GROWING UP IN THE MARGINS: RURAL AND URBAN THERAPEUTIC LANDSCAPES FOR FEMALE HUMAN TRAFFICKING SURVIVORS IN INDIA

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE DIVISION OF THE
UNIVERSITY OF HAWAIʻI AT MĀNOA IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS

IN

GEOGRAPHY

DECEMBER 2016

By

KATHRYN L. METZKER

Thesis Committee:

Mary Mostafanezhad, Chairperson
Reece Jones
Nancie Caraway

Keywords: human trafficking, rehabilitation, identity, place, landscape

© 2016 Kathryn Metzker

All Rights Reserved

Acknowledgements

First and foremost I would like to thank Carol Metzker, both an expert in anti-human trafficking, who has shared her knowledge and expertise with me day and night, as well as my fabulous mother. She has been an advisor, editor, motivator, and enthusiastic supporter throughout. The work that she does in her own life to educate people about human trafficking and help survivors is a daily inspiration to me. Next I would like to thank Supriya Awasthi, former South Asia Director of Free the Slaves, for welcoming me into her home and helping me coordinate my trip to Punarnawa Ashram, as well as answering my millions of questions about trafficking and India. She is an anti-human trafficking rock star whose passion and drive are matched by none. The way she takes on life with fire and zeal is a personal inspiration. I am also deeply grateful to my thesis committee at the University of Hawai'i, advisor Mary Mostafanezhad, Reece Jones, and Nancie Caraway, for their advice, edits, and help navigating this complex process.

I would also like to deeply thank the staff and survivors at Punarnawa Ashram and Kranti, particularly their directors Amita Gaur and Robin Chaurasiya, without whom this work would not be possible. Many thanks for letting me stay in these special centers. Also to Dubey, the accountant at Punarnawa, I would like to thank for helping me feel so welcome at the center, for answering all of my questions, and for all of the care he puts into his work at Punarnawa. I would not have found Kranti without Katelyn Sheehan, anti-human trafficking and trauma-informed care consultant. Thank you for going on this adventure with me and for sharing your love of life with these survivors. Thanks also to the team of social workers at the Salvation Army's New Day to stop Trafficking Program in Philadelphia for teaching me about what you do, addressing similar issues in a very different place.

Next I would like to thank all of those who helped fund me: the J Watumull family, the University of Hawai'i Graduate Student Organization, and the East West Center who has given their support through research as well as during my degree. At the East West Center I would specifically like to thank Mendl Djunaidy, Mary Hammond, Mona Nakihei, and Kuhio Vogeler. I would not have been able to have such effective interviews without all of my Hindi study, so my thanks to the US State Department Critical Language Scholarship Program for funding my

Hindi studies, as well as all of my phenomenal professors at the American Institute of Indian Studies in Jaipur. Also thank you to Sai Bhatawadekar, Asher Jesudoss, Anamita Guha, Sumit Saha, and Maria Kosinki, director of the University of Miami Directed Independent Language Studies, for helping me with my Hindi at the University of Hawai'i and the University of Miami. I would also like to acknowledge those who read my applications and proposals and wrote recommendations for me: Sai Bhatawadekar, Cedar Louis, Alison Rieser, Sarah Meltzoff, and Gina Maranto. My most sincere thanks Sarah Meltzoff and Gina Maranto for their advice and encouragement while I was in the field and for continuing to support me even now, long after their official advisor roles have finished.

Lastly to my biggest supporters – my sister Elizabeth, my parents Eric and Carol, my dear friend Martin Moon, and the Lorgus family, as well as my grandparents and extended family of Westtown School. Thank you all for cheering me on, believing in me, and sending me mental hugs from so far away. This was a big undertaking and a long list of people made this possible through their academic and emotional support. I am so appreciative of my Hawai'i friends and supporters, especially those in the Geography Department and at the East West Center: Tim S. Workman, Will Cecil, Li Philips, Allie Shae, Kerrie Littlejohn, Azmeary Ferdoush, Dylan Beatty, Maida Besic, Thomas Goedecke, and the EWC Likok Pulo Group. Although there may be others whom I have not mentioned by name, I am sincerely grateful for their contribution.

Abstract

This study examines the effect of place on recovery, care, and empowerment models of trauma rehabilitation for female survivors of the commercial sex trade and human trafficking in two residential facilities in India: one in rural Bihar and one in urban Mumbai. It focuses on the ideological, socio-cultural, and physical aspects of landscape that drive differences between rural and urban rehabilitation practices and opportunities for growth and learning. These differences affect survivors' development of place attachment, self-identity, and hope for the future. The case studies are contextualized within the broader scope of gendered political economy in India to discuss the ways political economy mediates gendered trauma care and informs the ability of survivors living in the margins to re-imagine their futures. Through a place-based analysis of marginalization, prejudice, and stigma, I also discuss the ways sense of place and trauma impact identity development and place-based empowerment models.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements ..... **ii**

Abstract ..... **iv**

Chapter 1 Introduction 1

Introduction 1

Background 5

Therapeutic Landscapes 7

Place, Identity, and Rehabilitation 9

Gender and Trauma-Informed Care 10

Research Methods 12

Outline of Thesis 15

Chapter 2: Landscapes of Rehabilitation: Resources, Economies, Ideologies 15

Chapter 3: Divided Expectations: Negotiating Identity between Place and Therapeutic Landscapes 17

Chapter 4: From Trauma to Empowerment: A Gendered Political Economy of the Future. 19

Chapter 5: Conclusion 20

Chapter 2 Landscapes of Rehabilitation: Resources, Economies, and Ideologies 22

Introduction 22

Landscape of Punarnawa 23

Landscape of Kranti 23

Landscape 24

Physical, Economic, and Ideological Resources 27

Physical Resources and Limitations: Kranti 28

Physical Resources and Limitations: Punarnawa 30

Economic Resources and Limitations: Kranti 32

Economic Resources and Limitations: Punarnawa 34

Ideological Inputs and Limitations 35

Ideals at Kranti 36

Ideals at Punarnawa 37

Local Culture Landscape Impacts on Ideals 38

Navigating Landscapes 42

Mobility at Kranti 43
Mobility at Punarnawa... 44
Conclusion.. 45
Chapter 3 Divided Expectations: Negotiating Identity between Place and Therapeutic Landscapes.. 47
Introduction 47
Place and Identity Politics in India.. 49
Caste and Economic Identities 52
Place and Gender Identity 54
Gender-Informed Rehabilitation 58
Connection.. 59
Sense of place 62
Conclusion.. 65
Chapter 4 From Trauma to Empowerment: A Gendered Political Economy of the Future67
Introduction 67
Gender in India... 68
Gender and Work 71
Caste and Gendered Job Markets 74
Income Generating Programs... 76
Future Perceptions: Trauma and Empowerment... 79
Empowerment... 80
Education 81
Painting the Future... 82
Conclusion.. 85
Chapter 5 Conclusion 87
Introduction 87
Landscape.. 90
Identity 91
Future Expectations.. 92
Broader Connections and Future Research 94
Mobility 94

Education 97
Trauma-Informed Care 98
NGO Interventions 100
Policy Implications 101
Hope for the Future 1022
References 103

Chapter 1
Introduction

Introduction

Punarnawa Ashram

New Survivor Intake Form[1]:

Name: Ankita Devi
Age: Approximately 19 years old. She would not tell her age when she arrived, so this is an estimate.
Address: Bihar. No further address was given for Ankita's first year at Punarnawa. Personal information such as age and origin are kept secret because of the shame of being trafficked or fear of being harmed.
Family: Father, mother, five sisters, one brother. Ankita is the oldest daughter.

Ankita and her friend Premi were walking to the market one afternoon to buy cosmetics, when they met two men – Chandra and Raj. They approached the girls and told them "Your mother is sick and she has been admitted to the hospital in town, come with us." The girls quickly followed the men to the car and got in. They drove for a long time, and finally stopped near a temple far outside the town. Night had fallen. It was dark and the area was deserted. Chandra said to Ankita, "Marry me". Shaking her head she replied "you are [old enough to be] my uncle. Where is my mother?" He did not reply. That night he violently sexually assaulted her. Raj did the same to her friend, Premi. The next morning when the men had fallen asleep, the girls left running. The girls screamed for help but no one came. They ran until finally they found a police station, and the girls dashed inside and told the officers the entire story.

At the station they filed police report number KH/RIJ/38 TF.-147/34. Their allegations against both men include: kidnapping, attempted forced marriage, and sexual exploitation. As a

[1] Case management file from Punarnawa Ashram (9/18/13), translated by Kathryn Metzker (8/2015). People, place, and file names changed for confidentially.

result of filing this report (form 210), the offenders, Chandra and Raj, were sentenced to 5 years in jail and a 5000 rupee fine (approximately $83 USD). The Trafficking in Persons (TIP) District Coordinator for the girl's district accessed a government program called the *Astetv Yojna* that provided Ankita 6000 rupees. They opened a bank account for her where they deposited the money.

Ankita came to Punarnawa Ashram on 18/9/2013. She was trained in sewing. After completing the 6 month training, she was awarded top marks on her USHA state sewing test certificate. The master trainer and the vocational trainer gave her tests on which she did exceedingly well. At the ashram she also took classes on craft making and other classes of interest such as reading. After an evaluation conducted by Punarnawa's Reintegration Officer on 21/8/2014, Ankita's house was deemed safe to return to. The TIP District Coordinator of her village and the ashram coordinator provided Ankita with a vocational kit and ensured her safe delivery to her parents' house. One month later, the ashram coordinator conducted a follow-up meeting with Ankita to check on her safety and progress. Ankita's sewing was coming along well and she recently made 500 rupees from her seamstress work.

***

Globally, approximately 45.8 million people are trapped in modern slavery, 55 percent of whom are women and girls (Global Slavery Index 2016, USDS 2014, Freedom Fund 2015, WWF 2014a, ILO 2015). In 2014, 14.9 million trafficked persons were in India alone, making it the country with the highest number of victims of human trafficking in the world (WFF 2014a). In India, the most vulnerable women who live in the margins of society – the rural poor and those of the lowest caste – are at the highest risk for human trafficking (USDS 2014, WFF 2014b, Bales 2007, Fegley 2008, Prasad 1979, Kumar 1991, Chakravarti, 2001). They perform tasks such as textile or carpet making, working in biscuit factories, in brothels, or working in agriculture or floriculture (USDS 2014). Some people are transported long distances to work, even across state and country borders such as to Nepal and Pakistan. Torn from their environments, language groups, communities, and control over their lives, survivors are stripped of everything that helps create and define their identities (Metzker 2012, Pile & Thrift 1995, Mazumdar & Mazumdar 2012).

In this thesis I examine the impact of place on rehabilitation and the experiences of survivors in a rural and an urban setting to understand the role place has on the ways rehabilitation is conceptualized and practiced in these two Indian settings. I discuss the role of place through the resources utilized by centers, and rehabilitation methods that affect place attachment, self-identity creation, empowerment, and hope for the future. Through a phenomenological lens, I look at place with attention to local culture, political economy, and environment, and give particular consideration to gender and caste as they shape and are shaped by each location. Rural and urban India provide dramatically different spaces for rehabilitation. Their landscapes of gender expectations, stigmas, and opportunities for growth and learning are very different. The two centers on which the case studies for this research are based are Punarnawa Ashram, in the state of Bihar, and Kranti, in the city of Mumbai.

Through ethnography of life in care centers, this thesis provides an understanding of the impacts of place and landscape on trauma rehabilitation in India from a lens of human trafficking and the sex trade. It builds on gendered political economy theory in India to discuss the ways political economy mediates girls' trauma and rehabilitation and informs the ability of these survivors to re-imagine their futures. Through a place-based analysis of marginalizing factors in rural and urban India, I discuss the ways place, sense of place, and trauma impact identity creation among these girls, contributing to theory on gendered identity and place. The results of this study aim to shed light on the gendered experience of trauma recovery in India and place-based empowerment models.

Human trafficking, defined by the US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report, is an umbrella term used for "recruiting, harboring, transporting, providing, or obtaining a person for compelled labor or commercial sex acts through the use of force, fraud, or coercion… [and] can include, but does not require, movement" (USDS 2014). As defined by Kevin Bales, a leading expert in modern slavery, as well as head of the Global Slavery Index, modern slavery is "the control of another person through violence or economic exploitation to a person or their family, and causes a loss of free will" (Bales, 2007). Modern slavery is set apart from past slavery in several ways. Today's slaves are cheap, because land and labor prices are low, and because of population growth. Therefore there is a high and fast return rate - slaves are expendable and easy to replace. I will use both terms "victims/survivors of human trafficking"

and “slaves” in describing the people who are offered refuge in survivor rehabilitation centers throughout the world.

A widely stated comment in anti-human trafficking work is that there is not enough research devoted to the subject on any level: politically, legally, and particularly on the rehabilitation of survivors (Bales 2004, Geneva Global 2014, WWF 2014a, MSEMVS 2014, Polaris 2015). To begin with, although slavery exists in every nation, it is illegal everywhere; thus, the underground nature of the crime makes it difficult for NGOs or governments to determine the numbers and locations of victims. Finding ways to rehabilitate survivors in a short amount of time in ways that can provide survivors economic security that has longevity is no easy task. Various local and international Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) have established rehabilitation centers, ashrams, around India and utilize various methods to help survivors recover mentally, physically, and spiritually. If slaves are not taken to rehabilitation centers, it is very easy for them to fall back into slavery because they do not have a job, home, or support system, leaving them in the same position that made them vulnerable to traffickers in the first place (MSEMVS 2014, USDS 2014). Sometimes rescued survivors return to their slaveholders by their own volition because they have nowhere else to go and at least know what to expect from those places, unlike having to start all over again somewhere new (Bales 2007, Fegley 2008).

Without NGO interventions, survivors are not often welcomed back into their communities because of the victim-blaming stigma that can often accompany slavery (MSEMVS 2014, Locke 2010). Survivors express guilt and shame; they may know that their enslavement was not directly their fault, but they feel they should have been able to avoid the situation (Bales, 2007). Rehabilitation is crucial to returning to society and to improving their own wellbeing. Rehabilitated survivors return to their villages with a higher level of literacy, confidence, and vocational skill-based knowledge than before (Bales 2007, MSEMVS 2014).

Rehabilitation centers for trafficking survivors in India have cropped up only in the last thirty years (Fegley, 2008), and best-practice methods have not been widely established or standardized. Rehabilitation homes have identified that survivors need psychosocial recovery and, in the past, that type of recovery has been the primary focus of care centers (Locke 2010, Fegley 2008, Awasthi 2014, Freedom Fund 2015, MSEMVS 2014). Critiques have surfaced

regarding rehabilitation methods and their lack of longevity of impact on survivors' lives and the lives of their home communities after survivors have been reintegrated (WFF 2014a, Shigekane 2007, Locke 2010). Survivors need long-term support to protect them against the all-too-common problem of being re-trafficked due to mental, social, and economic vulnerabilities. Therefore, in addition to therapeutic recovery efforts, vocational training is now used in rehabilitation efforts to provide survivor's with a way to gain economic security upon reintegration into society. In India, examples of these tasks include farming, sewing, and beautician work (Bales 2007, Metzker 2012, Awasthi 2011, Locke 2010).

It is important to note, however, the problem with examining the two centers studied in this research as centers for 'survivors of human trafficking'. Kranti actually calls itself a trafficking prevention center. The girls living there were not trafficked, but grew up in the red light districts with their mothers who call themselves 'sex workers'. At Punarnawa Ashram, the staff say that they take slavery survivors, girls who were sex trafficked, and orphaned street girls. These are all messy labels for a myriad of life experiences which have caused these girls some measure of trauma. Punarnawa and Kranti are for disenfranchised youth with similar experiences of trauma who have been marginalized by similar socio-cultural and economic structures. It is indicative of a wider lack of support or government services that all of these girls are sent to the same centers despite coming from different complex backgrounds of abuse and suffering.

Background

In 2011, I joined a team of American Rotarians, who had been raising money for Punarnawa, on their trip to the ashram to see the progress made on the center from the money they had donated. I joined the trip to study the sustainability efforts of the ashram: solar panels to provide electricity for the street lamps, a bio-gas system (for producing methane for the kitchen stove) with three cows, and an organic farm. There I learned about the work my mother does – anti-human trafficking. Punarnawa is a rehabilitation center situated in the rural north of the state of Bihar. The land was donated by a wealthy local landowner to Free the Slaves NGO. Punarnawa was started in 2010 and given the name that means "beginning of new life" (FTS 2010). Over the past five years it has grown dramatically with dormitories to house

approximately 40 girls. The girls are originally from every corner of India, trafficked within the country or to neighboring Nepal, and are brought to the ashram by police and rescue teams. Punarnawa is a mediating institution for survivors' futures, cultivating their potential to determine how their futures will be expressed and configured. Survivors are, in turn, using the ashram as a space for rebuilding self-identity and personal development to prepare themselves for the future.

I was introduced to Kranti by anti-human trafficking trauma-informed care consultant Katelyn Sheehan, who identified Kranti as an alternative care center in Mumbai that focuses not on trafficking after-care, but trafficking prevention. Residents of Kranti are girls who grew up in red light areas and whose mothers are sex workers. Through Kranti's own school program and extensive outside activities like dance, theater, and music, the girls learn to be not just survivors, but revolutionaries, sharing their stories with others to try to stop the patterns of sexism, abuse, racism, and poverty that create the situations that put their mothers in the red light districts in the first place. Growing up in red light districts, the girls have suffered from the same traumas as girls from Punarnawa, including sexual and physical abuse. Both sets of girls are from low castes and class, and face the stigmas relating to sex work and trafficking. And, importantly, they have all been given the opportunity to change the path of their lives. I give further detail about the background, landscape, and functioning of each center in Chapter 2.

Getting to know these girls during my research was a daunting task. I did not grow up in dire poverty. I am not a trafficking survivor. In the time I had with them, short for getting to know people deeply, I was very mindful of my own positionality as I approached my work. As a white woman from the US, I innately come to this research with my own biases, beliefs, and subjectivity. I worked hard to gain the girls trust, finding common ground of music, games, earrings, and anything that could tie us together across our vast differences. My role as a researcher made the staff at both centers somewhat nervous because to them I seemed like an auditor. At Punarnawa, they rarely have white people visit unless they are surveying the site to then make recommendations to funders. The Punarnawa and Kranti staff were at first wary to share any difficulties or issues with me because they wanted to present the centers in the most positive light possible in case my view were to impact funding for them. I worked to get to know the staff members on a personal level so they could come to trust me, to share both the

good and bad experiences of the centers, and to help me with my research instead of trying to stay separate from it.

Therapeutic Landscapes

Place has a well-established role in recovery (Curtis 2010) and is fundamentally connected to the development of individual and group identity (Duff 2011), affecting people's sense of self, belonging, and purpose (Williams 2002, Boyd et al 2008). It is an active presence, shaping interactions, habits, and the promotion of social capital (Thrift 1999, Carpiano 2006). The socio-environmental relationships formed at Kranti and Punarnawa are in many ways drastically different from one another because of how distinct each place and landscape is. Landscapes play a significant role in shaping local and regional identity (Palang & Kluwer 2003). Landscapes are concepts which emerge from the interactions between humans, society, the environment, physical environmental factors, material objects, and biological life forms (Conradson 2005). These factors shape each other; settings influence health and wellbeing, and vice versa (Fleuret and Atkinson 2007). Together, they form the landscape (Conradson 2005).

Also discussed as health geography, therapeutic landscapes encompass the relationships of health, location, place, and landscape (Gatrell 2013) to explain the connection between place and wellness (Dunkley 2009). My research addresses this dynamic, analyzing the therapeutic landscapes of each center and identifying how the landscape is impacting rehabilitation at each center. Using Kranti and Punarnawa as case studies, I outline the impact of place and landscape on care, identity, and empowerment to better understand urban and rural rehabilitation processes. These landscapes drive the ways places become "implicated in processes of healing or health enhancement such as environmental, social, and symbolic dimensions of place" (Conradson 2005). The idea of therapeutic landscapes was first discussed in Wil Gesler's 1991 *Cultural Geography of Healthcare*, suggesting cultural ecology as a new lens through which health and recovery could be examined, focusing on culture-environment interchanges. This interactive relationship provides an understanding of place and culture as it impacts health and identity through materialized discourse (Cutchin 2007).

Health geography combines wellbeing and space, examining the ways that the relationships which shape humans and who they are, are spatial and geographically embedded

(Conradson 2005). Therapeutic landscape scholars highlight the material resources, objects, and assets which tie local economic and social networks into their local community environment, as well as the social resources which support the crucial social networks that form the landscape (Duff 2012). Therapeutic landscapes have also been theorized as taskspaces (Dunkley 2009) to emphasize the activities which are constantly producing landscapes, individual understandings of landscape, and the therapeutic experience beyond simply material aspects of landscape. Therapeutic landscapes factor in community settings, imagined spaces, body movement, and power relationships (Parr 2000). Throughout the proceeding chapters of this thesis, I discuss these factors as they pertain to Punarnawa and Kranti regarding the girls' recovery, self-identity, and perceptions of their futures.

Many rehabilitation centers seek to address identity through developing girls' confidence, competence, and connections to place and people. However, these aims vary based on the people who run the centers. Some centers function primarily as shelters, aiming to provide food and housing for a large number of girls, while others, like Kranti, focus on offering just a few survivors as much help as possible. Trauma-informed care is crucial in all of these practices, at least to some extent, because kids who are targeted for trafficking prevention have all gone through traumatic experiences (Chaurasiya 2015, Awasthi 2014, Guria 2015).

Assessments of rehabilitation methods can be difficult to conduct because they are so widely different, and are further complicated by centers like Kranti that not call themselves a center for 'rehabilitation'. According to Robin Chaurasiya, the director of Kranti, "these girls do not need rehabilitation any more than you or I do. Everyone needs therapy. Some of these girls have undergone less trauma than I have, but because I am well-educated and have money, society does not think I need 'rehabilitation' like they do" (Chaurasiya 2015). Kranti staff members still agree that their girls need trauma care, a safe environment away from their previous situation, and some sort of preparation for life after Kranti – all pieces that Punarnawa identifies as necessary and also name "rehabilitation." Some of the necessary pieces of trauma-informed care are adressing the trauma-related issues, including disassociation and Post Trauatic Stress Disorder, providing a safe space, and managing the needs of traumatized individuals and the community together (HHS 2014). The staff must navigate these fields of care and respond to

the girls' affects which are quick to change as they recover, as well as minimize inadvertent retraumatization that can occur inside and outside of the home (HHS 2014).

Understanding the impact of place on identity and rehabilitation methods was my main focus while at Kranti and Punarnawa. Kranti and Punarnawa work to empower the girls, not only by providing a safe and healthy living situation for the girls, but also by providing tools for their futures. Their approaches to trauma informed care and preparation for the girls' futures were different in their interests, aims, and methods. I explore these differences to understand why they occur and how those differences are related to place. I particularly seek to understand the reasons behind their decisions in relation to where they are – What political-economic relations, cultural beliefs, and discursive structures have shaped the climate of trafficking in that region? What are the social, political, and structural components that have shaped staff members' views on trafficking and methods of rehabilitation? What has driven people to work against trafficking, and how have anti-human trafficking workers' ideals, focus, interests, and methods differed based on place and landscape?

Place, Identity, and Rehabilitation

Rehabilitation centers must find ways to help survivors re-negotiate who they are because trafficking strips them of everything they know: their home, control, and their identity. As victims of violence and rape by multiple perpetrators over extended periods of time, they experience confusion and sometimes hatred toward their bodies because their bodies are the scene of the crime (Metzker 2012). The colors, foods, smells, and comforts of home are all gone. Familial and community ties that define people through their feelings, actions, and expectations are severed through spatial disconnect. Indian girls are often taken to a place where they do not speak the local language for further isolation (Bales 2007, Awasthi 2011). Space and time are fractured due to the sudden changes in daily routines and spatial surroundings because of trafficking.

Identity is one of the most difficult psychosocial concepts to define. Authors who wrestle with identity and identity creation such as Pile and Thrift (1995) and Hall (1996) identify key features of identity such as subjectivity, experiences of the self and the body, the interactions between the self and its social and environmental landscape. Mobility, shared experience, and

existentialism also actively shape identity (Hall 1996, Tuan 1997, Simonsen 2013, Sampson 2010). At Punarnawa and Kranti, this manifests in the girls' daily routines, the ways they connect with and experience their surroundings, their perceptions of others in their environment, and the ways others perceive them. The girls struggle to find their place at the centers and in the world, seeking to understand where they belong and how to move their lives forwards.

The key issues I address in my thesis are sense of place, self-identity, and empowerment. These are often lost as a result of human trafficking and trauma (Awasthi 2011, Metzker 2012). Girls are removed from the places they know, taken away from any safety and stability they might have had, and are physically and mentally abused. Indian culture also stigmatizes trafficking, prostitution, and trauma, so the girls blame themselves, feeling dirty and shameful (Awasthi 2014). Helping girls develop a strong self-identity is empowerment in itself.

Studies on trauma recovery activities with other vulnerable populations such as immigrants (Mazumdar & Mazumdar 2012), refugees, former child soldiers (Fegley 2008), inpatient stroke victims (Nanninga et al 2014) and people suffering from psychological illnesses (Kam & Siu 2010, Adevi & Lieberg 2012) can lend insights into rehabilitation and reintegration methods and the connection these methods have to place. In India, another major vulnerable group is people of lower castes. Scheduled castes and scheduled tribes are most disadvantaged groups in India. Wide ranging economic liberalization in the early 1990s led to an overall increase in GDP and overall poverty reduction, but also a rise in inequality, widening the rural-urban gap and the gap between the urban wealthy and urban poor (Emran & Shilpi 2015). I address issues of caste, class, and rural vs. urban place because their intersectionality with gender is imperative to understanding the experience of women in India. Cultural and racialized differences impact youth in the cities of India, places which are hostile to the marginalized, even putting them at higher risk of disease (Smith 2015, Cornish et al 2012).

Gender and Trauma-Informed Care

I take a gendered political economy approach to this subject because the violence, discrimination, and abuse these girls have endured throughout their lives are based on inherently gendered structures which characterize society (Cook & Roberts 2000). From a base of gendered political economy, issues surrounding mental health and rehabilitation can be examined

within health geography in an interdisciplinary, intersectional way. Before girls can navigate care and identity development, or empowerment and prospects for future jobs, they must first deal with the recovery aspects of trauma rehabilitation. Gender causes marginalization in India and is then further compounded by issues of caste, class, and survivor status due to stigma around trafficking and mental health issues. Survivors come out of the red light districts and trafficking situations battling depression, Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder, and other mental illnesses.

Some of the basic components for maintaining mental health include improving social connections, eliminating violence and discrimination, and generating income opportunities (Kermode et al 2007). In India, these components can be extremely difficult for women to secure. Rape is the fourth most common crime in India against women (Rao & Tandon 2015). Females face discrimination in everyday life, even in the most cosmopolitan areas. At Kranti, girls frequently expressed feeling unsafe traveling through the city alone. At night, they would accompany me to buy food at a stand that was just one block away for my safety. At Punarnawa, girls are kept as far away from men as possible. The five-meter boundary wall keeps people and prying eyes out of the space. The few men who are involved in Punarnawa as guards and groundskeepers are kept separate from the girls to avoid upsetting any of the girls or making them feel uncomfortable. Staff must consider issues of PTSD, depression, and fear surrounding men which are particularly prevalent among female survivors.

Insecurity and physical threat to women is a major concern in India, with a reported increase in serious crimes against women over the last few years, according to police records (Verma et al 2016). While many rapes and attacks are still not reported or publicized, there is a rising reporting rate in tandem with rising awareness and resistance (Sullivan 2015). There are high violence rates against women in public areas (Bhattacharyya 2016, Verma et al 2016) and in private settings (Dalal & Lindqvist 2012). Particularly after the gang rape and death of a woman in Delhi in 2012, the Indian government has taken steps to acknowledge and fight prevalent gender based violence rates in public spaces (Bhattacharyya 2016). Women are not safe in public spaces, constantly subjected to various forms of objectification, mistreatment, and sexual assault. Because of the danger of public spaces, women of all income levels travel less far and less frequently than their male counterparts (Mahadevia & Advani 2016).

