Slide 1

Meaningful SLOs for PBLL
Yao Zhang Hill, Ph.D.
Assessment Office
University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa

Slide 2

SLOs = Student Learning Outcomes

| Knowledge | Skills/Abilities | Dispositions |

Given your understanding SLOs, complete the following metaphor:

SLOs are like _______________ because ____________________.
To me, SLOs are like a lighthouse in the sea. It directs you where you need to reach but it doesn’t chart the water for you. 

Other metaphors:
1. Finish line of a race: If you cross it, you know that you are there
2. Sweet Mochi: It’s a sweet reward

What are your struggles in developing SLOs?

1. Think by yourself (30 seconds)
2. Share with someone next to you
SLOs can be easy or very hard to develop

Students will be able to

- List
- Describe
- Analyze
- Compare
- Hypothesize
- Synthesize
- Propose
- Integrate
- Research

Easy: If you use an action verb, it is measurable.
Difficult: Which action verb to use to capture what you want students to achieve?

Two perspectives to make SLOs meaningful

- Connect to broader contexts (program, institution, field, society)
- Balance between being aspirational and achievable (or general and specific)
Societal Needs

Results from a National Survey of Employers by AAC&U 2013:

- 93 percent say that “a demonstrated capacity to think critically, communicate clearly, and solve complex problems is more important than [a candidate’s] undergraduate major.”

Language is powerful. It helps build a habit of mind and foster success skills. Imagine that your students are coming out of your class able to listen emphatically in any setting, saying things such as: I can see where you are coming from. What you said makes sense. Could it be that ... I can’t speak for all but my experience makes me believe... My experience of living in a big city makes me think...
Foreign Language As Required College Courses means:
The higher education expects our students out of the foreign language courses learn more than the target language.

Why require a foreign language for a Biology major?
To gain fundamental competencies as an educated person and gain world views that help students function as productive world citizens.

LEAP champions the importance of a liberal education and has 12 liberal arts essential learning outcomes (https://www.aacu.org/leap)
In higher education, often the accreditation agency captures the core competencies they want across all regions. How can language programs/classes contribute to these essential competencies? To language educations, it is easy for us to consider written and oral communication skills, and to some extent, critical think and information literacy skills. We rarely think about the relevance of quantitative reasoning skills. However, this skill can be particularly relevant to PBLL classes. Often, instructors would engage students in sustained inquiry and investigate a phenomenon (e.g., sustainability, health and wellness, identity) which require students to read and produce reports that use numeric information and logic.
Institutional Learning Objectives for undergraduate students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KNOW</th>
<th>DO</th>
<th>VALUE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Breadth &amp; depth of knowledge</td>
<td>Intellectual &amp; practical skills</td>
<td>Personal and social responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.a. Gen Ed</td>
<td>2.a. Think critically &amp; creatively</td>
<td>3.a. continuous learning &amp; personal growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.b. Major study</td>
<td>2.b. Conduct research</td>
<td>3.b. respect for people &amp; cultures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.c. Hawaiian culture and history</td>
<td>2.c. Communicate and report</td>
<td>3.c. stewardship of the natural environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.d. civic participation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These are Institutional Learning Objectives, or ILOs, at the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa. Language courses have the special advantage to address the outcome related to “respecting for people and culture.” What about providing stewardship of the natural environment? PBLL on the topics of sustainability are very relevant in addressing this SLO.

Slide 13

Chinese BA Program SLOs

1. Oral Communication
2. Reading
3. Apply **critical thinking** and rhetorical skills in writing
4. Use sources
5. Conduct research

These are selected program student learning outcomes from the UH Mānoa Chinese BA program. Similar outcomes also belong to other foreign language programs on this campus. We are familiar with addressing oral communication, reading, and writing. However...
Do you know that critical thinking skills and research skills are expected when your students graduate from a language program? Think of your own research experience, what is needed for students to be able to conduct independent research? Would starting in the 4th year be too late?
Support the institution and have the institution support you

*Support the institution* means that you provide the learning opportunities that help the students to achieve their program-level and institutional learning goals. For example, the Jiang Song Laoshi and Haidan Laoshi had their students conduct sustainability research and present their findings in posters. That activity supported students’ learning toward the institutional goal: the stewardship of natural environment. Connect with General Education Office, Assessment Office, and Center for Teaching Excellence to understand the broader institutional needs. If you can, get the data to support your project. For example, UH Mānoa’s institutional assessment result on quantitative reasoning is not very promising. It is an area that we have to address in our accreditation. We are all struggling to find a solution. As a language teacher, what career pathways are relevant to your students? What project can you have your students do to address that? If you come up with a good idea, you may be able to get some funding to support your project because it is so important to our accreditation.

