Visualizing the Article

An Exploratory Study of Undergraduates’ Educational Reactions to Images in Scholarly Articles

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE DIVISION OF THE UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI‘I AT MĀNOA IN FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF LIBRARY & INFORMATION SCIENCE

MAY 2013

By
Sarah Vornholt

Thesis Committee

Rich Gazan, Chairperson
Diane Nahl
Martin Frické
Dedication

To Scott,
Whose constant support and sacrifice made all of this possible.
Acknowledgements

This brief acknowledgement cannot fully show my immense gratitude to all those who selflessly shared their time to provide support and advice. Without the support of my dear friend and colleague Joshua Mika, I would have never overcome my fear of writing. Without the ongoing support and flexibility of my advisor and committee chair Rich Gazan at the University of Hawai‘i I would not have seen this research through to the end. The University of Arizona School of Information Sciences and Library Resources and Martin Frické so graciously took me in when I needed a home. Special thanks go to Catherine Brooks who volunteered her time and resources to my research; without her I would have been in quite a recruitment pickle. Sincere thanks to my wonderful friend Lisa Harris who donated her time to improving the quality of my writing.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. iii

Chapter 1. Introduction .............................................................................................................. 1

Chapter 2. Literature Review .................................................................................................... 5
  Images and Visual Literacy ....................................................................................................... 5
  Scholarly Publications and Image Inclusion ............................................................................. 7
  News and Pictorial Influences ................................................................................................. 10
  Diverse Disciplines and Images ............................................................................................... 14

Motivations for Neglecting Images in Scholarly Publishing ................................................ 17

Chapter 3. Methods ..................................................................................................................... 19
  Overview of Methods ............................................................................................................. 19
  Research Participants ............................................................................................................ 21
    Main experiment participants ............................................................................................... 21
    Pre-test and pilot test participants ....................................................................................... 21
  Apparatus and Setting .......................................................................................................... 22
  Research Design ..................................................................................................................... 22
    Introduction to research design ........................................................................................... 22
    Cross-sectional research design ......................................................................................... 23
    Repeated measures design ................................................................................................. 23
    Mixed-method research design ........................................................................................... 24
  Measurements ....................................................................................................................... 25
    Variable and operational definitions .................................................................................... 25
    Reliability ............................................................................................................................ 27
    Validity ................................................................................................................................ 27
  Pre-test design and evaluation ............................................................................................... 29
    Pre-test participants ............................................................................................................ 29
  Pre-test online survey display ............................................................................................... 30
    Pre-test article elements ....................................................................................................... 30
    Image elements .................................................................................................................... 31
    Pre-test procedures ............................................................................................................. 31
    Pre-test results ..................................................................................................................... 32
  Main survey element design ................................................................................................. 35
    Design and content of final scholarly articles ...................................................................... 36
    Image manipulations .......................................................................................................... 36
  Pilot experiment .................................................................................................................... 37
  Procedure ............................................................................................................................... 40
# Table of Contents

Recruitment ........................................................................................................... 40
Survey procedures ................................................................................................. 40
Recall segment ......................................................................................................... 42
Ethics ......................................................................................................................... 43

Chapter 4. Results ..................................................................................................... 44
Data Collection and Conditions ............................................................................... 44
Participants Demographics ..................................................................................... 47
Comparison of Article Selection ............................................................................. 50
Educational interest and image correlation ............................................................. 53
Factors Influential to Education Interest ............................................................... 54
Image Responses ....................................................................................................... 56
Unprovoked image responses ................................................................................... 56
Image recall. ................................................................................................................ 57

Chapter 5. Discussion ................................................................................................. 59
Introduction to Discussion ....................................................................................... 59
Analyzing Participant Demographics and Activity Procedures ............................. 60
Article Selection and the Image Disconnection ....................................................... 61
Lack of relationship between variables and images ................................................. 62
Educational Interests Decoded .................................................................................. 63
Accounts of Image Statements and the Implications ................................................. 64
Narrative analysis of individual reactions. ............................................................... 64
Image recall and the illusory image ......................................................................... 66
Limitations of the Study ............................................................................................ 67

Chapter 6. Conclusion ............................................................................................... 71

Appendices ................................................................................................................. 74
Appendix A: Institutional Review Board Approval ................................................... 74
University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa IRB Approval (May 23, 2012) ................................ 74
University of Arizona IRB Approval (August 30, 2012) .......................................... 75
Appendix B: Experiment Consent Forms ................................................................. 77
Pre-Test & Pilot Experiment Consent Form (University of Hawai‘i) ......................... 77
Main Experiment Consent Form (University of Arizona) ......................................... 79
Appendix C: Pre-Test Articles .................................................................................. 81
John Sloan: Clown Making Up .................................................................................. 81
John Sloan: Hairdresser’s Window ............................................................................. 83
The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue ....................................................................... 85
The Promise of Doing Well by Doing Good: A Review of Contributors ................. 87
Homelessness in the Colonies ................................................................. 90
Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal ...................... 93
Fathers on the Small Screen ............................................................... 95
Fathers in Popular Picture Books ....................................................... 97
Appendix D: Pre-test Images ................................................................. 99
Clown Making Up ............................................................................... 99
Hairdresser's Window ...................................................................... 100
New Lanark Mills ............................................................................. 101
Evicted ............................................................................................. 102
Father Knows Best .......................................................................... 103
Flood Waters (Only for use in Pre-Test) ............................................ 104
Appendix E: Pre-Test Survey .............................................................. 105
Appendix F: Pilot Experiment Survey ................................................. 117
Pilot Test - Main Experiment ........................................................... 117
Pilot Test Recall Survey ................................................................. 123
Appendix G: Main Experiment Articles ................................................ 125
(Art) John Sloan: Hairdresser’s Window ........................................... 125
(Art) John Sloan: Clown Making Up ................................................ 127
(Business) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue ............................... 129
(Business) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good .... 131
(History) Homelessness in the Colonies ......................................... 133
(History) Homelessness in the Great Depression Years and New Deal 136
(Sociology) Fathers on the Small Screen .......................................... 138
(Sociology) Fathers in Popular Picture Books ................................. 140
Appendix H: Main Experiment Survey ............................................... 142
Main Experiment - First Survey Segment ....................................... 142
Main Experiment – Second Segment - Recall Survey ...................... 149
Appendix I: Raw Data ...................................................................... 151
References ....................................................................................... 154
List of Tables

Table 1. Image Comparisons in Top Scholarly Journals ................................................................. 9
Table 2. Research Question/Operational Definition/Survey Map .................................................. 26
Table 3. Pre-Test Articles Contents and Titles ........................................................................... 31
Table 4. Article Content Similarity Results .................................................................................. 33
Table 5. Image Agnostic Level Results ....................................................................................... 34
Table 6. Construct Educational Interest Variable Ranking Results ........................................... 35
Table 7. Article Itemization and Image Inclusion ....................................................................... 37
Table 8. Participant Fall-Off ....................................................................................................... 48

List of Figures

Figure 1. Repeated Measures Experimental Design ...................................................................... 24
Figure 2. Operational Definition of the Construct Educational Interest ....................................... 25
Figure 3. Coding Tree for Educational Interest Factors (Expressions) ......................................... 46
Figure 4. Comparison: Disqualified Data .................................................................................... 47
Figure 5. Responses for Ease of Retrieving Information .............................................................. 49
Figure 6. Learning Style Responses ........................................................................................... 50
Figure 7. Overall Quantitative Frequency of Educational Interest .............................................. 52
Figure 8. Selections: Personal Interest, Educational Interest, and Article Recall ......................... 52
Figure 9. Coded Responses Indicting Educational Interest Factors ........................................... 55
Figure 10. Image Statements in Relation to Learning Style ......................................................... 58
Chapter 1. Introduction

The aim of this research is to explore undergraduate underclassmen interactions with scholarly communication and in what manner the inclusion of images impact the student's educational interests. Scholarly journals and articles are a common companion to many university courses. According to Bishop and Neumann (2000), students tend to retrieve digital scholarly journals more than their faculty. Libraries at university campuses subscribe to multiple types of costly educational databases to provide faculty, students, and researchers with access to scholarly materials. To provide an example, Harvard University recently performed a complete overhaul of their library subscriptions claiming these subscriptions were “fiscally unsustainable and academically restrictive” with 3.75 million dollars of their budget paid in 2011 to database providers for access to scholarly articles (Harvard Faculty Advisory Council, memorandum, April 17, 2012). With so much of the universities funds pouring into scholarly communication resources, the student users should feel their academic needs are met.

Just as scholarly resources are an important component of education for undergraduates, visual aids are becoming a regular element in webpages, classrooms, and news. Technological advancements in the classroom settings have caused an escalation of education research into user-friendly improvements for webpage design. Images, visual resources, visual aids, and pictorials are cornerstone design features of web pages on the internet. Various researchers have discovered learning, comprehension, and navigability increase when webpages focus their attentions to users through designing visually interesting sites (Kanuka & Szabo, 1999, Fawley, 2012, Cuddihy & Spyridakis, 2012). In addition, news interfaces, both digital and print, include images to entice readers’ curiosity and interest in the matter. This is not without complications; concerned communication and journalism academics concentrate on the overlooked effects images have on readers’ perceptions, emotions, and selectivity (Knobloch et al., 2003, Zillmann, Knobloch & Yu, 2001, Sargent, 2007, Gibson & Zillmann, 2000, Rössler et al., 2011, and Sacchi et al, 2007). Equally gaining attention in research, other descriptive visuals such as tables, graphs, and diagrams have seen an increase in usage from the social and natural scientific communities in the last
century (Desnoyers, 2011, Arsenault, Smith & Beauchamp, 2006). Very few academics have considered investigating the influence visual resources have on readers’ perceptions when placed within a scholarly article. To date, visual resources are not yet considered a serious enhancement to the textual world in many fields of academia.

It has been proven time and again visual aids in education improve learning. Kate Manuel in her article “Teaching Information Literacy to Generation Y” (2002) explains that students from Generation Y, those born after 1981, are diverse learners who benefit for visual aids incorporated with text,

...the average student retains only ten percent of what s/he reads but twenty to thirty percent of what s/he sees. Visual modes of learning are especially important for Gen Yers, who grew up on television, video games, computers, the Web, and other increasingly sophisticated multimedia presentations (Manuel, 2002, p. 201-202).

Hayward’s information literacy course LIBY 1010 at California State University, titled Fundamentals of Information Literacy, found undergraduate students from Generation Y tend to misunderstand text directions that are presented in a linear fashion (Manuel, 2002). When implementing a new course design, information literacy teachers focused on allowing students to “see the big picture, in every sense of the word, when being introduced to concepts and procedures” (Manuel 2002, p. 9). Through directions presented in a visually graphic format, the students produced more conceptual paper topics, evidencing a greater understanding of their written topics. Undergraduate students from Generation Y, are a substantial pool of scholarly journal users at universities, and their presence is growing. Their education experience may be inhibited because of a one dimensional style of learning presented in scholarly communication.

If the majority of scholarly articles currently available prevent today’s university students from a meaningful opportunity to interact with literature, consider the educational effects of including images in scholarly publications. Based on the assumption undergraduate undergraduates interact often with scholarly journals and are highly influenced by visuals, this research aims to explore the impact of images in scholarly communication and illuminate the enhancements images bring to scholarly articles. This exploration study is the first of its kind, focusing on the unprovoked response underclass undergraduate university
students have on images in scholarly publications, with a concentration on the students' perceived educational interest. The purpose is to discover any links, patterns, or causal effects scholarly articles present when text and images illustrate their pages.

These images are defined as iconic signs representing entities (i.e. photographs, paintings, illustrations) rather than other forms of visual aids, such as charts and graphs. Graph or chart visual aids have received substantial attention in literature (Krohn, 1991, Best, Smith & Stubbs, 2001, Bowen & Roth, 2002, Arsenault, Smith & Beauchamp, 2006 Desnoyers, 2011), thus the boundaries of the research has been set to images, representing a gap in scholarly focus.

To begin an experimental questionnaire study was conducted at a research university on underclass undergraduate students from an introduction Information Resources and Library Science (IRLS) course. The participants were presented with brief articles on various subjects (history, business, sociology, and art) containing either an image related to the topic or text only. The participants were asked a variety of open-ended, free response questions related to their perceptions of the articles, their opinions on using them in further research, and recall information retained from the articles. The research questions center around the general impact of images in scholarly publications, but specifically (a) how will undergraduate underclassmen respond to articles with images as compared to those without images, (b) what kinds of factors influence this population's educational interests in scholarly journals, (c) how are educational interest and images linked, (d) if unprovoked, will students notice and comment on the addition of images in a scholarly article. Because the study's core is the students' unprovoked responses to images, the participants were not aware of the true nature of the study, and any references to images were spontaneous and not suggested.

This thesis is organized as such: Chapter 2 surveys the literature and experimental investigations from various related fields to information sciences. Chapter 3 details the methods and procedures adopted to study participants' relationships with images in scholarly articles, with a focus on measuring educational interests (defined as motivations behind interest in academic materials). Chapters 4-5 review and discuss the results of the experimental survey. In Chapter 6, the conclusion, it will be shown there are many different
causes for students to view an article as educationally interesting, but images do appear to be a factor for many students. This indicates that images in scholarly articles can be an important enhancement to scholarly communication for students with diverse learning styles.
Chapter 2. Literature Review

There is a pressing need to further develop and understand the impact images have on scholarly communication. In order to achieve this, past research must be examined from an interdisciplinary approach to identify diverse outlooks on images and publishing ranging from visual literacy, scholarly credibility, journalism research, graphical and visual aids in the sciences, and publishing positions on images. The literature review is constructed into these five sections with the intention to provide justification for this research.

Images and Visual Literacy

How can visual information perform such a variety of roles in education and be called by so many different names? Just as visual information is documented through various medias such as photographs, illustrations, paintings, graphics, diagrams and film, in today's digital platform the expression often used for visual information is the fickle term image. An insightful remark by Roque in his essay titled *Boundaries of Visual Images: Presentation* encapsulates this idea, “The concept of an image is an irritating and frustrating one... ‘image’ belongs to those kinds of terms everybody immediately understands as long as they are not strictly defined, but immediately disagrees with once they are given a definition” (2005, p. 111). Going straight to the source to define this cumbersome term, one deeply embedded in this research, Oxford English Dictionary defines an “image” as:

A physical or digital representation of something, originally captured using a camera from visible light, and typically reproduced on paper, displayed on a screen, or stored as a computer file. More generally: any picture or graphic (regardless of origin) displayed on a computer monitor, television, etc., or reproduced in printed form.

This may be considered a stifling definition by some standards, but one that fits into the world of publishing as a two-dimensional and static representation of an object, person, idea or illustration alongside text.

While an image is often seen as purely visual, James Marcum acknowledges the power images have beyond mere observation: images can be used as a vehicle to create meaning and improve overall understanding (2002, p. 190). His term visual ecology refers to the forced evolution of images from distraction to ecology caused by the digital realities of
the internet age, "Ecologies are interactive, encompassing both the subject and the environment as they interact with and influence one another dynamically, as a system" (Marcum, 2002, p. 190). Marcum, together with Barbara Maria Stafford (a scholar who studies the relationship between visual arts, physical and biological sciences\(^1\)) challenges scholars with the "important task of validating the image as an effective form of intellectual communication" also asserting "a task that should be – but is not yet – adequately developed by our educational system" (p. 190).

A decade has passed since Marcum’s argument was published, but not much has changed in the overarching educational systems’ perceptions of images. Indeed, Harris (2006) advocates for the holistic inclusion of visual literacy in the existing information literacy practice. Information literacy, and its relationship with images and text, has received little attention in professional literature, while images have become an increasingly present entity in educational practices (Harris, 2006, p. 214). Additional findings related to images and educational practices (Mayer & Goldstein, 2009, Green, 2006, and Pisciotta, Doris, Frost & Halm, 2005) claim faculty at universities are incorporating more images in their conventional teaching activities.