Public and private exposure to physical and sexual violence are extremely prevalent, and disadvantages such as caste, poverty, and low social status disproportionately affect women (Malhotra & Shah 2015, Sharma & Pathak 2015). In a study of more than 100,000 women in India from various castes, one third of all of the women reported low level physical violence at home, and physical and emotional domestic violence were found significantly higher rates in women of low castes (Dalal and Lindqvist 2012). In many Indian social traditions, discrimination is written into gender roles as it relates to marriage, subservience, education, and social and familial codes of conduct (Sharma & Pathak 2015, Watve & Raju 2015). Women and girls have much higher social expectations to live up to: how to act, how to dress, and what spaces they may occupy. Breaking these norms and standards have much higher consequences for women. Women suffer from reduced access to education (Esteve-Volart 2004), are marginalized in their access to healthcare (Haq 2008), and face job and wage discrimination (Agrawal 2014). Caste, poverty, and social status similarly impact trafficking victims. These aspects of identity leave women vulnerable to violence and crime, including trafficking. The majority of girls at Kranti and Punarnawa are either from low caste or are Muslim, and therefore similarly persecuted in highly Hindu areas.

Research Methods

My research methods follow those of Cresswell's (2013) phenomenology methodology. In 2015 I spent more than three weeks at Punarnawa and five weeks at Kranti. During this period, I conducted extensive participant observation, one-on-one semi-structured interviews, and a visual research project to grasp the individual experiences of the phenomenon of rehabilitation and then determine the common threads between them to understand the essence of the lived experience of gendered trauma care, recovery, and empowerment at the centers. To conduct participant observation, I immersed myself in each center, living, eating, and playing with the residents. I took part in daily chores such as picking food from the garden, milking cows, assisting in their in-house school programs, and shopping at the markets with staff at Punarnawa and the girls at Kranti. I spent additional time in spaces where the girls felt comfortable or felt a connection with, such as the kitchens, gardens, and lounge areas. I engaged in as many of the tasks as possible to gain rapport as well as to more deeply understand their

experience. By taking part in their activities, I was also able to initiate unstructured group interviews, starting conversations about particular activities in the center or other aspects of their experience that I could learn more about in a casual group setting. Examples of group questions I posed during participant observation include: How do you feel about the task you are doing? How often do you do this? What are your favorite activities here (in whatever space we are in)?

In the one-on-one semi-structured interviews I conducted with residents and staff members, we talk individually about their experiences at the center, their backgrounds, ideals, and futures. These were conducted during residents' free time and lasted approximately 30 minutes to one hour. Some survivors were interviewed multiple times to gain a better understanding of their experiences. Questions were open-ended and prompted responses surrounding identity issues, perceptions of change, how survivors themselves have changed, their passions, and their hopes and fears about the future. Examples of questions I asked the residents were: How do you feel about the center? What is your favorite activity here and why? Where do you go when you are feeling sad? Who do you talk to when you need support? What activities do you take part in within the center? Outside of the center? How do you feel about leaving the center? What do you hope to do when you leave?

For staff interviews, I asked questions about their backgrounds, how they came to this work, and their ideals to understand what messages are passed on to the residents and the foundations on which the residents' healing is built. In Bihar, I was also able to conduct short interviews with a local district commissioner (Bihari 2015), who is in charge of overseeing rescues and reintegration for individual districts and could talk more about the policy aspects of recovery. He was also able to share many stories of girls from his district who had graduated from Punarnawa and been reintegrated into their villages. In Mumbai, I was able to speak with two survivors who had graduated and left Kranti to work in other parts of India. These interviews gave me insight into survivors' experiences after leaving the rehabilitation centers.

I sought descriptions of experiences from individuals, finding the connections between philosophy and interpretive frameworks to understand and analyze individuals' responses to them to draw out a common experience (Cresswell 2013). I examined these groups because I sought to understand the common meaning of their shared lived experience, and found similarities and difference between these places. The residents came from different places all around India, were

different ages (8 – 22), and survived different types of trauma (sex abuse, domestic abuse), but there were common threads to their past stories and their futures. They experience the same stages of recovery within each center, so I examined the meaning they individually and collectively ascribed to their activities. Survivors gained different experiences within their centers, so what I sought was a description of the universal essence of this phenomenon. I examined what aspects were universal across the two centers and what differed, seeking to answer the difficult questions of why experiences of rehabilitation were different and what effect place had on their differences. These narrowly focused answers were then re-examined with a broader scope to understand them in the context of major issues facing female survivors in rural and urban India.

Due to their ages (8 - 22), younger participants at times had difficulty in explaining their feelings and emotions (Burke 2008, Harris et al 2014, Kaplan 2008) so I involved alternative activities to gain a sense of their experiences and emotions. Visual research incorporates tangible and interactive tasks engage young people in the process (Thompson & Hall 2008). One way to help them feel more comfortable while talking was to play with a ball, braid each other's hair, or draw with colored pencils. Another way to enhance my understanding of their current experience and hopes for the future was to conduct a painting task. Mixed media visual art projects have been conducted to understand the lived experience of children in many settings including in Calcutta brothels (Briski & Kauffman 2014), on the streets of Kampala (Young & Barrett 2000), and in inner-city Philadelphia (Kaplan 2013). Children in these studies were able to express themselves more deeply without having the language faculties to do so orally (Delgado 2015).

For my visual research painting task, residents were asked to take a piece of paper and draw a line down the middle. Then on one half, draw "your life/experience now," and on the second half draw "your life/experience in the future." These instructions were left intentionally vague to let the girls respond in any way they saw fit and retain the integrity of the results. This way it could be anything that best represents their lives now and what they hope for their futures. Drawing is another form of self-expression in which the child's response is not tied directly to physical surroundings but can express any level of imagination beyond what is immediately, tangibly possible (Leitch 2008, Moss 2008).

Responses from the interviews, participant observation, and art projects were coded, structuring the information gathered into major themes that emerged from the data, such as self-perception, safety, future hopes, and engagement in surroundings. I conducted discourse analysis (Gee 2014, Cresswell 2013) on interview transcriptions and participant observation notes, as well as later to analyze the visual art project. For my applied discourse analysis I focused on the recurring themes, ideas, and difficulties that arose in these sources (Gee 2014). The drawings were also analyzed based on content and cross-analyzed with survivors' verbal responses which they gave after drawing, explaining what they had depicted (Walker 2008). Responses ranged from hoping to be happy in five years, to having a family and taking care of the home, to starting their own businesses. Through a critical phenomenological lens, residents' and staffs' common experiences were then contextualized within the scope of localized Indian female gender identity and human trafficking.

While I approached this research looking at the ways people experience events physically and emotionally, I also must acknowledge that I can only understand their experiences through the lens of my own lived experience (Cresswell 2013, Velmans 2006, Moreira 2007). An important part of a phenomenology analysis is addressing the researcher's position and experience of the interactions to minimize subjective skew on the participants' responses. I have therefore explained my own background and positionality on the subject to "bracket" out my own experience from theirs (Cresswell 2013). That way, I can describe the "essence of the experience for the individuals" incorporating what they have experienced and how they have experienced it, having addressed and minimizing my biases (Cresswell 2013).
Finally, all names of survivors are pseudonyms for the sake of privacy and safety.

Outline of Thesis

Chapter 2: Landscapes of Rehabilitation: Resources, Economies, Ideologies

In Chapter two I discuss the concept of landscape as it pertains to each rehabilitation center and the impacts those landscapes have on rehabilitation activities. I argue that the local landscape in which a rehabilitation center is set significantly impacts the rehabilitation methods employed by staff at the centers through the economic and physical resources available to these

centers, both in the resources utilized and the resources that are absent. I also argue that socio-cultural factors of landscape, which shape the background of the staff and the girls' local prospects, drive the ways staff members design recovery and empowerment strategies to prepare the girls for life after the center. This work augments current literature on therapeutic landscapes, but in a context of trafficking survivors in India. It adds an intersectional approach by delving into the local socio-cultural landscape and the ways it affects not only the direct rehabilitation activities, but the positionalities of the staff members to understand how they develop their methods based on the socio-cultural and economic factors of landscape that affect ideals.

I begin the chapter with a depiction of daily tea rituals to show the differences between the centers' experiences of a seemingly simple task and the impacts of landscape on it. Landscapes are cultural concepts, interfaces between society and history that are imbued with history and both produce and are produced by complex power dynamics (Cosgrove 1988, 1998; Mitchell 1994, Rose 1993). Through descriptions of the centers, I set the stage for understanding what is available to each center and the decisions that staff members make as they navigate facilitation of recovery. Landscape can be understood through the economic drivers of human-environment interactions, specifically the way human labor and the drive to accrue capital affects the way humans interact with their environment as resource. Landscapes of rehabilitation, commonly discussed as therapeutic landscapes (Gesler 1992), healing places (Gesler 2003), or enabling landscapes (Duff 2011), are the connections of place with processes of healing through environmental, social, and symbolic dimensions of place, focusing on the ways people relate to their landscapes individually through a series of interactions with a socio-environmental setting (Conradson 2005). I explore the physical, economic, and ideological inputs to the centers, identifying both availability and limitations, which impact daily life, education, care, and growth.

Material inputs include the environmental resources; objects, often in the form of donations to the NGOs; and the make-up of the people, shops, and environment which surround the centers. Economic inputs are highly dependent on donations for each center, and they use their economic resources differently. Landscape impacts how they choose to use their money. Punarnawa can cut down on food costs because they have a farm to produce much of what they eat. While Kranti does not have the luxury of land, they have access to many free events and

services in Mumbai. Landscape, including economic interactions, mediates development and a sense of inclusion and purpose (Duff 2011, Williams 2002). Ideological inputs speak to the staff member's backgrounds and beliefs which drive the ways they choose to design their rehabilitation programs, as well as the beliefs and values they teach the girls. I argue that the ideological inputs are the most important because no matter what is available, the staff choose what is most important for the center. Kranti makes an extra effort to help the girls travel internationally, even though resources for such an activity are not easy to acquire, and choose to not take advantage of easily accessible items or people like local food vendors who could teach the girls a trade.

Throughout the chapter I fold in discussions of gender, trauma stigma, and caste as they are part of the local landscapes and the impacts they have on the staff and staff decisions, as well as on the girls' daily lives. Stigmatization has been widely found to increase marginalization and isolation and, particularly relating to mental health stigmas, excludes people from community life (Parr 2008). Addressing landscapes in India requires a strong attention to gender and what is available specifically to marginalized, stigmatized women. Therefore, this chapter uses a feminist lens to examine the specific rehabilitation activities the girls take part in relation to their landscapes.

Chapter 3: Divided Expectations: Negotiating Identity between Place and Therapeutic Landscapes

In this chapter, I discuss the role of place in identity constructions at Kranti and Punarnawa and the ways the centers foster a sense of place. I use a story about Aliya, a survivor from Kranti, and a small part of her journey navigating her identity between the red light district and recovery to highlight some of the main issues these girls face. The aspects of identity I highlight in their lives are caste, class, and gender. I argue that the survivors juggle the often-contradictory local societal expectations and NGO staff members' expectations to develop their own sense of identity as it is tied to their sense of place within Mumbai and Bihar, as well as their 'micro-place' of the centers. I contribute to the theoretical work on the impact of therapeutic landscapes on identity within a context of marginalization in India.

Place attachment plays a strong role in giving places meaning and influences a person's perception on the identity of a place or their understanding of a place (Shamsuddin & Ujang 2008). The built architectural environment interacts with people's social activities within it, and thus structures social relations and fosters community identity (Mazumdar et al 2000). Therefore, I discuss the physical and built landscape of the areas to understand how girls interact with the landscape and within it. To discuss identity and place, I first define place and explore these concepts in relation to identity politics in India, specifically in the factors which affect how outsiders perceive the girls based on their cultural landscape.

In this chapter I discuss gender at length in the ways it affects identity in Bihar and in Mumbai. In some cases, the girls experience similar prejudices, but these manifest in different ways and yield different social expectations for the girls. Coupled with literature on gender in rural and urban India, I tell stories of the girls' gendered experience of trafficking, trauma, and place to theorize their experiences. To help the girls reconstruct identities, the centers foster connection and a sense of place, both intentionally and inadvertently. People crave a sense of place and actively engage in place-making activities (Cresswell 2014). Place-making not only helps the girls heal mentally and emotionally, but also a way for them to learn to interact within space, through an opportunity to take control over their subjectivization and resingularize the self by self-defining who they are as individuals (Guattari 1992).

I also discuss the concept of sense of place as it impacts identity and recovery paired with place descriptions and the girls' own place descriptions of the centers. I demonstrate the ways the girls perceive the centers and the ways the staff attempt to foster place attachment among the girls. Identity development is highly dependent on the people who the girls are exposed to and their sense of place. Staff members and survivors work to create a sense of place because the sense of home created is a strong place attachment which fosters continuity and order, rootedness, and attachment, all of which impact the development of self-identity (Lewicka 2011, Case 1996, Moore 2000). I draw from studies with human trafficking victims as well as other trauma survivors who may have been through different ordeals but whose depression, PTSD, and other post-traumatic responses are comparable. People and place each have a strong role in gender-informed rehabilitation and recovery. The centers work on connections and communication with the other survivors, staff, and people from outside the centers.

Chapter 4: From Trauma to Empowerment: A Gendered Political Economy of the Future

In the final chapter, I examine the gendered political economy of the future by investigating the girls' perceptions of their futures and how they are informed by place and identity. I discuss the ways they construct their expectations, particularly in the ways place affects how they perceive their lives after graduation from the centers and reintegration into the community. I argue that place mediates the girls' perceptions of their futures through place-based economic opportunities, gender expectations, and the staff's expectations for the girls' future manifested in on-site activities. As I continue to define place, I identify major features that are connected to place and identity that shape the girls' perception of what work they will do and who they will become: gender, work, caste and trauma. This chapter adds to theory on gendered political economy in India, particularly on the effects of gender on perceptions of ability and future capacity.

Disadvantages such as caste, poverty, and low social status disproportionately affect women, increasing their vulnerability to abuse, violence, and trafficking (Malhotra & Shah 2015, Sharma & Pathak 2015). Discrimination is written into gender roles as it relates to marriage, subservience, education, and codes of conduct (Sharma & Pathak 2015, Watve & Raju 2015), but that discrimination and the gendered expectations of women socially and economically change based on location. Place is connected to the social drivers that shaped how the girls and the staff came to their perceptions of the future, so I look at place both in the larger senses of Mumbai and Bihar, as well as the "place" that is within the walls of the center to show how those are tied to each other and to perception of future.

Through a gendered political economy lens (Cook & Roberts 2000), I discuss gender in Mumbai and Bihar in more depth in this chapter, highlighting the factors which affect the girls' impressions of who they can become. A major factor of gender and gender roles in these areas relates to work, so I examine gender and work, breaking the ideas down into urban and rural work. There is a complex relationship between women, work, and status in India (Jannuzi 1974, Sugana 2006, Prasad 1979, Chakravarti 2001), and while there is more flexibility in urban work due to an increased variety in jobs and increased mobility for women, women in both locations

are still expected to operate largely in the unpaid care work economy (Chant 2013). I examine women's roles and the types of work in which women engage in rural and urban India, emphasizing the social and cultural expectations of women. In addition to gender-based discrimination, caste impacts opportunity through unequal access to education, markets, and political power (Emran & Shilpi 2015). At the centers, staff prepare the girls for these environments with income generating programs, education, and empowerment. Stories from participant observation and from resident's experiences with the programs explain the types of vocational training offered at the centers and the staff members' ideals behind what they teach. The staff impressions and beliefs are crucial because they help empower the girls through activities and lessons on who they should become.

This chapter is based on data from a visual research art project I conducted with the girls to depict their perceptions of their current lives and their futures. This is a way of imagining what they want life to be or what they think it will be, in five years. They were able to visually express their hopes and expectations for jobs, family life, and activities they wish to pursue. Drawing is a non-verbal form of self-expression in which the child's response is not tied directly to their physical surroundings but can express any level of imagination beyond what is immediately, tangibly possible (Leitch 2008, Moss 2008), allowing survivors to imagine any possible future without having to find the words to describe it. Rehabilitation is about giving girls a chance at a better future, so I explore their sense of hope by discussing what they want to do in their futures and the potential they see for themselves. My findings echo Beaman's (2012) work on youth empowerment and the impact of female leadership on girls in India – the aspirations of parents, or in my case the rehabilitation staff members, for their children greatly influenced the aspirations of the children themselves. I conclude by discussing reintegration and the ways trauma factors into their long-term experience as survivors.

Chapter 5: Conclusion

I conclude the thesis by summarizing how place affects care, rehabilitation, and empowerment. Marginalization and institutionalized discrimination are causative factors of human trafficking and also significantly influence centers' methods through helping the girls develop their identities in particular ways and pushing the girls towards specific futures that are

constantly shaped by the public expectations of survivors. Gender, caste, and class-based discrimination make certain people targets because they are seen as expendable and less valued than other people (Bales 2007, Metzker 2012, Awasthi 2014). I re-examine landscape, identity, and future perceptions focusing on the intersectionality of marginalizing factors such as caste, class, and other characteristics which I do not delve deeply into in the thesis such as race. The socio-cultural traditions in which the girls are mired inform all of the complexities of the intersections of identity for women in India (Haq 2008).

I also discuss additional factors beyond place that are defining features and drivers of girls' experiences of rehabilitation. For example, education is widely regarded as the best plan for empowering women for home work such as childcare, health, nutrition, hygiene, as well as skills for paid work participation (Mukherjee 2013), but is a luxury still not afforded to many girls in India. Education levels upon arriving to these centers changes the girls' experience of their rehabilitation and impacts their own self-identity. I discuss the limitations of my work and suggest areas of future research connected to broader implications of this research such as education, mobility, and trauma-informed care. These are, in themselves, interconnected; it is widely understood that education is imperative to empowerment, but it must also include teaching women self-worth to be empowering (Mukherjee 2013), which is where trauma-informed care methods come into play. I also discuss the limitations of these rehabilitation centers, briefly problematizing NGO interventions in India. Economic liberalization has worsened the public services situation in India, causing a lack of social services which NGOs are now trying to fill (Desai 2005). However, it is necessary to be wary of particularly international NGOs to be critical of interventions for their frequent oversimplification of the role of culture in care and rehabilitation (Kostick et al 2011).

Chapter 2

Landscapes of Rehabilitation: Resources, Economies, and Ideologies

Introduction

Early each morning, the girls at Punarnawa milk the cows and carry full metal buckets to the kitchen to make *chai*, tea. Some of the girls gather urine and dung from the cow shed for the biogas system to keep the stoves supplied with methane gas, while others harvest food from the center's garden, and another group gathers in the kitchen to cook breakfast. The fresh milk is boiled with locally grown tea; driving to Punarnawa from the airport, the car has to pass through fields of tea plantations. After cooking together under the watchful eye of Rekha, the center's cook, the girls sit down to a big breakfast and cup of chai. While this seems like just an everyday activity, the animal husbandry and cooking skills they learn are part of their rehabilitation. Amita Gaur, the head of Punarawa, born and raised in rural Bihar, gives high importance to tea time and the ritual of morning breakfast activities before beginning the day's classes.

Chai is part of the morning ritual at Kranti as well, but instead of drunk from small, individual metal cups like at Punarnawa, chai is served in a few large ceramic mugs and shared among the girls. Every day or two, one of the girls goes to the street to buy packets of milk from the *duudwala*, the milkman. Vandana, Kranti's caremother, makes breakfast and chai every morning for the girls so the girls can start Kranti School, their daily classes held within the center, right away. She boils the milk and adds tea leaves bought in bulk from the market, and distributes it during Kranti School, along with a very light breakfast. In this case, chai and food are not part of rehabilitation, but for staving off hunger during class. Food is fairly perfunctory, intended to fuel them while they go through rehabilitation, handed to them in manner typical of fast-paced, urban Mumbai. Robin Chaurasiya, the head of Kranti, chooses to have a staff member make breakfast so the girls can get right to studying in the morning with no delays. Due to each center's rehabilitation priorities and access, or lack thereof, to resources, their individual landscapes make chai-drinking a completely different experience of rehabilitation in the two locations.

Landscape of Punarnawa

15 kilometers from the nearest town, down a dirt road weaving between expanses of tea and jute farmland and small rivers, Punarnawa is located in the flood plains of Bihar that is home to the majority of India's agricultural production. While Bihar is the state with the highest population, crime rates, and poverty level in the country, you wouldn't necessarily know it from entering Punarnawa's campus. Surrounded by a four-meter-high brick wall, Punarnawa's five acre campus is an open, grassy space with a two-acre vegetable farm on one side. A small shed for the center's four cows sits by the farm. The well-manicured gardens, cared for both by the residents and a paid gardener, greet visitors with soft scents of jasmine and hibiscus, setting the scene of serenity on the campus. Clustered at the center of the campus, single-story yellow dormitories, classrooms, offices, and a kitchen house the 18 girls and seven staff members, in addition to the five staff members that commute in every day. At the center of the buildings is a large raised pavilion which is the main hub of activity at the center. The pavilion is where girls start their day with group exercises, spend time between classes, gather after school for snack and tea, and read or work on homework. It is also where they shell peas or cut okra as meal preparation.

Past the kitchen, a dirt path leads to the tool shed and garage. Tools for gardening are kept in a small room next to the shed for the tractor. Girls who choose to learn more farming as their vocational training are taught to drive it, making them some of the only women who drive tractors in Bihar. Just past the tractor is the garage for the big red SUV that was donated by members of Rotary International, a global service organization, who have supported Punarnawa by donating the cows and shed, solar panels to heat water, a water filter, and the pavilion. The car is used to pick up visitors, food from the market, and even to bring the doctor in. Importantly, it acts as an emergency vehicle to take girls to the hospital or doctor because the doctor only comes once a month.

Landscape of Kranti

The second center, an NGO called Kranti, does similar work but in a very different environment. Kranti is located at the corner of a major intersection in the cosmopolitan megacity

of Mumbai in the state of Maharashtra. One of the most densely populated cities in the world, more than 22 million residents were living in Mumbai in 2015 (IOP 2015). Their home is found down a narrow walkway off a street jam-packed with vehicles, people, and street-food vendors. Off the main busy road, down a narrow alleyway, turning left at the field that doubles as a trash dump, Kranti is in a row of factories where tailors, cloth manufacturers, and wood-workers reside. Kranti's three-story house has a metal-barred front with a space between the metal front and the cement walls, just enough for an overflowing shoe rack and the metal spiral staircase that leads up to each floor. That staircases and outer area is still outside so precarious in the rain. At the top of the stairs on the third floor there is a small covered porch. The doors to each floor are almost always left open to the narrow but long rooms inside. Because each floor consists of mainly one room, each floor is left fairly empty for its many purposes.

In their three-story refurbished cloth factory, Kranti conducts a care and empowerment program for its residents, 13 teenage girls and four on-site staff members. When I first arrived, Kranti had just recently moved into its current location in Vakola, Mumbai, so it was quite messy and chaotic, with lots of cats wandering in and out, boxes everywhere, laundry hung all over the spiral staircase out front, and girls digging through the piles of suitcases they were still living out of. However, by the end of my five weeks in residence, the first floor was free of dust with a fresh coat of paint, the second had lots of shelves that the girls were starting to move their clothes onto, and the third floor was clear of all of the many bolts of cloth that had been left there by the previous owners.

Landscape

Landscapes are cultural concepts, interfaces between society and history that are imbued with history and both produce and are produced by complex power dynamics (Cosgrove 1988, 1998; Mitchell 1994, Rose 1993). Landscapes are ideologically-charged and rooted in modernization and the outward expansion and internal reorganization of European cities (Cosgrove 1998). There was an economically driven shift in how people were looking at society and economy with new approaches to production and land, following capitalist values of maximizing the surplus value of human labor and resources (Harvey 1990b, 2005; Mitchell 1994). Landscape can be understood through the economic drivers of human-environment

interactions, specifically the way human labor and the drive to accrue capital affects the way humans interact with their environment as resource. Landscapes of rehabilitation, commonly discussed as therapeutic landscapes (Gesler 1992), healing places (Gesler 2003), or enabling landscapes (Duff 2011), are the connections of place with processes of healing through environmental, social, and symbolic dimensions of place, focusing on the ways people relate to their landscapes individually through a series of interactions with a socio-environmental setting (Conradson 2005). Researchers studying therapeutic landscapes highlight the importance of healthy environments for recovery which then contribute to strong sense of place within the recipients of care (Woodgate & Skarlato 2015).

In this chapter I examine Punarnawa's and Kranti's resources, limiting factors, and ideals, and how they are affected by their local landscapes. Scholars researching enabling places have identified that these therapeutic landscapes include enabling resources, such as social, affective, and material resources (Duff 2011). In looking at care, rehabilitation, and empowerment, a major variation between centers is their inputs and what is possible to provide for the girls. These economically-driven and ideologically-charged spaces impact the process of rehabilitation in what they provide for staff and survivors and in what is not available that limits or alters rehabilitation practices. The major resource inputs I have identified are the physical items that are needed for eating, learning, and maintaining a center, as well as human resources who can support or enhance care, recovery, and empowerment. On the other side of that are the limiting factors, things which the staff or residents may need or want but are unavailable for a wide variety of reasons. In this chapter I argue that the local landscape in which a rehabilitation center is set significantly impacts the rehabilitation methods employed by staff at the centers through the economic and physical resources available to these centers, both in the resources utilized and the resources that were absent.

In addition, landscape can be examined for their impact on human interactions and power dynamics. Cosgrove (1998) identifies major pieces of the history of landscape within the period of agricultural transform, industrial production, and urban development in Europe. These changes brought about an urban hierarchy and specialized agriculture, causing different spaces to become more specialized. To do so, there was significant alteration of land and thus a development of landscape that had a significantly exploitative nature, embedding those

hierarchies among people as well as between people and the environment in these budding landscapes. Other discussions of the power relations embedded within landscapes acknowledge the erasures which landscape enact, enforcing gender and socio-economic hierarchies through reduction of agency or visibility (Rose 2012, Sturken and Cartwright 2009). I examine the broader local landscape as well as the micro-landscapes within the center because ethnographic research focusing on micro-spaces can be useful tool of investigation to give insight into larger landscapes (Parr 2000).

Therefore, I also argue that socio-cultural factors of landscape, which shape the background of the staff and the girls' local prospects, drive the ways staff members design recovery and empowerment strategies to prepare the girls for life after the center. I found that these ideological factors were the most important inputs, because they dictated which available resources were used, which available resources were ignored, and which resources, that were not available, were given more effort to seek out. In the chai story, both centers drink tea daily, but in Bihar, it will be imperative for the girls to be able to make breakfast for their families in the mornings once they leave the center, so they must learn this daily ritual. It is part of both training, as well as therapy at the center, involving themselves in growing their food and preparing food and chai to support the whole center. At Kranti, Robin has structured the activity to teach girls, consciously or unconsciously, that they do not have to be domestic. After they leave Kranti when they are working in Mumbai, they will likely pick up breakfast from one of the dozens of food vendors on the street along the way to work. This structure came not from the relationship to physical resources, but came from Robin's background and ideals, that the girls need to focus on learning in a modern classroom setting, preparing for non-agricultural, non-domestic livelihoods.

Analyzing each center within its specific landscape engages them with the local resources, histories, economies, and ideologies that shape the centers. I then discuss the physical, monetary, and ideological inputs and limiting factors to these centers to better understand how these centers function and gain a connection between rehabilitation and landscape. These connections can lend insight into understanding place and gendered trauma rehabilitation as well as ways to improve or enhance rehabilitation and care techniques. As I discuss the ideological inputs, I will focus on the ways local culture impacts the ideals of staff

and survivors. I critically analyze how the staff came to their ideals based on their own backgrounds and local culture in response to their understanding of the environment of human-trafficking and the sex trade. To do so I will also discuss navigating landscapes and some of the obstacles these centers must overcome.

Physical, Economic, and Ideological Resources

These centers can be analyzed within the larger landscapes of their regions, but the micro-landscape of the centers themselves are very telling about inputs and limitations. Landscapes orders human interactions, identifying the ways different spaces define how to act, interact with others, and really, who to be (Cosgrove 1988). In this line of thinking, we live in a rationally ordered, carefully designed world, within which specific structures and mechanisms are legible to humans as they prescribe how we are to alter and improve the environment for our benefit. Societies interpret the ways in which landscapes communicate specific sets of values that individuals are expected to follow and comply with, creating delineations between people who obey these to differing degrees. Of course on the other side of these separations, there are implicitly unities. There are factors that tie people to regions as an undivided entity, a group of individuals who perhaps relate to the region in a specific way or to similar ends, which I will examine through the inputs and limitations of these centers. Methods which incorporate the local landscape, be it geography and/or culture, hold value within local communities and are beneficial to the cohesion of people in therapy with the local community (Serbulea & Payyappallimana 2012).

