**Book Reviews**

**All the King’s Horses**  

This is a massive volume, in A4 format, with more than eleven hundred pages of mostly ten-point type, a jacket compact disk, and weighing a mighty six pounds (2.7 kg). Much heralded and long awaited, it is destined for library shelves everywhere. With its huge price tag, it will not be affordable for most individuals. It is well bound, on good paper, with numerous black-and-white photographs. These are of execrable print quality, with faces and details blacked out and in most cases indistinguishable.

A design feature of the book is an extremely wide left-hand margin, occupying a full third of the page. Occasionally it is used for a photo or caption, or for part of a transcription. I would have preferred a smaller margin and larger, more readable, text.

Criteria for selecting authors are nowhere stated, but there is an apparent preference for indigenous rather than outsider perspectives where possible. More than one hundred sixty writers, many hitherto unknown, contributed materials. A well-meaning attempt at political correctness substitutes new names for musical instrument terms long recognized as inadequate by ethnomusicologists but nevertheless accepted by convention. Readers are told early in the editors’ introduction (xiv) that in this volume “swung slat,” “hollowed log idiophone,” and “lamellaphone,” respectively, are to be understood as “bull-roarer,” “slit-gong,” and “Jew’s harp.” Throughout the book, New Zealand is referred to as Aotearoa, again politically correct in some quarters.

After a short overview, part 1 begins with selected descriptions of music and dance by outside observers from explorers through to filmmakers, moves on to discussion of present-day performing festivals, and lastly addresses “movements of peoples and their musics.” Music ethnography follows in part 2 with a 45-page section on popular music followed by thematic treatment of music and “ingested substances” (kava, betel, and alcohol), religion, politics, theatre, gender, and education. Also in part 2 are sections of elementary instruction on understanding music and dance; other sections cover the use of language, performance accoutrements, composition, and musical instruments. Part 3 is an area survey beginning with Australia and ending with East Polynesia. Part 4 is devoted to “resources” comprising archives and institutions, discography, filmography, bibliography, a glossary, notes on the compact disk, and an extensive index.

The preference throughout most of the volume is to concentrate on the contemporary rather than the historical, and this is one of the main...
strengths of the work. In many cases
the writing is explicitly up-to-date,
with sections on “music in the
1990s.” An attempt at overall histori-
cal perspective is the part 1 section on
“Encounters with ‘The Other’,” cob-
bled together over a space of some 45
pages with contributions from no
fewer than eight different authors.
The result, exemplifying the approach
followed throughout the volume, is
seriously disjointed and fragmented.
Adrienne Kaeppler begins with
extracts from seventeenth-to-nine-
teenth-century explorers’ accounts of
Polynesian dance in Tahiti, New
Zealand, Tonga, Hawai‘i, and Samoa;
an account of Miklouho-Maclay’s
nineteenth-century Russian expedition
to Bongu village, New Guinea, fol-
lows; next comes a vignette about
German, American, and Japanese
ethnographic expeditions to the South
Seas in the 1900s; then a long account
of songs in the Pacific War (1941–
1945), focusing largely on their texts;
finally, there are sections on refer-
ces to Pacific music in fiction, art,
poetry, and by filmmakers at dis-
parate times and places. So what? one
asks. At the end there is no summary
and no conclusions—just 2 1/2 pages
of references.

The section on “Musical Migra-
tions” (69–121), where one would
expect to find information on the his-
torical spread of music and dance in
Oceania, is devoted entirely to expatriate communities throughout the
area.

Except for limited treatment in the
part 2 section on “Understanding
Music,” and sporadic bursts of infor-
mation elsewhere, anyone hoping for
much in the way of musical analysis
will be disappointed. In part this may
be because, with such a vast geo-
ographical scope, encompassing the
whole of Oceania as well as Australia,
word limits had to be imposed. There
nevertheless seems to have been an
editorial decision, applied throughout
most of the volume, to eschew technical detail in favor of general descrip-
tion. In the section on musical instru-
ments, for example, information on
geographical distribution is often so
generalized as to be useless, if not
misleading. Thus, under the heading
of “Aerophones,” statements are
made that “Oceanic end-blown flutes
include piston flutes, water flutes
[and] flutes with holes for fingering”;
and side-blown flutes are said to
occur in “several areas” but to be
“typical of New Guinea.” Ascribing
water flutes and piston flutes to
“Oceania” at large suggests that they
are widespread, but both are rare.
Water flutes are characteristic of west
New Britain, and outside the New
Guinea area are reported only for the
Loyalty Islands. Piston flutes are con-
fined to a highly localized area in the
Huon Peninsula of Papua New
Guinea and to New Caledonia. The
New Guinea transverse flutes referred
to belong mostly to a special class of
paired or “sacred” flutes that are con-
centrated in the Sepik, Madang, and
Highland areas of Papua New
Guinea. There seems to be no reason
to withhold such details from a gener-
al article. The interested reader, how-
ever, must either deduce them by
referring to the index or must aban-
don Garland for some other source of
information.