Green’s research, commissioned by the Wesleyan University in collaboration with the National Institute for Technology and Liberal Education, focuses on the teacher/student relationship with images in the new instructional environment of the digital age. After conducting more than 300 interviews and 400 surveys with faculty and staff at 33 colleges and universities, Green clearly states images are of great importance to faculty. Green even goes as far as to conclude digital images have the potential to revolutionize teaching and learning due to the rich experience images offer to students both in the classroom setting and in their studies (p. 99).

Like Green encountered in his study, academic reference librarians interact regularly with reference demands for images and image usage in their places of work. Inspired by a noticeable increase of interest in their own academic universities, Mayer and Goldstein employed survey methods to question academic librarians about their image reference

---

\(^1\) Research interests of Stafford were retrieved from her personal webpage, http://barbaramariastafford.com.
requests. The research reports faculty utilize images for a variety of purposes: to supplement a class lecture (69 percent), class analysis exercise (53 percent), instruction (40 percent), for use within their publications (35 percent), and unknown purposes (30 percent) (2009, p. 19). The researchers did not ask survey participants how often faculty members seek requests for images (i.e. amount of time per semester librarians receive image requests), but it is clear in this research that images are an important aspect of instructional culture for students. Teaching with images is further proven as a significant instructional tool by the Visual Image User Study at Penn State University; faculty used images for courses more than any other function (Pisciotta, Doris, Frost & Halm, 2005).

Many resources provide copyright accessible images to faculty and students in a university setting. ARTstor is the leading database and a non-profit organization for educators’ needs in the arts and humanities, supplying over 1.4 million images (ARTstor, 2012, p.1). This database is used for teaching and research purposes in a wide range of subject areas including art, architecture, music, religion, anthropology, literature, world history, American Studies, Asian Studies, Classical Studies, Medieval Studies, Renaissance Studies (“Mission & History,” 2012). ARTstor is a collaborative project which works with artists, scholars, photographers, colleges, universities and archives to create collections which allow institutions to share art (Wagner, 2007, p. 86). Though ARTstor does not permit images to be distributed through press, commercial or non-commercial entities, they have implemented a new program called Images for Academic Publishing (IAP) to provide publication-quality images for use in scholarly publications free of charge. There are currently over 45,000 images available through IAP (Images for Academic Publishing (IAP),” 2012). As Mayer and Goldstein’s study reveals, faculty members request images for scholarly publications. ARTstor has begun providing images for the precise purpose of promoting visual information for academic publishing. Scholarly publications and images have a relatively young, and often complicated, relationship.

**Scholarly Publications and Image Inclusion**

Not only is an image difficult to describe, a scholarly resource covers a multifaceted and dynamic body of knowledge from different fields of research, thus enabling clear parameters. As defined by Maron and Smith (2009), “‘Scholarly’ resources are those
authored by and for the scholarly community. This definition encompasses a wide variety of formal and informal resources” (Maron & Smith, 2009, p. 5). Though scholarly communication takes on these variegated personas, often a scholarly journal is not a commercial enterprise and employs standards to merit a scholarly reputation, such as peer-review and retaining editors from within the field. Journal articles published both online and in print have seen rapid growth in recent years; in all actuality, articles today are more accessible and utilized than ever before (Tenopir, Mays, & Wu, 2011). Back in 1996, Tenopir and King estimated a typical scholarly journal is read by 50,000 to 100,000 people (p. 32). This is a considerably large readership community: according to the UlrichsWeb Global Serial Directory, there are currently 104,119 individual academic scholarly journals both online and in print in the year 2012.

Yet, how prolific are images in these scholarly publications? A reoccurring theme in quality evaluations of journals and their accompanying articles is to discount images as a desirable quality in publications. With the various desirable qualities that weigh the value of a scholarly publication from citation matrix, author, institutional affiliation, publisher, H-Index and Impact Factor Score, the perceptions of the particular field’s scholarly cohorts holds credence while visuals seem to be overlooked. As evident in Tenopir et al.’s (2011) recently published article, academics judge a scholarly article’s value by considering the author of the articles affiliation, citation matrix, and publisher, but the research does not take into account the contextual enhancements provided by visual resources or graphs; at no point in Tenopir’s qualifications for a valuable journal article does she mention visual aids or consider participants would acknowledge visual aids as a quality inclusion.

Despite of its importance, little information is available about images in scholarly articles. Research determining the average amount of images per journal page, article, or issue has not yet been conducted. Consequently included in this research, a preliminary small archival study was conducted by surveying online electronic top journals in the fields of history, sociology, business, and art; the number of images per individual issues were calculated and analyzed. To define a top journal from each field, peer-reviewed scholarly journals were selected with the highest Impact Factor and H-Index (relative to the appropriate scales for that field). While Impact Factor and H-Index cannot adequately
compare journals across diverse disciplines, two journals from each discipline were chosen based on their scores as representative samples in their fields. Pages from current publications were examined and images, excluding graphs, charts, plots, etc., were calculated, see Table 1 for survey results.

Table 1. Image Comparisons in Top Scholarly Journals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Journal Title</th>
<th>Impact Factor or H-Index</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Images (IM)</th>
<th>Average IM per Issue</th>
<th>Average IM per Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Art</td>
<td>Museum International</td>
<td>H-Index: 6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism</td>
<td>H-Index: 10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>996</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>4.67</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>Academy of Management Review</td>
<td>Impact Factor: 11.42</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1384</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of Marketing</td>
<td>Impact Factor: 5.472</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1880</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>American Historical Review</td>
<td>Impact Factor: 1.103</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3411</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>11.18</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of American History</td>
<td>Impact Factor: 1.1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2802</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>12.67</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>Annual Review of Sociology</td>
<td>Impact Factor: 4.442</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1178</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>American Sociology Review</td>
<td>Impact Factor: 4.422</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2205</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>.007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results are revealing: Table 1 suggests art publications, Museum International for example, encourage their contributors to use images. In specific fields like art, where research relies on forms of art as evidence, images are of perceived importance and find their ways into the publication pages. Similarly based on this research, history endorses images in their publications. Comparing the data, history on average contains 11 images per issue and .04 images per page. Other fields like sociology and business rarely fuse images with their
News and Pictorial Influences

Though information specialists have not yet addressed scholarly publishing and supplemental educational images, one discipline surpasses all others in the study of images and publishing: journalism and communication scholars study the diverse effects caused by pictorials. News and magazine publications resemble scholarly journals by means of providing information, and like scholarly publications these medias have readers, subscribers, and publication woes; their success depends on their perceived importance and readership behaviors. While some may consider scholarly publishing superior to news and magazines because of their non-profit education base, the problems facing visual imagery in the news are relevant to scholarly publishing.

Numerous investigations were conducted to examine the influence images have on readers’ exposure time and selection process (Wolf & Grotta, 1985, Gibson & Zillmann, 2000, Zillmann, Knobloch & Yu, 2001, Knobloch et al., 2003, Sargent, 2007). Of particular interest, an experiment conducted in 2001 by Zillmann, Knobloch and Yu’s discovered the effects photographs have on the reading behaviors and perceptions of print news reports. Experimental methods were used to measure students from a university communications course by instructing the participants to browse through twelve articles arranged as an “experimental” magazine. The participants were aware of time limit restrictions minimizing the number of articles that could be read in the time allotted. Presented in multiple formats, the articles either contained a story with manipulated images or provided a story completely devoid of images which allowed investigators to measure the affects innocuous images, “report-related events devoid of harm,” and agonistic images, “depicting either persons in acute danger of being physically harmed or persons having already suffered the infliction of such harm,” have on readers (Zillmann, Knobloch & Yu, 2000, p. 311). An array of techniques measured the effects images have on readers, translated into reading time: eye movements and page scanning by participants, a post questionnaire cue test that measured the amount of reading done by participants, and the participants’ memory of time spent reading specific articles. Based on reading time results, the investigators conclude images of both an
innocuous and agonistic nature, in conjunction with text, result in more reading time by the participants. A significant increase in reading time results from the inclusion of agonistic (threatening) images, 41.4% reading time growth, as compared to the 16.5% reading time growth of innocuous images.

Similarly, a study conducted in a digital environment by Knobloch et al. in 2003 resembles and reinforces Zillmann, Knobloch and Yu’s work on images in news selection. This research focuses on internet news platforms and provides the interactive components (hyperlinks and visually dynamic headlines) found in modern internet news. Also concentrating on innocuous and agonistic images in news articles, the researchers selected research participants from vocational schools in Germany and undergraduate communication classes in the United States. The ability to compare these two cultures not only offered an interesting perspective to the results, but it increased the external validity of this investigation by reaching results beyond the United States. The experiment involved asked the participants to test the online version of the fictitious magazine World Wide News by browsing the hyperlinked articles and, like the Zillmann, Knobloch and Yu’s experiment, there was not enough time to read every article because a questionnaire automatically stopped the participants at the designated time limit. Unlike the previous study, all articles included an image either innocuous or agonistic yielding the only aspect of the study with distinguishable text and image presentation to be the initial headline choices. The primary emphasis of the investigation was article selection, secondary to imagery conditions of innocuous and agonistic images on the reading time of participants. Substantial findings support the hypothesis that images in internet news headlines positively increase selection: article selection increases by 61% of American participants and 36% of German participants due to agonistic images in the headlines. Innocuous images in headlines profoundly influence American participants, 41%, German participants at 15%. Reading time is also influenced by the type of images: German participants increase their reading time 39% with agonistic images and 20% with innocuous images (though all articles contained one type of image). Americans are more influenced by images with a 65% reading time growth of agonistic images and 33% for innocuous. Not only does this research show the profound effects images have on reading time of participants due to accessibility in news article and headline selection, but it highlights the differences in two different cultures. American
readers are especially affected by imagery and will choose articles with images in the headline more readily.

A fellow communication scholar Sargent (2007) concentrated research efforts on selective exposure on technology-driven computer based stories and inherently provides a novel contribution to existing research findings. Sargent’s study population also consisted of communication students and news stories, yet in contrast with previous research, this experiment employed eight separate news stories with four filler stories and four manipulated stories on a computer based program. News articles for this study were presented in multiple facets ranging from one to three pages, no images, author portrait, innocuous images and agonistic images. Respondents behaviors were evaluated by three depended measures: times of self-exposure (total viewing time for each page of a manipulated story), information acquisition (post-test about articles), and image recall (recalling which articles contain images). Similar to the other studies findings, exposure to agonistic and innocuous images on the first page of the articles results in longer self-exposure time by the readers. Agonistic images also influence the drive of the reader to continue beyond the first page of the article. There is, however, a new aspect of self-exposure results from this study: participants spend significantly more time with articles that had complex images whether those images are threatening or non-threatening. As eminent from the past research, scholars in the communication field have primarily focused on the types of images, threatening or non-threatening, and have yet to focus on the complexity of the images to elicit longer viewing time. Sargent’s research suggests the complexity of images may be influential to participants reading selections; Sargent challenges colleague scholars to research this in more depth. Of the three empirical studies on images and reading exposure, Sargent poses the most unique perspective on the command visual intricacies have on readers. However when critically evaluating the procedures, the direct questioning of the participants about images coupled with text provokes questions about internal validity. Participants may comprehend the importance of the images due to the experimenter’s prompts and this may have an influence on the results of the study.

Among prevailing research on the effects of images on selection and reading time, other scholars focus their attentions on the reactions images have on participants’ perceptions
and memory (Gibson & Zillmann, 2000, Lindsay, Hagen, Wade, Garry, 2004, Sacchi et al., 2007). Gibson and Zillmann’s 2000 article titled *Reading between the Pictures: The Influence of Incidental Pictorial Information on Issue Perception* uncovered findings that prove images accompanied by news articles influence the readers’ perceptions of the issues. Participants were assigned two stories, one about conservation in environmental wetlands and the other about a newly discovered illness spread by ticks. The second fabricated story comprised of four different image options serving as image manipulations. The breakdown of the measures were as follows: (1) the controlled condition, no-image, (2) an image of two ticks with no people, (3) an image of two ticks with three victims with mixed ethnicities (white and black), (4) an image of two ticks with three white victims, and (5) an image of two ticks and three black victims. The participants, students from an introductory class and an alumni focus group, were asked questions about the symptoms of the disease and the people most at risk.

Overall, the findings confirm participants are very influenced by the races of the victims in the photographs, though there was no mention of race in the article’s text. For examples, these participants view those in the community with a higher risk of obtaining the disease based on the ethnicities in the images. An important and unexpected finding from this experiment is the greater information acquisition of participants when text and images coincide. The author suggests engagement of text with stimulating images can increase curiosity and reading time. These findings demonstrate images in text enhance the information received, though more research is required to confidently declare this as fact.

Impressed by the comprehensive articles produced by communication and journalism scholars in the field of visual resources in news articles, clearly images and news are an important topic of study. Scholarly publishers can learn from this research: images may promote readers exposure to articles and increase the educational information retained. An interesting theme emerged when reviewing these articles: every study used the same participant population of students at a university. This very well is a convenience sampling, but the audience of news readers is far larger than one class of students. This can be claimed a flaw in the research of news selection; arguably the studied population is more reflective of a user pool for scholarly articles than news stories.
Diverse Disciplines and Images

Not all fields of study treat visuals equally in their publications. In recent years scientists have embraced the explanatory capabilities images can offer the reader, naming images the “treasures of science” (De Meys, 1992, p. xii). Desnoyer’s (2011) archival study examines the use of visuals in 295 scientific papers on the subject of Ergonomics, the study of linking specific communication tools to technologies. Of those 295 articles, 2,192 visuals were contained on the pages. Desnoyers separates the visuals into 3 types of classes: typograms (linguistic statements using typography, i.e. numerical equations), analograms (graphic signs representing quantitative data, i.e. histograms), and cosmograms (iconic signs representing entities, i.e. photographs). While typograms and analograms are considered visual representations by Desnoyers, the interest here is mainly in cosmograms which constitute the least used visual aids at 17 percent. Desnoyers research illustrates the relative importance images have on the study of Ergonomics, though the limited topic and nature of Ergonomics as a study of the environment, conditions, and tools, may provoke an added need for images than a different, less specific, topic.

A similar and more inclusive study was conducted by Arsenault, Smith and Beauchamp (2006) to compare the use of visuals in hard sciences (medicine, biology, chemistry, and physics) and soft sciences (sociology, economics, and psychology). Arsenault, Smith and Beauchamp surveyed top journals from the above seven disciplines and measured their use of graphs, NGI (nongraph illustrations – the focus of the current study), tables, equations, and montages (figures that contained more than one inscription type). 12,629 inscriptions were found in the overall sample and NGIs were used the least “at a level equal to roughly two-thirds of the usage level for graphs and tables” (Arsenault, Smith & Beauchamp, 2006, p. 395). Comparing hard science visual usage to that of soft science, this study found not only were NGIs used more frequently in the hard sciences than soft sciences, but also NGIs types and subtypes used in the soft sciences are absent in the hard sciences, and vice versa. In particular, conceptual diagrams tend to dominate the soft sciences while photographs and illustrations are most prevalent in the hard sciences. According to the authors, the abstract nature of the soft sciences adds difficulty when capturing their conceptual topics through photography. Moreover, the well-funded hard science journals provide support and means to publish with images (Arsenault, Smith & Beauchamp, 2006).
While there is truth behind the financial backing available to hard sciences for publication, Arsenault, Smith and Beauchamp should avoid the sweeping statement concluding soft sciences are too abstract to capture in photography. It might be argued that photography illustrates the complex social and personal relationships studied in the fields of sociology, economics, and psychology with a rare and relatable verisimilitude.

Despite the fact this research took place in the mid-2000s, Arsenault, Smith and Beauchamp used visuals in science journals published from 1980 and 1981 because of their desire to model their research on the 1984 survey of graphs found in hard and soft sciences by statistician William Cleveland. By comparison, Desnoyers more current survey from 2011 lacks the analytical detail Arsenault, Smith and Beauchamp provide by examining visuals in a range of disciplines. Evaluating these individual investigations collectively allows the scholarly community an understanding of visuals in soft and hard sciences from a specific point and time, as well as a contemporary analysis of a particular research field.