Through this section I outline the inputs and limitations for each center individually and discuss the place-based activities that are associated. From my research I found that the three most important categories of inputs and limitations were physical, economic, and ideological. Ideals are perhaps the most important because they drive how people use physical and economic resources, and even which resources people choose. This is not a deterministic argument, but one of how place, the local culture, history, and environment, shape the resources for rehabilitation. This extends to the outcomes of rehabilitation.

Physical Resources and Limitations: Kranti

The first floor of Kranti is a space for staff and newly an event space which they hope to rent out. The front, main space was turned into a pop-up loft, a short-term rentable open space that they were hoping could cater to events, talks, or schools. A deaf school that soon needed to leave their school building was considering renting the space from Kranti for the afternoons, which would have been particularly beneficial to Kranti because one of the girls attends that school which right now is far from their section of Mumbai. For their grand opening of the space, named Vakoloft, Robin and Melissa invited their friends from many different sectors in Mumbai to come see the space and give ideas. People who came were journalists, videographers, artists, consultants, small business owners, and activists. An enabling place such as Kranti facilitates access to resources, including social resources (Duff 2011), promoting social capital (Carpiano 2006), and supporting the creation and maintenance of social networks (Duff 2012). Place actively shapes habits and interactions, designing peoples' interactions within (Thrift 1999). Vakoloft, which is still new enough that no concrete plans have been made for it, has the potential to impact the girls' rehabilitation through bringing revenue into the center and also bringing new people and ideas to teach the girls.

Stepping outside Kranti's front gate onto the narrow walkway behind the row of buildings, the acrid smell of smoke emanates from the burning trash mountain next to their back garden. Wealthy people in the city can give their trash to their house workers, who bring it to the dump, but Kranti residents cannot get away from it. However, their location keeps the rent reasonably low, at least for Mumbai, where real-estate is relatively expensive. Between the trash mound and Kranti's front gate, men sit on the low walls surrounding their junk-filled back garden under the pretenses of sitting outside of the factories next door. They blatantly stare in through the open side of Kranti's building at the girls. Gender-based violence is rampant in India and permeates both private and public spaces (Bhattacharyya 2016). Cases of insult and outrage to the modesty of women, objectification, mistreatment, and even assault and rape are extremely common (Bhattacharyya 2016), and certainly are more common in poorer and more dangerous areas where women are more marginalized, where there is less police activity, and where streets are more crowded. Walking around the corner from Kranti through the narrow alley, big rats run across your feet on the dirty street. Out front is a lively street jam-packed with

people, lined with open sewage, inexpensive food carts and vegetable sellers. Anything the girls needed, from phone sim cards, to throat lozenges, to art supplies, could be found within a five minute walk from their house.

When it comes to supplies and materials at Kranti, they rely heavily on donations and their network of friends and donors to provide these. They get the majority of their clothes and books through donations, but there is a lot of fighting over other important supplies that are less commonly donated like their one pair of scissors and, even worse, the single mirror in the house. When the girls have to share something like scissors, it reduces the number of girls who can participate in art projects at any one time, like when we were making rugs out of bolts of fabric. At the beginning when we had to cut the fabric into many strips, only one girl could cut with one or two others holding the fabric. The rest of the girls stood on the side becoming bored and restless. Limited access to resources can sometimes encourage creativity of ways to get more people engaged in an activity with only one pair of scissors or how to invent new ways to do certain jobs, but it also can make girls leave each other out and cause arguments.

Fighting over items and space makes hierarchies develop in the house. The girls argue for time with the scissors and who will get them first, or worse, at the line to the one bathroom they have regular access to. They lose time waiting for their turn, and, especially when girls are trying to get out the door to school, tempers run high and tears are frequent. Social stressors such as crime, poverty, and poor sanitation impact social cohesion and increases mental health problems such as depression and perceived powerlessness (Greif & Dodoo 2015). Poverty has also been described as a predisposing factor contributing to vulnerability to trafficking, especially as poverty interacts with gender-based mistreatment (Silverman et al 2007). Girls who are more dominant jump the line and bully other girls into giving them more food, the mirror, or whatever it is they want. They leave people out, such as Meena, who is deaf, in the line to the bathroom, because the other girls pretend they do not understand what she is signing to them when she tells them she was next in line. This constant bickering is bad for morale in the house, and causes longer-term grudges to build up.

The girls bickered over taking turns with the mirror constantly. For instance, when Aliya put make-up on, Purnima would frequently push her out of the way saying that she had to leave first so she should get first dibs. When she then got up for just a minute to go to the sink to wet

her hair, Shreya had already taken the mirror downstairs where she wanted to use it. On Friday evenings when the girls would get dressed up and go out with friends, the mirror would go up and down the stairs between all three floors because the girls wanted to use it in their space, whether that be next to their clothes they were putting on, next to the bathroom, in the staff room, etc. In fact they moved it and took it from each other so much they ended up breaking it. Ownership is incredibly important to these girls' identity and is tied to place. Effective therapeutic landscapes elevate people's sense of personal satisfaction and self-efficacy (Cattell et al 2008), and facilitate a greater sense of belonging and personal meaning through attachment to the physical and material space (Boyd et al 2008). The way the girls attached the desire of looking in the mirror to particular spaces and refused to do it differently was interesting in how it seemed to tie into a sense of place and where they felt the mirror should be used.

Physical Resources and Limitations: Punarnawa

In their rural setting, the most basic of resources, water, shelter, and food, are plenty. They have a pump that draws fresh water and have the generous donation of a filter for extra health protection. They have the benefit of fresh, locally grown food that is healthy and home-cooked. They are able to grow their own food because they have lots of space. Research on rehabilitation for patients with depression and PTSD has shown that open space and being in nature are helpful for recovery and reducing stress (Adevi & Lieberg 2012, Kam and Siu 2010). "Natural environments and gardens offer positive stimulation of emotional, cognitive, and physical functions" (Adevi & Lieberg 2012, pg. 51). The peace and serenity the girls gain from the gardens and having open space to think and process is a major strength of Punarnawa's. While far away from their homes and communities, they get a break from the pressures of life to focus on healing, growth and learning. This is only made possible by place and the location of the ashram.

The girls at Punarnawa grow the majority of their own food on the farm under the care of a teacher who comes to the center four times a week for vocational training. In addition, the girls spend time on the farm in the afternoons after school. The girls grow anything they want in their own plots, and in the shared sections they all worked to grow vegetables and one staple crop for the center, such as lentils or potatoes. However, while I was there, they had not been farming for

the past few months. At the end of April, Bihar suffered a massive cyclone that destroyed almost 1.5 million hectares of agricultural crops affecting two million farmers in the state (Damodaran 2015). This drastically impacted the economy because Bihar's primary industry is farming. Many towns were completely leveled, and others sustained serious damages to buildings and farm fields. Three days later, they also felt the earthquake that hit Nepal. "We were so scared to even go outside. We felt six of the aftershocks here. Having all of those after the cyclone, we just didn't know when the world would stabilize again. I miss being on the farm." said Kavita, one of the girls who had previously worked on the farm. She had her own plot on the farm, in addition to helping on the bigger shared section, but no one was working out in the farm for a long time after that.

The crops at Punarnawa were destroyed as well, and many parts of the surrounding wall were knocked over, leaving the girls vulnerable to outsiders. While I was there, the guard apprehended multiple people allegedly just passing through, along with several goats and dogs. Even when the girls were ready to begin farming again, they could not because their farm teacher became very sick so was not able to teach. He had not returned by September, when I was there, and the staff did not know when he would return. Because the boundary wall had been damaged in the storm, the girls could not even continue on their own because they could not be in the fields by themselves, so far from the main buildings and so close to the holes in the wall. So, for the meantime, the girls harvest from the few leftover squash and okra plants nearest to the buildings and from the small garden beds that hold mint for chutney and small peppers for seasoning.

Food and meal preparation are major parts of the day for the girls. Due to their inability to farm, staff members have been buying all of the fruits and vegetables they need from the market, along with staples like flour, sugar, and tea. They are able to produce milk from their cows, providing enough to cook with and serve tea – *masala chai* – at least three times a day. The girls were also offered warm milk before bed while watching their evening soap operas. All of the girls take turns working in the kitchen, helping the full-time cook who also lives on the premises. The kitchen is small and dimly-lit, but always bubbling over with people and laughter. Girls have kitchen duty on rotation, but even if they are not working, they are frequently there chatting, lending a hand, or even just sitting quietly, listening to the chopping and simmering of

constant cooking. Cooking is a way girls help produce healthy space within the center and gain agency over their space (Dyck & Dossa 2007). Some girls like Asha and Priya spend more time in the kitchen because they are better cooks and enjoy it more than others do. Even the youngest at eight years old is taught how to flip the *chapati* in the open flames and hold the large upright knife between her feet to cut beans, greens, and onions.

Place drives what is available and thus the activities of the centers. Punarnawa cannot teach the girls how to ride the train by themselves because there is not a train anywhere nearby. Kranti's gardening program is nonexistent, because even though they want one, they have no space to grow it. They therefore play to their strengths and try their best to work around limitations. Therapeutic places offer a controlled space where staff can promote changes in behaviors (Dunkley 2009). The physical limitations within the centers are driven by place and, also significantly, by money. In many situations these centers may have ways to access other goods but do not have the financial means to do so.

Economic Resources and Limitations: Kranti

Staff and residents at Kranti will tell you that right now, their greatest limitation is money. They have many more ideas of how to improve and change their program than they have money to enact those dreams. The girls used to get a small weekly allowance for snacks or whatever they wanted, but Robin says they are not getting that now because they do not have the extra money for it. As discussed in the last section, this also impacts their supplies and material needs. Kranti struggles for money, but for how new the organization is, started in 2009, they do pull in an impressive quantity of donations and press both locally and internationally. They just started a new money-making initiative with Vakoloft on the first floor. This will help provide income outside of dependence on donations.

With the money they do pull in, they are barely able to pay the rent on their three story row house and keep food on the table. They do however make psychologist visits an imperative expense – every girl and staff member gets therapy sessions weekly or even more often if they are having a hard time. While they get a discount this is still quite expensive, but according to Robin, a non-negotiable priority. The paradox is that while they cannot afford food, they still send the girls around the world to camps, leadership conferences, Semester at Sea, and even

university. They take trips as a group, trekking in Nepal and touring around the US. This is only possible, however, because these trips – tuitions, plane tickets, etc. – are donated. People do not donate the money for a trip to the US, but airlines give them free tickets, hotels give them free rooms, and universities give the girls full scholarship for attendance. Where they can, they also have local friends take them in and give them food while traveling. As NGOs it can be very difficult to get people to donate to everyday living costs – most donors want to give money to projects or donate tangible items more than sending a check for daily groceries.

While Kranti does not have much money for extra staff or supplies, living in Mumbai means they have access to social capital: people, ideas, and opportunities that are free of charge. Girls can take public transportation for little to no cost and have access to free museums, rallies, NGOs, and libraries. Even though public transportation takes longer, they have plenty of time, and Robin says that it is better to use their time than money. "Kranti fights every day to make sure that our girls have access to the same opportunities as everyone else" says Robin. This goal drives them to make engagement with the city possible so that the girls can engage in every activity they can dream up. One of the Kranti girls is deaf, but is able to go to a deaf school and have her own tutor come to the house to teach her to sign, read and write. When girls hear about a gay pride parade in the neighboring state or a communication workshop in another city, Kranti staff finds a way to cover the transportation and entrance fees to make these opportunities realities for the girls.

Because they are surrounded by people and possibilities, the girls regularly take theater classes, art, dance, music, and drawing lessons. They stay up-to-date with the ever-changing face of Mumbai by attending events like Q Fest, an LGBTQ event nearby, and to a religious tolerance march. Social capital is significant to broadening recovery beyond a single care center (Villavonga-Olives & Kawachi 2015). Mumbai offers a landscape impacted by its cosmopolitan residents who infuse the scene with a wide variety of beliefs. Robin aims to help the girls engage with as many of these local people and ideas as possible, but also says it is just as important to travel to learn about other places and broaden the girls' perspectives.

The girls are supposed to move out of the house once they are financially stable on their own or at least living with friends or host families who provide their housing and food. They leave around 21 or 22 years old, but Robin acknowledges that the girls need to leave at different

times, respecting when they are ready or not. Robin says she wants to "give the kids chances that typical American teens have – if that means they fall on their faces, that's their right too" (2015). Some of the girls have expressed though that more graduated girls have 'fallen on their faces' than they would like. At Kranti, the staff take care of providing food, paying for the building, organizing the girls' activities, etc., so many of the girls do not know how to do those practical, life-building requirements once they are out on their own. Because Robin is their point person for anything that goes wrong, they struggle to fix many of their own problems and have difficulties interacting with other adults who could help them.

Economic Resources and Limitations: Punarnawa

When driving into Punarnawa, the first thing to see is the big sign above the metal gate that says "Punarnawa" and below that, Free the Slaves. Punarnawa is run by Free the Slaves, an international organization working to eliminate slavery in countries where human trafficking is rampant. The current director of Punarnawa was hired by Free the Slaves from a nearby village, and she in turn hires the other appointments. Punarnawa gets the majority of its funding through Free the Slaves' domestic and international fundraising. They are a well-known and trusted organization that works in tandem with other service and charity organizations to raise money, as well as organize project-by-project funding. This means that the center has enough money to pay the salaries of a large staff, get all of the supplies they need, and even to buy sweets on holidays or special occasions. They benefit from a large gazebo in the center of the campus, a drinking-water filtration system, and three cows which provide milk and dung for their bio-gas system thanks to project-specific donations from outside sources.

Once through the gate, the center's friendly "guard" dog can usually be found on the porch of the guest rooms the campus has for visitors. Their large campus takes care and maintenance, which the center affords through Free the Slaves' financial help. Next to the guest house is the office where the director, Amita Gaur, has her desk, along with the caseworker, who is in charge of the girls' legal cases and now in charge of counseling; the reintegration officer, who does family visits and determines where the girls will live and work after reintegration; and the accountant, who also teaches one of the girls computer lessons. Together with one teacher, a care mother, the cook, the caretaker, two guards, a maintenance man, a gardener, and the

livestock teacher, they maintain Punarnawa and care for the girls. Being able to afford all of these care-givers has a huge impact on the amount of attention each girl gets from adults, the number of new people and ideas they are exposed to, and activities they are able to do within the center, all of which play a role in rehabilitation.

Free the Slaves is a well-established, long-standing, international organization with significant local and international donations so they are able to provide plenty of staff as well as plenty of supplies. The girls who practice sewing leave the center with a USHA sewing accomplishment certification and materials including a sewing machine to start their own practice outside. Girls can also earn money from sewing projects they do while at Punarnawa, giving them their own income while in the center and also a sense of agency and pride. Girls who studied farming and have land at home may be given a cow with the help of the Trafficking in Persons project.

Ideological Inputs and Limitations

The staff are the main people in charge of facilitating postive changes for the girls, and the choices they make for best practices are informed by their own backgrounds and ideals. The residents' backgrounds and ideals also factor into what they will put into and get out of their time at these centers. These backgrounds and ideals are crucial resources for the center because no matter how much money, space, or activities the centers have, the ideals of the staff will overrule what resources will go into rehabilitation and caring for the girls. For example at Kranti, they could easily afford a sewing machine and the girls could learn tailoring like the girls at Punarnawa, but Robin will not allow a sewing machine in the house because she believes the girls should not be learning traditional vocational training like many centers because those vocations support the gendered social hierarchy they are trying to escape. Therefore, I talked to the staff at each center to identify which components of rehabilitation they do believe in and strive to provide.

Before I do that, I must briefly discuss rehabilitation and the discourse within India surrounding trauma victims to contextualize the staff members' ideals. Centers are responding to this crisis of trauma and trafficking and seeking answers to these problems, so we must first briefly look at the issue they are trying to address to later understand how and why they do what

they do. Victims undergo a wide variety of traumas and come to the rehabilitation centers with a variety of issues they need to work through (Metzker 2012). Within literature on addressing mental health, the best methods for prevention and stability are enhancing social unity, minimizing discrimination and violence, and offering ways to earn an income (Kermode et al 2007). These are difficult to address in rehabilitation owing to the magnitude of these problems, particularly toward women (Watve & Raju 2015). Discrimination and violence against women are rampant in India, and something the girls at Kranti and Punarnawa will still have to deal with once they have left the centers because it is so prevalent and widely socially accepted (Watve and Raju 2015, Rao & Tandon 2015, Malhotra & Shah 2015). I will go into more detail regarding gender discrimination in chapter three on Gender in India.

Ideals at Kranti

Robin Chaurasiya, the woman who started Kranti, grew up in Seattle, Washington in a fairly wealthy family but in an unhealthy home-life with an abusive father and mentally ill mother. After being kicked out of the military because she was gay, she became a human rights activist, speaking about her experience and advocating against "Don't Ask Don't Tell." Robin's family is Hindu and is Other Backward Caste, one of the lowest castes that is considered to be disadvantaged socially and educationally (Srinivasan et al 2015). While Robin grew up with some privileges, she also intimately understands prejudice. She leads by example for the girls at Kranti, who have also been racial minorities, grown up in abusive households, and experienced social prejudices because they are the daughters of sex workers.

One of the major ideals that Robin passes along is the importance of mental health, particularly in the methods she encourages for improving it. According to Robin, mental health care cannot entail only counseling, but the girls also need to learn how to work through problems, express themselves, and create a network of support. To her, empowerment can go one of three ways: you can empower girls to just live independent lives, to live decent lives, or you can transform their lives. She says that 'typical' Americans teenagers are not limited to working or learning a trade, but instead can take their time in exploring their interests and talents. At Kranti, staff members encourage the girls to grow up strong, smart, and able to express themselves. Therefore in Kranti School, they not only talk directly about mental health, but also

about their common issues such as prostitution, rape, and gender discrimination in India. I will talk more about Kranti School in the section below on Education. Other activities Robin encourages them to do is art, dance, and music to express themselves and learn creativity. The girls also do many team-building exercise to build trust and supportive relationships.

Ideals at Punarnawa

Nisa Das, the main teacher at Punarnawa, plays a major role in shaping the emotional and interactional landscape at Punarawa. She is motherly but stern and keeps her classes in quiet order. Even though she is the only teacher, she is very engaged in class all day long. The classes are separated into three levels, attempting to cater to a wide range of educational backgrounds. Even within the separate sections, everyone is still at extremely different levels of knowledge and ability so Nisa has to come up with different projects for each individual student to meet them where they are. She gives them a lot of individualized attention which can be difficult to balance with so many girls. There used to be another teacher to share some of the burden with her, but she was only part time at Punarnawa and her other job moved her to a different district. She does get help from Rakesh Dubey, the accountant and computer teacher, with discussing ideas for improving lessons.

The staff at Punarnawa decide the vocational training activities based on what they believe will be most lucrative for the girls after reintegration. Farming, sewing, and beautician teachers are normally at Punarnawa, although the farming and beautician teachers did not come while I was there. Vocational training is important to girls in developing a sense of belonging because their future jobs involve them in their landscape. Landscape, including economic interactions, mediates development and a sense of inclusion and purpose (Duff 2011, Williams 2002). The girls have the benefit of various vocational trainers as well as their teacher and many other staff members. Staff members do not encourage the girls to start an NGO or become entrepreneurs like staff do at Kranti, because that is not seen to be a viable choice for a rural woman to make money. The girls were allowed to choose their vocational training focus and sewing was the most popular training at Punarnawa. When I asked the staff which vocation they felt was the best choice for the girls, they all said sewing, as did the local Trafficking in Persons District Coordinators I interviewed. The girls parroted the influential adults in their life, saying

sewing would be most helpful for them to help them earn money but while still being able to stay in the home and take care of a family.

Local Culture Landscape Impacts on Ideals

Staff members' ideals affect how they see human trafficking, why it happens, how to fix it, and what is available to help them accomplish change. Ideals determine whether staff members interpret certain inputs like religion, sewing machines, or self-dependence as positive or negative. They determine whether these girls are seen as victims, prostitutes, survivors, trash, outcasts, or people. It is important to critically analyze how the staff came to their ideals from their landscapes: based on their own backgrounds and local culture in response to their understanding of the environment of human-trafficking and the sex trade. Landscapes help to shape local and regional identities (Palang & Kluwer 2003). Conradson (2005) discusses how humans internalize their experiences, which are geographically embedded, folding these events and spaces into their selves. Therefore, these spaces and the experiences girls have within can carry through to have effects beyond the immediate occurrence, shaping the self through interactions with localized norms and expectations (Conradson 2005).

While doing her research in India on rehabilitation centers and victimhood discourses, Robin Chaurasiya found that other centers did little to no work on mental health. Even the staff members at Kranti have weekly therapy appointments. They are lucky to be in Mumbai and have access to educated, accredited therapists, unlike in rural Bihar where they cannot find a therapist to work there because people with higher education leave Bihar for school and have little incentive to come back. Kranti advocates for community-based and community-engaged rehabilitation because of the benefits of socio-spatial networking in the community (Pinfold 2000). Robin says that her girls do not need to be rehabilitated any more than anyone else in the world does, and that she thinks everyone should see a therapist. Kranti is as much for Robin and the staff to get care and self-improvement as for the girls. Many of the staff members have backgrounds that drove them to Kranti to heal themselves, providing people spaces to heal. They all do meditation together every morning before school, though often only one staff member is present. Robin studies Buddhism and particularly draws from mindfulness and

meditation to care for and teach the girls. Meditation is only one of many activities in which the girls engage to assist in mental health care.

While at Kranti, Robin deals with her own trauma and mental health problems, and is very open and frank with the girls and the public about her personal life. She works to inspire the girls at Kranti, destigmatizing trauma and mental health problems, as well as destigmatizing seeking help. Stigmatization has been widely found to increase marginalization and isolation and, particularly regarding mental health, excludes people from community life (Parr 2008). It further negatively impacts mental health and, because people do not talk about their problems as a result of the stigma, they lose the opportunity for education and discussion on prevention and care (Chin et al 2008). Group trauma and abuse intervention have been found effective in decreasing trauma symptoms (Ward & Roe-Sepowitz 2009), showing that women greatly benefit from spaces where they can process their trauma instead of hiding it (Stamm et al 2002). And, it also means that mental health needs are often not met because of social stigma (Suresh et al 2009). The girls from the red light districts can relate to Robin and her experience with "Don't Ask Don't Tell" because they too are asked to hide their lives, asked to move on from their problems, and interact in society with a "Don't Ask Don't Tell" policy about their lives and their mothers. All of the girls at Kranti see therapists once a week, and mental health is a common topic of discussion in Kranti School. Robin got her BA in psychology and her MA in gender studies, both of which permeate her work and her dedication to mental health.

Another staff member at Kranti is Zarna Jain, the main teacher at Kranti School. She is a volunteer who comes in for three to four hours in the morning to teach their lessons after meditation. They start with a warm up – some sort of brain teaser exercise like Sudoku puzzles, logic puzzles, or creativity games. Then they have a different theme for each day of the week for lessons: Math Monday, TEDTalk Tuesday, World Wednesday (for current events and geography), Theme Thursday (for visitors to come in and speak on particular topics) and Field Trip Friday. Zarna has put her own spin on the lesson plans, but they were written originally when Kranti started by Robin's wife at the time, Katie. Katie wrote the lessons with empowerment and mental health at the forefront. She wanted the girls to have activities that would help them face their issues head on and not avoid tough issues like abuse, family problems, poverty, prostitution, and inequality.

Zarna is wealthy enough that she is able to donate her time to Kranti. She teaches in the afternoon at another school to make it possible to come to Kranti daily. While Zarna did not go through the same childhood traumas that the girls did, she is still very open and supportive, and does not look at the girls differently because of their mothers' work. She says that the most important lesson for the girls to learn is to open their minds and deal with their issues head on. She tries to provide a safe space for the girls to think through their issues in a safe classroom space and to facilitate thinking in a broader way about their issues, rather than repressing their problems because they are not socially acceptable. She does not want them to just narrowly look at problems with anger so they aim to look at issues from other angles and step back to gain more clarity. The girls are also able to support each other in these lessons because they acknowledge in group that these things happened and they are things the girls have in common. As an institution, Kranti has the ability to affect change locally by teaching these girls counter-culture ideals. Institutions affect wider value-based and tradition-focused discourse, and thus by teaching the girls differently, they have the ability to challenge the prevailing social structures and societal norms of their local community (Chin et al 2008).

Teachers have a similarly impactful role at Punarnawa. Nisa, the teacher, lives at Punarnawa. She moved there from her nearby, similarly poor village. Her husband has moved away to the city in search of work, so she moved into Punarnawa two years ago with her newborn son. It is common in Bihar that men leave the state to make money for their families because the state has a large population, little access to education, and virtually no industries outside of farming (Nair 2015, Maharatna 2003). Now two years later, her son Ani is an adorable, trouble-making toddler with twenty aunties to play with all of the time. In a place where acting out of the ordinary or changing the routine is frowned upon, Ani is a breath of fresh air, constantly bringing his silly, curious, enthusiastic two-year-old perspective to an ordinary day. With him, the girls get a break from their problems and can just kick a soccer ball around with a giggling little boy who loves to make mischief but also to just snuggle on someone's lap. He is a great comfort and source of hope, according to many of the survivors. The girls learn childcare skills and observe healthy parenting with him and with Punarnawa's other baby, the six-month-old son of one of the survivors. Women in Bihar are incredibly dependent on the

family structure for social and economic security; childcare almost entirely falls to them (Jackson & Chattopadhyay 2000).

Another staff member at Punarnawa is Deepshika, the center's caseworker, acting counselor, and part-time teacher. She helps teach a Saturday class once every two months or so about women's' health, rights, and nutrition. Nutrition is especially important in this context because the girls are all nutrient deficient when they arrive. While enslaved, the girls do not get enough food. Even when they arrive, they do not eat much for the first few weeks, partially from the trauma and partially from the medications they are given upon arrival. Their other lessons on women's rights and health are special because few people from that area would ever get that sort of education. However, they are not nearly as progressive as Kranti and do not speak as openly. Even though this institution is freer than the surrounding village and they are not explicitly enforcing social norms with the intent of supporting the local social or gender structures (Chin et al 2008), those norms seep into daily education at the center.

The first time I met with Deepshika in her office, I asked for some of the back stories of a few of the girls. I was looking for just a page of background, but when she opened up her cabinets, my jaw dropped at the sheer volume of paper inside. Every girl's file, even those who had not been at Punarnawa for very long, was massive. Intake forms, back stories, medical records, legal records, notes from their teacher on how they are doing in their classes, the files went on and on. In addition to her caseworker duties, she is the acting counselor at Punarnawa right now. As I have mentioned before, counselors are extremely difficult to find and keep in rural Bihar because anyone who has the means to get educated usually goes to school outside of the state for a better education and works elsewhere for better pay (Nair 2015, Maharatna 2003). As it is, Deepshika's legal work for the girls is more than a full time job.

As a result of government and police corruption in addition to the societal stigma towards victims of trafficking, pressing legal charges against traffickers is extremely difficult. At Punarnawa staff work hard to help the girls to be willing to testify against their traffickers. Deepshika acknowledges that it can be extremely taxing to re-live trauma and girls fear the backlash against them and their families by the traffickers or their accomplices. Then ,even when they have girls to testify, it can be difficult to find other proof to support their word. The courts are often corrupt, so Deepshika says that she has to make sure all of her paperwork, the

full case, is impeccably done. Bribes are common and the traffickers are often wealthy. Traffickers also often retain a high standing in society so police, lawyers, and judges do not want to cross them (Bales 2007, Awasthi 2014, Metzker 2012). One of the local District Coordinators, Bipin Bihari, with whom Punarnawa works said that the trials are not often given importance within the courts, so they are slowed down and dragged out. Finally, if the trafficker is charged, it is hard to make sure justice is carried out. It is too often that they are left alone, without paying a fine or spending any time in prison even if they were sentenced.

As girls prepare to graduate from Punarnawa, Deepshika and the reintegration officer, Pradeep, aim to provide the girls with everything they can to ensure their wellbeing upon reintegration. Their role is crucial because there are many national and state benefits that the girls are legally entitled to, but without people to fight for those benefits for them, they would not likely get them, let alone know about them without help (Bales 2004, Bales 2007, Metzker 2012). As I learned from the Punarnawa staff and District Coordinator Bihari, they help the girls gain access to government-promised money for food, state health care, and a job card that will help them secure employment. If they cannot find a job, they can get a secure minimum wage job from the government. Girls can get further monetary and social support from the government after their trafficker is convicted, if someone is indeed convicted. Girls who are younger than 18 are secured a place in school and are given school supplies and a bicycle when they return home.