The fragmented arrangement of
subject material chosen by the editors,
and the pattern of multiple authorship used everywhere in the book, results in continual jumps of topic and abrupt shifts of locale in part 2. For example, in the last 15 pages of the section on language in music, successive topics from seven different authors are “Concealing and Revealing in Kapingamarangi,” “Epigrammatic Songs of Oceania,” “Strophics and Society in Santa Cruz,” “The Strophics of Sikaiana Verse,” “Metaphor and Symbolism” (mostly in Papua New Guinea), and “Samoan Nuptial Cheers.” This reads more like a list of conference papers than a coherent chapter of a book and is typical of the approach throughout. The editors’ method for compiling the book appears to have been to solicit mini-articles from contributors on a variety of topics, chop these into bits, and then reassemble them. Any coherence there might have been has been lost. A related problem emerges from the use of topic headings, especially in part 3. Although these should have conferred some unity of approach, the same headings mean different things to different people, nullifying the intention and contributing to the fractured effect. It is just as well there is a comprehensive index, because scattered through the hotchpotch are nuggets of important information and some real gems. By and large, they will not be found by reading consecutively through the book.

Most interest in the volume, and most people’s use of it, will center on the regional studies that occupy the largest portion of the book (407–955). Again there is a scattergun team approach, with numerous loosely organized sections by multiple authors. A conscientious attempt has been made to provide information about all forms of music-making: by colonists and migrants as well as indigenous populations. The large number of topics that had to be accommodated, however, has inevitably resulted in superficiality. The Aboriginal music of central Australia, for example, which has had the benefit of several entire books written exclusively about it, is allocated just 6½ pages, including about 1½ occupied by transcriptions and diagrams.

Because no research has been carried out in many areas of Oceania, especially in most of the many hundreds of language groups and local cultures of New Guinea, it is manifestly impossible to encompass them all. The editors have coped with this as best they could, often by means of snapshots or capsules of particular cultures for which information is available. New Guinea, for example, is quartered into four broad regions: Papua (Central, Gulf, Milne Bay, Northern, and Western provinces of Papua New Guinea), Highlands (PNG), Mamosi (Sepik, Madang, and Morobe provinces of PNG), and Irian Jaya (the entire Indonesian-controlled western half of New Guinea). Within these groupings, capsules are offered of Motu, Angan, Binandere, and Managalasi for Papua; Maring, Melpa, Kuman, Enga, and Huli for the Highlands; Abelam, Iatmul, Waxei, Buang, Irumu, Komba, and Siassi for Mamosi; and Asmat and Eipo for Irian Jaya. As well, there are sections on some broader groupings within each of the four main areas.
The result is much more comprehensive than anything that has hitherto been available. This section alone is enough to render the Garland volume indispensable.

Island Melanesia is treated in similar fashion to New Guinea. Political imperatives have led to some awkward naming of the regions. Again there are four areas: Island Region of Papua New Guinea (better known as the Bismarck Archipelago); Solomon Islands (including the northern area of Buka-Bougainville, which also belongs politically to Papua New Guinea); New Caledonia including the Loyalty Islands (under French administration); and Vanuatu. (Fiji has been assigned to West Polynesia later in the book.)

Within the first of these areas, separate sections accommodate Manus, New Britain, and New Ireland. The Manus section is devoted largely to Baluan; in the New Britain section, Bali-Vitu, Lolo, Anêm, Kaulong, and Lote-Mengen-Mamusi are given separate treatment; New Ireland groups featured in the same way are Sursurunga and Tarbar. These eleven groups may or may not be representative of the entire area: further information, as for most of New Guinea, awaits future research.

Familiar to many because of work done in the 1970s by Hugo Zemp are the remarkable panpipe ensembles of Malaita in the Solomon Islands. Malaita appears in the Solomon Islands section of Garland as one would hope and expect, preceded by some 35 pages on the other (to most) less well known provinces of these islands. But surprisingly, although Zemp wrote this section himself, the justly famous ‘Are’are panpipe ensembles are barely mentioned. Nor do they rate more than a single sentence from Zemp elsewhere (398). They aren’t on the accompanying compact disk either. Whatever happened? Has Zemp lost interest in the ensembles? Have the editors?

The 18-page section on New Caledonia and the Loyalty Islands is valuable because so little information has hitherto been available on the music and dance of these areas. The associated list of references confirms the paucity of other information. A workmanlike 22 pages on Vanuatu completes the coverage of Island Melanesia.