The seemingly trivial value of images as evidence can be seen through Arsenault, Smith and Beauchamp’s (2006) research in the comparison of other forms of visuals in hard sciences to soft sciences. Pauwels (2010) argues visual methods should be considered a viable methodological framework in the field of sociology, “Unfortunately there is little integration with respect to the findings and practices of visual methods, especially between the social sciences and humanities and behavioral sciences” (Pauwels, 2010, p. 546). Through displaying a multitude of methods treating images as evidence, cultural data sources, the reference or subjects of research, and visuals as a medium for displaying information, Pauwels constructs visual methodologies as accessible and palpable. Erstwhile sociologists Fyfe and Law (1988) launched their book *Picturing Power: Visual Depictions and Social Relations* with an introduction focused on the “invisibility of the visual” stating visual depictions of social life as relatable evidence are missing in the realm of sociology (p. 1). This contradicts the claim set forth by Arsenault, Smith and Beauchamp that soft sciences are too intangible to capture pictorial evidence, thus reiterating the earlier claim soft sciences are an ideal platform for visual representations of the human experience.

A growing number of advocate scholars from disciplines outside of sociology are laboring for equal recognition for images and text as “admissible evidence.” First, historians
like Burke (2010) bring to light the conflict between history and images. He recognizes visuals as testimony to history,

Relatively few historians work in photograph archives, compared to the numbers who work in repositories of written and typewritten documents. Relatively few historical journals carry illustrations, and when they do, relatively few contributors take advantage of this opportunity. When they do use images, historians tend to treat them as mere illustrations, reproducing them in their books without comment. In cases in which the images are discussed in the text, this evidence is often used to illustrate conclusions that the author has already reached by other means, rather than to give new answers or to ask new questions” (Burke, 2010, p. 10).

Contributing two articles to the issue of visual materials as historical sources, Layton-Jones introduces a 2008 special edition of *Visual Resources: An International Journal of Documentation* in response to the changing status of images as historical evidence. While not yet equal status to textual documentation, Layton-Jones acknowledges the acceptance images have received from academic historians, however she notes some faulty errors conducted by the world of academic publishing. Publishers often view visual resources as a “luxury rather than essential” and require authors of the articles cover any and all reproduction fees (Layton-Jones, 2008, p. 192). Historical academics are requesting academic publishers to see the value contributed by images to their research; unfortunately some publishers have not yet realized the value of this visual contribution.

Do scholarly publishers really deny the inclusion of images and require authors to forfeit fees out of pocket when they wish to include images in their research? Publishers' vary in their submission guidelines but their required image stipulations may impinge on the authors’ relationships with visual materials, thus trickling down to the readers and affecting the information intake of the published research. To provide a single example, guidelines for the *Journal of American History* are very specific and encouraging of image use, at the same time cautioning submitters of the responsibilities to consider:
Once a manuscript is accepted for publication, the JAH [Journal of American History] strongly encourages the author to enhance the article with illustrations. The author will be responsible for providing the illustrations in a form that is suitable for publication, for obtaining permissions, and for paying any permission, use, or processing fees involved with the illustrations (Article submission guidelines, Journal of American History, 2012).

This strict and cumbersome financial responsibility almost certainly discourages authors from including images in their accepted articles.

**Motivations for Neglecting Images in Scholarly Publishing**

It is fair to speculate restricting authors to legal responsibilities with no guidelines on how to obtain and properly manage copyright permissions and fees is constraining image inclusion in publications. The true motivation behind the small amount of visuals in publications may be caused by a multitude of issues including fees, quality of images, complacency, and the authors who contribute to the publications. Various academic authors also have asked this same question in hopes to explain why images are not abundant in publications when they are often readily accessible online. First, Pauwels (2010) deliberately alludes that even if authors have the skills to select appropriate images, they have,

...very little control over the final “look of things,” especially when publishing academic articles. These usually have fixed templates and as a rule are not ever well adapted to accommodate creative (and meaning generated) treatment of words, image, and layout” (Pauwel, 2010, p. 596).

Second, Fyfe and Law (1988) stress the insincere cost related explanations claimed by journals regarding images are superficial because scientific journals encourage and depend on visualizations in their articles. To add to matter, the lack of agreed upon method for analyzing significant objects of study complicate the inclusion of images.

Agreeing with Fyfe and Law, Bennett (1999) explains publishers are not responsible for images when she shared her personal experience as an academic turned publisher in a 1999 article for *Journal of Scholarly Publishing*. She places absolute ownership on the authors as accountable for submitting suitable imagery, “Quality of images, retaining
appropriate permissions, and insuring the visual image matches the articles contents are the responsibility of the author and not the journal” (Bennett, 1999, p. 193-195). Bennett asserts authors neglect to obtain proper copyright and provide poor quality images for reproductions, consequently costing the publisher and consuming staff, technical, and financial resources. While analyzing Bennett’s words, it brings to light the question, where does the responsibility of the scholarly authors (who presumably did not receive payment for their work) end and where does the responsibility of the publishers begin? It is worth noting Bennett’s article is dated thirteen years; unfortunately, this unique article has yet to be replicated with knowledge from today's editors.

This research is interested in the motivations of academic publishers and authors in regards to image negligence; however the aim is not to explain why academic publishers do not utilize images as a resource to complement the text of articles. Instead, the focus of this research is to explore, through empirical methodologies, the effect images in scholarly articles will have on undergraduate underclassmen.
Chapter 3. Methods

Overview of Methods

This research explores the developing field of visual resources in scholarly publications through analyzing undergraduate underclassmen's unprovoked reactions to images in scholarly articles. A number of questions are addressed in this research concerning these populations' interactions with scholarly journals. The purpose of this exploratory research, influenced by past literature on images in education, communications, and publishing, anticipates insight into the following research question: *What impact will images in scholarly articles have on undergraduate underclassmen?* To add complexity and focus to the research question, it has been fragmented into sub-questions:

- Research Question: What impact will images in scholarly articles have on undergraduate underclassmen?
- Research Sub-questions:
  - RQ1: How will undergraduate underclassmen respond to articles with images as compared to those without images?
  - RQ2: What kinds of factors influence this population's educational interests in scholarly journals?
  - RQ3: How are educational interest and images linked?
  - RQ4: If unprovoked, will students notice and comment on the addition of images in a scholarly article?

A conventional strategy for measuring image impact in articles is to focus on reading exposure time (Gibson & Zillmann, 2000, Zillmann, Knobloch & Yu, 2001, Knobloch et al., 2003, Sargent, 2007), but for measuring educational interest a different approach was designed. To discover answers to these research questions, a questionnaire experiment using survey strategy was conducted with the end goal of measuring educational interests in students by demonstrating a variance between two different presentation formats in journal articles: those that include visual resources and those that are devoid of these resources.

A main survey experiment was designed using 34 participants from an introductory Information Resources and Library Science (IRLS) course at the University of Arizona with
a pilot test conducted using six Library and Information Science graduate students from the University of Hawai‘i. An original survey using repeated measures design was created allowing each participant to be exposed to multiple journal articles of different subject disciplines. Participants viewed the same articles on the subject areas of art, business, history, and sociology in a uniform order. Participants were asked questions after each subject set to ascertain educational interest, allocated into four variables (reference choice, prospective reference, interest in information, and information recall) and operational definitions. Determining educational interest was possible through forced selection between the two articles and the supplemental open-ended, free response essays following the article selection. Each subject set contained two articles on a specific topic, totaling four article and questionnaire sets per participant. At the end of the survey, a segment asked the overall favorite article of the participant in order to probe for a deeper understanding of participants' personal interests. A short follow-up survey a week following each individual participant’s initial completion date measured recall information, both content and imagery recall. Further explanation of the operational definitions can be found in the research design section, Table 3. Every participant was provided with the same scenarios and background on the study. A pre-test preceding the pilot and main experiment was conducted using nine Library and Information Science graduate students from the University of Hawai‘i These participants measured the variables for the construct educational interest, rated similarities for the journal articles used in the survey, and evaluated the levels of threat for images selected for the articles.

In order to represent scholarly articles for the experiment, existing articles were altered to create excerpts totaling eight separate articles on related themes within the discipline. Three of the articles were manipulated by inserting images related to the article. The manipulated images are non-threatening and innocuous, acting as representative resources of the content rather than informational evidence. One article set, art history specifically, contain images that directly relate to the imagery provided. Business, history and sociology article sets contain one image per set as representative of the article. For the purpose of this initial experiment, it was beneficial to discover the impact images have on articles when they are only representative and decorative. In the future, further experiments may be conducted measuring involvement of images in relation to the content.
This chapter is presented in five stages. In the first, the underclassmen are introduced as research participants. Second, an overview of the apparatuses and settings used in the survey are reviewed. Third, the research design will be displayed explaining the methodologies, measures, and issues of validity and reliability will be confronted. Following the design, a consecutive order of the experimental procedures is presented for easy reliability. Finally, this chapter will conclude with ethical planning before proceeding to the results of this research undertaking.

**Research Participants**

**Main experiment participants.** Research participants were thirty-four underclass (freshman and sophomore) undergraduate students at the University of Arizona located in Tucson, Arizona. The sample population was retrieved through non-probability, accidental (or convenience) sampling. Participants were recruited from an introductory course containing 140 students titled “Social Media and Ourselves;” paper flyers were also placed around popular meeting areas on the University of Arizona main campus to gain awareness in the study. An age limit was not enforced and participants were not discriminated against based on gender. Participants self-selected into the study; consistent with accidental sampling, the first sixty University of Arizona students who expressed interest in the study via email were eligible, as sixty was the study threshold. Fifty-two participants expressed interest in the study and thirty-four completed both segments of the study. All participants who contributed to the study were members of the “Social Media and Ourselves” course; the paper flyers around campus did not generate any participants. During the study, respondents were assigned articles via survey software. Participation was voluntary and compensation in the form of 1.5% extra credit from the “Social Media and Ourselves” professor and a $5 eGift certificate to a gourmet coffee shop was awarded post completion of the experiment.

**Pre-test and pilot test participants.** In addition to the main experiment population, fifteen participants from a different population pool were recruited to serve as pre-test and pilot test participants. Participants for the pre-test and pilot test were Library and Information Science (LIS) graduate students at the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa derived from convenience sampling; participants are graduate school colleagues. The age of these participants is a medium of 1982 and 6% male \( (n=1) \) and 94% female \( (n=15) \). Participants
were recruited through the localized LIS listserv operated by University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa LIS faculty and staff. Compensation for the participants’ time and energy was the participants’ choice of a $5 gourmet coffee or online bookstore eGift certificate delivered electronically through email.

**Apparatus and Setting**

On account of the abundant resources available for online survey design and application, creating and administering an online survey was free and easy to use. The online survey tool used was through a web-based company called Survey Gizmo. Participants did not need to provide any materials and instruments to take the survey; they only needed access to a computer and internet (some internet browsers were not compatible with Survey Gizmo software, Firefox and Google Chrome were the recommended browsers). For the main experiment, a computer was the only acceptable device for viewing and completing the survey due to the embedded document viewer from a company called Docstoc. Docstoc allowed the upload of survey materials and was the recommended resource by Survey Gizmo. Participants were provided with a video tutorial describing how to use Docstoc at the start of the survey. The recall, or follow-up, section of the survey was brief and did not contain articles, so participants could use any smart device (computer, smart phone, or tablet) to complete the final segment of the survey. Surveys could be completed at any time and in any setting by the participants; the only requirement being the time allotment to finish the survey in one sitting (i.e. the survey could not be saved and returned to at a later time). Responses were captured at the time of submission using the online survey software’s built in response records.

**Research Design**

**Introduction to research design.** A cross-sectional research design was created to measure university underclass students’ unprovoked perceptions of images in scholarly articles. To increase the validity and reliability of the study, participants were exposed to the independent variable, images in scholarly articles, using a repeated measures design. Repeated measures design is the best choice for this study because it enables the participants to act as their own control group while indicators were measured repeatedly against the same participants. A mixed-method approach was selected to obtain empirical and qualitative
data with the goal of obtaining different but complementary data incorporating multiple perspectives on the educational interest and images. Qualitative data was collected from the survey in response to articles provided to the participants through free-response essays. The essays did not suggest images as a means of measurement, thus all information retrieved from the study related to images was spontaneous and unprompted, making for rich and complex qualitative data.

The participants' responses measure the construct *educational interest* through four indicators: reference choice, prospective reference, interest in information, and information recall. Reference choice, prospective reference, and interest in information were presented in survey format but included the experimental quality of the participants' reactions on a controlled independent measure, images in scholarly articles. Information recall was measured through a follow-up survey questioning the information remembered through content and images.

**Cross-sectional research design.** The nature of the cross-sectional design is that of a survey where data is collected at one point in time from a sample selected to describe a larger population, in the case of this experiment the population is underclassmen undergraduates (Babbie, 1990). The survey was administered in a virtual environment through an online survey source, Survey Gizmo, to replicate the computer atmosphere students experience when retrieving articles from an online database. Participants were provided up to two weeks to complete the survey. This allowed data collection at a single point in time, rather than a longitude survey. A post-test presented on the same survey platform was administered a week after participants completed the general survey. For this experiment, interest in past experiences with articles is not a priority as it would require recalling behaviors and remembering opinions from past research; the immediate interaction with controlled and manipulated articles is the focus.

**Repeated measures design.** Repeated measures design is ideal for this type of study based on the nature of article contents and inconsistencies control groups could present. For example, if a participant was presented with an article on her favorite subject, history, this participant will likely rate the article with a higher educational interest. On the other hand,

---

2 Indicators for educational interest are based on the Pre-Test survey results.
another participant may read the same article but find the contents uninteresting because of
the subject of history. This is a major threat to the internal validity of the survey and
presenting articles on various broad subjects minimized this threat. Using a repeated
measures design, all participants were exposed to independent variables and dependent
variables multiple times. Figure 1 illustrates the repeated measures design through a linear
equation.

\[
T_1 \to Exp_1 \to Obs_1 \to Obs_2 \to Obs_3 \to Exp_2 \to Obs_1 \to Obs_2 \to Obs_3 \to Exp_2 \to Obs_1 \ldots \quad T_2 \to Obs_4
\]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>T</th>
<th>Timing of observation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(T_1) = Administration of survey (T_2) = Administration of follow-up survey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exp</th>
<th>Experimental treatment (independent variable)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Exp_1) = Images in scholarly articles (Art) (Exp_2) = Images in scholarly articles (Business) (Exp_3) = Images in scholarly articles (History) (Exp_4) = Images in scholarly articles (Sociology)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Obs</th>
<th>Observation made in relation to dependent variable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Obs_1) = Reference choice (Obs_2) = Interest in information (Obs_3) = Prospective reference (Obs_4) = Information recall</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Modeled from Social Research Methods by Alan Bryman, p. 37.*

**Mixed-method research design.** The two research strategies, quantitative and
qualitative, allowed for a combination of causal relationships provided by empirical data and
enhanced understandings provided by qualitative data. The empirical assessments allows for
clarification on the forced selection of articles and the qualitative unrestricted responses
allows for exploring the dynamics of educational interest through clustering and comparing
of concepts. When analyzed together, the combination of mixed-method data provides an opportunity to draw inferences from variety of data sources.

**Measurements.** Measuring the abstract construct educational interest requires consistent operational definitions, independent/dependent variables, and indicators. Educational interest as an construct is dimensional and defined for the purpose of this study as a perception of scholarly materials that would elicit interest to learn more on a subject, save for future reference, select as reference in research, and recalled information at a later time. These components to educational interest create the indicator expressions: interest in information, prospective reference, reference choice, and information recall.