Navigating Landscapes

Rehabilitation is dependent on what landscapes provide, but, as I have also pointed out, must work around the limitations that come with those landscapes. When children newly arrive at a care center, they inherently seek out places where they feel a sense of restoration and recovery to create their own therapeutic landscapes (Sampson & Gifford 2010), which can occur within the care center or outside of it. Not all needs can be met within the care center, so people must move outside of the center to meet them. Mobility is a major indicator of agency, as it allows access to goods, people, and other resources while reifying individuality and one's own control. In *A Global Sense of Place* (1999), Massey looks at flows and interconnections within space and the access people have to those, as well as the agency they have over that mobility.

She says we can think about mobility in terms of how much people move around and how much power they have over that process. Within therapeutic landscapes, researchers identify the positives of mobility, including access to goods and services, and freedom and agency of movement, but also the negatives, including the lack of safety that is attached to moving around in public (Gatrell 2013). Such dangers are particularly potent in India where women are constantly harassed, abused, and violated in public spaces (Bhattacharyya 2016). Mobility is an integral part of interacting within landscapes and is determinedly related to poverty and caste. In fact, I will discuss how mobility is, in many ways, a spatial expression of caste, class, and gender, particularly in Mumbai.

Mobility at Kranti

The girls at Kranti had just recently moved into a new house because they were evicted from their last one when the landlord found out where the girls were from. Quickly, Robin found a house right next to the train station. This was actually a big step up for them, because access to free public transportation significantly changed the girls' connection to city services, education, and resources. Many of the girls attend traditional school in the afternoon after Kranti School, and one of the girls even teaches at an elementary school in the afternoons. Others go to internships around town, like at the local animal shelter. They are all expected to take at least one enhancement class outside of Kranti, so girls learn dance, art, and singing. In some senses, the train gives them the agency to move around, but upon closer look, this movement is not fully agentive because while they are supposed to pay for tickets, they instead slip onto the trains unnoticed because they cannot afford tickets. They are therefore not completely in control of the process of moving or the movement of their resources. Traveling to their extracurricular activities can be dangerous because of the rampant violence and molestation towards women in Indian cities (Bhattacharyya 2016).

Being poor or part of a lower caste in Mumbai means limited mobility, which therefore means limited empowerment. The mode of transportation people use in the city determines how far they can go but also aligns with where people go. People take the mode of transportation they can, so the poorest must walk because they cannot afford a rickshaw or a car. Walkers go to outdoor markets for their proximity and their lower prices. People with cars, however, can go

further, and usually go to fancier stores with air conditioning and foreign goods. In Indian cities, women have been found to travel less often than men and do not travel as far (Mahadevia & Advani 2016). Caste also has been found to have significant correlation with travel; those of lower castes do not travel far, especially because of lack of access to public or private transportation that cost money, and do not travel frequently (Mahadevia & Advani 2016). In Mumbai it is not entirely uncommon to see women driving cars, usually to the gym or to meet other wealthy friends at a high-end coffee shop. Most of the Kranti girls did not travel the city when they lived in the red light districts, but are given the chance to do so at Kranti. Particularly by taking the train, the girls are exposed to many new parts of the city and therefore new people and ideas, changing where people of their castes, the lower castes, go.

Mobility at Punarnawa

While a rural setting offers Punarnawa many benefits, it also comes with many limitations. While the girls have more freedom to move within the campus than Kranti's girls do in their small apartment, the same level of mobility outside of the center is not enjoyed by survivors at Punarnawa. The girls are cut off from the world, which can be a nice break, but can also be constricting. Mobility offers engagement with new places, people, and ideas, and has been proven beneficial to stress reduction as well as strengthening and broadening social connections (Gatrell 2013). They are restricted for their own protection because Punarnawa staff believe that mobility and exposing the girls to people outside puts them at too high a risk of being found by traffickers. Mobility is not a luxury afforded by many women in general in Bihar, in large part because it is not safe to travel alone there (Bhattacharyya 2016). Men have much more travel flexibility in India, and researchers have found that women travel significantly less often and less far from home than men do (Mahadevia & Advani 2016). Because they cannot leave, the only people survivors regularly get to see are other survivors and staff – sometimes for years. It is hard to bring new ideas and new energy to the center when very few people are allowed into the space. Their distance from town is purposeful because of safety, but it also makes the girls' transition back home more difficult because they were so significantly removed from society.

This distance and isolation also can make finding long-term staff difficult. That location is not a very educated area, so finding qualified teachers, counselors, doctors, particularly who can stay for a long time or can come regularly enough, is one of Punarnawa's biggest struggles. People from far away are willing to come work for a few months, some even volunteering, but do not wish to live there for more than that time. Staff can still leave Punarnawa's campus, but the girls cannot. They can get special permissions to go home only if a relative has died or some similar family crisis, but usually if they want to have a family visit, their family comes to Punarnawa instead.

Because the girls cannot go outside, the staff have to be their connection, getting things they need, but also advocating for them in their villages. Additional help particular girls need can also be difficult to find. One girl, Pooja, suffers from trauma but also, almost certainly autism. She shows many signs of autism, however has never been formally tested for it and therefore is unable to get the medical attention that would be most suited to her. The center is not well equipped to deal with learning differences or other disabilities. This is compounded by the problem that abuse is much more likely and often much worse toward women who suffer from mental disorders so the trauma recovery is much more difficult and the intensities of PTSD and depression are much higher (Sharma & Pathak 2015). Without a therapist, specialist, or doctor who acknowledges or addresses this problem, it is difficult for Punarnawa to do enough for Pooja's rehabilitation.

Conclusion

Fresh air vs. factory fumes is just the start of a place-based comparison of these rehabilitation centers. To understand the different activities and desired outcomes of these centers, the resources, ideals, and limiting factors are crucial to examine, but most important is to understand how these are determined by place. Of these factors, ideals proved to be most significant in determining activities. The place and its associated culture, history, and environment create the backdrop of problems that cause trafficking and abuse in sex work. It also influences the ways people conceive of rehabilitation and how to enact positive change.

While the centers have to work within their landscapes and the available physical inputs, the resources they choose to utilize are based on ideals which tie into this multi-layered concept

of landscape. Ideals will also determine how the centers use the resources they choose, such as money. Punarnawa puts it into an impressive campus, and Kranti puts it into travel and activities outside of the home. Kranti's goal is to revolutionize what it means to be marginalized in India. Intelligence, maturity and a marginalized past shape experience and add value as a leader. Therefore if girls are empowered and supported, Kranti believes these girls can become leaders of social change. It showed that a lot of what seems possible to achieve is based on what the girls see, what they are told their options are. By looking at the inputs and limiting factors at each center, we are able to understand more deeply the ways these centers are run and identify the connections between rehabilitation and place. This can lend insight into understanding place and gendered trauma rehabilitation as well as ways to improve or enhance rehabilitation and care techniques.

Further aspects that arose during my research that require further study are safety and the place-based resources that allow centers to maintain safety for survivors. This is crucial for a drop in center, a shelter, and especially a rehabilitation center that is more deeply engaged in girls' improvement and well-being. Cities, especially slum areas, are difficult places in which to protect girls. In such a highly populated area, men are constantly around, ogling and harassing the girls. Bihar, on the other hand, is known around India for being unsafe, but within the high walls of the ashram, little can reach the girls. Safety is a hugely important part of rehabilitation and deeply tied to place. It also ties into one of the larger connections between place and rehabilitation that I will look at next – sense of place and identity.

Chapter 3

Divided Expectations: Negotiating Identity between Place and Therapeutic Landscapes

Introduction

While I was at Kranti, part of my role was helping with the morning lessons. After meditation, we taught the girls brain teasers such as word games, creativity exercises, and math puzzles. One morning, a girl named Aliya was struggling with her math problems, so I went over to help. She did not speak very much English, so we worked together in Hindi. She was quiet, dark-skinned, and could usually be found with a mistrusting scowl on her face, but we worked well together, so continued to do so over the next few days. I had heard about her before; Aliya was one of the most troubled girls at the center, struggling with mental health, post-traumatic stress syndrome, and trust. At first she did not volunteer any information about her life and I did not push, hoping that over time she might want to talk to me.

One day in Kranti School we were listening to a song by 2Pac, the LA-born rapper, about prostitution and pregnancy, and the girls were instructed to answer questions on a worksheet such as 'who or what does this song make you think about?' and 'how does this song make you feel?' Because they were supposed to write their answers in English, Aliya asked me to help her spell a few words. "How do you spell hate?" she asked me in Hindi. A little surprised, I spelled it for her. She showed me her full sentence: "I hate my mom." I asked why, and she told me that she blames her mom for how the world sees her – dirty, worthless, and incapable of becoming anything in life.

That weekend she invited me home to meet her family. She dressed up in jeans and a tank top, excited for me to get to meet them. We hopped on the train and went to the red light district. When we got off, we crossed the train tracks, walked through town, down a few alleys, and up a very narrow staircase to her home. Her home was a single room about 5 x 10 feet, with a single bed, small stove, and a few kitchen shelves. Aliya immediately ran into her mother's arms, both of them exclaiming in Marathi with big smiles. We sat on the floor to eat, chatting casually. Aliya was very snuggly with her mom and her mother was hand-feeding her. At the

end of the meal her uncle joined us for tea. They hugged, and while we sipped chai, she cheerily told them about Kranti, saying school was hard and the food was good, except when Shreya was in charge, because she was not a very good cook.

Watching these interactions caused a sort of cognitive dissonance for me. She was hugging her mother, genuinely happy to see her, but at the same time she hated her mother for the work she does. It is hard enough to be a girl in India, but to be a dark skinned Muslim girl who grew up in the red light district with a mother who is a sex worker causes an intense level of marginalization, prejudice, and discrimination from society. Sipping chai with her uncle and watching Aliya chat with him animatedly, I enjoyed their interaction until I remember what she had confided in me the week before. I thought to myself, "isn't this the man who raped you every day for years because your mother was working and he was supposed to be taking care of you?"

These are powerful demonstrations of the contradictions that people learn to live with, which are deeply tied to identities. These girls can be upset with their parents but still want to be held in their mothers' arms. Massey (1999) argues that the multiple identities one person has can be a source of richness or source of conflict. Aliya is able to walk in multiple worlds, but this does not come without difficulty. The stigmas of being female, poor, associated with sex work, and not knowing the identity of her father are directly tied to growing up in the red light district of Mumbai and living within the surrounding society (Trani 2015, Cornish 2006, Fehrenbacher et al 2015). These stigmas are all deeply place-based, and features of how they affect identity are crucial in the development of girls' self-identity at these rehabilitation centers. Throughout this chapter I will refer back to this story to build on the stakeholders of identity, the people who impact girls' identity, and the ways they do that.

Sense of place mediates our understanding of landscapes in the ways people interact with and connect with landscapes and the histories and cultures embedded within them (Conradson 2005). Because of identity and how people relate to places, individuals' interactions with the landscape can be radically different from one another. Identity both defines how people interact with their landscape and is in return shaped and reshaped by landscapes. Landscapes impact the girls' rehabilitation in practical physical, economic, and ideological ways, but also deeply impact these girls' identities in how girls create their self-identity and in how their societies' identify

them. Therefore, in this chapter I explore the questions: How does sense of place impact self-identity? How are sense of place and self-identity fostered at these centers? To answer these questions, I argue that the girls at the center juggle the often contradictory local societal expectations and NGO staff members' expectations to develop their own sense of identity as it is tied to their sense of place within Mumbai and Bihar, as well as their 'micro-place' of the centers.

In discussing identity and the ways these girls are exploring and redefining who they are, I hone in on factors that marginalize them. These girls face significant stigmas and prejudices. Their identities are tied to body and place, are visual, and are thrust upon them from the outside. Caste and gender are the two most significant aspects of identity for women in the majority of India, shaping the ways these girls' are perceived by their communities. In my analysis, I begin by discussing identity and place politics in India, starting with definitions of these two complex terms. Within identity I discuss subjectivity and contradictions of identity. Specifically within place, I illustrate how these care centers are consciously and unconsciously creating a sense of place and place attachment for the girls.

Place and Identity Politics in India

Agnew (1987) defined place as made up of location - the literal coordinates of a space, locale - the material setting for social relations, and sense of place. Place can be looked at in terms of space and landscape, locations embedded with history and emotion. It anchors culture and identity in that cultures and identities are associated with and rooted in particular places (Hall 1995). Cultures and identities are represented and reproduced in those locations. Places are constantly changing, and are shaped in contrast and connection to other places (Duncan & Ley 1993). They are hierarchically interconnected, and therefore "cultural and social change becomes not a matter of cultural contact and articulation but one of rethinking difference through connection" (Gupta & Ferguson 1992).

Place discourse gives meaning to life, allowing people to position themselves within a place in specific ways in regards to society and the belief systems societies instill in a place (Hall 1995, Guattari 1992). Hegemonic discourses of the manner in which people should act, the activities they should engage in, and how people are expected to interact with each other are

reproduced in the community and define categories of people that become their identity, such as gender, caste, and class.

Indian social space is highly gendered (Raju 2004), the impact of which is felt daily by these girls. Kranti and Punarnawa both have created their own place that is an island away from society, created in direct opposition to local society and place. Punarnawa responds to the nearby town which is chaotic and violent by creating a quiet, peaceful place for girls to spend time away from men and away from the social structures that caused them to be trafficked in the first place. Of course both Kranti and Punarnawa have allies outside of their walls and model their places after the parts of their surroundings that support their beliefs, but generally are constructing places that go against the hegemonic discourses within Bihar and Mumbai. Kranti too has created a place that is a sanctuary from the dangerous streets and pervasive male stares, in part through creating a school curriculum that reinforces their beliefs and separation from the larger "place" of Mumbai.

Kranti School was started by Robin and a former member of Kranti staff, Katie, who wrote the majority of the curriculum. They were finding that many of the girls, who come from a diverse background of schooling, talent, languages, and learning disabilities, were struggling in traditional schools where teachers could not cater to these differences. Girls were coming home distraught each night, not feeling smart enough, and frustrated learning only traditional Indian ideas. Girls are even ridiculed by their teachers for not wearing traditional clothing. Therefore, Kranti School was started to give the girls a safe space to learn a more extensive variety of lessons with one-on-one attention and activities that can cater to many different levels of education. With the help of a part time teacher and the benefit of internet access, the girls are exposed to geography, Ted Talks, music, current events, and social justice issues.

Kranti has become a place for new learning and of difference from the outside world. The way the staff structure their lessons and make the house a safe place for Western clothes and ideas develops a place which exists in stark contrast to the outside world, in conversation with the limiting options these girls are given for acceptable dress, actions, and learning. The question of traditional Indian clothing and lessons speaks directly to the strongly embedded traditional Indian values which girls are expected to follow and embody, even though many of the girls do not prerscribe to them. The center works to support the girls in who they are,

regardless of those values. For example, homosexuality is supported at Kranti, whereas in Mumbai, especially in the poor and less progressive neighborhood they live in, it is not acceptable at all. The belief systems of groups of people with control over a place, the controlling discourses, determine what identities are or are not acceptable.

Identity is complex and there are many definitions and nuances within geography literature. Identity is constructed through difference and relationship to others (Hall 2004, 2005; Harvey 1996; Gupta & Ferguson 1992). It is constantly in flux, renegotiated by the self, by others, by cultures, and politics (Massey 1995). This process-oriented idea of identity is mediated by past experience, and contributes to an ongoing self-representation and reimagining of the self. Experiences of the self and body, particularly in relation to subjectivity and social and environmental landscapes, are major features of identity. To understand identity, we also have to understand the practices, beliefs, knowledges, and ideas which comprise the 'funds of identity', "the historically accumulated, culturally developed, and socially distributed resources" essential to a person's self-definition (Esteban-Guitart & Moll 2014).

"Identities are never completed, never finished; that they are always as subjectivity itself is, in process, always in the process of formation" (Hall 2005). Conceiving of subjectivity and the ways different ideas are placed onto women and women's bodies in India deeply impacts these girls' sense of identity. As they express their internal conflicts of who they are and who they are expected to be, it is reinforced that their positionality within Indian society has a deep impact on how they see themselves. Hall (2005) connects identity with identification; one's own identity is in part constructed through the process of identification which others place upon us, in large part made up of the differences people see which set them apart from the group.

The girls at these centers must wrestle with the contradictions they find between societal expectations, pressures, and various subjectivities foisted upon them as they develop their identities. They must then negotiate these competing positionalities they are encouraged to adopt or are expected to uphold. For Aliya, this means grappling with society's expectations of her as a dark-skinned girl from the red light district, her family and home communities perception of her as a girl who in some ways abandoned them to go live in a better part of Mumbai, effectively ostracizing herself from the people she grew up with, and Kranti's constant urging to stand up

and speak out against the norms and practices of the culture she lives in. At the same time this means centers are adding further expectations of who the girls should be and should become.

Society's subjectivities are challenged through different types of rehabilitation such as sense of place building and school lessons that foster self-reflection and self-development. It has been shown in various psychological studies that perceived discrimination due to stigmas surrounding issues such as gender and poverty impact children's sense of self, well-being, and performance in schools, but also that home support and sense of community identity can alleviate some of these negative effects (Bradshaw et al 2015).

Caste and Economic Identities

Rakesh Dubey, the accountant at Punarnawa, approaches his work with a unique perspective because he is Brahmin, the highest Hindu caste. This means he comes from money, so he is able to live in town and come to work on his motorcycle everyday. He believes that no one deserves to be trafficked, and says it happens because the traffickers are from a lower caste and thus are not refined people. "Many people of lower castes are barbaric. They do terrible things. It is not really their fault, it is their caste - people of that caste are dangerous and lazy and do not want to do honest work. But it is their caste. It is not their fault. It is who they are." According to Dubey, the girls are trafficked because they too are of a lower caste and therefore of little value. They are targeted because their families are poor and easily exploitable. What he says about the girls being targeted because they are of a lower caste is seen widely in human-trafficking in India (Awasthi 2015). In Bihar, trafficking is often a result of poverty because families are desparate, uneducated, and more likely to be tricked into allowing their children to leave with strangers when promised jobs and education. Dubey says that even though they are of a lower caste, he deeply cares for the girls, and even goes to visit them in their poor villages after they are reintegrated.

Even Dubey, a person who deeply cares for these girls and works tirelessly against trafficking and injustice, has deep-seated prejudices against lower caste citizens. The caste system still defines Hindus, 80% of India, stratifying people based on birth into categories that determine who they can marry, what work they can do, and their status in society (Borooah et al 2014, Vaid 2014, Jalali 2015). Hierarchy and inequality still go even deeper, working into

identity. In rural north India, caste identity is an important form of social capital (Jeffrey 2000). Self-worth and self-identity are affected by caste. Dubey was making comments about lower castes, not just in their access or income, but about their affect and abilities. There are much deeper prejudices within people when it comes to caste – lower caste citizens are looked at as truly inferior people (Desai & Dubey 2012, Srinivas 1996). This system of exclusion and exploitation has strong linkages between occupation and income, as well as social and economic discrimination (Thorat & Newman 2009, Desai & Dubey 2012). From identity studies, Hall (2005) too argues that identities, and particularly identifications, are worked on by political and economic forces.

Kranti, too, is deeply impacted by caste, in that all of the girls who are Hindu at the center are of lower caste, even the founder, Robin. Robin is Other Backward Caste and the girls at Kranti are Dalit, Muslim, or marginalized in other ways. A survivor named Niddhi gave a speech in which she talked about herself, her past, and her caste. She is a Dalit with dark skin and her whole life she has been looked down upon as ugly and wrong. "We are people too, not less because of how we grew up or where or who raised us." (Katti 2014).

While caste certainly impacts identity at Kranti, class and income play an integral role in self-identification, much more so than at Punarnawa. At Punarnawa, the girls cannot leave so are not faced with class hierarchy daily as the girls are at Kranti. Punarnawa girls may not bring anything with them to the center – clothes, bedding, etc. are all provided by the center, which puts the girls on an even level of demonstrating wealth. Another major factor for Punarnawa is that in the small village where Punarnawa is located, people are extremely poor, but fairly evenly poor. Most closely around the center, everyone is a farmer and living in abject poverty. Of course there is some measure of social stratification, but not nearly to the extent visible in Mumbai. Poverty and lavish wealth reside right next to each other in Mumbai, emphasizing difference and impacting Kranti girls' sense of identity because they are poor and live in the slum.

Kranti has little money and relies heavily on donations of clothing and furniture. None of the girls grew up with very much money and they do not get personal spending money from the center. While no one complains very much about having little money at Kranti, many girls express embarrassment at going to school in second-hand clothes and not being able to do a lot

of things in the city that require money. Pramila, the youngest girl at Kranti, was wearing a shirt one morning that she suddenly realized had ripped. It was not a big rip and was not in a place that caused any problem, but she was so distraught about it that she refused to go to school. She later admitted to me that this was because she is already ridiculed about her clothes at school; her clothes are too western, too big because they are hand-me-downs, or they are old and worn because Pramila cannot afford new ones. Her meltdown was more about being embarrassed about being made fun of because she is poor than it was about any real problem with the shirt. Shreya, another survivor, has rationalized her poverty saying that she does not like money. She does not have it, but also does not want it because she says that money makes people act badly.

These facets of identity impacted by caste and class are significant to development and political identity. The historical aspects of the development and change in the caste system in India, as well as the specific formation of caste and class hierarchies in urban areas in contrast to rural areas impact political identity because it is complexly and historically informed (Banerjee & Knight 1985, Gupta 2005, Kumar 2015). Caste and class play a major role in influencing daily life and identity for these survivors. Before even those though, the arguably most significant and primary social construction which colors every part of these girls' lives is gender identity.

Place and Gender Identity

Even at their young ages, the girls at Punarnawa demonstrate the gender expectations that they have grown up with in rural Bihar. Whether it is making *rakhi*, bracelets, for the men who work at the center for the holiday *Rakshabandan*, or making sure that their bodies are appropriately covered even to go to breakfast in the morning, girls practice prescribed gender roles. The older girls scold younger ones for not wearing their scarves properly to cover their chest on top of their tunic and teach them to serve tea to the staff members. Their practices of cooking, serving, and cleaning, are routine necessary to learn for the time they leave the center because these will be the primary roles they have in taking care of the house and their future families. The only men at Punaranawa are the guards, grounds keeper, and Dubey, the accountant, all in roles that are separated from the girls to reduce bringing up past trauma from

interacting with these men. The girls do serve them food, and always wash their plates for them, but do not for the female staff members.

As we consider the impact of place and gender on identity, it is imperative to understand that trafficking, particularly sex trafficking, is not well understood in rural Bihar and carrys strong stigmas, shaming the girls and women who have been through this ordeal. In interviews with anti-trafficking rehabilitation staff, community educators, and trafficking response teams, these professionals and experts said that girls are blamed within their villages for being trafficked. "The villages that have not been taught about slavery do not understand. Girls cannot tell even their families where they have been or they will not be accepted back into their homes," says Amita Gaur, head of Punarnawa. Even in domestic or factory work, female trafficking victims are physically and sexually abused, just as they are in sex trafficking. The gender expectations of purity is deeply engrained in rural north Indian society, which means girls must not have any physical or sexual interactions with men before marriage (Jensen 2012, Chant 2013, Arnot et al 2012, Metzker 2012).

Girls who have been trafficked and sexually abused are seen as dirty and used up, which is detrimental in communal societies as these villages are. It becomes particularly problematic when the girls' families are looking for a husband for her later – the stigmatization of prostitution is so great it can be almost impossible to find a man willing to be with her (Cornish 2006, Fehrenbacher et al 2015). In India, marriage is of utmost importance for social and economic support (Jensen 2012, Eswaran et al 2013, Sabarwal et al 2014, Cornish 2006). People are expected to live within family structures, and women are dependent on men for income, a place to live, social standing, and legitimacy within the community (Sabarwal et al 2014, Maertens 2013, Mukherjee 2013).

Women are not safe alone – they need men for protection and security, whether it be economic security, because men have higher access to jobs and wage earning (Agrawal 2014), or physical safety moving through public spaces, or living within societies which look down upon unmarried women (Bhattacharyya 2016, Mahadevia & Advani 2016). Anti-human trafficking workers have formed community education teams to teach villages about trafficking and start to remove these stigmas. Groups like the Trafficking in Persons project have had some success in reintegrating girls into these newly-informed communities. This education has also succeeded in

preventing further trafficking cases. However, in villages where this education has not occurred, it is often unsafe for girls to return. Even at Punarnawa, the surrounding villagers are not told that the center's residents are girls who have worked in red light districts or as domestic workers, for fear of violence against the center.

Safety and security are major issues in a big city like Mumbai as well. A major aspect of gendered life at Kranti is the proximity of the center to men and boys. The center is in the middle of a busy part of the city and the girls constantly interact with men. And, as teenagers, are very interested in dating. The girls are allowed to have boyfriends, but they first must come to the house and interview with the staff. Their boyfriends have usually been understanding about the girls growing up in the red light district, not ostracizing or judging them once they find out. However, trafficking consultant and Kranti staff member Katelyn Sheehan said that because it is public knowledge that these girls come from the red light district, it does make more boys come around and think that the girls are "easy".

The Kranti girls have grown up watching and living with only sexualized relationship with men in the red light district, therefore informing how they interact with men – sexualized interactions have been taught to them from the beginning. If a man enters the Kranti, therefore, the girls automatically change their demeanor and flirt with him. While other rehabilitation institutions choose to keep the girls away from boys as much as possible, Robin says this is not realistic, and it is better to facilitate healthy interactions with boys by meeting the boys and allowing girls to see them instead of pushing the girls to hide inevitable relationships (Chaurasiya 2015). The girls openly talked about their relationships in the center and with me. A seventeen-year-old, Purnima, especially, loved to talk about her past relationships. "I have had many boyfriends while here at Kranti. I introduce them to Robin *didi* (older sister) and Bani *didi* and if the guy is willing to meet them, I know he really cares about me. I was dating a guy who worked at Café Coffee Day for a while and he gave me free coffee sometimes. He was really sweet. He cared about me. Robin really liked him too, which made me feel better about him". The staff and girls have conversations in Kranti School on friendships and relationships, discussing healthy interactions and dynamics, as well as touching on gender roles and sexuality. In many ways, the staff actively try to shape the way the girls think, and encourage them to reflect critically on the topics in society and their self-identities.

At Kranti, the staff work to help the girls engage with the city, discussing the difficulties of engagement as a woman and how then handle themselves within gender-discriminatory space. They discuss the problems the girls face, articulate their pasts, and use those to think about what they want to do differently in the future. During Kranti School one day, we discussed what social change the girls want to see in India and particularly in Mumbai. Immediately, many hands shot into the air to share their thoughts. They touched on everything from gay rights, to gender equality, to religious discrimination and separation. Nitya, the oldest girl at Kranti, spoke passionately about how difficult it is for a girl or woman to have an independent life in India because of wide gender discrimination and expectations for women. One of her friends is thirty years old and no one will rent an apartment to her because she is not married and no land lord would rent to an unmarried woman that old. Most of the other girls chimed in, agreeing that in India, women cannot live the way they want or wear the clothing they want, especially if they are a further minority because of skin color, level of education, or, for all of these girls, rampant sex worker stigmas which turn people against them. This observation is supported in public health and social work literature on gender and sex work stigmas in India (Cornish 2006, Fehrenbacher et al 2015). These stigmas still keep many marginalized people from access to education and social services which could otherwise help improve their lives (Trani 2015). Many of the Kranti girls, both current and graduated, are very engaged in social justice initiatives such as giving speeches and helping others who struggle with similar issues as ways to interact with the community in Mumbai.

An integral demonstration of Kranti's gender identity education and self-exploration was a play they performed around India and the US. The US tour they did this past summer in 2015 was incredibly special because they were performing their play, a play written and directed by Robin. This play is incredibly influenced by place, dealing with issues of growing up in red light district of Mumbai. The play, entitled the Lal Batti Express, cast one girl as a madam in charge of a brothel and another as a *hijra*[2], a Hindu third gender, mother of two. It discussed major issues of sexual abuse, women's rights, and traditional Indian gender roles. At one point in the play, a girl says she wants to work in hotel management, and she is berated by her family

[2] For more information on hijras see *Not This, Not That: The Hijras of India and the Cultural Politics of Sexuality* by Vinay Lal (1999).

members, telling her to know her place which is certainly not in management. Some of the stories in the play are inspired by the girls' own stories, like Sonya who was frequently raped while her *hijra* mother danced in bars. As the girls act out the various roles, they are able to look at their own life experiences from different perspectives, as well as examine this depiction of societal norms and injustices towards women and other marginalized people to see what they want to change about their own society.