Communicating with the Assessment Office, Institutional Research Office, Program Review officers, Accreditation Liaisons on campus help you understand institutional needs, help the institution to fulfill that needs, and receive support and resources along the way.
Just now, I talked about connecting your course-level learning outcomes with the program, institutional, and accreditation learning outcomes/competencies, and the societal needs. Now, I am going to discuss another issue that contribute to the difficulty of the SLOs development: how general and how specific should they be?
The camp that insist that the SLOs should be specific and measurable tend to make the SLOs mundane and granular.

There is a tendency to make each SLO represent each task that students do.

For example, if you have students conduct an interview with native speaker, the corresponding SLO becomes: Students are able to interview native speakers.

Interviewing native speakers is a task. There are multiple facets of skills involved. Which ones do you want to achieve? Did you deconstruct a complex skills into component skills? Did you scaffold the skill development?
Slide 18

Capturing the essential skills

Did you...
• deconstruct the skill into component skills?
• scaffold the development of the component skills?
• give students to opportunity to integrate the component skills?
• give students the opportunity to apply the integrated skill to the new situations?

Slide 19

Deconstructing interaction skills required for an Interview task

1. Ask questions
2. Listen for the key words and main ideas
3. Ask for probing and clarification questions
4. Use compensation strategies to deal with communication breakdown
5. Use back channeling, rephrasing, paraphrasing, and summarization to show understanding
6. Greet and take-leave appropriately
7. ... 

If your goal is to have students interact with native speakers through interviews, you would give students the sentence patterns and compensation strategies to practice. You can do interview simulations through pair work and with invited native speakers to the class. Your assessment can be observation against a checklist, performance assessment of the interview recording if it is a culminating product.
• Interaction skills include listening skills, ability to ask the questions, provide appropriate response, use interaction tactic to keep the conversation engaged (back-channeling), ability to probe and ask clarifying questions.
• Pragmatics include: greeting, demonstrate sensitivity when talking about personal feelings and personal life, leave taking
• Content knowledge: include contextual knowledge of the participants and the knowledge from the sources that may help interpret the input from the interviewee and ask appropriate follow-up questions.
• Project management: Set up initiate contact, self-introduction, reminder, follow-up thank you, report sharing
• Research skills: Research the scope of the issue, use literature to drive research questions, and use research questions to develop interview questions, data analysis, data interpretation, report writing, and so on.
Interview: For what?

Alternative 1: Students are able to interact with native speakers to collect their perspectives on familiar topics.
Alternative 2: Students are able to develop and conduct an interview project interacting with native speakers on familiar topics.
Alternative 3: Students are able to investigate and contribute insights to a social issue (e.g., homeless) in their local community.
Alternative 4: Students are able to conduct research projects using empirical data collected from native speakers (e.g., interviews, questionnaires).
Alternative 5: Students are able to research and advocate for community involvement in addressing a social issue in the local community.

There are multiple ways to write a project learning outcome that emphasize the skill that you want students to gain. Take a moment to read these five options and see how they are different from each other.

Four dimensions of knowledge and skills

- Language proficiency
- Intercultural competence
- Content/Disciplinary knowledge (career pathways)
- Cognitive skills/Habits of mind

In addition to language proficiency, focus on one other dimension of knowledge and skill. Scaffold one dimension at a time. No need to address all dimensions at once.
As I said earlier, if your goal is to have students interact with native speakers with appropriate use of pragmatic language through interviews, you would give students the sentence patterns and compensation strategies to practice.
If your goal is to have students manage this project and manage their interaction with the native speakers, then you would want to train them on how to manage an interview project, starting with initial contact, sending the interview purpose and questions in advance, sending reminders beforehand, sending thank you messages afterwards, and possibly sharing the information summary. You would probably want to monitor them throughout the process. Your assessment may involve both self-assessment in terms of checklist, interviewee’s feedback survey, and performance assessment of the interview recording.