**Figure 2. Operational Definition of the Construct Educational Interest**

![Diagram of Operational Definitions](image)

**Variable and operational definitions:** Operational definitions of the construct *educational interest* were measured using selection choice and open-ended questions in the survey. As Figure 2 displays, the construct educational interest is measured by four variables and six operational definitions mapped through survey questions. The variables are delineated into operational definitions, practical applications in the survey. Each variable, aside from information recall, is represented in the questionnaire of the survey after each set of articles to measure the participant’s instantaneous perceptions of the articles. Information
recall is operationalized in a series of questions occurring after the initial survey. To further understand the survey questions in relation to the research questions and corresponding operational definitions please reference Table 2.

Table 2. Research Question/Operational Definition/Survey Map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Question</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Operational Definition</th>
<th>Survey Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RQ1 RQ2 RQ3</td>
<td>Interest in Information</td>
<td>Student expressing interest to learn more on a subject from article</td>
<td>Which article of the two made you want to learn more about [topic]?*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ1 RQ2 RQ3</td>
<td>Interest in Information</td>
<td>Student expressing tedious nature of article (measures opposite of interest)</td>
<td>Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ1 RQ2 RQ3</td>
<td>Prospective Reference</td>
<td>Student saving article on personal computer in case it is useful in their academic future</td>
<td>Which article of the two would you save on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ1 RQ2 RQ3</td>
<td>Reference Choice</td>
<td>Student choosing article for a research paper</td>
<td>You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use?*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ1 RQ4</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A – This is an supplemental format for participants to analyze the articles beyond the content</td>
<td>Aside from the content, did you like the presentation of the articles (i.e. readability, format, style, etc.)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ1 RQ4</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A – Free-response questions about overall personal favorite article</td>
<td>What is your favorite article on a personal level you read from Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ2 RQ3</td>
<td>Educational Interest</td>
<td>Student expressing the article with the most educational interest</td>
<td>Which article do you think is the most interesting article on an educational level you read from Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| (CONSTRUCT)       |                            |                                                                                        |                                                                                  |
| RQ1 | Information Recall | Student remembering information about the articles contents and images | 3 questions about most memorable and interesting article, 3 questions about article content, image recall for each article. |

*Each survey question is asked per article set; 4 article sets in total*

**Reliability.** To ensure the greatest stability of measures in this experiment, the survey questions and articles presented were consistent for all participants; every article contained the same images, text, and questions. The survey administered to participants remained fixed and unedited for easy replication.

**Validity.** Educational interest as a construct requires numerous indicator definitions of this concept to attempt a high level of internal validity. To maximize the experiments' convergent validity, possible systematic interests that could interfere with the desired measure of educational interest were determined. The participants could find themselves influenced by various factors in the experiment such as personal interests in an article, influence due to the addition of information provided by an image, article selection based on perceived ease, and the realization of the true purpose of the study. To address these issues, the measures include multiple methods to prevent convergent invalidity:

1. Personal interest in the article: Articles are on different topics to satisfy diverse interests (history, art, sociology, and business). Articles contain the same style of writing and topical contents. As well, opened-ended questions after each operationalized variable will give the participant an opportunity to explain why they designated the selected article of the articles provided.
2. Images add information to articles: All images will be non-threatening and will not add any information to the articles beyond a decorative quality.
3. Article selection based on perceived ease: All articles are consistent in educational level, author, and topic. Additionally, articles are at the most two pages in length (three pages with references).
4. Realized purpose of test: Participants knowledge of the true purpose of the experiment may result in a desire to appease the researcher, called subject-expectancy effect. To disguise the purpose of research, language about
images was not used and a set of art articles with images steered participants from realizing the factual experimental goal.

Furthermore, to gain merit through face and convergent validity, the pre-test measured the face validity and solidify convergent validity. Pre-test participants (graduate students from the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa) rated the similarities of articles presented to them, as well as rated the threatening nature of the images used as the independent variable in the main experiment. To measure face validity, participants cataloged phrases by ranking concepts of educational interest, thus judging the true indicators of educational interest.

Other forms of validity can influence the outcome of the survey experiment. A common distress to validity is in the form of random errors. To prevent random errors such as uncompleted surveys, accidental selection via the online survey, and not properly participating in the survey (non-participation), various decisions were made: (1) the online form required completion in entirety before proceeding to the next segment of the exam, (2) the survey provided an open-ended question for participants' clarification, and (3) compensation for participants was distributed after completing both aspects of the survey (initial survey and follow-up). A time limit was not enforced and the surveys could be completed at any time convenient for the participant.

Internal validity can influence an experiment negatively through insufficient discriminant validities; those variables that are not relevant to the study should remain unrelated to the outcome. Computer skills, scholarly article knowledge, and personal interests of participants may affect the validity of the experiment. To prevent discriminant validity, the population was limited to students who are comfortable with the internet and are in their first two years of college. As mentioned previously, a variety of topics will be presented in the experiment to prevent personal interests from overtaking the results. To address other aspects of internal validity, well-known threats are confronted directly:

1) History and mortality: History and mortality are not an apparent threat because the experiment will be done at a single point in time.
2) Maturation: To prevent possible boredom during the experiment all articles were significantly shortened.

3) Selection Threat: Biases to selection of the participant population will be minimized by disguising the true nature of the experiment thus reducing the possibility that those participants who select into the survey are particularly interested in visual resources.

4) Instrumentation: The survey is web-based and the only requirement from the participant will be access to a computer and internet.

External validity, such as generalizability, will not be claimed in this experiment (though the research population may be indicative of a larger representation of undergraduate underclassmen). Internal validity is the focus and the results will not represent all undergraduate underclassmen in the United States. Non-probability sampling of participants was utilized in this experimental survey.

Pre-test design and evaluation. The objective of the pre-test was to measure variables, verify article similarity and validate image innocuousness. Nine participants witnessed articles without visual resources, ranked images on the levels of threat, and cataloged in ranking order terms to define the construct educational interest. While the results were not as expected, with new and ambiguous information, the pre-test greatly influenced the design and methods of the main experiment.

Pre-test participants. Participants for the pre-test were chosen by convenience sampling and email recruitment methods were used. Nine participants from the University of Hawai‘i’s Library and Information Science graduate department volunteered to serve as participants for a small compensation of their choice from a $5 gift certificate to a gourmet coffee shop or an online books store. The first nine participants to express interest in the study were recruited; all nine participants completed the survey. This portion of the experiment was conducted remotely from the participants own computers. An online link to the survey was emailed to the participants. They were provided unlimited time and a one week deadline to complete the survey in its entirety.
**Pre-test online survey display.** The 35 question online survey questionnaire contained the following sections: (1) Introduction and demographic questions, (2) Article set #1 and ranking scales, (3) Article set #2 and ranking scales, (4) Article set #3 and ranking scales, (5) Article set #4 and ranking scales, (6) Image #1 and ranking scales, (7) Image #2 and ranking scales, (8) Image #3 and ranking scales, (9) Image #4 and ranking scales, (10) Image #5 and ranking scales, (11) Image #6 and ranking scales, (12) Term cataloging of educational interest, and lastly (13) Submission and thank you.

**Pre-test article elements.** To stay consistent with scholarly articles and the authoritative qualities that make an article scholarly, all articles were selected from peer-reviewed journals that were published within the last five years. The topics of art, history, business, and sociology are broad and themes were narrowed to contents that were not overtly controversial and required no additional education on the subject. The original articles were discovered through information seeking search techniques on subject specific EBSCOhost online databases provided by university subscription. Alterations were not made on the articles unless it was necessary for contextual purposes. For example, if the article referred to a “him” and it was necessary to clarify the person indicated.

To create parallel content and themes, the following criteria was used: (1) one subtopic of each discipline was selected, (2) one author and article was selected for each subject area, these larger articles were dissected and two standalone excerpts were created from a single article, (3) articles were of the same word length and footnotes were maintained if originally in the publication. This constrained article selection insures the style, topic, and level of writing remains as consistent as possible. Given that two articles were generated out of one published scholarly article, a title was falsely created to distinguish the articles within each subject set. Please see Table 3 for a description of the larger discipline topics, article sub-topics, and article titles.

Ultimately, the articles were selected based on their subject areas and the format of the articles. Many articles were examined and read, but the four articles chosen to represent each discipline were ultimately selected based on the following conditions: Articles must (1) use language an undergraduate student would understand - scholarly, yet did not use
technical language, (2) be long enough to be sectioned apart containing more than two sub-topics within the larger topic, (3) not require previous knowledge of the discipline to understand the contents. The articles that were assigned to the pre-test participants can be viewed in Appendix C.

Table 3. Pre-Test Articles Contents and Titles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Theme of Article</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Art</td>
<td>The American artist John Sloan</td>
<td><em>John Sloan: Clowning Making Up</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>John Sloan: Hairdresser’s Window</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conscious capitalism in business</td>
<td><em>The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td></td>
<td><em>The Promise of Doing Well by Doing Good: A Review of Contributors</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>The history of African-American homelessness</td>
<td><em>Homelessness in the Colonies</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>Fatherhood portrayed in popular culture</td>
<td><em>Fathers on the Small Screen</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Fathers in Popular Picture Books</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Image elements.** Images were selected to accompany scholarly articles based on the contents in the article. Complying with copyright is essential when gaining access to images. Many of the visuals used were purchased through rights managed companies Getty Images©, AP Images© or retrieved through the educational image database ARTstor. Images must not contain overt danger, violence, sickness, or natural disasters to be determined innocuous images and selected for use in the experiment. One additional agonistic image was selected solely for the pre-test as a comparison for the main experiment images. Images were originally present in one set of articles, art; this was intentional because the images in art are vital to the content. Business, history, and sociology images were independently obtained and are in no way linked to the published articles. To view the images evaluated in the pre-test please reference Appendix D and Appendix E for their application in the survey.

**Pre-test procedures.** Each article set for the eight subject areas, were presented to the participant without any type of images named Content Evaluation. This pre-test was conducted in order to test the similarities of the articles’ content for the main experiment. Each participant was asked to evaluate how alike each subject set is in (1) context, (2) style
of writing, (3) language and vocabulary, and (4) level of interest. Pre-test participants examined the four sets of articles by ranking the similarities of each article set on a Linkert scale from 1 (strongly disagree) - 7 (strongly agree). To enhance the understanding of the selections of participants a comment box was available for further explanations. Appendix E displays the complete survey used in the pre-test.

After the participants completed the Content Evaluation section of the survey, the Image Evaluation was presented to obtain bipartisan input from pre-test participants to check the visual resources before the main experiment for (1) agonistic (threatening) levels and (2) image quality. A total of six images were displayed during the pre-test, five of which relate to corresponding articles and strive for innocuous qualities. One image was agonistic in nature to act as an anchor for the participant results. This image of a child being rescued from raging flooded waters is directly inspired by the Knobloch et. al article about image selection in news articles. The same Linkert scale was employed for image manipulation, 1 (strongly disagree) - 7 (strongly agree), with the statements: “This image reflects harm and danger” and “The quality of this image has high resolution resulting in a clean picture.”

The last section of the survey was designed to measure the variables for the construct educational interest used in the main experiment. Seven phrases were presented to participants with instructions to rank the concept educational interest, one being the highest ranking and seven being the lowest ranking: (a) wanting to learn more about the subject in the article, (b) sharing the articles with other classmates or friends, (c) select for use and citation in a research paper, (d) receiving a high score on a test about the journal article, (e) recalling the information from the article at a later time, (f) posting information learned in the article on a social network site, and (g) saving article for later use in other courses. The top four concepts that pre-test participants consider best describes educational interest were used as variables in the main experiment.

**Pre-test results.** Due to vague directions and term definitions on the content evaluation design, it is unclear exactly the viewpoints of the participants and their perceived level of similarities in articles. Yet, participants found all four articles overall similar

---

3 The exact image was not found. One comparable will be used in my experiment.
Unfortunately a larger amount of participants disagree with the similarity than is ideal (m=21.5%). Table 4 contains the complete overview of similarity percentages. One change was made to the articles in direct response to the pre-test results; the business articles were changed slightly to reflect greater similarities in content by exchanging a paragraph from one article to the other. Excluding the business articles, it was decided the articles provided were not as similar as initially planned, but would be sufficient for this initial experiment. Aside from supplying the same articles for each subject set or rearranging the paragraphs to create an illusion of a new article, it is impossible to ensure similarities on all fronts. Since the main priority in this study is the unprovoked reactions of the participants in regards to images in publications, it was determined rearranging the articles would provide knowledge the articles were not the research focus.

Table 4. Article Content Similarity Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article Set</th>
<th>Agree Similar</th>
<th>Neutral Similar</th>
<th>Disagree Similar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Art</td>
<td>52.8%</td>
<td>13.9%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>72.2%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>27.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>80.5%</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>88.9%</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MEAN</strong></td>
<td><strong>73.6%</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.8%</strong></td>
<td><strong>21.5%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All images but two passed the agonistic test. The two images, “Hairdresser’s Window” and “Evicted...,” collected less than desirable results. “Hairdresser’s Window” received a large amount of “neutral” responses (33.3%) while “Evicted...” received too great an “agree” response that the image reflected harm and danger (77.8%). Table 5 further explains the results for images evaluation. To better understand the participants’ views on the images, all participants that judged images as threatening were contacted via email for further explanation. It became apparent that the survey question “This image reflects harm and danger” was too vague. When the participants were emailed, the terms “harm and danger” were clarified to mean: (1) Do the images make you feel threatened, in danger? (2) Do the images show a combative situation or struggle? (3) When looking at these images do you feel a strong sense of harm to those in the photograph? All participants that viewed the image as initially harmful clarified their thoughts to express the situations were viewed as
socially threatening rather than provoked a sense of danger. An example of a description shared by a participant for “Hairdresser’s Window”:

“For Hairdresser's Window, I initially didn't feel any danger, but the one woman's face on the bottom of the picture looking back almost made her seem like she was struggling somehow. That's the main reason I put neutral, her face made me question the atmosphere at the time.”

A participant also explained her views of the image “Evicted…”

“The image does not make me feel threatened or in danger, I think the image shows more of a struggle. The image speaks so much about the poverty these people are in and I saw the struggle faced by the people in the photo especially after reading the article. I feel these people are perhaps in harm or are enduring a form of suffering that can been seen when looking at their body language and what looks like a somber expression on their faces.”

Image resolution questions were disqualified. The question about a clean picture was confusing to participants. The images were purchased and of the highest quality, thus this question was not needed for the main experiment.

**Table 5. Image Agonistic Level Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image Set</th>
<th>Agree Agonistic</th>
<th>Neutral Agonistic</th>
<th>Disagree Agonistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clown Making Up</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>88.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hairdresser’s Window</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>55.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flood Waters</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evicted...</td>
<td>77.8%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father Knows Best</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>88.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Lanark Mills</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>88.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interestingly, the results that impacted the main experiment the greatest was the variable cataloging for the construct educational interest. Before the pre-test (based on past research referenced in the literature review and outside perceptions) it was assumed the
variables that represent educational interest would consist of reference selection, sharing information with peers, level of interest, and information acquisition. Yet, according to the pre-test, participants strongly chose the variable rank, as seen in Table 6: (1) desire to learn (2) saving for future reference (3) reference selection and (4) Information recall. This changed the format of the main survey. Initially there was to be a quiz at the end of the survey to measure information acquisition. This quiz was eliminated and a follow-up memory based survey was added to measure information recall.

Table 6. Construct Educational Interest Variable Ranking Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wanting to learn more about the subject in the article</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saving article for later use in other courses</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select for use and citation in a research paper</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recalling the information from the article at a later time</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing the articles with other classmates or friends</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posting information learned in the article on a social network site</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receiving a high score on a test about the journal article</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Indicators and variable manipulation checks employed in the pre-test verified the best operational definitions for the construct “educational interest.” By designing a pre-test to address and avoid biases, the experiment’s internal validity was strengthened to prevent corruption of participants’ selections in the main experiment. It is imperative the articles offered to participants be similar in content, while different in subject, so the variables measured are indeed indicative of the addition of images than the perceived ease of the article or style of the writer.