Gender-Informed Rehabilitation

Identity and specifically identification of social categories such as caste, class, and gender, are shaped by place specifically through the societies that are connected to and shape those places. Mental health problems like depression and perceived powerlessness tie into community-based predictors such as crime, poverty, sanitation, local cohesion, and culture (Greif & Dodoo 2015). Stigmas and prejudices, along with social expectations and societal norms, create a huge burden on girls who are from the red light district or have been trafficked (Fehrenbacher et al 2015, Cornish 2006, Trani 2015). In response, Punarnawa has created a fenced-in sanctuary, keeping girls away from people who might try to re-capture them. While the confines of the campus have become a place of sanctuary, this also has the effect of amplifying the feeling of threat in the space that is outside of the wall (Dunkley 2009). The girls expressed fear in going back to their villages. After parts of the wall were destroyed in the cyclone, the girls kept to the center of the ashram, trying to avoid even the gaze of people from the outside. The barrier of the inside and outside of the care centers creates a separation of who gets to participate in this seeing and who is excluded (Dunkley 2009). This spectatorship within the center of girls watching each other and staff members, is a medium through which the girls learn how to act. The internal space inside the ashram is a place of safety and growth, within which the staff have the ability to create new norms and expectations, mediating between the girls and society (Conradson 2005).

At Kranti, perhaps even more than at Punarnawa, the staff encourage girls step outside of traditional gender and caste roles. They drive the girls to be *krantikari,* revolutionaries, who change their environments. Because the girls are interviewed and must be chosen to come to Kranti, they are already not the type to want to just be a tailor and get married because the staff

choose girls who want to be *krantikari*. They do not discourage the girls from marriage but want them to understand and challenge patriarchy and societal norms. The girls look to each other and even more so to the staff as role models of who to become. This empowerment and connection to an older role model is a rehabilitation method Kranti works hard to facilitate by giving the girls activities in which they have to trust each other, like taking the train without an adult. Developing that trust and connection is imperative within a care center, and, as expressed by staff at both Kranti and Punarnawa, also one of the most difficult aspects of care and rehabilitation.

Connection

Connection is vital for support because girls come out of trafficking and of their lives in the red light districts with severe trust issues. They were abused and abandoned, forcing them to fend for themselves and leaving them suspicious and mistrustful of strangers. At Punarnawa, the staff assign each new incoming girl to a mentor in the center – someone to teach them the schedule and show them around. The girls said they were much more wary of adults than kids and did not feel they could trust the staff immediately upon arrival They felt more comfortable around the other girls, connecting thorugh similarities. While some express that identity is largely made through idenitifying difference (Cresswell 2014), part of self-identification is understanding one's self through finding similiarities with other people who have been characterized in the same way (Ashforth & Mael 1989, Hogg & Turner 1985). Survivors may have nothing else innately in common with each other, but are able to find connection through marginalization and a common experience. Some of this commiseration and connection has to be facilitated by staff. They help the girls connect to create a place that feels safe and comfortable, as demonstrated by the stories of two Kranti staff members: permanent staff member Bani Das and visiting teacher Shammi Nanda.

Bani Das, a cofounder of Kranti, worked at the organization where Robin conducted her research, so she was able to teach Robin a lot about trafficking, raids, and the rehabilitation system. Bani had been part of the raid team, and when Robin came, Bani had a caretaker role. She was close with many of the girls, but generally, the staff barely even knew the girls' names. The caretaker role was a familiar one for Bani, because she had done the same thing for her

family at a young age. Bani was married at 18, moved to Mumbai where her husband lived, and had baby right away. She raised the baby on her own, and when her father died soon after, Bani's four sisters and mother came from their village to live with her and she took care of them too. This story is indicative of poverty in India and the power of change that cities offer. Rural life is rarely amenable to a woman who wants to make her own way, take care of her family, and improve her family's situation without the help of males in her family (Haq 2008).

Improving communication is a goal of the Kranti staff members for rehabilitation but also as a vital necessity to live with 14 troubled teenagers in one small house. While I was at Kranti, they hosted a communication workshop, inviting three nonviolent communication teachers to work with the girls for a week. Robin had met the head teacher, Shammi, at nonviolence workshops in the past. Typical communication at Kranti involves a lot of yelling, insults, and often physical violence. Their rough interactions reflected their upbringing and the inequality and lack of value of women in society (Haq 2008). Listening to the way the girls speak to each other, they seemed to be replicating what they know from outside, not valuing themselves and not valuing each other. With Shammi, they practiced argument scenarios with examples the girls thought of from real issues around the house. They worked on speaking in a calm way, taking a deep breath, expressing real feelings instead of lashing out, and handling their anger to speak with a clear mind. In these scenarios, they often stepped into each others shoes, playing someone else's role in a disagreement to be able to understand each other better. During one argument, Shreya was playing Aliya and she responded to a statement but everyone stopped her, saying that Aliya would have responded differently.

Robin and Bani wanted Shammi to come help the girls communicate better and solve some of the issues in the house that get in the way of connections. The activities aim to develop emotional safety. With a chance to explore their feelings and develop trust between each other and the staff, this space becomes one of safety and comfort. This 'psychological safety,' which has been defined as the "degree to which individuals feel comfortable taking positive interpersonal risks" allows people to "exercise their agency to engage in experience and interactions throughout life" (Wanless 2016). The more safety and security the girls feel in these centers, the more they are able to try new things and develop their identities. Shammi helped the girls and staff identify the issues in the house, practice talking about them with a moderator, and

then re-examine these discussions as action plans for continuing the discussion and fixing problems in the house. For example, they discussed a constant point of tension in the house – cell phones. Phones are not provided for the girls but they are allowed to have them if they acquire them in other ways. Most commonly, the girls are given phones by their boyfriends. They are helpful tools for communicating with friends and Kranti staff, but can also be taken away as punishment in the house. Shreya's phone had recently been taken away, and she saw this as a lack of love and care. Girls in the house often respond from fear of a lack of love and care, though this is unsurprising because how little love and care the girls grew up with. Shreya worked one-on-one with the staff and the help of Shammi to understand why she did not have her phone and the standards she was expected to achieve while staying at Kranti.

In the transition of moving into Kranti, many of the girls are surprised by being held to a higher standard than ever before. As the daughters of sex workers they are seen as worthless by outsiders and by themselves, so in Kranti, by holding the girls to a higher standard, it means the staff believe in these girls, expecting them to do more because the staff know they can. In these discussions with Shammi and Shreya, the staff helped Shreya see that Kranti was a privilege, and in fact, her phone was taken away because the staff care for her and want to keep her from making bad choices in the most effective ways they can find. Shreya is learning that actions always have their consequences, and the discussion ended with clarity and both parties expressing their love for the other. Kranti is a family, but the expression of love does not usually follow an argument, so this was a major feat for them. Most of girls did not grow up with this calm way of discussing issues nor constant reminders of care and love, not because their moms did not love them, but because they often did not have much time to spend with their daughters.

The last conversation with Shammi was about life after Kranti. Many of the girls are scared to leave the comfort and support of Kranti, and the girls who have graduated have a very hard time finding paid work. One project Bani would like to start is a sort of "halfway house" for Kranti girls who are old enough to leave Kranti but do not have financial security yet. It would be a place the girls could go to live on their own and be in charge, but could still be financially supported by Kranti. Unfortunately, this is not something that Kranti could even begin to support financially. Bringing these issues to the table cleared the air and everyone got to practice healthy forms of communication that help them in the house and will also help them

outside of Kranti. It helps to build trust and relationship, especially in being able to see that other people care for them, want to hear their opinions, and seek to finish the conversation with a resolution that addresses everyone's needs.

Sense of place

People crave a sense of place and actively engage in place-making activities (Cresswell 2014). Cresswell defines sense of place, as the "subjective and emotional attachment people have to place." The meaning and experience we ascribe to space and the ways those impact how we think about the world individually and collectively shape places (Cresswell 2014). Discourses of a place represent the meaning people have ascribed to it. Place attachment plays a strong role in giving places meaning, as well as influences a person's perception of the identity of a place or their understanding of a place (Shamsuddin & Ujang 2008). The sense of security and sense of self that place attachment facilitates lead people to alter their locations to help create it (Sampson & Gifford 2010). When Kranti was remodeling the first floor to build Vakoloft, they let the girls help design and construct it to give them a sense of pride over the space and connection to it. At Punarnawa the girls help cut the grass and tend to the gardens, engaging in beautifying activities to again instill a sense of pride in and interactive connection with a place. These are just a few of the ways that these centers attempt to foster a sense of place.

Sense of place is important to consider when discussing identity and its impact on identity creation. The ways women are viewed in Mumbai and what is expected of them shapes these girls as they are growing up and learning who to become through watching and interacting others within their spheres of movement. Social expectations of wearing modest clothing and moving within mainly women's spaces like the market or women's-only train cars influence the girls' decisions to follow or intentionally break those rules (Haq 2008). When the Kranti girls talk about social expectations, they are also talking about the low expectations society has for them in terms of success or work outside of the home. If the girls only know how to tailor, cook, and clean once they leave Kranti, they will re-enter society under the roles that reinforce their marginalization. Job expectations for women play into cultural identities, which reflect the identity of the place in which those cultural identities are enmeshed (Agrawal 2014, Hall 1995).

Built environments define social order and determine human interactions as they establish order and organization in a natural environment of chaos (Tuan 1974, Ash 2014). Natural environmental space affects awareness and gives people a sense of freedom with the room to create and act, unconstrained by the influence the built environment has over society and order (Tuan 1977). The built architectural environment directs people's social activities within it, and thus structures social relations and fosters community identity (Mazumdar et al 2000). Architecture's impact is twofold, in that design produces useful space for the general population, but the design itself is a way of living in this space (Guattari 1992). Place-making not only helps the girls feel better, but also a way for them to learn to deal with space afterward, through an opportunity to take control over their subjectivization and resingularize the self (Guattari 1992).

Each floor of Kranti and the different spaces in Punarnawa tell a story of the centers' resources, possibilities, group dynamics, and activities. By identifying the items and layout of the places, it is possible to glean what activity occurs in that space, the layout ,and space within each place dictates what will be possible there, how people will interact there, etc., effectively determining the resources, group dynamics, etc. that can occur in each place (Tuan 1977, Shamai et al 2012, Anguelovski 2013). In Place and Space, Yi Fu Tuan states that "architectural [structured] space can define sensations, make them vivid, and helps us comprehend reality." Structured space helps define social roles and how to interact with others in it (Tuan 1977). These spaces can thus dictate the activities within, which has strong implications for rehabilitation activities within these centers.

Walking into the first floor of Kranti, you are greeted by bright red walls and a chalkboard reading 'Vakoloft,' the name of their rentable event space to be used by NGOs, schools, etc. Behind the event space, a newly added door separated Vakoloft from the staff space – a washing machine, two bathrooms, and a small bedroom. Even though the staff room was supposed to be a quiet space closed to the girls, most of the girls spend a lot of time there, sprawled out on the beds together, talking and laughing. Spending time there was a way to get time with the director, Robin who spent most of her time working in there. Two of the other staff members, Bani and Vandana, also spent a lot of time there. Robin and Bani started the center together and share a lot of the main duties of caring for the girls. Vandana is the mother of a few of the girls at the center, and has the role of care mother to all of the girls, cooking

breakfast, facilitating the girls cooking the other meals, and being a supportive presence in the house.

The second floor is the heart of the house where the girls spend the majority of their time sleeping, in class, and in the kitchen. The first two-thirds of the floor is open with no furniture but the shelves along the walls for clothing. That is where the girls sleep and also where they have school during the day. They sleep directly on the floor or on mats, all lined up next to each other. The oldest girls, Nitya, has taken up the duty of waking everyone up in the morning for a quick breakfast and then Kranti School, which starts at eight. The other part of the second floor is the kitchen, a place where the girls say they find a lot of comfort. The sticky floor and lack of ventilation made it hot and smell a bit funny, but most of the girls said this did not bother them. They were much more used to hot weather than I, so did not even bother turning on the overhead fan while cooking. The girls had a rotating chores schedule which included taking out the trash, cleaning dishes, and mopping. Particularly the dish cleaning had to be a collaborative effort beyond those assigned to the task because somehow the sink was constantly filled to the brim with dirty dishes. Activities that put the girls in charge of caring for their space and each other within that space help foster a sense of place.

Another method of sense of place creation is developing a routine within the home around these collaborative place-caring activities (Dyck & Dossa 2007). For example at Kranti, Vandana, the center's care mother, makes breakfast in morning, and it is usually something light like *chapati*, thin fried bread, and there is always *masala chai* – spiced milk tea. The girls usually make lunch, which, because it is not part of the schedule of chores, means the job falls to those without outside school or midday activities to make lunch every day. Even though they eat breakfast by 7:00am, they often do not eat lunch until 2:00 or 3:00 pm, and then have dinner around midnight. The girls always wait for each other to eat as a group. They sit in a circle on the floor with the pots of food in front of them and usually only a few plates between them to share from. They sometimes pull bread from a communal plate, and they always have rice and lentils, and usually make an extra vegetable dish.

The girls eat with their hands and commonly feed each other as a sign of care. Who they feed changes with each meal, really only depending on who they are talking to at the time. Food practices like these have a great deal to do with place-making in facilitating care for each other

and a sense of comfort and calm (Dutta 2016). It also helps the girls exert agency in producing their own healthy space (Dyck & Dossa 2007). Pooja said, “I like cooking with my sisters here. It is good to learn and it helps me be calm. If I am having a bad day I like to cook lunch and I feel better”. Cooking for each other gives girls a chance to care for each other as well as be cared for. The stability and security of regular meals provided by people who love you is not something these girls are often familiar with growing up in situations where food is scarce, as is parental time and care.

The connections girls forge with each other, the staff members, and the places they live in can foster a sense of security and safety. Shreya, one of the more troubled girls at Kranti, told me, “Kranti is not just an NGO – it’s a family. Vandana Mommy and Robin *didi* (sister) and all of us here. They make us safe.” Communal spaces like the kitchens are examples of place accommodating and fostering care and community, as well as the staff members’ expectations of working together and caring interactions. The sense of home created is a strong place attachment which fosters continuity and order, rootedness, and attachment, all of which impact the development of self-identity (Lewicka 2011, Case 1996, Moore 2000).

Conclusion

Aliya’s story demonstrates the contradictions girls must reconcile within themselves as they build their identities out of their past experiences, society’s expectations, and the rehabilitation centers’ ideologies and perceptions of who these girls are and should be. Her story captures the tensions of different subjectivities and positionalities as they illustrate the human experience of living with and normalizing contradictions. These particular subjectivities differ with place. Expectations and limitations in rural Bihar overlap with Mumbai perspectives but differ enough that rehabilitation centers must adjust to respond to the local society and utilize what they can from their locations to improve the girls’ chances of success.

Interactions with broader landscape, the care centers’ ‘micro-landscape,’ and the people within those spheres constantly shape, reflect, and reinforce girls’ identities. Direct confrontation with society’s expectations for them as girls from low castes and class mix and conflict with staff members’ ideals of who the girls should aspire to become. Rehabilitation methods address, both directly and unconsciously, issues of identity and sense of place which are

crucial to the girls' sense of security and security, which in turn give them space to learn and grow. Through Aliya's difficult venture of identity development, it is important to see that she keeps moving and growing, developing her understanding of herself and how she wants to position herself in relation to gender, race, religious, class, and sexuality norms. Rehabilitation attempts to renew these girls' sense of agency; their identities are not just foisted upon them from the outside, but also through the agency they have over their own lives.

Chapter 4

From Trauma to Empowerment: A Gendered Political Economy of the Future

Introduction

While I was with the girls at Punarnawa and Kranti, self-identity and self-worth arose as major underlying themes of their development and well-being. This was particularly true regarding their perceptions of their future. Place and self-identity impact the girls' present and shapes how they conceive of their futures. In this chapter I explore the questions: How do the girls perceive their futures? How does place affect their perceptions? I examine how the girls perceive their own futures, as well as how the staff members conceive of the girls' futures. I then deconstruct these ideas, identifying the social drivers that shape the ways the girls and staff created their perception of the future. I argue that place mediates the girls' perceptions of their futures through place-based economic opportunities, gender expectations, and the staff's expectations for the girls' future based on on-site activities.

This chapter first examines gender in Bihar and Mumbai, work in rural and urban India, and caste and gendered job markets. I engage with literature on gender, caste, and class in India as it pertains to political economy. According to Cook & Roberts (2000), "gender must be an essential basis for analysis in mainstream political economy". Particularly in India, inherently gendered structures characterize society in both rural and urban areas, so a study of political economy must take a gendered focus to approach gender-biased economies, societies, and politics. I examine how these concepts are manifested through rehabilitation practices, examining income generating activities and education at Kranti and Punarnawa. I bring these place-based ideas of gender, work, and income generating activities together to examine their impact on the girls' future perceptions, tying together the trajectory of trauma to empowerment. To understand the girls' perceptions of their future, I discuss the girls' reflections on their lives now and where they see themselves in five years based on an art therapy project I conducted with them. I finish by discussing reintegration and life after recovery, whichk,for survivors, is a life in recovery.

Gender in India

While issues such as gender and identity were traditionally pushed to the margins in the field of geography, following a more "colonial construction of knowledge" (Raju 2004), they have expanded to become core themes in the field. It is crucial to identify the power structures and how those relationships produce inequalities significantly along gendered lines, which are potent in India. Other dividers such as caste, class, and religion are all intimately tied with gender. Women are undeniably treated as second class citizens in India, blatantly marginalized in both rural and urban sites, which affects women in every aspect of life. From work to worth, discrimination is rampant. Studies such as Silverman et al (2007) show that gender-based mistreatment of women and girls in families in conjunction with poverty heightens the risk of sex trafficking. Poverty itself was described by all of the women and girls in Silverman's study as a major vulnerability factor that increased their risk of being trafficked (Silverman et al 2007).

Improving social connection, eliminating violence and discrimination, and generating income opportunities have been identified by mental health researchers as the most basic components for maintaining mental health (Kermode et al 2007). In India, these components can be extremely difficult for women to secure. Women in North India face discrimination in everyday life, even in the most cosmopolitan and progressive areas. Exposure to physical and sexual violence are extremely prevalent, and disadvantages such as caste, poverty, and low social status disproportionately affect women (Malhotra & Shah 2015, Sharma & Pathak 2015).

In many social traditions, discrimination is written into gender roles as it relates to marriage, subservience, education, and codes of conduct (Sharma & Pathak 2015, Watve & Raju 2015). "At home, everyone taught me that I needed to learn to clean and cook as the most important lessons I need to be able to get married" said Shreya, a Kranti girl, when discussing her home-life before coming to Kranti. Girls are socially required to get married (Mukherjee 2013) and are not thought to be economic assets to their families. Their place is in the home. Even within more progressive couples, women are expected to stop working in marriage because of gendered traditional roles and values associated with marriage in Indian society (Mukherjee 2013).

At Kranti, the staff members do not discourage the girls from marriage, but teach them to understand and challenge the engrained patriarchy and gendered societal norms. Gender inequality issues are rarely discussed in India, especially in productive ways, with young people (Verma et al 2006), though there is a growing discussion of the topic on a larger scale within the media and academic literature and research. In a study in 2006 (Verma et al) with 126 young men in Mumbai, the overwhelming majority of them said they had not been exposed to education or activities on gender, sexuality, or masculinity, nor had they ever been asked to think more deeply about these topics or challenge their own views. Unsurprisingly, that study showed that the boys changed their behavior toward women, reducing the instances of disrespect toward women directly and even in the street. Kranti has implemented this kind of education, particularly about male-female interaction dynamics, because of the girls' traumatic pasts of gender-based violence.

Living in the Red Light Districts, the girls' relationships with men are sexual and violent. Family members are not even safe; in fact, they are often the perpetrators of sexual and physical violence against the girls while they are supposed to be caring for the girls while girls' mothers are working. Therefore, even after coming to Kranti, any relationship these girls have to adult men is sexual because most have never had a safe or un-sexualized relationship with a man. The sexualizing of these interactions often comes from the girls. When male visitors or teachers come to the centers, the girls will dress more provocatively and pay the men all their attention. According to Katelyn Sheehan, anti-human trafficking consultant working at Kranti while I was there, this is the only way they know to interact with men.

Rural Bihar has a significantly male dominated culture, even in comparison to other states within India (Jackson & Chattopadhyay 2000). Bihar is the poorest state in India and predominantly dependent on agriculture, so a staggering number of men leave the state to find work in cities all over India and Nepal (Maharatna 2003, Smith 2015, Rao & Mitra 2013). While urban gender discrimination is certainly potent, urban woman tend to have more flexibility of mobility, work, and autonomy, whereas women in Bihar are almost entirely dependent on their husbands. Marriage is a veritable requirement, and it is especially common to think that once a woman is married, she must leave any paid employment she might have had outside of the house and end her education (Arnot et al 2012). Amartya Sen (1999) discusses three types of

entitlements on which people depend for livelihood which in essence are market entitlements and the ability to get a job, production entitlements to produce goods or crops to live off of or to sell, and transfer entitlements based on benefit from familial and social ties. Of Sen's entitlements, woman mainly rely on inheritance and transfer entitlements because they do not have access to their own means of production (Sen 1999). It is harder for women to work in the paid labor force because they need to be taking care of the home but also, especially in Bihar or other rural locations where paid jobs are sparse, the men leave to make money to send back to their families, so the women are the sole caregivers (Jensen 2012). Even still, staff at Punarnawa highly encourage education because they want girls to have options outside of the home. Girls have classes every day of the week except Sundays and, upon reintegration, the younger girls are given incentives to go to school such as school supplies, money for uniforms, and a bicycle for commuting.

Rural healthcare is limited, especially for women. Limitation in part stems from Bihar's "brain drain" – people must leave the rural areas, and often the state, to get education to be doctors, and rarely return (Nair 2015, Maharatna 2003). Large populations and little access to education in Bihar result in a vast flow of human capital and potential to other states (Chandrasekhar & Sharma 2014). At Punarnawa, the psychiatrist they use is not actually a trained psychiatrist but a general practitioner doctor because there are no psychiatrists in the nearby village. A lack of trained professionals is also troubling when so many of these girls come to Punarnawa from the sex industry and thus commonly have STDs. Deepshika, the center's acting counselor, says it is hard to get girls to admit to their diseases upon arrival. "At first, the girls often do not agree to a doctor check-up. We must try to motivate them to say yes for their own safety." The staff members believe this original refusal comes from stigma around having these diseases, as well as the inevitable situation of being in vulnerable positions with unknown male doctors. The limited access to doctors they do have, however, as well as to the women's healthcare classes taught by Deepshika and Punarnawa's teacher, Nisa, are luxuries rarely afforded outside of this kind of care center by regular women.

Gender and Work

In the most rural and the most urban places in India, there are significant gender expectations, many of which overlap among these various regions. There is a complex relationship between women, work, and status in India (Jannuzi 1974, Sugana 2006, Prasad 1979, Chakravarti 2001). While women who work have a higher level of autonomy, economic self-sufficiency, and individual clout, the families of working women are seen to be less wealthy and lower class (Kumar 1999). This is true both in rural Bihar and, perhaps even more, in Mumbai. Women who work in Mumbai are still seen as lower class because if their families were wealthy enough, they would not have to work, though that is changing as women are entering higher professions such as health care. Women who are not earning their own money often have less ability to make their own buying choices, and this effects autonomy and individuality (Kumar 1999). From a study on increased market opportunity for women in India, Jensen (2012) found that increased employment opportunities changed women's family dynamics such as delayed marriage and childbearing, increased aspiration for careers, and increased social and human capital investment for girls. This increased market opportunity, however, can be difficult to find both in rural and urban settings in India.

Due to significant wealth gaps in a city such as Mumbai and the impersonal nature of cities, there is often increased violence, crime, and insecurity in comparison to rural spaces (Chant 2013, Roy 2003). Poverty is rampant and government support services are few; over 50 percent of Mumbai's population is made up of slum and pavement dwellers (Phadke 2007). India's economic liberalization worsened the public services situation, or lack thereof, leaving poorer citizens without governmental support (Desai 2005). Kranti is found in a huge slum in Mumbai, but they are still in many ways lucky because they have a solid roof over their head, unlike the hundreds of street dwellers right outside of their apartment.

The gender bias presents itself in cities in part because there are fewer women in the cities than men due to male-selective urban migration, largely for work, and because there are more moral and physical restrictions on independent female movement (Mukherjee 2013). These restrictions on independent female movement are not just on women trying to move from rural to urban spaces alone, but within urban spaces themselves. Daughters are still seen as a disadvantage to a family, even in major cities which are thought to have moved beyond such

backward and seemingly rural ideas. The gender bias in contemporary India still gives sons a higher economic value because they make more money, offer higher post-retirement economic security, and the family does not have to make dowry payments as families would for daughters' marriages (Mukherjee 2013).

Within Mumbai, there is a widely described lack of safety for women in public areas, as discussed in the previous chapters (Phadke 2007, Bhattacharyya 2016). Instances of molestation and rape are high and make women travel less frequently and less far as men (Mahadevia & Advani 2016, Verma et al 2016, Sullivan 2015). When I arrived at Kranti, the girls told me not to leave the house alone, especially at night. Even if a girl just wanted to go downstairs to the shop next door to recharge minutes on her cell phone, she would take another girl with her for safety. Gendered insecurity in public spaces inherently defines where women go and how they go there. Women choose to travel in groups and take dangerously overcrowded trains rather than walk through so many areas where women are subject to verbal and physical abuse. Rape is the fourth most common crime in India against women (Rao & Tandon 2015) and a very real danger, which thus informs simple tasks such as going outside the house for work because of how a woman dresses, where she goes, with whom, etc. In Kranti School and in everyday life, the survivors learn about gender and the role it plays in dictating their lives. Their center is in a back alley surrounded by sewing and wood-working factories, exclusively peopled with men. The men hang around the center waiting for the girls, constantly watching, flirting, and leering as the girls move through the outside stairwell. There is no privacy or protection.

Punarnawa's setting in rural India is the exact opposite, protected by their high walls and guards. Working on the farm or in the sewing room at Punarnawa provides the girls a safe space to practice the livelihoods they will likely continue when they are back in their villages.

In rural India, women have low participation in paid labor but they are very alternatively economically active; women work in household production, on family farms, and in family businesses (Jensen 2012). Women are commonly in the unpaid care economy, doing domestic and care labor (Chant 2013). In farming families, women actually perform many jobs in the field and in the home for field preparation and harvest processing, but these activities are rarely visible because the women are not the wage earners (Mehar & Prasad 2015). Men have the majority of decision-making power over household and farming decisions. They are also the landowners of

the farms and have more access to education, giving them significant advantage over their wives. Women in Bihar are predominantly landless, and do not often fight for land rights because they will lose more from family strife than men do as they are more dependent on men and on the family structure (Jackson & Chattopadhyay 2000). Sen's (1999) entitlements approach speaks to this problem. Women have fewer entitlements than men, depending on largely inheritance and transfer entitlements if they cannot work or cannot own land to control.

At Punarnawa, they aim to address these issues through teaching girls skills that can help them in the house, on family farms, and with family businesses, but take another step to teach girls skills that make them competitive in job markets. In addition to their education in English, Hindi, and math, girls learn practical skills such as animal husbandry or how to drive tractors, an activity exclusive to men. Girls who have been reintegrated are getting jobs on farms driving tractors, and those who learned animal husbandry are often given a cow to have their own business selling milk and breeding cows.

Many of the tasks girls learn at Punarnawa could be done at a higher level outside of the home or can be maintained as part time work within the house. This is practical for the survivors because while some may go on to be entrepreneurs or working women, many who get married will be constrained by the requirements of home and family care. It is harder for women to work away from the home because they are expected to care for the house, especially in Bihar or other rural locations where paid jobs are sparse, the men leave to make money to send back to their families (Jensen 2012). When the men leave to get jobs in cities such as Kolkatta, Delhi, or Mumbai, they send money back to their families and the women must maintain the family alone. In other, rarer cases, some families depend on women migrating to other areas to become sex workers, which often makes the women fall prey to trafficking and children to sexual slavery (Desai 2005). Trafficking is hugely driven by poverty and a subsequent lack of education (Bales 2004). Families may sell some children out of desperation to feed their other children or they may be tricked into giving up their children for the promise of a job for them in another city. There is little education about trafficking prevention in many rural areas, making people much more vulnerable still. Women are particularly at-risk because they have a lack of access to livelihoods of their own; their security is dependent upon family.