Summary: Two perspectives to make SLOs meaningful

- Connect to broader contexts (program, institution, field, society)
- Balance between being aspirational and achievable (or general and specific)
Your SLOs should represent the essential skills

Require the instructors to:

• deconstruct the skill into component skills
• scaffold the development of the component skills
• give students the opportunity to integrate the component skills
• give students the opportunity to apply the integrated skill to the new situations

Aspire for integrated skills

• Language proficiency
• Intercultural competence
• Content/Disciplinary knowledge
• Cognitive skills/Habits of mind

Connect to one more dimension in addition to language skills.
Group Work: Develop a pathway related SLO for the Hawaiian Plantation Village Children Activity Book Project

Let’s review the project that you participated: Hawai’i’s Plantation village Activity Book.
Instructions

• Divide into two groups, each focus on one pathway:
  • Education and Training Career Cluster ➔ Teaching/Training Pathway
  • Arts, A/V Technology & Communications Cluster ➔ Visual Arts Career Pathway
• Each group develop
  • 1 pathway related SLO
  • Brainstorm component skills needed to achieve the SLO
  • Evaluate/Create 1 scaffolding strategy

The idea for this activity was from the recommendations of Cindy Kendall below (personal communication through email on 8/3/2017)

Sample:

**Education and Training Cluster**

**Teaching/Training Pathway**

**Essential Knowledge and Skills Statement**

EDPC01.04 Use content knowledge and instructional skills to construct standards based educational goals.
EDPC01.04.01 Use knowledge of learners to align goals with learners’ developmental level, abilities, interests, and future objectives.

With regard to the Plantation Village activity, the participants need to consider, when developing their activity:
- types of activities in an activity book
- what makes an activity interesting
- what kinds of activities are appropriate for a 6-year old (emergent literacy)
- how the objects will connect to the child’s life
- how the activity connects to Hawaii’s Plantation Village
- how the activity engages the learner and expands the learner's experience and knowledge

With regard to page design, Stephen gave the participants a template and identified the header (title), a space for the activity, and the directions in the footer. What activity (refer to education
standard) and the use/quality of image used the activity (graphic design) are up to the student. Honestly, we did not formally address the principles of graphic design quality, and the participants are converting their images from a photo to a line art using a tool that has several options (so it is their experience in quality materials, clear images, etc. that are being tapped).

So regarding page design:

**Arts, A/V Technology & Communications Career Cluster**

**Visual Arts Career Pathway**

**Essential Knowledge and Skills Statement**

ARPF01.04.02 Apply art elements and principles to photographic works of visual art in both traditional and digital photographic media.

Participants are going to take a photograph and turn it into a black-line clip art image to incorporate into activity.

Participants need to consider:

- quality of photograph to become a black line graphic
- the object having intended meaning within the activity
- the process of turning the photograph into a black-line clip art and using it in their activities
- the creation of the text in both English and Chinese on the page

Very specific, you could use:

ARPF01.04.01 Analyze art elements and principles of two-dimensional works of visual art in various media, including drawing, print making, and computer software.

This statement can target the conversion of the photograph into a black-line clip art, and their success in doing so - look at the quality of the image, pixelation, clarity, sharpness for printing, etc.
Resources

- Career pathways’ essential knowledge and skills
- AO action verbs
- List on NFLRC PBLL Project Evaluation Rubric
- Yao’s SLOs repository under construction
  - Interview projects
  - Research projects
  - Guide writing projects
  - Interculturally focused SLOs
  - World Language Sample Learning Outcomes

Career pathways’ essential knowledge and skills: https://careertech.org/career-clusters
AO Action verbs link: http://manoa.hawaii.edu/assessment/howto/outcomes.htm
Operational verbs link: https://csass.ucsc.edu/seminars/VERBSHandout.pdf
Yao SLOs repository: https://docs.google.com/document/d/1tqKA9cCWgOle2amp7YzWa3xcPq7ZcEXMhgYLv09I/edit?usp=sharing

- Interview projects
- Research projects
- Guide writing projects
- Interculturally focused SLOs
- World Language Sample Learning Outcomes

(The SLOs are not meant to be exclusive. Not meant to be used all together at once.)
Questions:
Yao Hill at yao.hill@hawaii.edu