**Main survey element design.** The main survey measured the construct educational interest and gained insight into students’ interactions with images in scholarly publications among the desired population of undergraduate students. A pilot test was conducted prior to
the main experiment to discover issues with survey presentation, software, question arrangement and wording. The main aspect of the survey was the scholarly articles presented to the participants. A detailed account of the creation and design of these articles is essential to understanding the measures. The exploration study will discover any causal effects of educational interest, the dependent variable, based on scholarly articles and the inclusion of images, the independent variable. The complete survey provided to participants in the main experiment is viewable in Appendix H.

**Design and content of final scholarly articles.** Each article set contained two articles on the same topic and similar in style, content, difficulty level, and interest (as confirmed by the pre-test). The internal article layouts were modeled after popular scholarly journals using Microsoft Word 2010. The articles remained consistent throughout the experiment from the fictional scholarly journal *Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin* complete with false volume, numerical, and page number sequences. The article design comprised of two-three pages, title header, 12 Times New Roman font, two column layout, and footnotes (if applicable). These articles (Appendix G) were excerpts from larger scholarly articles, used in the pre-test.

The subjects of the articles were art, business, history and sociology. The topics of the articles are identical to the topics used in the pre-test except manipulated by images. The only change in the articles contents from that of the pre-test articles was the transfer of information from the business article *Challenges of Sustaining Virtue* to the companion article *The Promise of Doing Well by Doing Good: A Review of Contributors*. As stated in the pre-test, these articles are excerpts from peer-reviewed journals.

**Image manipulations.** All images are related to the associated text but do not add any information to the articles’ text. Image title captions were provided to reduce misunderstandings; however no additional contextual information was delivered. For the purpose of this experiment, the visual resources in the articles must act as representational rather than information sources. When the image manipulation is employed, the image is displayed on the second page of the text and all images positioned in the same location, the upper middle of the article, with the text wrapping around the image. All images are equivalent in size with high-resolution quality. In light of past research (Gibson & Zillmann,
2000, Zillmann, Knobloch & Yu, 2001, Knobloch et al., 2003, Sargent, 2007), readers' perceptions are very influenced by agonistic images and images of this nature will be avoided because they may create visible biases. All images were rated as innocuous by the pre-test. Each of the three manipulated article sets contained one image (see Table 7). Business, history and sociology articles are considered manipulated because their images were inserted for the purpose of this experiment. One article set, art, contained two images, one in each article, a painting by the American artist John Sloan. Considered the control group, the articles in art have not been manipulated and the original article contained the image used. Art was chosen as the control group because art journal publications include images to a greater degree than the other topics. The small archival study (see Table 1) suggests the discipline of art more frequently supplements their articles with visuals as compared to business, sociology, and history.

Table 7. Article Itemization and Image Inclusion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>With Image</th>
<th>Without Image</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Art*</td>
<td>John Sloan: Clowning Making Up</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Sloan: Hairdresser’s Window</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Promise of Doing Well by Doing Good: A Review of Contributors</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>Homelessness in the Colonies</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>Fathers on the Small Screen</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fathers in Popular Picture Books</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Art is the control group and both articles will contain the originally supplied image of the painting.

Pilot experiment. A shortcoming of the pre-test was the misconception caused by vague directions and terms. To prevent problems in the main experiment, the pilot study was conducted to test the survey procedures and question wording used. This pilot test was tested by six Library and Information Science graduate students from the University of Hawai‘i, a different population from the main experiment. To predict issues with the survey software, similar email distributing procedures built into the software and time completion frames were
used as intended for the main experiment. Data was not collected and analyzed from the pilot experiment because the participants were aware of the purpose of the study and were of a different population. To view the pilot test used, please reference Appendix F.

The survey software included a useful built in email distribution tool that automatically sent reminder emails and completion emails. The pilot test was a safe atmosphere to explore the different distribution options and often the emails did not send as scheduled. Therefore, it was clear that email recruitment had to be closely monitored for the main experiment. As the pilot participants began finishing the first segment of the survey, the randomization of the articles and questions were causing an error in the software. The explanation segments were not aligned to the proper question and the results were extremely skewed and confusing. Because these errors were discovered in the pilot test, they were able to be corrected for the main experiment.

Demographic questions in the pre-test survey proved to be well-defined and understandable. After reviewing the question about learning styles and the potential complexity of learning styles, it was decided a more inclusive list should be provided for the main experiment. Consulting an online resource (learning-styles-online.com), three additional learning styles were added and definitions clarified interpretation.

Not only did the pilot study highlight issues with the survey software, but it provided awareness as to the complex answers the educational interest variables enlist from participants. The participants deeply analyzed the articles and probed intensely into the content and references. Granted, the pilot participants were graduate students, but based on the reactions from the participants it was apparent the questions asked were specific and understandable. However, there was no mention of images in the pilot experiment data. Focusing on participants' unprovoked responses to images proved the research was at risk for missing data. The premise of the research experiment was based solely on unprovoked responses to images in scholarly articles, thus the questionnaire was modified after the pilot survey. A question after each article set was appended to the questionnaire which focused on the article presentation rather than content which allowed for data outside of content analysis. Finally, it was necessary to retrieve more information on educational interest in a direct,
open-ended format. As a result, a question group directly following the personal interest question was added, and on the recall survey a more in-depth examination into image recall was added. Please view the pilot experiment in Appendix F, compared to the main experiment in Appendix H.
Procedure

Recruitment. Participation in the current study was voluntary and withdraw was available to participants at any time without penalty. Utilizing accidental sampling, participants were recruited from an introductory Information Resources and Library Science (IRLS) course titled “Social Media and Ourselves.” Participants viewed the recruitment letter and flyer on the course main webpage with an offer for extra credit and a $5 eGift certificate to a gourmet coffee shop. Participants initiated contact via email and expressed interest in the survey. Upon receiving a response email, the participants were given a participant ID number that remained their identification throughout the experiment to safeguard confidentiality. A recruitment email was sent from the survey software which allowed for tracking of participants progress and reminder emails were sent regularly. 52 participants, of the desired 60, expressed interest and 34 completed the survey in entirety. A two week deadline was set and directions informed the participants of restrictions on survey recovery, they could not save and returned to complete the questionnaire at a different time. After the first segment of the survey was completed, an automated email was sent to participants a week later to complete to recall survey.

Survey procedures. The online questionnaire form contained the following sections: (1) Introduction, (2) background questions, (3) Article set #1 and questionnaire, (4) Article set #2 and questionnaire, (5) Article set #3 and questionnaire, (6) Article set #4 and questionnaire, (7) Overview of favorite article (8) Submission and thanks. Each section of the online form enclosed a detailed explanation of the task at hand.

The survey began with an introduction to the survey and outlined a scenario for the participants. The participants were provided with a false study name, Journal Article Euphoria: A Study into How Undergraduate Students Select Journal Articles as assurance that the true purpose of the study stays undisclosed. The scenario presented to the participants is as follows:

Your scenario: You are assigned four (4) short essay papers in your English 101 course. The subject areas are business, sociology, art and history. Your time and energy has been spared by the teacher and two articles for each topic were already chosen for you out of a new scholarly journal Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin.
Please evaluate each set of articles for each subject area and select the ONE article that answers the question provided. Please do your best to explain WHY you chose this article out of the two provided. Before you begin your assignments you will be asked a few introductory questions about your background. A short follow-up survey will be required a week after submitting this survey.

You will not be able to save and return to this survey once started.

Thank you for your support!

Following the introduction, participants were presented with an agreement to complete the follow-up segment of the survey, the consent form (Appendix B), and a self-made tutorial instructing the different viewing options when using the platform Docstoc (an embedded document viewer in the survey).

At the start of the survey, the undergraduate students were asked to provide background information related to their gender, age, and majors. Additional questions were asked to determine the participants' research preferences and learning styles. After completing the background information, the participants began reading eight articles divided into four different sections within the survey. Each segment was presented to participants in the following order: (1) art, (2) business, (3) history, and (4) sociology. At the time of the experiment, the survey software did not have the technology to randomize the articles within the survey. However, the two articles within each subject set were presented randomized and with a concise abstract supplying background knowledge for the participant. After reading was completed, the participants proceeded to the questions measuring educational interest; after each question an essay style explanation was required. All participants received the same order of questions but each set was arranged differently. The addition added from the pilot test, comments on presentation of the articles, consistently remained at the end of each question set. The participants were able to navigate the survey by using a back button. To prevent morality, occasionally throughout the survey there was motivating language such as “Only two more articles. You are almost done, keep going!” The ending segment of the survey was participants' choice of their “favorite article.” Five questions allowed participants to select one article that was personally interesting and one article that was educationally
interesting. Most importantly, an explanation was required after each selection. From this information, insights into the participants’ personal and educational interests were examined.

**Recall segment.** A week after the completion of the survey’s first segment, participants received an email allowing them access to the final recall survey. This, unlike the first segment of the survey, could be taken on a smart phone, tablet, or computer. Upon entering the recall survey, participants were welcomed with this message,

A week ago you read eight (8) articles from the journal *Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin.* You will be asked a few questions about those articles. Please answer the questions to the best of your ability based only on memory and personal perceptions.

After some identification information, the participants were asked for information on the most memorable article read, why it was memorable, and their favorite part of the article. Proceeding to the next section of the recall survey, the participants were asked if they conducted any additional research after reading the articles. If they did indeed do independent research they were asked additional questions about the topics researched and why. If they did not, they were ushered forward to a segment about information retained from the articles.

The final aspect of the survey was the largest opportunity for data on images. Participants were asked if they remembered if articles containing images. If they did remember images, they are shown a multifaceted table that queries the participants’ knowledge on the articles, if they included an image, and what the image looked like. To finish the survey the participants were asked for any additional comments about the articles or images in articles. By submitting this final segment, participants fully contributed to the research and were immediately awarded their $5 eGift card to a gourmet coffee shop and added to the list of extra credit participants for the volunteering professor. Participants completed their surveys at different times and reminder emails were required for some participants. Luckily, all participants were dependable and completed the follow-up survey.
Ethics

Proper permissions and ethical reviews were needed for the above studies. Due to the use of human subjects as participants, authorizations from the participating universities Institutional Review Boards (IRB) were mandatory before the study could begin. The above experiments were conducted at the University of Arizona and sponsored by the University of Hawaiʻi at Mānoa. As a result, multiple approvals were required and obtained through a formal application and review process. The application for the University of Hawaiʻi at Mānoa’s Institutional Review Board was obtained in April 2012 and received approval for the study in the form of an “exemption”. The University of Arizona also required approval to use their campus and students; this approval was obtained in August 2012. Both approvals do not expire and protect the researcher, participants, and university from any ethical misconduct. Please see Appendix A for the University of Hawaiʻi at Mānoa and University of Arizona’s IRB approvals.
Chapter 4. Results

It will be recalled that the purpose of the current study is to explore undergraduate underclassmen’s unprovoked reactions to images in scholarly publications. To discover correlations and concepts, the data retrieved from the experimental questionnaire was analyzed around the general research question, what impact will images in scholarly articles have on undergraduate underclassmen, and the more descriptive sub-questions, (RQ1) how will undergraduate underclassmen respond to articles with images as compared to those without images, (RQ2) what kinds of factors influence this population’s educational interests in scholarly journals, (RQ3) how are educational interest and images linked, and (RQ4) if unprovoked, will students notice and comment on the addition of images in a scholarly article? The data was analyzed through the comparison of measures and extensive qualitative analysis utilizing theme coding from numerous open-ended questions.

Data Collection and Conditions

Respondents completed two segments on the questionnaires and provided quantitative data in the form of forced selection and qualitative written data in the form of free-response, open-ended questions. To reference the raw data free of analysis please visit Appendix 1. No participants were disqualified in totality based on their responses. However, various selections from participants were eliminated in the comparison measures collection due to the expressed personal interest in an article rather than educational interest and a clear lack of choice further reveled in the open-ended accompanying response. An example of a disqualifying response is as follows: a participant selected the article Fathers on the Small Screen as the best article to save for future use in a course because, “I have seen some of the shows that they referred to in the article and I like them.” This response shows a great personal interest in the article and was disqualified. Another respondent chose John Sloan: Hairdresser’s Window as the article that made her want to learn more on the subject of John Sloan, then explained, “[I] actually don’t want to learn about [J]ohn [S]loans artwork just because [I] do not have an interest in it.” As seen in Figure 4, some articles lost as many as 25 responses due to the participants’ personal reactions to the articles. For the qualitative analysis, these responses were coded and did not receive this disqualification.
The quantitative analysis was conducted after eliminating disqualified responses and totaling the number of responses for each article in each set. Data was analyzed progressively deeper concentrating on patterns as they emerged. Unfortunately, the data could not be compared statistically because articles were not identical and qualitative data proved motivations behind article selection, thus rendering statistical analysis insignificant.

The qualitative open-coding analysis consisted of two parts: first to minutely subdivide the individual material into summary statements, and second the analytical process of clustering the data into conceptual themes. This theme evaluation explained participants' perceptions of the articles and captured ideas; the breakdown can be seen in a coding tree represented in Figure 3. Respondents had the opportunity to express themselves freely in the survey, and as a result some participants cited multiple reasons for selecting an article—their responses were coded accordingly. To demonstrate how responses were coded, take a look at the following examples: one student chose the business article *The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good* as the article that increased the desire to learn because,

...For me, I extrem[e]ly like the article "The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good". This article start [sic] a really attractive title and gives me plenty interests to read. I want to learn what this article is talking about. It points out a really good argument at the beginning, too. I would like to learn how the author discuss [sic] about his argument.

This response was coded in two categories, “Form” due to the emphasis on the title being a motivation for interest, and “Analysis” for the focus on the articles argument. A different participant chose the same business article *The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good* as the article that increased the desire to learn, “The argument [b]eing sais [sic] is very interesting makes you want to learn about what the future has in hold.” This statement was coded in the theme “Analysis” again because of the emphasis on the argument used in the article. Many responses were multifaceted and required thoughtful consideration of the themes represented.
Figure 3. Coding Tree for Educational Interest Factors (Expressions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focused Coding</th>
<th>Initial Coding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic Viability</strong></td>
<td><strong>Focused Coding</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Important topic in field</td>
<td>Evokes Interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavily researched topic in field</td>
<td>• More interesting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applies to different topics</td>
<td>• Thought provoking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholarly credibility</td>
<td><strong>Form</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great amount of references</td>
<td><strong>Historical Significance</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Accessibility</strong></td>
<td>• Writing style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easier vocabulary</td>
<td>• Descriptive writing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Readability</td>
<td>• Vocabulary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understandable</td>
<td>• Title of article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analysis</strong></td>
<td><strong>Informative</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical</td>
<td>• More information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different viewpoints presented</td>
<td>• Better information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Descriptive</td>
<td><strong>Modern Relevance</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument</td>
<td>• Reflects modern issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation</td>
<td>• Broader social relevance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depth of analysis</td>
<td>• Relates to modern life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New perspective on topic</td>
<td>• Future implications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analysis Potential</strong></td>
<td><strong>Personal Motivations</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broad potential for future analysis</td>
<td>• Personally relates to article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imagine analysis project based on article</td>
<td>• Personal preference to topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Content</strong></td>
<td>• Personal bias against topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject matter</td>
<td>• Emotionally affected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background content</td>
<td><strong>Specifics of Note</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Story told in article</td>
<td>• Highlights specific idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diverse subject areas presented</td>
<td>participant found important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focused on target topic</td>
<td>• Specific example used</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discovery of Topic</strong></td>
<td><strong>Verismilitude</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learned something new</td>
<td>• Reality of writing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gained new perspective on topic</td>
<td>• Honest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provoked curiosity</td>
<td><strong>Visual Resources</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evidence</strong></td>
<td>• Attracted to image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factual evidence</td>
<td>• Inclusion of image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount of facts</td>
<td>• Images helped understanding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Participants Demographics

Participants’ completion of the first segment of the survey, which included eight two page articles and corresponding questions, had an average duration time of 1 hour and 12 minutes (1:12). Participants were not able to save the study and return at a different time, thus responses were completed in one sitting. 34 respondents completed both segments of the survey (article segment and recall segment) and 52 respondents requested to participate. The survey was started on 37 occasions and abandoned on 10 occasions. The survey software allowed for participants to return to the questionnaire at a different point and time if it was abandoned or incomplete. Table 8 illustrates the fall-off of participants at various points of the survey.