Family is an imperative security net in India, especially in rural areas. Women need to maintain their home life despite domestic abuse or simply disagreeing with the husband's wishes or expectations. In many cases, this is because the women have nowhere else to go if they were to leave their husband's family and house. Through family, they have social welfare and economic security (Sen 1999). Alone, it is difficult for a woman to get a job or find housing. Women do not usually have other means of production such as owning land or resources to produce their own goods to sell, and do not have the means to access market entitlements just as getting a job (Sen 1999). In Bihar it is uncommon for women to work outside of the house and there are few jobs for those who might be allowed to go work, therefore taking away one entitlement and making the women more vulnerable and less independent. Therefore of Sen's entitlements, the only one left is dependence on family and social support.

Caste and Gendered Job Markets

Rakesh Dubey is Punarnawa's accountant who was born a Brahmin, the highest caste, and grew up in a town not far from the center. He heard about Punarnawa from his sister, who had worked there as a therapist for a few months before going to graduate school in Psychology. Dubey had worked for years as an accountant in many different parts of India and in Pokhara, Nepal before Punarnawa. He had fairly high paying jobs in the corporate world, but felt like he was missing something. He was seeking meaningful work, so came back to his hometown to try to make a difference in a place that he felt really needed help. Bihar is one of the poorest states in India, and suffers from a "brain drain" (Nair 2015, Chandrasekhar & Sharma 2014, Maharatna 2003), so Dubey is rare in that he returned with education and experience. The majority of young people who have money or education leave to find better jobs and do not return.

Two major points surface in Dubey's story: literacy and mobility. Education and wealth are rarely available to rural people, and only to males from high castes. Serious disparities in literacy among different groups are obvious: men have much higher literacy than women, people from low castes have less literacy than those of higher castes, and even religiously based discrepancies surface because Muslims have less literacy than Hindus (Borooah & Iyer 2005). There is a clear causative relationship between education and caste, that also have secondary consequences on access to business and wage earning. Therefore, it is imperative to look beyond

the simple connection of poverty and education because there are wide inter-group disparities delineated by caste, religion, region, assets such as land ownership, and gender (Deshpande 2000, 2001). Social impacts are significantly connected as well. Indian women who do not have education and are from low castes do not usually have access to markets through work or spatial separation, or means of production such as their own land to produce their own livelihoods (Sen 1999, Mukherjee 2013). Because of this, Indian women are dependent on social entitlements of family and friend networks, largely relying on their father or husband, which has further social implications of women's vulnerability and male dependence (Sen 1999), as discussed previously in relation to gender in India.

Clearly, caste compounds the issues of gender and work because while it is difficult for women to get work, it is even more difficult for women of lower castes (Kumar 2013, Liddle & Joshi 1986). Wide ranging economic liberalization in the early 1990s led to an overall increase in GDP and overall poverty reduction, but also a rise in inequality, widening the rural-urban gap and the gap between the urban wealthy and urban poor (Emran & Shilpi 2015). Among those poor, scheduled castes and scheduled tribes are most disadvantaged groups in India. While generally women do not work outside of the home, as discussed in the last section, this holds less true among scheduled castes because the men often do not make enough money to support the family and so women are encouraged to work, compelled by poverty. Munshi (2016) argues that people form strong networks around caste as a natural unit of economic activity and mobility. He also points out that while within castes people can move and thrive, people cannot move outside of their castes and thus suffer from the "static and dynamic inefficiencies that castes generate" (Munshi 2016).

When women have limited mobility, they are largely kept out of the paid labor force and kept within in the unpaid care economy (Chant 2013). In fact, limited mobility is one of the most significant factors in reducing women's ability to benefit from urban prosperity economically, socially, and politically. Women who cannot easily travel around the city due to transportation or safety limitations, which is most women in Mumbai, cannot necessarily attend school, mix with other social groups than their own, or participate in varied labor activities (Chant 2013). This was very true to my own experience in Mumbai – even as a white, comparatively wealthy woman, I was not safe to move about many parts of the city by myself.

Public transportation can be very unsafe for women, and I saw how women had limited access to different spaces in the city due to necessary permission from families, the expectation to stay near home, and the need to stay near other women and travel in groups due to safety (Bhattacharyya 2016). This became more widely discussed in public and in the media after the 2012 rape in Delhi which forced a change in rape laws and also caused increased awareness and resistance by women to public violence (Sullivan 2015, Verma et al 2016). When women do move around they have to adhere to specific dress and behavioral standards. These expectations and limitations are also stricter among the urban poor (Chant 2013), which I saw through my travels of Mumbai.

I address issues of caste, class, and rural vs. urban place because their intersectionality with gender is imperative to understanding the experience of women in India. Cultural and racialized differences impact youth in the cities of India, places which are hostile to the marginalized, even putting them at higher risk of disease (Smith 2015, Cornish et al 2012). Among the urban poor, women suffer significantly more than men due to unequal access to work, pay, safety and security, intra-urban mobility, and representation in government to enact any protection or anti-discrimination laws (Chant 2013). People of lower castes suffer from an inequality of opportunity from differential access to education, markets, and political power (Ghurye 1969, Emran & Shilpi 2015, Thorat & Neuman 2012). It is no surprise that the Hindu girls at Punarnawa and Kranti are almost entirely Dalit, the lowest caste. At their ages, caught between childhood and adulthood, they are the most vulnerable to poverty due to increased social expectations and reduced familial support (Arnot et al 2012, Lloyd 2005). Caste, class and religion often divide at-risk youth in India to a greater extent than in many other places, and affect them more than other place or identity-based factors do (Jeffrey & Young 2012).

Income Generating Programs

On the subject of vocational training, Punarnawa is quite different than Kranti because Punarnawa's staff members highly value vocational training as imperative to the future success and wellbeing of survivors. "Especially for the older girls, generating their own income is a way to provide security and prevent re-trafficking" says Bipin Bihari, the Trafficking in Persons District Coordinator of Gathan. In his role as the District Coordinator he works with rescue

missions, community anti-trafficking education programs, and follow-up with reintegrated survivors. One of Punarnawa's stars, a reintegrated survivor named Jaya, demonstrates the success of the center's vocational training programs. Thanks to her education at Punarnawa, today she is a self-sufficient entrepreneur. She is first and foremost a seamstress, the first in her village and the first woman to own her own business there as well. For additional income, Jaya also processes rice at night the way she learned to at Punarnawa through the farm training program. She buys unprocessed rice from local farmers, shells and cleans it at night, and resells it for a higher price. She reinvests her profits in those same farms for better seeds and fertilizer for higher quality crops and improved yield. Through her work, she has improved the circumstances of herself, her family, and her small rural community.

In addition to farming, the center offers a choice of sewing, farming, and beautician work, and everyone learns cooking. One girl has even begun to learn computer skills. This vocational training is incredibly important to the staff at Punarnawa because it will offer the girls a way to generate income upon reintegration. This emphasis on post-reintegration well-being is aimed at practical activities for women within a rural Indian setting. Sewing has become the biggest program at the center and has produced great results for girls who have graduated. Girls in the program can even get a USHA sewing certification from outside of the center after a significant number of instruction hours and passing a standardized test, which gives them higher credentials in their jobs. Emphasis on income generation at Punarnawa is common within human trafficking rehabilitation because, practically, these women are incredibly vulnerable and income is a major form of stability and control. All the while, much of this work can be done in the home, which is crucial so that once these girls get married they can still continue to work while remaining within the dictated domain of a wife.

Though many argue that these vocational activities may not appear to many people as forward-thinking or pro-feminist, they have made significant changes to the girls' lives and to their villages. The staff members at Punarnawa do not expect the girls to completely change the face of gender roles in their villages; they accept many gender and cultural norms such as communal living, the necessity of marriage, and the stipulations and restrictions on women's jobs and movement in rural Bihar. Researchers studying NGOs and empowerment programs

such as Desai (2005) are critical of such programs because they often oversimplify the role of culture and do not incorporate local culture into interventions or, in this case, rehabilitation.

To say that Punarnawa's efforts are not progressive enough and therefore do not actually help the girls, as various activists and staff members at more "modernized" rehabilitation centers said to me, is misapprehended. Reducing rehabilitation and not incorporating the cultural context of a centers into the methods is necessary for recovery and empowerment. Survivors from Punarnawa like Jaya have started their own sewing businesses in their villages, becoming the first seamstresses and entrepreneurs there. Girls who have learned to drive tractors at Punarnawa are some of the first women in rural Bihar to do so and get jobs doing so after reintegration. These paying jobs are usually for men, so for women to be in these positions is quite significant. Teaching skills that work around gendered cultural mandates such as staying in the home and caring for the family is a way that Punarnawa incorporates local culture into rehabilitation in a necessary and productive way. On the other hand, this does mean that girls are not encouraged to pursue other interests or to do more than go home and stay as a second-class citizen in rural India.

Kranti holds a position on vocational training that is quite opposite to the activities and beliefs at Punarnawa. Kranti's main focus in preparing the girls for later life is mental and emotional health rather than income-generating activities. Their activities such as dance, art, and music are for girls' growth and mental health more than job training, although because of their exposure to the arts, many girls do wish to pursue those activities as careers later. These developmental activities they do at Kranti drive the girls' imaginations and interests, which may lead to potential careers in the future. Robin, particularly, is strongly against offering vocational training at Kranti, in contrast to most other rehabilitation centers. She believes that the vocational training that centers offer are only activities that shuttle girls right back into their poor, Dalit lives on the outside where they do only what people expect of them. Sewing may perhaps be better than sex work or being trafficked, but it supports the infrastructure that leads to sex work and trafficking.

Sewing is a gendered job, and one of the few that are widely accepted for women. Robin does not want her girls to be within gendered jobs because she believes that gendering jobs gives men power over women and forces women into a second class position. I found that the

interpreted power or lack thereof that sewing can provide a girl is a significant rural-urban divide: at Punarnawa, sewing has been revolutionary for many survivors, allowing them the start their own businesses, be in charge of their own finances, and become wage earners in ways they would not have been able to if they had not learned the trade. But in Mumbai, where there are now positions for women at much higher levels within companies and NGOs, Robin sees sewing as a move backwards. She feels women are trapped in sewing by an androcentric society, reducing their agency and thus feeding into negative power dynamics that also are a cause of sex trafficking.

Future Perceptions: Trauma and Empowerment

The girls talk about their futures frequently and discuss what they want to do when they leave Kranti. A few of the girls want to open a café together when they finish Kranti, and these kinds of start-ups and individual businesses are highly encouraged at Kranti. Some of their job ideas are perhaps not as realistic, like becoming a famous singer or an animal therapist, though to their credit, they are trying to think outside of the jobs expected of them, being from their castes and neighborhoods. Aliya was struggling with feeling bullied and overburdened at Kranti when I was there. In her good moments she says she wants to be a social worker, but in her bad moments she says she wants to leave Kranti and return to her home and find work on Grant road, meaning in the red light district, even though she faces physical and sexual abuse at home.

According to Desai in a study on women's empowerment in the slums of Mumbai, "changes in the labour market and crises in urban livelihoods associated with economic globalisation are making poor urban women reassess their sense of who they are, and what they can do" (Desai 2005). The structure of these economic systems coupled with culture changes impact women's agency and thus their perceptions of their futures. Also important in the development of these survivor's sense of self and perception of their futures is society's perception of the girls and their futures, as well as NGO staff member's perceptions of and expectations for the girls' futures. According to development studies in Mumbai, urban NGOs can strengthen the capabilities of women in slums particularly in their ability to support women through dramatic changes in their lives, both social and economic (Desai 2005). This is Kranti's aim.

Empowerment

Gender disparities in job training and education significantly impact "personhood," in how they affect women's other capacities such as self-esteem and the ability to exert one's own agency (Chant 2013). Therefore, empowerment is a major aim of NGOs to boost women's sense of self and agency, in large part through increasing job training and education. According to Kabeer (1999), empowerment is "the ability of individuals who have been long denied choices to be able to make choices for themselves." Higher education is imperative to empowerment but also needs to be coupled with lessons of self-worth (Mukherjee 2013, Kabeer 1999). Empowerment is a "fluid and often unpredictable process, which leads to fundamental social transformation of society that enables individual women and marginalised groups to make decisions that allow them control over their lives" (Scheyvens 1998, Parpart et al. 2002). The staff members at Kranti have put together activities and lessons that help the girls practice autonomy and learn how to take back their own lives.

In the center, the staff help the girls engage with what is going on in the city and within themselves. Empowerment strategies must be highly place-specific if they are to be successful because they must respond to varied and complex national, regional, and local factors that affect women's capacity for organizing and engaging locally (Asthana 1996). At Kranti, they discuss the problems the girls face, articulate their pasts, and use those lessons to think about what they want to do differently in the future. During Kranti School one day, we discussed what social change the girls want to see in India and particularly in Mumbai. Immediately, many hands shot into the air to share their thoughts. They touched on everything from gay rights, to gender equality, to religious discrimination and separation.

During one of these discussions, Nitya, the oldest girl at Kranti, spoke passionately about how difficult it is for a girl or woman to have an independent life in India because of wide-spread gender discrimination and constricting social expectations for women. One of her friends is thirty years old and no one will rent an apartment to her because she is not married and no land lord would rent to an unmarried woman that old. Most of the other girls chimed in, agreeing that in India, women cannot live the way they want or wear the clothing they want, especially if they are a further minority because of skin color, level of education, or, for all of these girls, rampant

sex worker stigmas which turn people against them. Many of the girls, both current and graduated, are very engaged in social justice initiatives such as giving speeches and helping others who struggle with mental health or trauma issues. Engagement and interaction with community dynamics helps to engrain intervention activities and beliefs of the center in setting those beliefs into context, as well as increasing the center's network of support, resources, and public interest (Jana et al 2004; Schensul 2009).

Education

Development and empowerment literature all point toward education as a major way to change women's circumstances globally. Social change and women's agency first starts with educating women, particularly in how education opens the way for more entitlements that women can gain access to, such as markets and means of production (Sen 1999). Educated women are more able to negotiate in the home with husbands and the husbands' parents, as well as involve themselves in family money decisions and other tasks which allow the women more agency and active worth within the home (Arnot 2012, Mukherjee 2013). Literacy is particularly important for survivors of trafficking and the sex trade to understand their rights which are so often withheld from them.

Through education, women in poverty are able to escape a "normative biography" – the standard life expected of women in that area (Arnot 2012). This holds true particularly for the Punarnawa girls because without the center, the majority of these girls would not have had more than a few years of education, and many would have had no education at all. Both Punarnawa and Kranti staff members value education as a critical aspect of rehabilitation and empowerment. Schooling itself can be difficult for girl however. Once they overcome familial and societal pressures to keep girls out of school because it is not their place or they are needed for work at home, girls suffer from gender bias in access and admittance to school (Agrawal 2014). They also suffer from bias within schools, dealing with preferential treatment towards boys and a common attitude from teachers that girls are less smart and less capable than their male counterparts (Haq 2008).

Painting the Future

To explore the survivors' impressions of their future more deeply, I conducted a visual art research project with the girls at both centers. I asked them to take a piece of paper and draw a line down the middle. Then, on one half, draw their life now, and on the second half, draw their life in five years. These instructions were left intentionally vague to let the girls respond in any way they saw fit and retain the integrity of the results by ensuring the girls would not feel restricted to only draw, for example, a picture of a future job or home. This way they could draw anything that best represents their lives now and what they hope for their futures. Drawing is another form of self-expression in which the child's response is not tied directly to physical surroundings but can express any level of imagination beyond what is immediately, tangibly possible (Leitch 2008, Moss 2008).

These pictures supported the conversations I had with girls, showing me that that a major impact on what jobs the girls wanted was what they told their options were by the staff. Kranti girls drew pictures of being teachers, singers, actresses, and travelling the world. A study by Beaman (2012) examined youth empowerment and the impact of female leadership on girls in India and found that the aspirations of parents for their children greatly influenced the children's own aspirations. Exposure by Kranti staff to social workers, nonviolent communication teachers, and therapists, as well as dance, music, and theater lessons, drives the girls to want those jobs. Mumbai, as a city, offers a plethora of different professions, and the ones the girls are exposed to by the staff are what becomes engrained in their minds. In Kranti School, staff also cater to the girls needs and abilities, helping Shreya, who is severely dyslexic, find ways to engage in more hands-on practical learning, or finding that Meena, who is deaf, needs to not be in Kranti School, but in a school that can teach her sign language and then conduct all of their classes in sign. This flexibility allows for girls who, outside of Kranti, would have been left behind to flourish and improve themselves too.

In Kranti School the girls have field trips each week with this in mind to introduce them to what is out there and what is possible. Meeting other women who are in leadership roles can be very influential to adolescent girls' career aspirations and education attainment. Women who are leaders or experts become role models for young women, breaking subservient gender role

stereotypes and increasing women's interest in and propensity to enter traditionally male-dominated spaces and professions (Beaman 2012).

The influential impact of teachers' beliefs on girls' perceptions held true at Punarnawa as well. The caseworker, Deepshika, says that she feels that sewing is the most helpful and impactful vocational training they offer, and thus it is unsurprisingly the most popular subject. In the Punarnawa pictures, most girls depicted their lives in five years with sewing shops and sewing projects more difficult and complex than the ones they could do now. A few girls drew big houses and described wanting to have a family and take care of a nice home. Two girls drew books and pencils, saying they wanted to be teachers. Only one girl drew something outside of what they learned at the center, depicting her life as a future police officer.

Many girls from Punarnawa were at first wary of the exercise, and a few refused to partake altogether. One girl, Neysa, was upset and frustrated by the idea, saying that she did not know what her future was going to be, and it did not matter. This sixteen-year-old girl and mother of an eight-month-old stood before me, paralyzed by fear of the future. In many ways, Punarnawa is a safe haven from the outside world, which also means girls can hide from dealing with the outside world or what comes next. Besides their vocational training, staff members talk very little with the girls about what comes next in life until they are ready for reintegration, and even then, little preparation is done with the girls for reintegration. The reintegration officer said that they work hard with the parents and villages to prepare for the girls return, but without mentally preparing the girls for the future, many desperately feared the unknown of life after Punarnawa. Without careful rehabilitation and reintegration, there is a high likelihood of being re-captured or even survivors returning to their traffickers willingly because it is a life they know (Bales 2007). Even though the life is bad, it is a roof over their head and it is less scary than the unknown; there is some level of safety in letting someone else control their lives if they do not have the tools to feel that they can be in control of their own lives (Bales 2007).

While this art project was largely intended to shed light on the differences or similarities in the girls' future perceptions, the "now" pictures were surprisingly informative in their own right. In the Punarnawa girls' present pictures they had drawn big houses, flowers, books, and the sun: in short, pictures of stability and happiness. When asked to explain their pictures, the girls said this too. "I feel safe here", Arthi said. In complete contrast, the majority of the Kranti

"now" pictures expressed confusion, turmoil, stress, and fear. Swirling dark colors represented feeling that they were in an unstable space now, with the explanation, "I don't know what my life is now. I am confused. I don't know what I'm doing." Another girl, Shreya, had painted the present all black, with somber eyes on top, and the future bright yellow, with painted pink fingernails in the corners. "Now I'm sad. All I want in the future is to be happy."

Reintegration is the main hurdle to overcome when helping survivors because it can be fraught with complications and tests the girls' newfound sense of identity and confidence. In a study on rehabilitation and reintegration with live-in recovering hospital patients, some said about going home that they thought "everything would go back to normal in due course, others began to realize in the post-discharge phase that their life would never be the same, and this hit them hard" (Nanninga et al 2014). This range of responses is similar within Kranti, as are the feelings of sadness and fear when looking out into the tumultuous future that many of the girls still cannot quite imagine. Shreya, a twenty-year-old at Kranti, said she was terrified to leave the organization. She showed me one of her daily journal entries which talked about her future, and in it she expressed not knowing what she wants to do or where to go. While she gets very frustrated with the rules and people at Kranti sometimes, Shreya admitted that she never wants to leave and does not feel like she knows how to reinvent herself outside of the center.

To help process and understand the role of gender, caste, and class in Mumbai as well as process their own recovery and futures, Robin wrote a play called Lal Batti Express. The girls acted in it, playing sex workers, madams, etc. to explore major issues of sexual abuse, women's rights, and traditional Indian gender roles. This play was just one of the many ways that Kranti girls engage with the city not in a learning, but a teaching capacity. Many of the girls offer their stories as guest speakers for events, rallies, companies, and NGOs to teach people what it is like to grow up in the red light areas. Aliya teaches children around Mumbai about childhood sexual abuse, speaking from her own experience (Chaurasiya 2013). These interactions help humanize survivors too. The subjects of prostitution and trafficking are so taboo that they are rarely discussed and people do not have a face to empathize with instead of jumping to their own conclusions about what the daughter of a sex worker might be like. By telling their story, the Kranti girls can reach people in a positive way, putting those terrible experiences to good use and thus reshaping their trauma into empowerment.

Conclusion

Place significantly impacts the trajectory of care and empowerment required to propel survivors into safe and healthy positions after reintegration due to local economic opportunities and gender, caste, and class-based expectations. Gender roles and expectations overlap in rural Bihar and urban Mumbai, but each society does have different beliefs and culture surrounding women and work. Local political economies and job markets shape the access women have to work and thus to autonomy and agency. Jobs they can perform and the mobility required to get to jobs that are out of the house are dependent on culture and place-based understandings of women's potential and utility. Increased job markets for women alone are not enough if women cannot travel back and forth to work safely or cheaply. Place-based expectations for women put tremendous pressure on survivors and who they should become. Gender expectations not only differ based on place, but differ on caste and class-based lines as well. Spaces within the home, town, or cities are divided into spaces for women and men, people of different caste, and different classes through work that is done in those spaces, different types of interactions the space provides, and even the manner of accessing a space such as by foot or by car. These factors impact the survivors' sense of self and perception of the future based on society's expectations for them. Gender, caste, and class expectations and stigmas also inform staff members' perceptions of the girls' futures and how staff choose to guide the girls to their definition of success.

It is important to note in this analysis that I met the girls at Kranti and Punarnawa in what is kind of a transitional period of their lives. These centers are their launch pads, not their final place to stay, and with that the girls are within a major learning process. Girls may not internalize lessons they learn from classes and activities until years later. Shreya, a Kranti girl who was having behavioral problems, went to an Outward Bound camp for troubled teens. Melissa, one of the staff members, was thrilled to see the girl's improvement, but only a few days after finishing the one-month program, the girl was caught stealing from her friends again. Clearly, development is slow and oscillates. The hope is that with enough time and enough different programs and exposure to new ideas and positive experiences, the girls will be able to make long term change in their lives.

Empowering survivors' to not only get past their traumas but then become leaders in their societies through fighting trafficking in Bihar or sex worker stigma in Mumbai is dependent on engagement with activities and people associated with place, education, and creating a safe space for the girls to recover and grow. They need to understand the prejudices and intersectional marginalizing factors of identity and, importantly, where those stigmas come from, to understand how to make social change. When girls described their paintings, residents at both Punarnawa and at Kranti expressed the love and familial care they felt from the center. That security and inspiration from staff members who double as caretakers and role models, impacting the girls' future perceptions, inspire the girls to fight systems of oppression and make sure other girls like them do not have to face the same level of stigma and danger they did, or at least not face them alone. Even Priya from Punarnawa, who said she only wanted to become a housewife in her rural village, expressed her desire to take care of her children and make sure nothing like what happened to her ever happens to her children, ending the cycle of trafficking in her own small way.

Education and empowerment have helped Priya understand that trafficking can be prevented and she can use her traumatic experience to make positive change in her society by helping prevent further abuse. In this rural site, even house wives can be change-makers. This chapter has shown the impact of gendered places on developing a girl's sense of self and ability. Survivors' perception of their future is mediated by what they learn from social and economic aspects of the landscape which divide work into men's work and women's work or work specifically for low caste people. Rehabilitation methods must take these social expectations of the girls into account to understand how the girls' interests may be based on those expectations they have heard their entire lives, and also must include giving girls tools to achieve a higher standard of life than they had before through vocational training and education. This research sheds light on gendered political economy in India and the ways gender and other place-based identity factors inform survivors' ability to reimagine their future.

Chapter 5
Conclusion

Introduction

Discrimination and marginalization set the stage for trafficking and the necessity of rehabilitation. Political and social systems contextualize recovery methods and activities of care centers. Methods vary based on place and landscape, at times mirroring local social order and, at times, intentionally opposing it. Place impacts the staff members' ideals, shaping their beliefs about gender expectations, rehabilitation, mental health, and the role of NGOs in India. The major themes in this thesis of landscape, sense of place, identity, and the gendered political economy of the future, are deeply enmeshed in one another, and together encompass some of the most salient efforts within survivor rehabilitation. My research offers a comparative case study of these key concepts from health geography, providing a unique view from within the centers to demonstrate the way survivors and staff interact with their urban and rural landscapes.

Through ethnography of life in rural and urban care centers, this thesis provides an understanding of the impacts of place and landscape on trauma rehabilitation in India from a lens of human trafficking and the sex trade. It builds on literature about gendered political economy in India to discuss the ways gender informs trauma care and recovery. Through a place-based analysis of marginalizing factors in rural and urban India, the thesis discusses the ways place, sense of place, and trauma impact identity creation among these girls. It also identifies how gender and the local social and economic structures and expectations on women impact the ability of these survivors to negotiate their identities and re-imagine their futures.

Often when I talk to Americans about my research, I hear a common refrain: 'How could parents sell their children into slavery? How could a mother make her daughter live in the red light district if the girls are so frequently mistreated? How could a parent do that to their child? They must be terrible people, terrible parents who do not love their children.' This view, however, is uninformed and misguided. More often, girls are captured or families are tricked into giving their child to a trafficker. Someone comes into a village and tells a family, 'I will give your child a job and an education, and they will send money back to you. Just send your

child with us!' And, of course, parents are often thrilled for such an opportunity. Growing up in dire straits, whether it be poverty in a city or on a rural farm, causes desperation. Parents want their children to have a better life, and do not know enough to protect their children. For the women raising their daughters in the red light district, they often do not have any other choice or way to take care of their daughters. Even in situations where a family member sells a child, it is much more complicated than a mere lack of love. Severe poverty and hunger drive people to desperate decisions.

There are institutionalized discriminations that make trafficking possible: gender, caste, and class-based discrimination make certain people targets because they are seen as expendable and as worth less than other people (Bales 2007, Metzker 2012, Awasthi 2014). Lower caste people are kept out of jobs where they might be able to improve their livelihoods. Poor farmers cannot move to a place where they could get a higher paying job to better support their families. The institutions that facilitate poverty disproportionally impact these marginalized communities, making them more vulnerable to traffickers through desperation and lack of education (Bales 2004, Silverman et al 2007). I discuss education and its relationship to marginalization, trafficking, and rehabilitation further in this chapter because it is inextricably tied to all of the inter-connected facets of survivor care and empowerment.

Marginalizing factors of identity such as gender, caste, and class also set the stage for those same people to fall through the cracks of the political and security systems put in place to protect the citizens of India. The interaction of poverty and gender discrimination increases the risk of sex trafficking (Silverman et al 2007). Prejudice against the Dalit community can make police officers look the other way when someone is being abused (Awasthi 2011). It can also cause policy makers to turn a blind eye to structural discrimination of marginalized people which they could help correct, such as issues surrounding women in the work place (Esteve-Volart 2004, Agrawal 2014). India's social system is built on communities – people depend on their communities of family, locality, vocation, etc. to fill social, cultural, and economic needs (Sen 1999). When people are outside of that system as a result of being orphans or being taken out of their communities, they are easily taken advantage of. There are many factors that could lead people to be trafficked or working in the sex trade, but marginalization is always one of them. I

found that gender, caste, class, and, by proxy, access to education were the most significant stressors to the survivors' vulnerabilities in both the rural and urban location.