Coverage of Micronesia, divided into west and east, begins with a position piece by Barbara Smith, breaking the pattern of introductions elsewhere, which are almost invariably supplied by Kaeppler, alone or in association with others.

Part 3 ends with music and dance of Polynesia. There are three subsections: West Polynesia (Fiji, Tonga, Samoa, Uvea-Futuna, Niue, Rotuma, Tokelau, Tuvalu); Polynesian Outliers (covering eight of the nineteen islands in this category); and East Polynesia (Society, Austral, Tuamotu, Marquesas, and Cook Islands, together with Hawai‘i, Aotearoa [New Zealand], and Rapa Nui). Although Fiji has cultural affinities with Polynesia, its inclusion here will not be accepted by everyone. Generally it is regarded as part of Melanesia. A stronger case can be made for Rotuma, whose people are acknowledged to be of Polynesian origin. Particularly in the articles on the outliers, there is new material here, unavailable elsewhere, and again an
effort has been made to extend accounts of even well-known traditions into the 1990s. Both here and in earlier sections, this has been accomplished, in part, by inviting indigenous writers to contribute a “local view,” complementing those of the principal writers.

ARCHIVES AND INSTITUTIONAL RESOURCES
As time goes on, archival collections of recordings will become increasingly important for research. Listed under this heading are all the major institutions of the area and many minor ones, often with lists of their principal holdings.

FILMOGRAPHY
Organized by area and preceded by an apposite warning about the limitations of multimedia, there is an excellent list, compiled by Love, of “Films and Videos of Oceanic Performing Arts.”

DISCOGRAPHY
Again under area headings, with informative introductory essays preceding each section, the discography tends to be comprehensive rather than selective. Hawai‘i alone has 58 entries.

BIBLIOGRAPHY
Under the heading “Books for Further Reading,” most of the key books on Oceanic music are listed, again organized under area. Other works can be found by referring back to the references appended to each individual section of the encyclopedia.

COMPACT DISK
No effort appears to have been taken to make the compact disk representative. Rather, it reflects availability of recordings. Of the 56 items, 4 are from Kiribati; 3 each come from Baluan and the Marshall Islands; 3 are from Kaeppler’s area of special interest, Tonga; and 7 from Love’s, Samoa. Recordists whose materials have been most used are Frédéric Duvelle (3), Kaeppler (5), Love (6), Mary Lawson Burke (7), and Gerald Messner (8). From most areas there are no recordings at all.

INDEX
Readers need to be warned that index terms are classified under broad headings. Ukulele, for example, will not be found under U but as a subheading under chordophones; and Jew’s harps are not cross-referred—one must remember they are called lamellaphones.

In summary, sizable as it may be, the Garland Australia–Pacific Islands volume falls short of a one-stop compendium on the area. Readers would not be wise to throw away their other reference books.

Finally, it seems extraordinary that although Polynesia, especially, is an area where music and dance, like the languages and the people themselves, are obviously related, no attention has been paid to this in the present volume. One would have thought that an entire section would be devoted to song, dance, and musical instrument
relationships within Oceania at large. For decades, archaeologists, linguists, ethnologists, botanists, physical anthropologists, historians, and others have been working on the manifold relationships of Pacific peoples. The people themselves are also interested in their origins and, when they meet together at festivals and the like, eagerly discuss such questions. The potential for music and dance to contribute to the origins debate could well exceed that of other disciplines, especially as so little has been done to date. Two tasks lie ahead. One is to fill areal and other gaps in information, especially in places where little or no field work has been carried out. The other is to make productive scholarly use of the wealth of information that has already been accumulated.

This volume of Garland has been promoted by its editors as a model for future work in the area. On the whole, although it is the product of a great deal of work by many people, one hopes the call will not be heeded. As a vehicle for organizing information, the book is innovative but, as I have tried to show, it obscures relationships. The challenge now is to put Humpty Dumpty back together again.

Mervyn McLean
Auckland, New Zealand

* * *


The interaction between sounds and spirits is a complex and integral aspect of life for the Waxei people from the East Sepik Province of Papua New Guinea. Yamada explains these relationships through sound in this translation from Japanese of his revised PhD thesis, originally published in 1991. It is the latest in the excellent Apwitihire series from the Institute of Papua New Guinea Studies Music Department.

After basic background information on the Waxei, chapter 1 contains detailed explanations of wept songs, possession of men and bamboo flutes by spirits, and the complex system of behavior and response linked to grudge relationships across generations and clans. Chapter 2 then presents an “ethno-classification” of the different spirits and attempts to describe their cognition by the Waxei. The next two chapters describe and analyze songs related to two particularly significant spirits involving human voices and ensemble bamboo flute playing. Chapter 5 draws the material together to summarize ways in which human and spirit activities are inextricably linked, and the importance of song and sound as a medium for such communication.