Participants were provided information about the survey on 1/23/2013 and participants began submitting the completed article segment of the survey on 1/24/2013, with the latest submission date of 2/3/2013. The final participant to submit the recall segment of
the survey was on 2/13/2013. The range of time taken by respondents lies between the shortest duration, 14 minutes (:14), and the longest duration 3 hours and 33 minutes (3:33). Respondents were from the desired population with expected age range for first and second year students at a university setting. Their birthdates range from a birthdate of 1992-1995 and a mean with the year 1994. There was a majority of females at 61.8% (n=21) to males, 38.2% (n=13). 97.1% of participants were in their first year (freshman year) of college (n=33), and one student in their second (sophomore year). As Figure 5 shows, a majority of students, 61.8%, shared it was “moderately easy” to retrieve information when conducting research for courses. In regards to information retrieval formats, 88.2% of students (n=30) use online search engines as a resource for educational purposes. When participants were asked their style of learning, 50% (n=17) of students saw themselves as visual learners, defined in the survey as “You prefer using pictures, images, and spatial understanding.” The two learning styles that received the smallest responses were physical (you prefer using your body, hands and sense of touch) and verbal (you prefer using words, both in speech and writing) with n=3 at 8.8% each. See Figure 6 survey learning style percentages and Figure 10 for image statements in regards to learning style.

Table 8. Participant Fall-Off

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page Title</th>
<th>Page Submitted</th>
<th>Was Exit Page</th>
<th>% Exit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abandoned survey with no data</td>
<td>10*</td>
<td>10*</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Follow-Up Survey Agreement</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. How to Take this Survey:</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Consent Form</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Background Information</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Art: John Sloan</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Art: John Sloan Questions</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Business: Conscious Capitalism</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abandoned responses by definition do not submit any page of the survey. This number represents a total count of abandons, not the submission of a page.

Figure 5. Responses for Ease of Retrieving Information
Comparison of Article Selection

Turning to the first question: How will undergraduate underclassmen respond to articles with images as compared to those without images? As Figure 7 reveals, yes, overall participants were more educationally interested in articles that contained images. In total, the articles with images were selected as future references, provoked learning, saved for later use, interesting (as measured by the opposite of boring), and recalled. Disregarding the control group, the subject of art, participants did find the articles that contained images as more educationally interesting, though not by a significant amount. Cumulatively, 35.7% of response frequencies (n=194) chose articles with images as educationally interesting, 27.2% chose articles without images (n=148), excluding the art articles and those that were disqualified (totaling 37.1%, n=202). Of the articles remembered in the latter recall portion of the survey, 35 responses were recorded from 34 participants: one participant remembered details on two articles consistently in all sequential questions. 48.6% of participants recalled articles with images (n=17), 20% recalled articles without images (n=7), and 31.4% recalled one of the art specific articles (n=11). Two participants specifically remembered the painting "Clown Making Up" because they recalled the image provided. One participant shared, 
"...[John Sloan: Clown Making Up] was memorable, because of the image it instilled in my head." Aside from the art articles, one other participant remembered the article Fathers on
the Small Screen because of the image, “I also remember a man in the picture... Because there is a picture. I think a picture will be more efficiency [sic] and elaborate.” Excluding the three image statements, there were no other mentions of images as the cause of article recollection, consequently revealing the correlation between article recall and image inclusion relevant for 8.6% of the responses.

Participants were personally interested in the articles that contained images by a significant amount, as compared to those that did not contain images. Yet, when the participants were asked to select the article that was educationally interesting, more participants selected articles without images (see Figure 7). 52.9% of participants (n=18) chose the articles with images as their personal favorite article, while those without images were selected by half the amount of participants, 26.4% (n=9). 48.5% of participants (n=16) chose the article without images as the most educationally interesting, compared the 45.4% of participants (n=15) that selected an article with an image as educationally interesting. Again, art was measured separately with 20.6% of participants selecting an article on art as their personal favorite (n=7) and 6% selecting an article on art as educationally interesting (n=2). Unfortunately, through contextual coding analysis explained in more detail in the Discussion chapter, this is not due to the inclusion of images, but is a result of various aspects and complex perceptions from the participants.
Figure 7. Overall Quantitative Frequency of Educational Interest

![Bar chart showing the overall quantitative frequency of educational interest with categories: Reference, Save, Learn, Interesting. The chart indicates the number of responses for each category.]

- Article with Image
- Article without Image
- Art Articles (Control Group)
- Disqualified Responses

Figure 8. Selections: Personal Interest, Educational Interest, and Article Recall

![Bar chart showing selections for personal interest, educational interest, and article recall. The chart includes categories: Images, Non-Images, Art Article (Control Group), and Disqualified Responses.]

- Educational Interest
- Personal Interest
- Article Recall (Variable of Educational Interest)
The final variable of the construct educational interest was information recall. Participants were asked a week after completing the article segment of the survey to recall articles, content, and images. Responses were coded by description of the articles and 35 separate responses were retrieved from the 34 participants. The articles with images were deemed more memorable by participants overall (see Figure 8). Again, separating the articles about art, the articles that were remembered the greatest were those that contained images with 48.6% of the responses recalling these articles (n=17). Articles that did not contain images were recalled the least with 20% (n=7). The art articles were remembered by 31.4% of responses (n=11) exclusively due to the inclusion of an image. Of these 11 responses, the piece of art for Clown Making Up was mentioned by 75% of the responses and 33% for the artwork Hairdresser’s Window. To measure the participant’s content recall, a three part opened-ended quiz was given for the subjects business, history and sociology. 88.2% of respondents described a time in history of African American homelessness, 55.9% of participants remembered correctly how conscious capitalism changed throughout the years, and only 38.2% of participants could remember a book or television show mentioned in the sociology articles.

**Educational interest and image correlation.** Can it be considered that educational interest and image inclusion are indeed linked? No. Images did not prove to be a reoccurring theme in the coding results and cannot correlate educational interest based on this study. Participants did not respond to images in a significant way with 15 image statements as a motivation for selecting the article for the three variables educational interest and information recall (excluding least interesting article). Five image statements were collected: two participants in reference to the sociology article Fathers on the Small Screen, three image statements from two participants from the history article Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal, three image statements from three individuals from the art articles, and three image statements from three individuals from the recall follow-up portion. The sociology article Fathers on the Small Screen included an image of a television show referenced in the writing received the most unprovoked responses with five responses stating images as a reason for selecting the articles. For example, one participant shared she would rather use this article as a reference because, “Has images, facts, things that can help you with a research.” The business article titled Challenges of Sustaining Virtue included an
image of a mill referenced in the article, yet not a single participant mentioned images in the responses for this article. Figure 10 illustrates the various image statements woven through the survey in relation to the participants’ self-identified learning styles.

Factors Influential to Education Interest

The variables for the educational interest construct are as follows: interest in information, prospective reference, reference choice, and information recall. There are a variety of factors that influence students’ educational interest and they were discovered through open coding on open-ended, free-response questions during the article segment of the questionnaire. Each participant responded to the first three variables for educational interest (interest in information, prospective reference, and reference choice) differently and provided unanticipated unique insights. Unfortunately the purpose of research, reactions and interactions with images (coded as “Visual Resources”), proved to be an unsubstantial motivation for educational interest as apparent in Figure 8. However, it was discovered there are many diverse motivations considered when viewing a scholarly article through the educational interest lens. As stated previously, all opened-responses were coded to reveal the overarching theme of participants’ responses. 499 complex responses were disassembled and examined for themes and phrases; 13 expressions, termed expressions from this point forward, to convey characteristic of selection emerged (see Figure 3 for coding tree and expression definitions). Articles were not analyzed separately by image inclusion; instead all articles were analyzed homogeneously to demonstrate an overview of the important qualities in a scholarly journal. The data suggests “Analysis,” defined as the analysis provided in the text by the author, is the most influential factor of a scholarly article receiving over 63 mentions. One student shared Homelessness in the Great Depression and New Age would make a better reference in a paper because “…it provides more logical arguments in it.” Another student explained why they would save Fathers in Popular Picture Books, “… It also describes a different perspective to the typical father figure and was a period of change.” “Evidence,” in the way of facts or appropriate examples provided in the text, was an impact for participants throughout the questionnaire; statements of evidence were represented 60 times during the course of the survey. Of least importance, verisimilitude (speaks truth) makes up 1% of the responses (n=3), visual resources (inclusion of image) was considered a
factor by 2% of respondents (n=10), and the articles historical significance (importance in the scope of history) was also mentioned by 2% of participants. When analyzing the educational interest factors by subject, as seen in Figure 9, it suggests different subjects persuade different purposes for educational interest. Regarding the art articles, “Analysis” was deemed the most influential reason for article selection with 18.6% of the responses (n=24), “Evidence” for business with 17.2% (n=23) and history with 17.5% (n=20), and finally “Personal Motivations” for sociology with 15.6% (n=19).

Figure 9. Coded Responses Indicting Educational Interest Factors

The coded data was also analyzed on an individual basis, thus examining particularized educational interest accounts. Data on a complete basis describes the overall sentiments influential of educational interest, however data on a case-by-case basis shows the variance in educational interest expression frequency and contributed responses. 35.3% of participants referenced four different expressions for educational interest (n=16), 47.1%
referenced three expressions (n=12), and 17.6% referenced the two same expressions throughout the survey (n=6). Participants tend to refer to the same expression repeatedly throughout the survey, suggesting some participants have a distinctive view of educational interest and choose educational resources because they reflect those views. The expressions with the highest frequency per participants were “Evidence” and “Form.” “Evidence” was alluded to by one participant on nine occasions during the survey and seven occasions by an additional participant; “Form” was referenced seven times by one participant. “Analysis” was referenced by one participant a frequency of six occasions and other expressions were referenced on five occasions, again on an individual basis: “Visual Resources,” “Evokes Interest,” and “Personal Motivations.” Between all participants, there was a mean of 4.2 frequency of the same expression.

The frequency of expressions fluctuated between participants, as did the amount of responses that contributed to the data. Each participant was asked three questions per set of articles (eliminating the two questions “Which article do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?” and “Aside from the content, did you like the presentation of the articles (i.e. readability, format, style, etc.)?”) This allowed for at least 12 free-response possibilities. As mentioned previously, a small number of questions were eliminated due to the lack of response and participants could provide more than one expression per question. The maximum number of responses per individual was 20 coded responses (ID 020 and ID 051), while the minimum was 8 expressions (ID 037).

Image Responses

Unprovoked image responses. Though there can be no correlation drawn between images and educational interest from the results, the open-ended responses show information from the perspectives of several participants. In total, there were 53 instances of unprovoked image statements out of the possible 544 open-ended free-response opportunities, equaling 10% of the open-ended responses. Women mentioned images in their free-response more than men: 71.46% of the women (n=15) mentioned images compared to 61.5% of the men (n=8). Of all the participants, only 32.4% did not mention images in their survey (n=11), while 67.6% of participants individually mentioned images from one-eight times (n=23).
Figure 10 illustrates a portion of the unprovoked images statements, 21 of the 53 recorded. All learning styles expressed interest in the images. The greatest amount of image statements, with a frequency of 30 statements, came from participants that self-identify as visual learners (n=17). Yet, when comparing ratios, visual learners did not have the greatest frequency of image statements per respondent. 58% of the visual learners commented on images (n=10) while 86% of the seven logical learners mentioned images unprovoked (n=6). Comparatively, the learning styles with the second largest ratio were aural and verbal; three of the four aural learners (75%) and two of the three verbal learners (67%) mentioned images. The smallest ratio of image statements to individuals (behind visual learners) is physical learners. One participant of three physical learners mentioned images, yet this participant commented on images eight times throughout the survey (more detail can be seen in Figure 10).

Image recall. At the conclusion of the recall survey, participants were asked “Do you remember if any of the articles contained images?” 55.9% of participants (n=19) answered they did while 44.1% of participants answered they did not remember images (n=15). Those that did remember articles were ushered into an additional segment of the survey completing a portion of the quiz that asks which articles had images and what they looked like. With 19 responses, 55.6% of responses by participants were correct in their memory of articles with images and those without. 44.4% of the responses were incorrect and misremembered. Interestingly, two of the articles that were void of visual resources, *Homelessness in the Colonies* and *Fathers in Popular Picture Books*, received 5 responses total (2 responses *Homelessness in the Colonies* and 3 responses *Fathers in Popular Picture Books*) described invented images that did not exist in the publications.
Having a picture to reference to was crucial to understanding the words describing the painting...

I really liked how the painting was on the second page so the reader can imagine the image while reading the first, then it all ties together on the second page.

The ones with images and data that I could look up at home were the easiest to remember.

I liked the presentation of pictures...

I liked the incorporation of pictures...

For most of the format I did not pay attention to the font if anything the things that stood out was the pictures.

I liked how they [images] were included. I am a visual person so it helped me learn more.

This article [John Sloan: Clown Making Up] was memorable, because of the image it instilled in my head.

Aside from the content, I loved the pictures... The pictures were my favorite about the style because I am a visual person.

I liked the presentation of the articles by using images because these images helped me understand more about content.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

The article of "Fathers on the Small Screen" is least interesting because compared with another article, I think this article doesn't explain much clear of the influence of popular culture on fatherhood even though it provides an image to support its content.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

The article of "Fathers on the Small Screen" is least interesting because compared with another article, I think this article doesn't explain much clear of the influence of popular culture on fatherhood even though it provides an image to support its content.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.

Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand.
Chapter 5. Discussion

Introduction to Discussion

This chapter will address the results of the experimental survey and provide interpretation of this research undertaking in context of past research. The research questions are tackled in the subsequent discussion; mirroring the preceding chapter wherein the results of the study were exhibited. Furthermore, limitations of the research and recommendations for further research are considered.

The principle purpose of this exploratory study is to discover what impact images in scholarly articles have on undergraduate underclassmen. As the results show, there is little support to prove undergraduate underclassmen as a whole are strongly impacted by images in scholarly publications. In fact, the images were often overlooked by participants. However, when participants do identify images in the articles, the student responses are often rich and perceptive. This shows how the images influence their opinions of the articles and answers one of the study’s sub-questions: if unprovoked, will students notice and comment on the addition of images in a scholarly article? Strong support was found to suggest participants do remark on images unprovoked. Conversely, the other study sub-questions related to the linkage of images and educational interest did not receive support in the study. Data retrieved from the forced article selection portion of the survey did not provide valid evidence correlating article selection and image inclusion.

It should be noted the participants’ open-ended responses gave valuable insights into perceived article selection criteria and motivations; an unforeseen reward on behalf of a vague questionnaire design (further discussed in the imminent limitations section). The initial decision to use a mixed-method design was to obtain complimentary results that could be analyzed both quantitatively and qualitatively. This mix-method design did not lead to similar results, but instead displayed different constructions of educational interest and image reactions. The nebulosity of the design, along with other design features in the study, resulted in unbiased participant responses. This feature added to the reliability of the study, though at an expense of missing correlations discussed above.
Although the purpose of the study was to explore how undergraduate underclassmen are impacted by images in scholarly publications, a true and fair interpretation of the data was the main focus. Directing participants' attentions to images would have muddled the results and created a false interaction with scholarly articles. It can be confidently stated the participants were in no way aware of the true purpose of the study and any responses about images were of their free will. Therefore even though not all of the study sub-questions were proven because this method was used, the results related to the unprovoked responses to the images are reliable.