Red light district social support systems are complicated because they are spaces of support, but also of violence and danger. Women in red light districts do have their own community, but they suffer from abuse within those communities instead of being buoyed by those people. Similar to women in situations of domestic violence, they cannot depend on the familial network for support and instead that social system makes their lives harder. Those familial networks are crucial within India and women are particularly dependent upon them for social and economic support. Women in red light district communities are disadvantaged because their support systems are not institutionalized or recognized by the state, and thus cannot get all of the same benefits of being part of that group. Sex work is not legal, and its legalization is highly contentious among anti-human trafficking workers globally. From her work with women in Mumbai's red light district, Robin Chaurasiya, Kranti's director, advocates for legalization because it will help these women access institutions like health care if they are recognized as workers in a legal profession. Other anti-trafficking workers argue legalization will only increase incidents of trafficking.

India's political and social systems have left a gap for survivor rehabilitation that NGOs must fill (Desai 2005). NGOs often arise when there is a lack of government services provided in a particular field or surrounding a particular issue (Whaites 2000). Human trafficking has not been widely publicly or governmentally acknowledged in India (Awasthi 2014) and, accordingly, the government has not established extensive or far-reaching care or recovery programs. The government has helped with rescue missions, as have local police forces, but once slaves are rescued, those survivors are expected to move on with their lives (FTS 2010). In the last ten years, government programs have been established to provide survivors who testify against their attackers with money and access to government jobs, but girls who are not put into institutions like Punarnawa often do not know these programs exist or how to access them (Gaur 2015). Additionally, girls are often unwilling to testify against their traffickers. Many girls are too scared of retribution, too ashamed to admit what happened in front of people they do not know, or go on record about it (Awasthi 2011).

Landscape

Landscapes offers a variety of physical, economic, and ideological inputs and limitations to recovery and care centers. The staff at Kranti and Punarnawa work within and around them to design their programs to the best of their abilities. Landscapes help shape local and regional identity by impacting socially acceptable, widely held beliefs and ideals (Palang & Kluwer 2003). Leaders and members of institutions may not explicitly enforce these social norms to support particular social, gender, or economic structures, but do so inadvertently in the ways they interact with residents and design their care programs (Chin et al 2008). Through chiding a girl for walking around without wearing a scarf or praising a girl for standing in class before speaking, the staff members instill local cultural values into the girls.

I focused on the relational dimensions of the self-landscape encounter (Conradson 2005), not simply looking at each landscape as one experience but the myriad of experiences individuals have with a landscape. Within health geography there is a tendency to frame therapeutic landscapes as having intrinsically therapeutic properties, but because people experience places in different ways, it is crucial to consider specifically an individual's interaction with landscape, more than the objective, unattached landscape by itself (Conradson 2005). Some girls love living at Kranti and in Mumbai, but a few expressed a wish to get away from the busyness and stress of the city, so two girls went to Outward Bound outdoor education camps in the United States and a few others spent time in rural Nepal with a trekking therapy group. Residents experience the landscapes differently, as do staff members. Landscapes shape them and their ideals, which in turn shape staff decision-making. Staff members go to great lengths to get something they do not have if they believe in it. On the other hand, in situations where they may have access to economic or social benefits, sometimes they choose not to utilize them because they do not want to form the girls in those ways. Robin will not allow a sewing machine in the house because she sees sewing as a job beneath the Kranti girls that reinforces gender discrimination, but will work hard to fundraise to take the girls to places they can be out in nature and hike which they cannot get in Mumbai.

Identity

Throughout this thesis I have demonstrated many ways in which girls' identities are shaped by their surroundings within the center and the broader community. Local societal expectations play a pivotal role in shaping the girls' upbringings and put a lot of pressure on the girls to be less than they could be. The NGO staff members also have expectations for the girls' recovery, behavior, and futures that are based on the staff members' own beliefs and place-based cultures. The survivors must then navigate these sets of expectations to develop their own identities and sense of self tied to their sense of place in Mumbai and Bihar, as well as the 'micro-place' of the centers. Major characteristics mediating girls' experiences with their surroundings include caste, class, and gender. The socio-cultural traditions in which the girls are mired inform all of the complexities of the intersections of identity for women in India (Haq 2008). It means a certain set of things to be a woman in India, and then to be, for instance, a dark-skinned woman in India, or a female trafficking survivor who is also a Dalit.

A piece of identity which I have not thoroughly examined is these girls' title as 'human trafficking victims.' Punarnawa and Kranti are run in a similar way to address similar traumas and social problems which emanate from gender, caste, class, race, and religious cruelties coupled with economic greed. However, it is reductive to call all of these girls simply human trafficking victims. According to Dubey and Amita, Punarnawa's accountant and director respectively, the girls at Punarnawa come from three tracks: slavery, sex trafficking, or were street girls, meaning they were homeless and police could not find their families, so instead of sending them to prison, the girls were sent to rehabilitation centers. Kranti girls were not trafficked, though people had tried to traffic some of them. They grew up in the red light district, again experiencing similar sexual, physical, and mental abuse to the three different types of girls at Punarnawa.

All of these girls are disenfranchised youth, marginalized by certain aspects of their identities, who have lived through rape and abuse, and have been rendered powerless to fixing their situation. They have been victims of the same political, economic, and social structures which enable trafficking, abuse, and marginalization of girls in India. However at a deeper level, these girls have undergone different experiences. They are not all trafficking victims, yet they are sent to a trafficking rehabilitation center or, at Kranti, a trauma recovery trafficking

prevention center. Further identity research at these centers could critically examine consolidating disenfranchised youth and how they self-identify as survivors of different traumatic experiences living and recovering together.

Funneling many types of girls into an institution like Punarnawa demonstrates the lack of resources and services for disenfranchised youth in India. Desai (2005) discusses NGOs and their role in strengthening women's social and economic lives. Economic liberalization has worsened the public services situation in India, causing a lack of social services that NGOs are now trying to provide (Desai 2005). Instead of having separate care centers for girls with different backgrounds, they are all expected to assimilate into one type of institution that, at Punarnawa, is labeled rehabilitation, which has significant implications of something being wrong with the girl that needs to be fixed. Robin feels strongly that Kranti is not for rehabilitation because she says there is nothing wrong with these girls and, to her, rehabilitation has negative connotations of broken girls needing to be improved. Instead, she wants to give the girls another chance at life outside of perilous situations within the red light districts. In the end, though, their goals of care, recovery, and empowerment at Kranti are, in essence, the same goals at Punarnawa. They want the girls to have a safe space to work through or get past some of their trauma and have a second chance at thriving in their futures.

Future Expectations

Girls interpret their futures through local gender expectations, staff's expectations, and place-based economic opportunities. Within the centers, on-site activities mediate the girls' understandings of appropriate jobs to have in the future and self-identity characteristics they are expected to develop. Staff members' lofty expectations of the girls becoming business owners or entrepreneurs are tempered by social and cultural discrimination against women. Social expectations on these survivors' future occupations have some similarities between rural and urban India. Women are second class citizens in both places. Both rural and urban women are commonly expected in unpaid labor, domestic work, and care work, restricting women's use of space and prospects of mobility (Chant 2013). However, there are more job options in Mumbai than rural Bihar and there is more job mobility afforded to women in urban settings.

Gender discrimination is, of cours,e complicated further when people know about girls' backgrounds of trafficking or living in the red light districts, and in some areas, the stigma can be insurmountable. It can be difficult for the girls themselves to get past, complicating interact with men, in social settings, in the workplace, and in marriage. Vulnerability and desperation arise out of extreme poverty from unequal globalization, and stigma has kept those vulnerable people separate and helpless (Bales 2007). These girls suffer compounded discrimination publicly and in the job market based on class, caste, religion, and race. Those stigmas often turn violent, making public space dangerous for women, reducing their mobility (Phadke 2007).

The rural/urban divide is most pertinent to the girls' futures as it impacts access to education, jobs, and services. Education is difficult to access in rural Bihar, especially higher education. Most young people who have the money to continue their education leave the state to do so (Maharatna 2003, Nair 2015). That, however, mostly pertains to boys, and is only afforded by the few wealthiest families in Bihar. More commonly, men leave to work instead of study. The majority of girls do not have either luxury. Access also affects the centers' income generating programs because of the skills they decide to teach at each. The goal of income generating programs is to teach the girls knowledge or trades that will empower them and help them get a job later. While the skills they teach at each center are very different, both are attempting to offer the girls employable skills in addition to academic skills such as reading, writing, and math. Teachers at both centers instill beliefs in the girls about identity and work that are counter to local norms for girls of their caste and background.

Access to inspiration and role models is crucial for girls to succeed in their futures. Both centers staff members are, themselves, significant role models for the girls. Many girls say they want to be teachers just like Zarna at Kranti or Nisa at Punarnawa. Female leadership influences adolescent girls' career aspirations and drive for education (Beaman et al 2012). Poor urban women's aspirations have been dramatically affected by the impact of global economic change on urban life in Mumbai (Desai 2002). These social and economic factors impact empowerment. Empowerment of individuals and communities is a fluid process which has the potential to lead to fundamental social transformation of society that can enable women and marginalized groups to make decisions that allow them control over their lives (Desai 2005, Scheyvens 1998, Parpart

et al. 2002). Attaining control of their lives is a major goal of empowerment and rehabilitation staff's major hope for survivors' futures.

Broader Connections and Future Research

Effective care and rehabilitation methods draw from issues and concepts beyond just health geography. In this thesis I focused on landscape, sense of place, identity, and future, but there are other topics that are extremely important to care and rehabilitation in the ways they impact care center methods and capacity to do their jobs. The three I have mentioned throughout this thesis are education, mobility, and trauma-informed care. Each of these has been a theme in every chapter because they impact aspects of landscape and resources, identity creation, and girls' perception of the future. They are all also tied to intersectionality and positionality as they are informed by many aspects of girls' identities, altering the ways the girls interact with the landscape. While I have discussed them in relation to my themes of landscape, place, and identity, each of these topics is rich for further study on its impacts on rehabilitation and human trafficking.

Mobility

As a white tall woman, simply going outside for a samosa was an endeavor in India. The stares, cat calls, comments, and advances from men are exhausting. I was lucky in my ability to get out of that space by going into the center, unlike the women who had to work on the street as a vendor, seamstress, or the like. I could also get off the street by getting into a rickshaw or on the train, which I, unlike many women, could afford. My whiteness gave me certain protection because the advances people made were largely non-threatening. The girls at Kranti showed me and told me about how difficult it is for them to move around the city. For girls of their age and backgrounds, they were incredibly mobile. From research in Indian cities, women from every class have been found to travel less frequently and less far as the men from their class, and both lower class men and women have less mobility than the wealthier classes (Mahadevia & Adani 2016). The Kranti girls hopped on the train, though never bought tickets, and walked long distances because they could walk in groups for safety. Safety has been a theme throughout this thesis both as a goal for the centers to provide a safe space for recovery and growth, as well as a

difficulty as it relates to experiencing private and public spaces. These girls come from abusive situations whether at home or in trafficking, and across India there is high insecurity among women because of the ever-present threat of violence (Verma et al 2016). Predictors of domestic violence are poverty and work status (Dalal & Lindqvist 2012), which also influence violence in public spaces.

While I did not get to see any of the Punarnawa girls go out to the market because they were not allowed to leave the campus, I did notice that the female staff members who went to market never went into public unescorted. They were driven to town by the neighboring male farmer who drove the center's vehicle. He stayed with them around town and then drove them home too. This is not to say that there are no solo-mobile or progressive women there. Even in the rural town, teenage girls could be seen in western jeans and tee-shirts, and sometimes Punarnawa's caseworker, Deepshika, rode a moped by herself in her sari to get to the center because she lived in town. More often though, Deepshika rode to work with Dubey.

Mobility gives women access to the world, though that mobility is mediated and often stifled by issues of identity. Poverty, caste, and skin color are just three factors that alter how women experience the space outside of the centers and, in fact, how much they are able to experience space outside of the centers. Public violence against women is common, especially towards more vulnerable populations which are those marginalized women (Bhattacharyya 2016). Mobility is important to discuss because it has been strongly tied to agency and can buoy a girl's sense of self and confidence. However, some girls move through space more easily than others. Specifically, visible markers of difference such as gender and ragged or cheap clothing make a person stand out when they are outside of the spaces where they are 'supposed to be' because they are a woman or because they are Dalit.

As I alluded to when talking about my own experience with mobility in India, skin color, too, is a powerful, visible factor of identity. I did not focus on it in this study, but it is a significant factor of identity for many trafficking/sex trade survivors in India, and a topic that would benefit further study. It is important to understand both my positionality, and the experience of survivors. Race has been a point of discrimination deep in South Asian history and further compounded by Eastern European colonization (Nicholson 2015). During the colonial period, European understandings of race were superimposed onto Indian social

conditions including caste (Dharampal-Frick 2013). People of lower caste were already often darker skinned than those of higher castes, but the European conception of dark skin made racism toward lower caste dark skinned people worse. This background demonstrates the ways political histories inform modern identities.

Throughout this thesis I have discussed intersectionality and positionality to discuss the girls' experiences of negotiating complex identities. Race is a factor of how the girls at Punarnawa and, perhaps more so, at Kranti, are perceived. In the media, whiteness and lightness is emphatically favored; every woman on TV in commercials and shows that the girls at Punarnawa watched was very light skinned. The girls even nicknamed one commercial actress "Kathryn" after me because they said she was white like me, even though she was also Indian. Whitening creams are ubiquitous in south Asia and rich women stay covered and out of the sun because it is looked down upon to be dark skinned. Light skin is supposed to look more beautiful and shows that the woman does not have to work outside.

Further research on race would be beneficial to understanding further intersectionality of survivors' identities and its impact on mobility. Race is very tied to caste; often those from the lowest castes are also darker skinned. Race also compounds issues of caste because it causes further hierarchy within a caste. Even at Kranti, some of the girls referred to Ranjeeta as "the dark one." The girls actually got along quite well with Ranjeeta while I was there, but when she first came to Kranti she was not as well accepted. Pooja, a light-skinned girl at the center, talked to me about the issue one day. "Girls like Ranjeeta and Aliya, the girls with darker skin, have a harder time. When they walk around on the street, they are judged. People are meaner to them than they are to us." Caste is not always automatically visible in the streets, but skin color is.

While it is necessary to address the dangers associated with mobility like racial prejudice, it is also important to acknowledge the great benefits to mobility for survivors. Mobility offers people agency, access to new people and ideas, and control of their own lives: instrumental values in promoting human development (Menon 2015, Kostka 2012). At Kranti, Robin folds mobility into the curriculum because she has found that the girls gain confidence and independence when they are able to navigate their landscape. "The girls are scared at first, but they help each other and they figure it out, you know? They need to get around to their dance

classes or art classes, and they will need to be able to get around once they leave Kranti too. For jobs, friends, events, whatever. They can benefit from the city if they are able to get around".

Mobility allows people power over their movement, body, and space, while also benefitting from urban prosperity such as schools, social mixing, and labor participation (Chant 2013). Traveling can be unsafe, but awareness and resistance of sexual violence toward women is increasing in India (Sullivan 2015). The staff members at Punarnawa, though, still feel now that the benefits of keeping girls in for safety outweigh the risk of leaving for any payoff mobility could offer them. They say it is too dangerous to go out both for the girls' immediate safety and for the center, because more people would learn about it and could find out where it is, making them more vulnerable to traffickers who are trying to find girls who have escaped. Unfortunately, mobility has significant implications for girls trying to get an education.

Education

Mobility is often an obstacle between girls and education in India. Education is still a luxury not afforded to many girls and lower caste people. While completion of education among the newest generations of girls has increased, it is still disproportionately low (Chant 2013). Education is widely regarded as the best method for equipping women with home skills, such as childcare, health, nutrition, hygiene, as well as skills for paid work participation (Mukherjee 2013). Lack of education makes marginalized people more vulnerable and impacts their ability to find jobs, adding to their already difficult time getting a job because of social prejudices against women, low castes, certain religions, etc. Within schools, gender discrimination is rampant in access to education, unequal treatment, and expectations in school (Esteve-Volart 2004). Kranti girls relayed stories of being ridiculed and not being taken seriously by their teachers. The intersections of multiple marginalizing identities can make it very difficult for girls to get an education.

Education changes how girls see themselves, their abilities, and their futures. Arnot (2012) argues that schooling is reshaping gender relations because the more girls are educated, the more they can interact as peers with boys and gain knowledge and confidence. Gender disparities in training and education affect women's other capacities such as self-esteem and the ability to exert agency – their so-called "personhood" (Chant 2013). Women in poverty are able

to escape a normative biography of house work and submission through schooling (Arnot 2012). This is a major point for Punarnawa girls because most them did not receive education before coming to the center and if they had not been at Punarnawa, probably would never have gotten it. More educated women are able to negotiate in the home with their husbands or husbands' families, and are more involved in family money decision-making, offering them more active worth and agency within the home (Arnot 2012).

Literacy alone is a strong force against human trafficking – if they can read, people cannot be tricked into signing something they do not understand, intending to agree to something good but instead signing their rights away (Bales 2004). Increasing education and literacy would reduce instances of trafficking (Bales 2004, Awasthi 2011). Education and literacy are, as demonstrated throughout this thesis, imperative to trauma-informed care. Both care centers incorporate education to empower the girls, help them press charges against their traffickers, and prepare them for reintegration.

Trauma-Informed Care

Crucial aspects of trauma and psychology are folded into this geographic study of rehabilitation and landscape as they relate to health geography. However, this research has implications for trauma-informed survivor care. Future research on place and rehabilitation could be done within geography or also within psychology, particularly if one wanted to quantify the effects of place on identity and empowerment or measure improvement and efficacy of rehabilitative tasks. Three points I would like to re-emphasize about trauma-informed care and my research are how we group trauma patients, stigma, and empowerment.

My research shows that not all trauma survivors are the same, nor do they respond to rehabilitation methods in the same ways. Centers must adjust their practices to cater to different individual needs and local cultural considerations, realizing that the girls come to the centers with different positionalities which will make them experience their care differently. On a larger scale, people with mental-health issues cannot be homogenized as a single excluded group (Parr 2000). There are boundaries within these groups that differentiate trauma survivors. Lines of distinction include regions of origin, religion, caste, skin color, level of education and age. As I discussed in the introduction, girls with very different past experiences are lumped together as

trauma survivors and put into an institution that must then address a wide array of needs. Girls at the centers see the differences between them. Because they are homogenized, girls will often receive similar stigmas for issues such growing up in the red light district, but girls who have other marginalizing identify factors experience more stigma and prejudice than others.

Stigma surrounding health issues increases marginalization and isolation and negatively impacts mental health (Chin et al 2008). Social stigmatization of mental health problems makes survivors feel they cannot discuss their problems, keeping them from getting the help they need. Survivors and wider communities also then may forgo the opportunity for education and discussion on prevention and care (Chin et al 2008). While gender and body stigmas surrounding sex trafficking have gained some attention from the academic community, further research on the impact of stigma on identity and reintegration would be beneficial to care centers. Stigma complicates reintegration, especially in the rural context. Girls must carefully decide with whom they can safely share their trafficking experience and from whom they must hide it. People who believe that girls are not victims but dirty and sullied will ostracize the girls from the community (Bihari 2015). Empowerment is therefore crucial to integrate into rehabilitation practice because the girls must be confident in their innocence and able to move forward with conviction, confidence, and strength.

Empowerment is the "ability of individuals who have been long denied choices to be able to make choices for themselves" (Kabeer 1999). It is widely understood that education is imperative to empowerment, but must specifically include teaching women self-worth to be empowering (Mukherjee 2013). I found that asking adolescent girls to think about what their futures look like can be scary for them, but also can be helpful. The painting task I conducted with the girls helped them think about what they can be and what they want to be. It helps them identify their own positionality, though they do not use that terminology, which can reflect back to them their own identities. This visual art project would be helpful to conduct again with the girls, not just for research to see how their perception of the present and the future change over time, but also for the girls to get used to reflecting about the present and develop their perceptions of their futures. This activity could become a semi-regular project to conduct once or twice per year to let the girls reflect on their lives and express their feelings visually so they are not constrained by finding the right words for how they feel. Empowerment along with

education has been used by NGOs to address identity, stigma, and marginalization among survivors. While NGOs take many different approaches to caring for survivors, they have arisen to provide a similar role in a community.

NGO Interventions

I would briefly like to examine Punarnawa and Kranti purely from an NGO standpoint and the role of NGOs in society. As I mentioned before, NGOs are filling gaps in rehabilitation needs that government is not addressing. However, it is necessary to be wary of particularly international NGOs and to be critical of interventions for their frequent oversimplification of the role of culture in care and rehabilitation (Kostick et al 2011). Kostick et al (2011) argue that local culture must be incorporated into rehabilitation interventions. This is beneficial for the residents because centers can better address community dynamics, allowing residents to better receive and absorb rehabilitation activities and principles. It also allows organizations to connect with community members to access local resources, assistance, and public support for their programs (Jana et al 2004, Schensul 2009). Punarnawa has an easier time of this because it is run by local Biharis. Kranti was started and is still headed by an Indian American, so have more to balance between American ideals and Indian culture.

Kranti's mixed heritage does allow them to more critically examine Indian norms and standards, setting them apart from some care centers which continue to institutionalize gender discrimination through keeping girls within the uneven social and economic structures that are rampant in India. According to development studies in Mumbai, urban NGOs can strengthen the social and economic capabilities of women in slums by supporting women through dramatic changes in their lives (Desai 2005). Progressive and marginalized community institutions inevitably challenge prevailing social and economic structures by helping under-privileged, under-cared for communities (Chin et al 2008). Those challenges can affect the ever-evolving norms of the local community. Punarnawa, too, is challenging local norms by teaching girls to start their own businesses and drive tractors – activities largely unheard of for women in rural Bihar.

Policy Implications

NGOs arise to address issues that have not been adequately covered by government assistance (Gemmill, & Bamidele-Izu 2002, Whaites 2000). My research helps to show that these centers need more government support in the shape of social backing and funding. It is common that NGOs, even those providing basic necessary public services, must depend on private donors because they do not get government funding (Palmer 2006). Donor funding is often less reliable than regular government funding would be. In India, the problem with government funding goes deeper. While the Indian government has laws about trafficking and government officials sometimes help with rescues, the wider stance of the government is still that India does not have a trafficking problem. Without acknowledgement of the problem, they cannot fix it and cannot then address the next aspects, such as rehabilitation and reintegration. National level policy changes are needed to make sure girls from any state can get financial and job support after being trafficked – this should not be left to the state government level to handle because that allows some states to not address the issue. While some policy is in place, enforcement is a major issue. There is a need for greater police involvement to protect communities against trafficking and to enforce current anti-trafficking laws.

With better government funding, more rehabilitation and care centers could open. India needs more rehabilitation centers, and my research shows that there need to be centers in a variety of locations so that girls can go to a center that fits their needs. They need a center that will help them reintegrate into their culture, so it could be more beneficial for rural girls to be rehabilitated in rural settings for the preparation for their rural life futures, and the same for girls preparing for reintegration into urban areas. Issues of access to people, resources, cultural and social values, and future job prospects vary by place, so these centers must be creative to get what they need for care and empowerment. Government and policy support would improve access to what centers need. Survivors would also benefit from policy changes addressing deeper issues of poverty, discrimination, and marginalization that are institutionalized into laws and practices that make them vulnerable to trafficking in the first place.

Hope for the Future

Asha came to Punarnawa at age 15, rescued from a house in Kashmir where she was forced to work in bonded labor for two years. Before she was trafficked, Asha had been living at home with her family in rural Bihar, struggling to make ends meet. A man approached her family and offered Asha a job. He said she would take her to his school in Kashmir where she could get an education, work, and send money home to her family. Her family was sad to see her go, but thrilled she could have such a wonderful opportunity. But instead, she was forced to work for no pay and did not go to school. If she did not do enough work, she was beaten. When her family wanted to come see her and find out what was wrong, they could not find her. Asha's father learned about the TIP India Program and went to their District Commissioner (DC) for help. With the help of other DCs, the police and local DC were able to rescue Asha. They first took her to the local state-run Child's Welfare Committee who sent her to Punarnawa.

She has now been at Punarnawa for a year and a half and plans to return home in another month. Asha has been studying sewing and animal husbandry. She enjoys working with cows and has been studying hard for her USHA sewing certificate. Her home assessment is under way, and Punarnawa's Reintegration Officer will meet with Asha's family multiple times to make sure she is going home to a safe place. He will also find nearby safe work for her to be placed with when she returns to the village where she will be paid a fair wage. Thanks to the TIP India Project, her family will be given a cow, and thanks to Free the Slaves, she will be given a sewing machine as well. There are not many seamstresses in her village so she will be able to start her own seamstress work. Her district's DC has been conducting Community Vigilance Committee (CVC) meetings in her village to teach them about human trafficking. Asha wants to work with the CVCs. "I want to teach my village about slavery. I want to make sure this does not happen to anyone else ever again."

References

Adevi, A. & M. Lieberg. (2012). *Stress Rehabilitation through Garden Therapy: A Caregiver Perspective on Factors Considered Most Essential to the Recovery Process*. Urban Forestry & Urban Greening. 11: 51-58.

Adger, W. (2006). *Vulnerability*. Global Environmental Change. 16:268-281.

Agnew, J. (1987). *Place and Politics.* The Geographical Mediation of State and Society. Boston, 3.

Agrawal, T. (2014). *Gender and Caste-Based Wage Discrimination in India: Some Recent Evidence*. Journal for Labor Market Research. 47(4): 329 – 340.

Anguelovski, A. (2013). New Directions in Urban Environmental Justice: Rebuilding Community, Addressing Trauma, and Remaking Place. Journal of Planning Education and Research. Sage.

Arnot, M., Jeffery, R., Casely-Hayford, L., & C. Noronha. (2012). *Schooling and Domestic Transition: Shifting Gender Relations and Female Agency in Rural Ghana and India*. Comparative Education. 48(2): 181-194.

Ash, J. (2014). *Geography and Post-Phenomenology*. Progress in Human Geography.

Ashforth, B. E., & Mael, F. (1989). *Social identity theory and the organization*. Academy of management review. 14(1): 20-39.

Asthana, S. (1996). *Women's Health and Women's Empowerment: A Locality Perspective*. Health and Place. 2(1): 1-13.

Arnot, M., Jeffery, R., Casely-Hayford, L., & C. Noronha. (2012). *Schooling and Domestic Transition: Shifting Gender Relations and Female Agency in Rural Ghana and India.* Comparative Education. 48(2): 181-194.

Awasthi, S. (2011). Personal interview. Free the Slaves. India.

Awasthi, S. (2014). Personal interview. Free the Slaves. India.

Bales, K. (2004). *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy*. Univ of California Press.

Bales, K. (2007). *Ending Slavery: How We Free Today's Slaves*. University of California Press, Berkeley.

Banerjea, N. (2007). *Poor Women's Mobilization and Participatory Development: An Ethnography of Volunteering Practices in a Kolkata Slum.* Dissertation to State

University of New York at Buffalo. UMI Microform. Proquest Information and Learning Co.

Banerjee, B., & Knight, J. B. (1985). *Caste discrimination in the Indian urban labour market*. Journal of development Economics. 17(3): 277-307.

Beaman, L., Duflo, E., Pande, R., & P. Topalova. (2012). *Female Leadership Raises Aspirations and Educational Attainment for Girls: A Policy Experiment in India.* Science. 335(6068): 582-586.

Bhattacharyya, R. (2016). *Street Violence against Women in India: Mapping Prevention Strategies*. Asian Social Work and Policy Review. 1 – 15.

Bihari, B. (2015). Personal Interview. Trafficking-in-Persons District Coordinator, Gathan, India.

Borooah, V. K., & Iyer, S. (2005). *Vidya, Veda, and Varna: The influence of religion and caste on education in rural India*. The Journal of Development Studies. 41(8): 1369-1404.

Borooah, V., Diwakar, D., Mishra, V., Naik, A., & N. Sabharwal. (2014). *Caste, Inequality, and Poverty in India: a Re-assessment*. Development Studies Research. 1(1): 279-294.

Boyd, C., Hayes, L., Wilson, R., Bearsley-Smith., C., 2008. *Harnessing the social capital of rural communities for youth mental health: an asset-based community development framework.* Australian Journal of Rural Health 16(4): 189–193.

Bradshaw, D., Jay, S., McNamara, N., Stevenson, C. & O. Muldoon. (2015). *Perceived Discrimination amongst Young People in Socio-Economically Disadvantaged Communities: Parental Support and Community Identity Buffer (Some) Negative Impacts of Stigma*. British Journal of Developmental Psychology.

