local government,
or deliberately left outside of it. Undertaking of the task,
would likewise help in formulating feasible anticipations that
would ramify into certain administrative areas as training,
structure, operations, interorganizational relations, and
others.

In going about the two tasks described, it is perhaps impor-
tant to take note of the lessons implicit from current experiences
in the dissemination of cultural practices. These include the
following: (1) the fallacy of slavishly imitating pratices
developed in other cultural settings; (2) the "staying power"
which aculturation gives to any arrangement irrespective of con-
sideration of logic; and (3) the capacity of developing coun-
tries to contribute innovative ideas and arrangements in the
process of grappling with problems.

NOTES

[1]See, among others, IULA, *Local Government in the XXth Century*
(The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1963); Economic Commission for
Africa, "Seminar on Central Services to Local Authorities, 29 June −

10 July 1964: Seminar Report," E/CN. 14/UAP/37 (mimeo.);
United Nations, *Seminar on Central Services to Local Authorities*
(New York: U.N., 1964), ST/TAO/M/23; and Economic Commission
for Africa, "The Orientation of Local Government Training in
Africa to Meet Economic and Social Changes in the Developing
Countries," (mimeograph draft) E/CN. 14/UAP/38 27 April 1965.

[2]The term refers to "the processes by which the efforts of
the people themselves are united with those of governmental
authorities to improve the economic, social and cultural con-
ditions of communities, to integrate these communities into
the life of the nation and to enable them to contribute freely
to national progress." (*Official Records of the Economic and
Social Council, Twenty-fourth Session, Annexes,* agenda item 4,
document E 12931, Annex III, para. 1.). In this paper no dis-
tinction is made between rural and urban community development
because while their contents may differ, the attendant proces-
ses are identical. Neither will any distinction be made between
types of community development programmes, e.g., those described
in United Nations, *Public Administration Aspects of Community
Development Programmes,* pp. 5-8, because their requirements as
described in this section seem to be common to all forms.

[3]In United Nations, *Decentralization for National and Local
Development* (U.N.: New York, 1962), pp. 9-12, forms of decen-
tralization were described as: (1) "Comprehensive" when "most
services at the local level are administered through multi-
purpose local authorities," and where "a concept of substantial
unity of purpose among representative bodies at all levels under-
lies the system;" (2) "partnership" when some services are
"rendered by field units of central agencies and others by local
authorities;" (3) "dual" when "central ministries administer
technical services directly, with local authorities having
autonomy legally to perform local services and do what they can
to foster local development, but actually performing few if any
technical services either directly or on behalf of central agen-
cies;" and (4) "integrated" when "central government agencies
directly administer all technical services" in the field.

[4]Barrio Charter provision.

[5]See Mijalko Todorovic, "The Federal Assembly in the System of Self-Government," *Review of International Affairs*, January 5, 1965; and Institute of Public Administration, "Recent Developments in Yugoslav Local Government" (mimeograph summation of remarks made by Dr. Eugen Pusic, Dean of the Advanced School of Public Administration, University of Zagreb, Yugoslavia, in a Seminar held at the Institute of Public Administration of New York on February 5, 1965.)

[6]See footnote 1.

[7]See footnote 3.

[8]*Ibid.*, p. 167.

[9]Brazil and Venezuela are outstanding examples.

[10]United Nations, *Decentralization for National and Local Development*, p. 181.

[11]See Romani and Thomas.

[12]United Nations, *Decentralization for National and Local Development*, p. 191.

[13]*Ibid.*, p. 167.

[14]*Ibid.*, pp. 181-182.

[15]*Ibid.*, p. 190.

[16]See footnote 5.

[17]United Nations, *Decentralization for National and Local Development*, pp. 165-170.

[18]The Philippine provincial governor and municipal mayor are popularly elected officials and are expected to function as a local chief executive. However, the principal officials at both levels who have responsibility for rendering essential

64

public services are functionaries of the National Government who
are stationed locally.

BOOK REVIEWS

New Zealand: Gift of the Sea. By Brian Brake (Photographs)
and Maurice Shadbolt (Text). Honolulu, Hawaii, East West-
Center Press, 1964. 149 pp. $9.50.

Rarely have a photographer and writer combined their tal-
ents so well as have Brian Brake and Maurice Shadbolt in the
production of this book. The text is a fascinating blend of
poetry and superb prose, balanced by what must be the finest
collection of pictures of New Zealand yet published in a single
volume. Yet prose, poetry and pictures do not, in this work,
obscure reality or produce an illusion.

The photographs are works of art, and yet at the same
time present us with a view of New Zealand amazingly free from
the distortions one instinctively expects in such surveys of a
nation; the same is equally true of the text. Anyone interested
in New Zealand should look at and read this book - as a general
introduction to the land and its people it has oft to be equalled.
The only criticism the reviewer can offer concerns the price;
the American edition published by the East-West Center Press is
about three times as expensive as the original New Zealand edi-
tion.

The authors tell us in their introductory notes that "this
is a book with few facts and fewer figures. With word and pic-
ture we have tried to show the New Zealand that was and the
New Zealand that is." They have succeeded in their objective.

Richard A. Benton
East-West Center

Community Development Programme In India - A Critical Evaluation.
By Iltija Husain Khan. Aligarh Muslim University Press, Aligarh,
1964. pp. 180. Price, not mentioned.