Analyzing Participant Demographics and Activity Procedures

Findings related to the participant demographics and practical procedural data reveals a number of important information about the study's population. The average time per participant to complete the first segment of the study was one hour and twelve minutes (1:12), yet an alarming amount of participants read eight articles and answered approximately 24 questions in less than 40 minutes (n=10). One participant took 14 minutes to complete the survey: an implausible amount of time to provide astute responses. In the choice to distribute participants an online survey, rather than an in-person experiment, it is acknowledged there were aspects of the research that could not be controlled. It can be confidently stated all participants provided functional responses and pertinent data regardless of the time devoted to the survey, yet in a different setting which allowed for more control a greater quality of responses could have been obtained.

While time impacts the perspicacious replies of the participants, the independent variable of gender plays a minor role in the survey results; there was a greater amount of women participants than male participants. Also, more women commented on images than men. Based on these results and without further research, there cannot be a claim of correlation between gender and image impact, but in future studies this may be an avenue of research. Regardless of gender, the targeted population for underclassmen at a university was fulfilled with the age ranges (1994 the medium year of birth) typical of 18-19 year-olds in their first year of college directly out of high school. Returning to Manuel's research on Generation Y (emphasized in this study's introduction), those born after 1981 are very influenced by visual resources and retain more visual information than through audio
projection or written words. However, the participants in this study are from a different generation than the Generation Y of past research; every participant is from “Generation Z” (those born in, or after, the 1990s). People from this generation have had lifelong interactions with media technology because their birth intersects with the birth of the World Wide Web (Rosenfeld, 235). Considering the various media technologies people from Generation Z fuse into their everyday lives (cell phones, video games, internet search engines, iPods, etc.) it is not surprising over half of this study’s participants deem themselves “visual learners” and a majority find retrieving information for university courses as “moderately easy.” In light of Manuel’s conclusion that Generation Y learners are affected by visuals in education, it is probably safe to say the more technology prone Generation Z benefits even more from visual resources in education.

**Article Selection and the Image Disconnection**

Educational interest was a construct created to measure a university student’s attraction to educational materials for academic purposes. The measured variables that make up educational interest are interest in information, prospective reference, reference choice, and information recall. As stated in the *Results* chapter, articles containing images were chosen more frequently when measuring educational interest, even when separating art articles and measuring data from only business, history, and sociology. However, this rarely is attributed to, or a result of, the comparison of articles with and without images; generally it appears to be plain luck rather than fact. The questionnaire design included the forced selection of two articles and required participants to address why this article was selected for the corresponding variable. While images are one of the causes for selection, it is on a very small scale compared to the other robust educational factors shared by participants. This is coded into *expressions*.

Although journalism and communication scholars (Gibson & Zillmann, 2000, Zillmann, Knobloch & Yu, 2001, Knobloch et al., 2003, Sargent, 2007, Lindsay, Hagen, Wade, Garry, 2004, and Sacchi et al., 2007) report participants had an increase in reading time and information acquisition in news articles that contain images (innocuous and agonistic) to those without, they do not take into account alternative motivations for reading time independent of the images. The integration of free-response explanatory responses
confirms the participants true motivations in article selection. Therefore, it cannot be assumed the images were the main influence for selection. While this is contradictory to previous research, the highlighted clarity from participants resulting in negative findings is capable of providing evidence rather than assumptions. Educational interest proved to be a more intricate construct than previously hypothesized and linking article selection to images is not possible because of the participants' explanations.

Forcing selection between two articles did not confirm images to be a main factor in selection, but will allowing participants to select one article out of the eight read stipulate refuting results? "Personal favorite article" and "educationally interesting article" arose to be a revealing aspect of the survey: participants chose substantially more articles with images as the personal favorite while articles without images were designated as educationally interesting. A closer examination reveals not a single mention of images from all 34 participants connects the favorite or educationally interesting article selection. Although the participants' favorite article for personal use and educational use may be interesting in themselves, there is again no correlation between images and article selection.

Article and content recall were placed in the recall survey to measure the influence images have on the ability to recall information, as reflected in the variable information recall. In the art articles, the recall aptitude did suggest articles are recalled because of the image when the image is an integral aspect of the content, but not on a large scale. On the contrary, content recall does not appear to be connected to image inclusion: the responses were in no way reflective of images in the article.

**Lack of relationship between variables and images.** Image inclusion did not have a significant impact on educational interest for these participants. Each article that included images incorporated an image that was referenced in the content, but did not add additional information. As stated, the picture's presence in the article was generally innocuous. Clearly, the art articles revolved around the image: it is necessary for articles on art history to include an image. Therefore, it was unsurprising that the art related articles received the greatest amount of individual image references because of the incorporation and importance of the image to the text. The image that lacked human subject (an image of a scenic...
painting) was placed in the business article *The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue.* Interestingly, this image and article combination was the only piece to not receive any notice. The most likely explanation for this is the lack of human figures, with emotions, to relate to.

**Educational Interests Decoded**

Again, the unexpected and satisfying aspect of this research is the discovery of 13 article selection criteria, decoded from intricate statements explaining educational interest and the true purpose for selecting articles as references, saving for a future endeavor, and producing a desire to learn. From an ensemble viewpoint, participants' views of these articles were genuine reflections and considerations for the purpose of the task, use for an English 101 course assignment. The analysis provided, evidence supplied, and content matter were the principal reasons for selecting the articles. The claim of the article and the interior substance were also of high importance for the undergraduate students. It should be noted that another influence were the student’s personal motivations; a moderate amount of participants selected articles because they could personally relate to the topic in some way.

Exposing the variety of reasons an underclassmen selects one scholarly article over another provides an exclusive, and somewhat intimate, perspective into these students' academic inspirations. These participants' educational interests were incomparable to one another: the choice was an individual one. This individuality in responses and quantity of educational interest objectives is one of the more unexpected aspects of this research and an insight.

When initially starting the research, it was presumed students would select articles because they were interested, an unspecified belief and one that required more investigation. What interested these students who are new to the college atmosphere and exploring their education? Did images add interest and, if so, in what way? The immense response to these questions in the form of qualitative data proved that there was a magnitude of influences interesting students beyond that of images. These interests were sometimes personal, based on past experiences and personal perceptions of the topic and also logical, based on what resource contains the most useful factual data to repurpose in their research. Some participants preferred resources that relate to modern times, while others wanted their resources to be of a topic that teaches them a new idea, different perspective. Truly, the possibilities are endless.
Additionally, many participants had a variety of motivations when choosing an article. On average, each participant explained four factors that influenced educational interest. This indicates these students are flexible in their perceptions of materials and view educational resources on a singular basis for the distinct assets offered in each resource; they are critical thinkers who adapt to the specific fields of research and consider the academic requirements in each field. For example, on a field such as sociology that examines personal interactions and societal origins more participants were personally affected, thus an influence to article selection. Yet, in the field of business, an article aimed at evaluating corporations' relations and successes, evidence was the most important feature in a research resource. Comparing the 12 expressions present in this research, beyond image inclusion (termed "visual resources"), it is clear educational interest is caused by an assortment of scholastic influences. Further analysis of the construct educational interest may be required.

**Accounts of Image Statements and the Implications**

Approximately three-fourths of participants cited images at one point in the survey. Taking into account these responses are unprovoked, it suggests images are important to scholarly articles for these undergraduate underclassmen. Much of the data retrieved as image statements was provided by the presentation question, added after the pilot test. This presentation question, which assisted students to view scholarly communication from alternative angles, and the consequential image statements, exposed substantial understandings into the potential benefits of images. This is best demonstrated through individual narrative analyses.

**Narrative analysis of individual reactions.** Analyzing image statements and image awareness on a case-by-case basis allows deeper understanding of how images impact the participant's thought process. Take participant ID 028, a female Communications major who sees herself as a visual learner. She starts the survey like all participants, on the set of articles from art, to business, history, and ending on sociology. She comments repeatedly throughout the survey revealing through brief moments her interactions with images in educational materials, "...I also liked the fact that there were pictures because I am a very visual learner," and "I really enjoyed reading these articles because they interested me and I liked the pictures." Sharing her final thoughts on the survey reiterates the importance of
images, "Putting images into articles make the article way more interesting and easier to understand." Another visual student, a female Family Studies and Human Development major (ID 049), experienced an evolving view of images as the survey progressed. When asked about the presentation of the business articles, she communicates, "[I] liked that the second article actually had a picture, but thats [sic] it..." By the time she arrives at the next article set, history, she is becoming more comfortable with images and acknowledges the power they have in an article. She finds *Homeslessness in the Colonies* particularly boring "Because [I] really am unfamiliar with the topic and the 'colonies' in general, [I] had to paint my own image and try to connect what they were saying with what it might have looked like." The other article *Homeslessness in the Depression Years and New Deal* contained an historical photograph illustrating this time in history. As she arrives to sociology, she begins to think like a true visual learner. *Fathers in Popular Picture Books* did not contain an image, something she would like to modify, "The presentation was ok, [I] would have liked to see some pictures of the covers of some of the books."

A male visual learner, ID 069 in the East Asian Studies program, comments repeatedly about the explanatory ability of images in the articles. The presentations of all articles, except sociology, was enhanced because of an image: art, "...these images helped me understand more about content;" business, "I liked the presentation of the articles from "The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue" because it provides an image which I could understand and know what the company looks like;" and finally history, "For example, the article of "Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal" has an image with it which illustrate [sic] the difference between the Whites and Blacks." While images act as evidence, he acknowledges this evidence does not offset a lack of analysis, "The article of "Fathers on the Small Screen" is least interesting because compared with another article, I think this article doesn't explain much clear of the influence of popular culture on fatherhood even though it provides an image to support its content."

Even verbal learners view pictures as a welcome addition to scholarly articles. ID 042, a female Sociology major, sees images as a way to emphasize the point of the article, adding, "I like to see pictures while I read, it helps me understand what the article is about." Participants from all learning styles commented on images through-out the survey,
suggesting a majority of students benefit from the addition of images, regardless of learning style. There is no pattern to indicate how participants will view images in scholarly publications; all learning styles detected the images and participants strongly drawn to images did not derive solely from the visual learner pool. Logical, aural, verbal, and physical learners commented on the images and predicting which learning style is more influenced is not possible. One physical learner created eight image comments while her fellow physical learners did not comment once. Virtually all of the logical learners mentioned images at least once. This data confirms the anticipation of students' relationships with images is not possible; there is always a possibility images will help articulate the contents and connect information with description. Hence, images can be an enhancement in incalculable ways.

**Image recall and the illusory image.** The follow-up segment of the survey was conducted a week after the completion of the main survey. The follow-up was dedicated to image recall. Less than half of the participants claimed they did not remember images in the articles. Contrary to the data, many of these same participants continued to reference images in the same survey either in the final comments segment or in the article recall. After consideration, it is plausible that some of these participants opted to select the option “NO” because of ease when presented with the question “Can you remember if any of the articles had images?” Why would they choose “NO” when they did remember images? The simple answer is in the design of the question: when the participants select “YES” numerous additional survey questions appeared on the page relating to these images, as compared to the “NO” option which at that point allowed participants to complete the survey. For example, one participant stated they did not remember images in the articles, then added in the final comment section provided, “Some of the articles that were the most interesting were the ones that provided pictures.” This may be a flaw in the survey design, and unfortunately it is unclear if the data gathered concerning the amount of participants that remember images is correct.

The most peculiar and bewildering fragments of data to emerge from this study is that of the illusory image. Participants that claimed to remember images in the articles were asked to recall article titles and the accompanying image in that article (if applicable). Five
participants remembered images from articles that actually did not have images. This phenomenon impacts two articles: sociology’s *Fathers in Popular Picture Books* and history’s *Homelessness in the Colonies.* Three participants remembered an image from *Fathers in Popular Picture Books,* all different and all imagery provided in the article’s text. Two participants recalled images that portray a family, “It had pictures of families from a different point in history,” and “It was a picture of what the character [sic] were doing,” while another recalled a picture book described in the text when asked if an image was provided with the article, “I think the book Goodnight [M]oon.” The article *Homelessness in the Colonies* was remembered to possess an image by two participants, both remembering different aspects of the textual story, “A picture of slaves running away and it was in black and white,” while the other participant remembered an image simply displaying “houses.”

Similar to Gibson and Zillmann’s study of pictorial information on readers’ memories (they discovered the images in the articles have a great influence on the perception of the issue) this research shows the textual content in the article has a great influence on the perceptions of the images remembered. Is the invention of images in articles a consequence of the participant’s subconscious desire for an image? Possibly. No conclusions can be drawn from these interesting results, but it might warrant additional research in the future.

**Limitations of the Study**

The biggest limitation of this study is the rather ambitious attempt to study a new research topic using an experimental survey method. The originality of the study presents a variety of problems resulting from uncertainty and a shortage of useful data specific to images in scholarly publications. At the start of the research, it was recognized that undergraduate underclassmen select materials for research based on a variation of reasons with the largest concern focused on the personal motivations interfering with article selection. As evident in the examination of the factors that influence educational interest, it is apparent there are many different reasons for selecting an article for use in class from the perceived academic viability of the article to the articles ability to evoke interest. In the research design there was an emphasis on disqualifying responses that reflected personal motivations by asking the participants to select the article that was their personal favorite, but the magnitude of other educational motivations for selecting an article took the study in a
different direction. These responses do not fall on deaf ears; it is as valuable and as important to evaluate and learn from the detailed descriptions the participants shared in this research about educational interest. While this is a limitation to the original purpose of the study, the unexpected arrival of additional incentives for selecting an article can be interpreted and used.

Though initially statistical analysis was planned, the various, individual reasons for article selection prohibited such an approach. The lack of quantitative statistical analysis has resulted in uncertainty of the reliability and validity of some of the data. The use of a mixed-method approach was initially designed to complement and reinforce the true motivations behind article selection. Simply collecting empirical data on article selection will not illuminate the interpretations of the participants. Qualitative responses simultaneously provide the corroboration necessary to validate if images influence participants decisions, even on the smalls scale suggested in this research. The nature of qualitative data analysis is subjective because the researcher is responsible for dissembling data and decoding themes, which in this case was done independent of qualitative computer software. Therefore, the study did not have the advantage of multiple assessments and viewpoints on the data that a research team provides. Taking this into account, it is a limitation that multiple investigators and computer software did not validate the coded expressions, but the unfolded qualitative data still generates an understanding into participants' perceptions of articles and images.

Articles for the study were segmented from the original content and created as individual entities representative of scholarly articles. Designed using existing articles as templates, these articles had the same layout and design. The addition of questions addressing academic uses of images and perceived appearance of articles could, and should, have been incorporated into the study. First, according to research on the applications of images in learning atmospheres (Kanuka & Szabo, 1999, Fawley, 2012, Cuddihy & Spyridakis, 2012) many instructors incorporate images into classroom lectures and as examples to demonstrate an argument. If the students had been asked, "Which article would you rather give a presentation on in class?" the results would display if students view images in scholarly communication an effective way of presenting knowledge. Second, this research does not reveal if articles that are presented as more aesthetically pleasing (meaning
colorful headings, decorative layout, images, and graphic design elements) are regarded as more accessible and/or interesting to students. In a future study it might be a better approach to present articles that appear more “visual” are indeed more alluring for analysis.

The research design caused some limitations to the final results. To indeed measure the impact of images in scholarly articles it would be necessary to prove this was the only explanation for the articles selected. It was discovered in the pre-test many of the articles were not seen as “similar” by participants’ judgments. To resolve this issue, it was considered using the same article for each article set but including an image in one instance while eliminating it in the other. In other words, the article Fathers on the Small Screen would be used twice, one version without an image one with an image. Yet, this would have provided information to participants about the true purpose of the study. It was assumed many participants would accelerate their survey completion if, and when, they realized both articles were indeed the same content except for the presence or non-presence of the image. The decision to use different topics from the same author, and the use of the same larger article, seemed a compromise for this first study. In retrospect, it would have been appropriate to interview participants and ask directly their perceptions of scholarly articles and the inclusion of images. These reflections of past and future use of scholarly articles and attitudes to images in academia could become a springboard for a study similar to the one conducted in this research.