Briski, Z. & R. Kauffman. (2014). *Born into Brothels: Calcutta's Red Light Kids*. Movie.

Burke, C. (2008). *'Play in Focus': Children's Visual Voice in Participative Research.* In: *Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People*. Routledge. New York.

Carpiano, R., 2006. *Towards a Neighbourhood Resource-Based Theory of Social Capital for Health: Can Bourdieu and Sociology Help?* Social Science and Medicine 61(1): 165–175.

Case, D. (1996). *Contributions of Journeys Away to the Definition of Home: An Empirical Study of a Dialectical Process*. Journal of Environmental Psychology. 16: 1-15.

Cattell, V., Dines, N., Gesler, W., & S. Curtis. (2008). *Mingling, observing, and lingering: everyday public spaces and their implications for wellbeing and social relations*. Health and Place 14(3): 544–561.

Chakravarti, A. (2001). *Caste and Agrarian Class: A View from Bihar.* Economic and Political Weekly. 36:17, 1449-1462.

Chandrasekhar, S., & Sharma, A. (2014). *Internal migration for education and employment among youth in India*. Indira Gandhi Institute of Development Research, Mumbai January.

Chant, S. (2013). *Cities through a "Gender Lens": A Golden "Urban Age" for Women in the Global South?* Environment and Urbanization. 25(1): 1-21

Chaurasiya, R. (2013). *Robin Chaurasiya; I am a Proud and Powerful Lesbian.* INK Talk. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zbviujSGhTw.

Chaurasiya, R. (2015). Personal interview. Kranti.

Chin, J., Neilands, T., Weiss, L.,& J. Mantell. (2008). *Paradigm Shifters, Professionals, and Community Sentinels: Immigrant Community Institutions' Roles in shaping Places and Implications for Stigmatized Public Health Initiatives.* Health and Place. 14: 866 – 882.

Conradson, D. (2005). *Landscape, Care, and the Relational Self: Therapeutic Encounters in Rural England.* Health and Place. 11:337 – 348.

Cook, J., & Roberts, J. (2000). *Towards a gendered political economy.* In: Towards a gendered political economy (pp. 3-13). Palgrave Macmillan UK.

Cornish, F. (2006). *Challenging the Stigma of Sex Work in India: Material Context and Symbolic Change*. Journal of Community & Applied Social Psychology, 16 (6): 462-471.

Cornish, F., Campbell, C., Shukla, A., & R. Banerji. (2012). *From Brothel to Boardroom: Prospects for community Leadership of HIV Interventions in the Context of Global Funding Practices*. Health and Place. 18: 468 – 474.

Cosgrove, Denis (1988). *Geography is Everywhere: Culture and Symbolism in Human Landscapes*. In The Cultural Geography Reader, Oakes, T.S. and Price, P.L. (Eds) (2008), London: Routledge.

Cosgrove, D. E. (1998). *Introduction: The Idea of Landscape and Landscape as a Social Formation in Social formation and symbolic landscape*. Madison, University of Wisconsin Press.

Creswell, J. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. 3rd ed. SAGE Publications. Los Angeles.

Cresswell, T. (2014). *Introduction: Defining Place*. In Place: A Short Introduction. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing (pg. 1-14).

Curtis, S. (2010). *Space, Place and Mental Health*. Ashgate, London.

Cutchin, M. (2007). *The Need for the "New Health Geography" in Epidemiologic Studies of Environment and Health*. Health and Place. 13: 725 – 742.

Dalal, K. & K. Lindqvist. (2012). *A National Study of the Prevalence and Correlates of Domestic Violence among Women in India.* Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health. 24(2): 265-277.

Damodaran, H. (2015). *Dipping Prices, Sudden Cyclone Disrupt Bihar Farmers' Dream Run with Maize*. The Indian Express.

Delgado, M. (2015). *Urban Youth and Photovoice: Visual Ethnography in Action*. Oxford University Press. Oxford.

Desai, V. (2002) *Informal politics, grassroots NGOs and women's empowerment in the slums of Bombay*. In: Rethinking Empowerment. Eds. Parpart, J., R., S. and K. Staudt. London: Routledge.

Desai, V. (2005). NGOs, *Gender Mainstreaming, and Urban Poor Communities in Mumbai*. Gender and Development. *13*(2): 90-98.

Desai S. & A. Dubey. (2012). *Caste in 21st Century India: Competing Narratives.* Econ Polit Wkly. 46(11): 40 – 49.

Deshpande, A. (2000). *Does caste still define disparity? A look at inequality in Kerala, India*. The American Economic Review. 90(2): 322-325.

Deshpande, A. (2001). *Caste at birth? Redefining disparity in India*. Review of Development Economics. 5(1): 130-144.

Dharampal-Frick, G. (2013). *Interrogating the Historical Discourse on Caste and Race in India*. NMML Occasional Paper: History and Society, New Series, 28. Nehru Memorial Museum and Library.

Duff, C. (2011). *Networks, Resources and Agencies: On the Character and Production of Enabling Places*. Health and Place. 17:149 – 156.

Duff, C. (2012). *Exploring the Role of 'Enabling Places' in Promoting Recovery from Mental Illness: A Qualitative Test of a Relational Model*. Health and Place. 18:1388 – 1395.

Dunkley, C. (2009). *A Therapeutic Taskscape: Theorizing Place-making, Discipline and Care at a Camp for Troubled Youth.* Health and Place. 15:88 – 96.

Dutta, S. (2016). *Spirits in the Food: A Pedagogy for Cooking and Healing*. ScholarWorks Georgia State University.

Duncan, J & D. Ley. (1993). *Space/Place/Representation*. Routledge.

Dyck, I. & P. Dossa. (2007). *Place, Health, and Home: Gender and Migration in the Constitution of Healthy Space*. Health and Place. 13:691 – 701.

Emran, S. & F. Shilpi. (2015). *Gender, Geography, and Generations: Intergenerational Educational Mobility in Post-Reform India*. World Development. 72: 362-380.

Esteban-Guitart, M & L. Moll. (2014). *Funds of Identity A New Concept Based on the Funds of Knowledge Approach.* Culture and Psychology. 20(1):31 – 48.

Esteve-Volart, B. (2004). *Gender discrimination and growth: Theory and evidence from India*. DEDPS, 42.

Eswaran, M., Ramaswami, B., & W. Wadha. (2013). *Caste, and the Time Allocation of Women in Rural India*. Economic Development and Cultural Change. 61(2):311-333.

Fegley, R. (2008). *Comparative Perspectives on the Rehabilitation of Ex-Slaves and Former Child Soldiers with Special Reference to Sudan.* African Studies Quarterly. 10:1, 35-69.

Fehrenbacher, A., Ali, S., Ghose, T., & D. Swendeman. (2015). *Exploring Pathways into Sex Work, Stigma, and Risk for HIV among Female Sex Workers in India*. In Society for Social Work and Research 19th Annual Conference: The Social and Behavioral Importance of Increased Longevity. Sswr.

Fleuret, S. & S. Atkinson. (2007).*Wellbeing, Health and Geography: A Critical Review and Research Agenda*. New Zealand Geographer. 63:106–118.

Free the Slaves Foundation (FTS). (2010). *New Shelter Opens for Slavery Survivors in India*. Web. https://www.freetheslaves.net/Document.Doc?id=155.

Freedom Fund. (2015). *Modern Slavery*. Web. http://www.freedomfund.org/.

Gatrell, A. (2013). *Therapeutic Mobilities: Walking and 'Steps' to Wellbeing and Health*. Health and Place. 22:98-106.

Gaur, A. (2015). Personal Interview. Punarnawa Director.

Gee, J. P. (2014). *An introduction to discourse analysis: Theory and method*. Routledge.

Gemmill, B., & Bamidele-Izu, A. (2002). *The role of NGOs and civil society in global environmental governance*. Global environmental governance: Options and opportunities. 77-100.

Gesler, W. (1992). *Therapeutic Landscapes: Medical Geographic Research in Light of the New Cultural Geography*. Social Science & Medicine 34(7): 735–746.

Gesler, W. (2003). *Healing Places*. Rowman & Littlefield, Lanham, MD.

Ghurye, G. S. (1969). *Caste and race in India*. Popular Prakashan.

Goetz, A. M., & Jenkins, R. (2001). *Hybrid forms of accountability: citizen engagement in institutions of public-sector oversight in India*. Public Management Review. 3(3): 363-383.

Greif, M. & F. Dodoo. (2015). *How Community Physical, Structural, and Social Stressors Relate to Mental Health in the Urban Slums of Accra, Ghana.* Health and Place. 33:57 – 66.

Guattari, F. (1992). *Chaosmosis: an ethico-aesthetic paradigm*. Indiana University Press. (Trans. Paul Bains and Julian Pefanis, 1995).

Gupta, A. & J. Ferguson (1992). *Beyond "Culture': Space, Identity, and the Politics of Difference.* In: Culture, Power, Place: Explorations in Critical Anthropology in The Cultural Geography Reader. T. Oaks and P. L. Price. New York, Routledge.

Gupta, D. (2005). Whither the Indian village: culture and agriculture in 'rural' India. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 751-758.

Guria. (2015). *A Fight against Human Trafficking and Forced Prostitution*. http://www.guriaindia.org/WebPage/index.html.

Hall, S. (1995). *New cultures for old?* In: A Place in the World? Places, Cultures and Globalization. The Cultural Geography Reader. T. Oaks and P. L. Price. New York, Routledge (pg. 264-274).

Hall, S. (1996). *Who Needs Identity.* In: Questions of Cultural Identity. Eds Hall, S. & P. du Gay. Sage Pub. London.

Hall, S. (1997). Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices. Sage (pg. 1-42).

Hall (2005). *Old and new identities*. In: Beyond Borders: Thinking Critically About Global Issues. P. S. Rothenberg. New York, Worth Publishers: 167-173.

Harris, C., L. Jackson, L. Mayblin, A. Piekut, G. Valentine. (2014). *'Big Brother Welcomes You': Exploring Innovative Methods for Research with Children and Young People outside of the Home and School Environments*. White Rose University Consortium. Sheffield.

Harvey, D. (1990a). *Between Space and Time: Reflections on the Geographical Imagination*. Annals of the Association of American Geographers 80(3): 418-434.

Harvey, D (1990b). *The Condition of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change*. Malden, Blackwell.

Haq, R. (2008). Intersectionality of Gender and Other Forms of Identity: Dilemmas and Challenges Facing Women in India. Gender in Management: An International Journal. 28(3): 171-184.

Hogg, M. A., & Turner, J. C. (1985). *Interpersonal attraction, social identification and psychological group formation*. European Journal of Social Psychology. 15(1): 51-66.

International Labour Organization (ILO). (2015). *Forced Labour, Human Trafficking, and Slavery.* Web. http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/lang--en/index.htm.

IOP (India Online Pages). (2015). *India Guide: Population of Mumbai*. (http://www.indiaonlinepages.com/population/mumbai-population.html).

Jackson, C., & Chattopadhyay, M. (2000). *Identities and livelihoods: Gender, ethnicity, and nature in a South Bihar village.* In: Agrarian environments: Resources, representation, and rules in India. 147-69.

Jalali, R. (2015). *Caste System of Stratification*. The Wiley Blackwell Encyclopedia of Race, Ethnicity, and Nationalism. 1–5.

Jana S, Basu I, Rotheram-Borus MJ, & PA Newman (2004). *The Sonagachi Project: a sustainable community intervention program*. AIDS Education Prevention. 16(5):405-14.

Jannuzi (1974). *Agrarian Crisis in India: The Case of Bihar*. University of Texas Press, Austin.

Jeffrey, C. (2000). *'A Fist is Stronger than Five Fingers': Caste and Dominance in Rural North India.* Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers. 26(2): 217-236. Wiley.

Jeffrey, C., & Young, S. (2012). *Waiting for change: youth, caste and politics in India*. Economy and Society. 41(4): 638-661.

Jensen, R. (2012). *Do Labor Market Opportunities Affect Young Women's Work and Family Decisions? Experimental Evidence from India*. The Quarterly Journal of Economics. 127:753-792.

Jodhka, S. (2015). *Ascriptive hierarchies: Caste and its reproduction in contemporary India.* Current Sociology. 0011392115614784.

Kabeer, N. (1999). *Resources, Agency, Achievements: Reflections on the Measurement of Women's Empowerment*. Development and Change. 30(3): 435–64.

Kam, M. & Siu, A. (2010). *Evaluation of a Horticultural Activity Programme for Persons with Psychiatric Illness*. HKJOT 20:2, 80-86.

Kaplan, E. (2013). "*We live in the SHADOW": Inner-city Kids Tell their Stories through Photographs*. Temple University Press. Philadelphia.

Kaplan, I. (2008). *Being 'Seen' Being 'Heard': Engaging with Students on the Margins of Education through Participatory Photography.* In: *Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People*. Routledge. New York.

Katti, S. (2014). *From Mumbai's red light district to the USA*. TED X Bangalore. http://tedxtalks.ted.com/video/From-Mumbais-red-light-district;India.

Kermode, M., Herrman, H., Arole, R., White, J., Premkumar, R., and V. Patel. (2007). *Empowerment of Women and Mental Health Promotion: A Qualitative Study in Rural Maharashtra, India*. BMC Public Health. 7:225.

Kostick, K. M., Schensul, S. L., Singh, R., Pelto, P., & Saggurti, N. (2011). *A methodology for building culture and gender norms into intervention: an example from Mumbai, India*. Social science & medicine. 72(10): 1630-1638.

Kostka, G. (2012). *Mobility and agency: Private sector development in rural central China.* China Journal. (67): 47-66.

Kumar, S. (1999). *New Phase in Backward Caste Politics in Bihar: Janata Dal on the Decline*. Economic and Political Weekly. Aug. 21-28.

Kumar, D. (2013). *Land and caste in South India*. Cambridge University Press.

Kumar, A. (2015). *Disparities in Access to Basic Amenities across Caste, Ethnicity and Classes in Rural and Urban India*. Journal of Governance & Public Policy. 5(1): 45.

Leitch, R. (2008). *Creatively Researching Children's Narratives through Images and Drawings*. In: *Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People*. Routledge. New York.

Lewicka, M. (2011). *Place attachment: How Far Have We Come in the Last 40 Years?* Journal of Environmental Psychology. 31: 207 – 230.

Liddle, J., & Joshi, R. (1986). *Daughters of Independence: Gender, caste, and class in India*. Rutgers University Press.

Lloyd, C. 2005. *Growing up global: The changing transition to adulthood in developing countries.* Washington, DC: The National Academies Press.

MacKian, S. (2008). *What the Papers Say: Reading Therapeutic Landscapes of Women's Health and Empowerment in Uganda.* Health and Place. 14:106 – 115.

Maertens, A. (2013). *Social Norms and Aspirations: Age of Marriage and Education in Rural India*. World Development. 47:1 – 15.

Mahadevia, D. & D. Advani. (2016). *Gender Differentials in Travel Pattern – The Case of a Mid-Size City, Rajkot, India.* Transportation Research Part D: Transport and Environment. 44: 292-302.

Maharatna, A. (2003). *Migration, Mediocrity and 'Misery': Case of West Bengal*. Economic and Political Weekly. 38(8): 679–683.

Malhotra, S. & R. Shah. (2015). *Women and Mental Health in India: An Overview*. Indian Journal of Psychiatry. 57(2).

Massey, D. (1995). *For Space*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications (pg. 1-35).

Massey, D. (1999). *A global Sense of Place*. Space, Place, and Gender. Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press.

Mazumdar, S., Mazumdar, S., Docuyanan, F., & C. Mclaughlin. (2000). *Creating a Sense of Place: The Vietnamese-Americans and Little Saigon*. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*. 20(4): 319 – 333.

Mazumdar, S. and S. Mazumdar. (2012). *Immigrant Home Gardens: Places of Religion, Culture, Ecology, and Family*. Landscape and Urban Planning. University of California.

Mehar, M., & Prasad, N. (2015). *Gender participation in rural farm household decision making: a case of Vaishali district, Bihar*. Indian Journal of Economics and Development. *11*(3): 755-760.

Menon, N. (2015). *Mobility and pathways to autonomy of women: a study of informal workers in fisheries sector in Kerala, India* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Manchester).

Metzker, C. (2012). *Facing the Monster: How One Person Can Fight Child Slavery*. Barrett-Kohler Publishers.

Metzker, C. (2015). Personal Interview. New Day Drop-in Center, Salvation Army. Philadelphia, PA.

Mitchell, W. J. T. (1994) *'Imperial Landscape' from Landscape and Power*. In: The Cultural Geography Reader, Oakes, T.S. and Price, P.L. (Eds) (2008), London: Routledge.

Moore, J. (2000). *Placing Home in Context*. Journal of Environmental Psychology. 20: 207 - 217.

Moreira, V. (2007). Critical Phenomenology of Depression in Brazil, Chile, and the United States. Latin-American Journal of Fundamental Psychopathology 7(2): 193-218).

Moss, J. (2008). Visual methods and policy research. In: Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People. Routledge. New York.

MSEMVS (2014). *MSEMVS Model: Community Vigilance Committees Working against Child Trafficking at Village Level*. Web. http://www.msemvs.org/.

Mukherjee, S. (2013). *Women's Empowerment and Gender Bias in the Birth and Survival of Girls in Urban India*. Feminist Economics. 19(1): 1-28.

Munshi, K. (2016). *Caste Networks in the Modern Indian Economy.* In: Development in India (pp. 13-37). Springer India.

Nair, K. S. (2015). *Human Resources for Health in India: An Overview*. International Journal of Health Sciences and Research (IJHSR). *5*(5): 465-475.

Nanninga, C., Meijering, L., Schonherr, M., Postema, K., & A. Lettinga. (2014). *Place Attachment in Stroke Rehabilitation: A Transdisciplinary Encounter between Cultural Geography, Environmental Psychology, and Rehabilitation Medicine*. Disability and Rehabilitation. Early Online: 1-10.

Nicholson, R. D. (2015). *Corporeality, Aryanism, Race: The Theatre and Social Reform of the Parsis of Western India*. South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies. 38(4): 613-638.

Palang, H. & G. Fry. Kluwer (2003). *Introduction.* In: Landscape Interfaces: Cultural Heritage in Changing Landscapes. Eds Palang, H. & G. Fry. Kluwer.

Palmer, N. (2006). *An awkward threesome—donors, governments and non-state providers of health in low income countries*. Public administration and development. 26(3): 231-240.

Parr, H. (2000). *Interpreting the 'Hidden Social Geographies' of Mental Health: Ethnographies of Inclusion and Exclusion in Semi-Institutional Places*. Health and Place. 6:225 – 237.

Parr, H., (2008). *Mental Health and Social Space: Towards Inclusionary Geographies?* Wiley Blackwell, London.

Parpart, J.L., S.M. Rai, and K. Staudt (eds.). (2002). *Rethinking Empowerment: Gender and Development in Global/Local World*. London: Routledge.

Phadke, S. (2007). Dangerous Liaisons: Women and Men: Risk and Reputation in Mumbai. *Economic and Political Weekly*, *42*(17): 1510–1518.

Pile, S. & N. Thrift (1995). *Mapping the Subject: Geographies of Cultural Transformation*. Routledge. London.

Pinfold, V. (2000). *'Building up Safe Havens…All around the World': Users' Experience of Living in the Community with Mental Health Problems*. Health and Place. 6:201 – 212.

Prakash, A. (2015). *Dalits Enter the Indian Markets as Owners of Capital*. Asian Survey. 55(5): 1044-1069.

Prasad, P. (1979). *Caste and Class in Bihar*. Economic and Political Weekly. 481-484.

Polaris. (2015). *International Trafficking*. Web. http://www.polarisproject.org/human-trafficking/international-trafficking.

Raju, S. (2004). *Contextualizing Critical Geography in India: Emerging Research and Praxis.* Geoforum. 35:539 – 544.

Rao, N., & Mitra, A. (2013). *Migration, representations and social relations: experiences of Jharkhand labour to western Uttar Pradesh*. The Journal of Development Studies. 49(6): 846-860.

Rao, T. & A. Tandon (2015). *Women and mental health: Bridging the gap*. Indian Journal of Psychiatry. 57(2).

Rose, E. (2012). *Encountering Place: A Psychoanalytic Approach for Understanding How Therapeutic Landscapes benefit Health and Wellbeing*. Health and Place. 18:1381 – 1387.

Rose, G. (1993). *Looking at Landscape: The Uneasy Pleasures of Power from Feminism and Geography: The Limits of Geographical Knowledge*. In The Cultural Geography Reader, Oakes, T.S. and Price, P.L. (Eds) (2008). London: Routledge.

Roy, A. (2003). *City requiem, Calcutta: gender and the politics of poverty* (Vol. 10). U of Minnesota Press.

Sabarwal, S., Santhya, K., S. Jejeebhoy. (2014). *Women's Autonomy and Experience of Physical Violence Within Marriage in Rural India*. Journal of Interpersonal Violence. 29(2): 332-347.

Sampson, R. & S. Gifford. (2010). *Place-making, Settlement and Well-being: The Therapeutic Landscapes of Recently Arrived Youth with Refugee Backgrounds*. Health and Place. 16:116 – 131.

Schensul, JJ. (2009). *Community, culture and sustainability in multilevel dynamic systems intervention science*. Am J Community Psychol. 43(3-4):241-56.

Scheyvens, R. (1998). *Subtle strategies for women's empowerment: planning for effective grassroots development*. Third World Planning Review. 20(3): 235-53.

Sen, A. (1999). *Development as freedom*. Oxford Paperbacks.

Serbulea, M. & U Payyappallimana. (2012). *Onsen (Hot Springs) in Japan – Transforming Terrain into Healing Landscapes*. Health and Place. 18:1366 – 1373.

Shamai, S., Arnon, S., & I. Schnell. (2012). *From Home to Community and Settlement: Sense of Place in Different Scales*. Stud Home Com Sci. 6(3): 153-163.

Shamsuddin, S. & N. Ujang. (2008). Making Places: The Role of Attachment in Creating the Sense of Place for Traditional Streets in Malaysia. Habitat International. 32(3): 399 – 409.

Sharma, I. & A. Pathak. (2015). *Women Mental Health in India*. Indian Journal of Psychiatry. 57(2).

Sharma, S. K. (2015). *Social Institutions and Caste Dynamics: A Study of Out of Caste Marriages in Urban Patna District*. Indian Journal of Applied & Clinical Sociology. 10(3): 42-48.

Shigekane, R. (2007). *Rehabilitation and Community Integration of Trafficking Survivors in the United States.* Human Rights Quarterly. 29, 112-136.

Silverman, J. G., Decker, M. R., Gupta, J., Maheshwari, A., Patel, V., Willis, B. M., & A. Raj. (2007). *Experiences of sex trafficking victims in Mumbai, India.* International Journal of Gynecology & Obstetrics. 97(3): 221-226.

Simonsen, K. (2013). *In quest of a new humanism embodiment, experience, and phenomenology as critical geography phenomenology as critical geography*. Progress in Human Geography.

Smith, S. & M. Gergan. (2015). *The Diaspora within: Himalayan Youth, Education-driven Migration, and Future Aspirations in India*. Environment and Planning D: Society and Space. 33: 119-135.

Srinivas M. (1996). *Caste: Its Twentieth Century Avatar*. Penguin Books. New Delhi.

Srinivasan M., Dunham Y., Hicks, C., and D. Barner. (2015). *Do Attitudes toward Societal Structure Predict Beliefs about Free Will and Achievement? Evidence from the Indian Caste System.* Developmental Science.

Stamm, B. H., Varra, E. M., Pearlman, L. A., & Giller, E. (2002). *The helper's power to heal and to be hurt—or helped—by trying.* Washington, DC: Register Report: A Publication of the National Register of Health Service Providers in Psychology.

Sturken and Cartwright (2009). *Images, Power and Politics in Practices of Looking: An Introduction to Visual Culture*.

Sugana, B. (2006). *Women and Development - Some Strategies and Interventions*. In: *Empowering Rural India: Experiments and Experiences*. Kanishka Publishers. New Delhi.

Sullivan, R. (2015). *Sexual violence in India: The History of Indian Women's Resistance.* McNair Scholars Research Journal, 11(1): 15.

Suresh, G., Furr, L. A., & Srikrishnan, A. K. (2009). *An assessment of the mental health of street-based sex workers in Chennai, India*. Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice. 25(2): 186-201.

Thomson, P. (2008). *Children and Young People: Voices in Visual Research.* In: *Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People*. Routledge. New York.

Thompson, P, & C. Hall. (2008). *Dialogues with Artists: Analysing Children's Self-Portraits.* In: *Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People*. Routledge. New York.

Thorat, S., & K. Newman. (2009). *Blocked by Caste: Economic Discrimination in Modern India*. Oxford University Press. New Delhi.

Thrift, N. (1999). *Steps to an ecology of place*. In: Massey, D., Allen, J., Sarre, P. (Eds.), Human Geography Today. Polity Press, Cambridge. 295–323.

Trani, J., Bakhshi, P., Kuhlberg, J., Narayanan, S., Venkataraman, H., Mishra, N., Groce, N., Jadhav, S., & S. Deshpande. (2015). *Mental Illness, Poverty and Stigma in India: a Case–Control Study*. BMJ Open. 5(2).

Tuan, Y. (1974). *Topophilia: A Study of Environmental Perception, Attitudes, and Values*. Columbia University Press. New York.

Tuan, Y. (1977). *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience*. University of Minnesota Press. Minneapolis.

Tuan, Y. (1979). *Space and Place: Humanistic Perspective*. In: Philosophy in Geography. Eds. Gale, S. & G. Olsson. Springer Netherlands.

United States Department of State (USDS). (2011). *Trafficking in Persons Report June 2014*. Web. 26 Nov. 2014. http://www.refworld.org/docid/4e12ee393c.html.

Vaid, D. (2014). *Caste in Contemporary India: Flexibility and Persistence*. Annual Review of Sociology. 40:391-410.

Velmans, M. (2006). *Heterophenomenology versus critical phenomenology*. Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences. Cogprints.

Verma, R. K., Pulerwitz, J., Mahendra, V., Khandekar, S., Barker, G., Fulpagare, P., & Singh, S. K. (2006). *Challenging and changing gender attitudes among young men in Mumbai, India.* Reproductive Health Matters. 14(28): 135-143.

Verma, A., Qureshi, H., & J Yearn Kim. (2016). *Exploring the Trend of Violence against Women in India.* International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice.

Villavonga-Olives, E. & I. Kawachi. (2015). *The Measurement of Bridging Social Capital in Population Health Research*. Health and Place. 36: 47 – 56.

Walker, R., B. Schratz, and P. Egg. (2008). *Seeing Beyond Violence: Visual Research Applied to Policy and Practice.* In: *Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People*. Routledge. New York.

Wanless, S. (2016). *The Role of Psychological Safety in Human Development*. Research in Human Development. 13(1): 6-14.

Ward, A., & Roe-Sepowitz, D. (2009). *Assessing the effectiveness of a trauma-oriented approach to treating prostituted women in a prison and a community exiting program*. Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma. 18(3): 293-312.

Walk Free Foundation (WFF). (2014a). *The Global Slavery Index: Findings*. Web. 26 Nov. 2014. http://www.globalslaveryindex.org/findings/.

Walk Free Foundation (WFF). (2014b). *The Global Slavery Index: India*. Web. 26 Nov. 2014. http://www.globalslaveryindex.org/country/india/.

Watve, V. & N. Raju. (2015). *Women Mental Health: Reflections from India*. Indian Journal of Psychiatry. 57(2).

Welton D. and H. Silverman. (1987). *Information Processing and the Phenomenology of thinking in Critical and Dialectical Phenomenology.* State University of New York Press. Albany.

Whaites, A. (2000). *Let's get civil society straight: NGOs, the state, and political theory*. Eade, D. (ed.).

Williams, T. (2002). *Changing geographies of care: employing the concept of therapeutic landscapes as a framework in examining home space*. Social Science and Medicine 55(1): 141–154.

Wilson, K. (1998). *Patterns of Accumulation and Struggles of Rural Labour: Some Aspects of Agrarian Change in Central Bihar*. Journal of Peasant Studies. 26:2-3, 316-354.

Woodgate, R. & O. Skarlato. (2015). *"It is about Being Outside": Canadian Youth's Perspectives of Good Health and the Environment*. Health and Place. 31:100 – 110.

Young, L. & H. Barrett. (2000). *Adapting Visual Methods: Action Research with Kampala Street Children.* Area. 333(2): 141-52.