Ever since the community development projects were started
in India thirteen years ago, there has been a flow of books,
articles and reports on the subject. Among the books and arti-
cles, many are written by those who are closely connected with
the movement through the Government of India or the state

governments. The reports have largely been made at the instance
of the governments. Scholarly attempts by university men, have
been few compared to the scope of the subject for social science
research. Among the scholars who have published, the anthropol-
ogists and rural sociologists have attracted greater attention
than the political scientists. Dr. Iltija Khan is a political
scientist.

The main achievement of the author lies in having been
able to put together in about one-hundred eighty pages, the
major aspects, characteristics and problems of the community
development program of India as observed not only by himself,
but also, by many authors, critics and committees.

This is not the result of an intensive field study conduc-
ted all over India on the basis of accurate statistical meth-
odology - an impossible task for any single individual even to
dream of! On the contrary, the book reflects a great deal of
library work. Even most of the "critical evaluations" are based
on the reports of the Study Teams, Estimate Committees and Eval-
uation Organizations appointed by the government. Nevertheless,
this revised book of a Ph.D. thesis does not betray ignorance
of the vital issues and major drawbacks of the community devel-
opment program in India. Dr. Khan has given a commentable treat-
ment of the "center vs states" and other problems of adminis-
trative relationships in community development. Prominent men-
tion has been frequently made to the agonies of the weakest sec-
tions of the Indian rural population who have not benefited much
from the program.

The first eight chapters are highly informative though there
is a frequently unpleasant mixture of description and hasty,
idealistic prescription. The ninth (final) chapter is a general
essay on the rural problems of India.

The major flaws of the book, more likely to be perceived
by those not used to them, lie in the editing and printing. A
listing of the errata, if attempted, would have been too long
to be included in the book. It is unfortunate that a publica-
tion coming out in the name of a well-known university of India
should have such a poor presentation.

Despite the apparent drawbacks mentioned above, this can
serve as a useful introductory book for those who may not have
the time or accessibility to the entire literature on the sub-
ject. Those who want to pursue empirical field research may
find many issues and hypotheses suggested directly and indirectly
by the author, useful to start with. The bibliography with more

67

than one-hundred fifty citations will also be useful to many
students in social sciences.

                                        E. H. Valsan
                                        East-West Center

Ways of Thinking of Eastern Peoples: India, China, Tibet, Japan.
Revised Edition by Hajime Nakamura. Edited by Philip P. Wiener.
East-West Center Press, Honolulu, Hawaii, 1964. pp. 750. $9.50.

Scholarly eclectic in source choices, and absorbing both
for students and laymen, *Ways of Thinking of Eastern Peoples*
provides a close study of four cultures which have been influ-
enced by Buddhism. Dr. Nakamura, ably assisted by his editor,
Philip P. Wiener, weaves an intricate but clearly followed the-
sis drawn from the fields of sociology, psychology, history, and
linguistics into a brilliant discussion of the impact of an an-
cient religion on new societies.

Nakamura concentrates on the manner in which Indian Bud-
dhism changed in response to its new environment as it moved
into Tibet, China, and Japan. That there is no such an entity
as the "Oriental Mind" becomes obvious, for social patterns
and ways of thought in each country have created highly individ-
ual forms of the religion. This individuality appears most
clearly in Japan whose Buddhism, instead of coming directly
from India, came from Chinese forms of the religion. Nakamura
argues that on the Asian continent the long history of conquest
and re-conquest required the individual to learn adaptive cun-
ning, a technique associated with individualism. In Japan, on
the other hand, a stable, long continuing culture based on rice
growing molded permanent communities in which individuality
yielded to social good.

It is a changing concept of individuality, of "self" emer-
ging from divergent cultures which occupies a major part of
the book. Though the discussion moves through many, many cen-
turies, its deft presentation allows even a layman to feel no
gap of time or place. In India, the reader finds the Universal
Self taking precedence over the individual self, creating a
society in which there is no true separation of one self from
another. China alters this attitude, for, as Buddhism encoun-
tered Confucian principles of public service, a high degree of
individualism emerged. Then, in its isolation, Japan converted
this Chinese Buddhism, a nonsectarian faith, into a sectarian

one with a strict rule of propriety which gave each man a position in society but which submerged his individuality.

Despite these differences, the transitional forms of Buddhism shown by Nakamura make the cultural process so clear that one country's history flows into another's. Only in Tibet with its concentration on the immediacy of death, on physical wellbeing, on today's concerns does there seem a break. According to the author, even the Tibetans see themselves as remote from India and its sages. This remoteness, forced on them by a cruel and hazardous land, has permitted them to shift from contemplative Indian Buddhism to Lamaism, a religion which reveres the Living Lama above Buddha.

In summary, this book offers a cultural feast for every reader. The fascinating footnotes, pleasantly placed in a section at the end of the discussion, add comments and suggestions for further reading. Those who have read the first edition of this book will find a great deal of new material. To the history of ideas, Nakamura continues to be a major contributor.

Mrs. V. N. Kennedy
University of Hawaii

East-West Center Review is one outgrowth of the programs
of the East-West Center Grantees' Association, an organization
of all East-West Center students in the Institute for Student
Interchange division of the Center. Most students in this
division of the Center are graduate students working for Master's
degrees and come from some twenty-five different countries.

The scope of *East-West Center Review* is the exploration
of cross-cultural contacts. This emphasis follows closely the
scope of the center as a whole, although the *Review* is not
meant to stand for any other organization than the East-West
Center Grantees' Association.

East-West Center Review embraces both the social sciences
and the humanities. The central theme of the exploration of
cross-cultural contacts is considered more important, however,
than disciplinary emphasis.