Using a survey method rather than face-to-face interviews presented advantages and disadvantages. One of the obvious advantages of an online survey was the swift data collection as a result of reports generated from the survey platform, sacrificed by lack of control from an investigator viewpoint. It is believed many participants saw the survey and supplementary follow-up survey as tedious; this is apparent by the drop-out rate and participant completion rate or almost 50%: 34 participants completed the survey of the initial 52 participant pool. As a result, a limitation of the survey method is the ability of participants to hastily finish the survey to receive the incentive desired, feasibly tarnishing the outcome and weakening the reliability. As mentioned in the above section, this was seen in the image recall segment of the survey when participants claimed to not remember images yet proceeded to comment about the images on the next opportunity. An interview or
controlled experiment may have been a better approach to the study, but in the time and resources allotted this did not seem achievable or reasonable.
Chapter 6. Conclusion

This original study asked if images in scholarly publications impact undergraduate underclassmen. This study’s goal was to enlarge the information science field’s understanding of images in scholarly publications. The result of this current research discovered that all undergraduate underclassmen do not view scholarly articles from a uniform standpoint. They are influenced by their personal experiences, their perceptions of a scholarly reference choice in the eyes of a professor, the potential for analysis, the descriptive writing styles, and, on occasion, the inclusion of images. Images do have an impact on students, but in a smaller scope than initially anticipated. However, unprovoked mentions of images emerge between all self-identified learning styles; from aural learners to logical learners, they commonly grasp the value in images and explain how it helps them understand the topic of the article. While there was no correlation discovering images in scholarly articles result in educational interest among this population at the University of Arizona, the open-ended statements shared by participants do imply some were impacted by images independent from their educational interest in the article’s text. The significance of these findings will be addressed in two contexts. First, the practical implications of images in scholarly articles will be presented. Second, the findings will be discussed in terms of the conceptual possibilities of supplementing more scholarly articles with images.

Again, for the purpose of this study, images included in the scholarly articles were innocuous. These images also did not add any information to the text and acted as representative “decoration.” From a practical perspective, these images were passive and restrained from the text. In a true scholarly publishing atmosphere, the images included would most likely act as evidence and essential to the development of the argument because of the high costs associated with images in publications (as referenced in Chapter 3). It is reasonable to assume the inclusion of images that revolve around the text, as in the art articles John Sloan: Hairdresser’s Window and John Sloan: Clown Making Up, the educational impact of these images would be profound. If taken into consideration the recall and comprehension possible with the marriage of passive images and scholarly publishing displayed in this study, applying the findings in publishing today could have an impact on the attitudes of the journal’s audience.
Students' learning styles affect the way they interact with educational materials and how information is absorbed. All learning styles are in one way or another impacted by the inclusion of images in scholarly articles. Whether it is because the presentation is more accessible, the topic appears easier to understand, or the images help recall the article, images matter. Therefore, images have the ability to enrich educational materials for peoples of different learning styles in an unpredictable way.

An increased awareness among the scholarly community that images are viable educational resources would be the ideal outcome of this research. While the ambivalent attitude towards images has previously been studied (Bishop & Neumann, 2000), given that the majority of digital journal readers are students and media users from Generation Y and Generations Z, studies such as this one may inspire a real change in the scholastic world. This research may not provide profuse evidence that images are a preferred feature of scholarly articles, but it does provide a research objective that is in need of advocacy. Despite the fact that the cost to include images in publications are often high, a move toward including images in scholarly publications in order to enhance reader understanding should take precedent over financial concerns. Clearly, additional research is needed on the matter of scholarly communication and images.

The assessment based on the data is only suggestive of the represented population and primarily serves as a potential resource for further study. Multifarious suggestions and recommendations for future research were considered after the completion and evaluation of this current study. Many of these retrospective reflections have been referenced throughout the Discussion and Conclusion chapters. Listed here, in order of importance and achievability, are possible suggestions for further research resulting from this work:

- An archival study, similar to the sample done for this research in the literature review, can be initiated as a comprehensive introduction to the amount of images published in scholarly journals from a variety of disciplines. At the start of this research it was assumed an extensive literature search would retrieve investigations of this particular scope, but not one was acquired.
- Conducting exploratory interviews with university students with a focus on their attitudes toward images in scholarly publications. Using exclusively qualitative
methods would construct an idiographic view of their educational worlds. To spark an instantaneous reaction to images in journal articles, it would be possible to provide one example of a scholarly article with images and one without (preferably the same article manipulated by images).

- Replicating the experiments by Gibson & Zillmann (2000), Zillmann, Knobloch & Yu (2001), Knobloch et al. (2003), or Sargent (2007) would permit the measure of reading time and information acquisition in scholarly articles, rather than news articles. This would validate the cost of including images in scholarly articles and extend the research of the effect of images beyond communication and journalism subject areas.

- The execution of an experimental survey similar to the current experiment could be conducted, however with an emphasis on the aesthetics of the articles (color combinations, images, fonts, and layouts). This study could discover the impact aesthetic appearance has on article selection.

- As mentioned, a surprising discovery of this study was the concept of the illusory image. Future studies can investigate how information is created into visual images. The phenomenon of this unexpected result displays the possibility that people create their own images and mistake them for existing images. Similar to Sargent’s study on memory and doctored images, visual memory may affect a person’s ability to distinguish a tangible image from an imaginary image.

It would be interesting to take the approaches suggested and continue the dialogue regarding scholarly communication and visual resources. For many, visuals provide information that cannot be rendered through text: a tangible and relatable object. The importance of adapting to the needs of scholars from new and different generations preserves the usefulness and justifies the high costs of article subscriptions. While images may be a pricey inclusion in an article, future studies may show their necessity for true education, comprehension, and retention.
Appendices

Appendix A: Institutional Review Board Approval

University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa IRB Approval (May 23, 2012)

May 23, 2012

TO: Sarah Vornholt
Principal Investigator
Library and Information Science

FROM: Ching Yuan Hu, Ph.D.
Interim Director
Human Studies Program
Office of Research Compliance
University of Hawai‘i, Mānoa

Re: CHS #20247 - "Visual Interactions with Art in Academic Database: Discovering University Students' Inspiration and Exploration"

This letter is your record of the Human Studies Program approval of this study as exempt.

On May 23, 2012, the University of Hawai‘i (UH) Human Studies Program approved this study as exempt from federal regulations pertaining to the protection of human research participants. The authority for the exemption applicable to your study is documented in the Code of Federal Regulations at 45 CRF 46 (2).

Exempt studies are subject to the ethical principles articulated in The Belmont Report, found at http://www.hawaii.edu/uhirb/html/manual/appendices/A/belmont.html

Exempt studies do not require regular continuing review by the Human Studies Program. However, if you propose to modify your study, you must receive approval from the Human Studies Program prior to implementing any changes. You can submit your proposed changes via email at uhirb@hawaii.edu. (The subject line should read: Exempt Study Modification.) The Human Studies Program may review the exempt status at that time and request an application for approval as non-exempt research.

In order to protect the confidentiality of research participants, we encourage you to destroy private information which can be linked to the identities of individuals as soon as it is reasonable to do so. Signed consent forms, as applicable to your study, should be maintained for at least the duration of your project.

This approval does not expire. However, please notify the Human Studies Program when your study is complete. Upon notification, we will close our files pertaining to your study.

If you have any questions relating to the protection of human research participants, please contact the Human Studies Program at 956-5007 or uhirb@hawaii.edu. We wish you success in carrying out your research project.
**University of Arizona IRB Approval (August 30, 2012)**

**PROJECT TITLE:** Are Pictures Worth 1000 words? A Study Examining the Impact of Visual Resources in Journal Articles on Undergraduates' Educational Interest.

**INVESTIGATOR**

- **Principal Investigator Name, Degree(s):** Sarah Vornholt, BA, MLISc (in process)
- **Institution/Organization:** University of Hawai'i at Manoa
- **Contact phone:** 480-298-8893
- **Email:** sarahv@hawaii.edu
- **Mailing address:** 7602 E. Lee Street, Tucson, AZ 85715

**IRB that granted approval of this project**

- **Name:** University of Hawai'i at Manoa
- **FWA Number:** CHS #20247
- **Contact phone:** 808-956-5007
- **Email:** uhirb@hawaii.edu
- **Mailing address:** 1960 East-West Road, Biomedical Science Building B104, Honolulu, HI 96822

**IRB approval information for this project**

- **Approval date:** 5/23/2012
- **Review level:** CHS \[Category Exempt\]
- **Expiration date:** N/A
- **When research will take place:** Begin: 9/1/2012, End: 11/30/2012

**Notes:**

- Only electronic submissions will be accepted (see electronic submission at the end of this form)
- Attach a copy of the IRB approval correspondence regarding this human research
I am conducting an original experiment for my graduate thesis in Library and Information Science from the University of Hawai’i at Manoa. The repeated design measure study will measure students' educational interests in scholarly articles accompanied by visual resources. The study will be conducted in a computer lab and in survey form. The participants will be first-year (Freshman) students from the University of Arizona and will be recruited via email and flyers around campus. There will be minor compensation and only 1 1/2 hours of their time required.

What UA Human Subjects and/or Records you wish to access: Email addresses for first year undergraduate students to act as participants.

How Many: 30 students (minimum) will be required for the study.

Based on the information provided by the Principal Investigator, I recommend authorizing access to the University of Arizona as a research site.

Email approval dated 08/30/2012

Signature
heidorn@email.arizona.edu

Date
(520) 621-3565

Print Name
Bryan Heidorn, PhD

Based on the information provided by the Principal Investigator (and recommendation of the Department if appropriate), I hereby grant University of Arizona site authorization for this research.

No expiration date

Period of Approval

Signature

Print Name

Title

Date

Signature of PI: ___________________________ Date: 7/23/2012
Appendix B: Experiment Consent Forms

Pre-Test & Pilot Experiment Consent Form (University of Hawai‘i)

University of Hawai‘i

Consent to Participate in Research Project

Are pictures worth 1000 words?
The impact of visual resources in scholarly journals, seen from the viewpoint of undergraduate students’ educational interests

My name is Sarah Vornholt. I am a graduate student at the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa (UH) in the Department of Library and Information Sciences and a visiting scholar at the University of Arizona in Tucson in the School of Information Resources and Library Science (SIRLS). As part of the requirements for earning my graduate degree, I am doing a research project. The purpose of my project is to examine how students select research articles. I am asking you to participate in this study to help evaluate the contents in journal articles that will be used in my official experiment.

Activities and Time Commitment
If you participate in this project, you will complete a survey and answer multiple questions about a variety of articles. You will not be required to meet in person but you may be required to participate in a follow up conversation via telephone. Your responses will be recorded through survey computer software.

Benefits and Risks
There will be no direct benefit to you for participating in this interview. I hope, however, that the results of this project will teach librarians and publishers how students’ view research articles. I believe there is little risk to you in participating in this research project. If however, you become stressed or uncomfortable during the survey you can take a break or withdraw from the project altogether.

Privacy and Confidentiality
During this research project, I will keep all data in a secure location on the computer. Only my University of Hawai‘i advisor and I will have access to the data, although legally authorized agencies, including the UH Human Studies Program, the University of Arizona Institutional Review Board, or the Office of Responsible Research Practices, can review research records. From the moment the study begins your name will not be associated with any of the information
you share with me and the survey will be anonymous. After participating in the study your email and phone number will be deleted and your survey will in no way be connected with your name.

Voluntary Participation

Your participation in this project is completely voluntary. You may stop participating at any time without any penalty or loss. Your participation or non-participation will not impact your rights to future involvement with the University of Hawai‘i or the University of Arizona.

As compensation for time spent participating in the research project, I will provide you with a $5 electronic gift certificate to either Starbucks Gourmet Coffee or Amazon.com.

If you have any questions about this research project, please call me at (480) 298-8893 or email me at sarahiv@Hawai‘i.edu. If you have any questions regarding your rights as a research participant, please contact the UH Human Studies Program, by phone at (808) 956-5007, or uhirb@Hawai‘i.edu. You may also contact the University of Arizona Human Subjects Protection Program at 520-626-6721 or online at http://orcr.vpr.arizona.edu/irb.

I am not giving up any legal rights by signing this form. I will be given a copy of this consent form for your records via email.

If you agree to participate in this project, please select “Accept” option to proceed with the survey. If you choose not to participate please select the “Do not accept” option to opt out.
Journal article euphoria: A study into how undergraduate students select journal articles

My name is Sarah Vornholt. I am a graduate student at the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa (UH) in the Department of Library and Information Sciences and a visiting scholar at the University of Arizona's School of Information Resources and Library Science (SIRLS). As part of the requirements for earning my graduate degree, I am doing a research project. The purpose of my project is to examine how students select research articles.

Activities and Time Commitment
If you participate in this project, you will complete two surveys and answer multiple questions about a variety of articles. You will not be required to meet in person and they survey will be conducted online. Your responses will be recorded through survey computer software.

Benefits and Risks
There will be no direct benefit to you for participating in this survey. I hope, however, that the results of this project will teach librarians and publishers how students' view research articles. I believe there is little risk to you in participating in this research project. If however, you become stressed or uncomfortable during the survey you can take a break or withdraw from the project altogether.

Privacy and Confidentiality
During this research project, I will keep all data in a secure location on the computer. Only my University of Hawai'i advisor and I will have access to the data, although legally authorized agencies, including the UH Human Studies Program, the University of Arizona Institutional Review Board, or the Office of Responsible Research Practices, can review research records. From the moment the study begins your name will not be associated with any of the information you share with me and the survey will be confidential. After participating in the study your email will be deleted and your survey will in no way be connected with your name.

Voluntary Participation
Your participation in this project is completely voluntary. You may stop participating at any time without any penalty or loss. Your participation or non-participation will not impact your rights to future involvement with the University of Hawai‘i or the University of Arizona.

As compensation for time spent participating in the research project, I will provide you with a $5 electronic gift certificate to a gourmet coffee shop.

If you have any questions about this research project, please call me at (480) 298-8893 or email me at sarahiv@Hawai‘i.edu. If you have any questions regarding your rights as a research participant, please contact the UH Human Studies Program, by phone at (808) 956-5007, or uhirb@Hawai‘i.edu. You may also contact the University of Arizona Human Subjects Protection Program at 520-626-6721 or online at http://orcr.vpr.arizona.edu/irb.

You are not giving up any legal rights by signing this form. If requested, you will be given a copy of this consent form for your records via email.

If you agree to participate in this project, please select “Accept” option to proceed with the survey. If you choose not to participate please select the “Do not accept” option to opt out.
Appendix C: Pre-Test Articles

John Sloan: Clown Making Up

By Michael Lobel

By 1910, this episode in Sloan's work had largely passed, and things had changed significantly for him. In the years after 1907, he became more caught up in the attention to his work that had been generated by the Macbeth Galleries exhibition. As his interest in politics grew, he became more and more devoted to the cause of socialism, which would result in his vigorous involvement with the journal the Masses. His painterly technique and palette also shifted. His awareness of these changes may be reflected in a 1910 canvas, Clown Making Up. It's a relatively simple and rather somber picture, which presents a costumed clown, seated and alone, applying makeup by candlelight. The picture's subject matter, at first blush, looks far removed from the paintings by Sloan, yet it, too, yields a self-conscious reflection on the artist's practice: it is, of course, a picture of someone applying pigment -- in other words, paint -- to his face. Sloan calls attention to this activity in a number of ways: he placed the clown's head and face just about dead center in the composition and indicated the presence of the pigment-applying tool (not a brush, but likely some sort of sponge) with a bright white squiggle that appears in the figure's hand. There is also that box of makeup that sits on the table before him, which bears a close resemblance to a painter's palette.

This interior is lit not by the gas or electric lights that are evident in so many of the artist's other works, but by two humble candles. There is really no indication of the modern world at all here; instead, we are treated to a practically timeless genre scene. And this is in keeping with the subject, in that the clown could have been, in other hands or even at another point in Sloan's practice, used as a symbol or avatar of modern urban spectacle. Clearly, Sloan could have captured any one of the wide variety of entertainments available to urban audiences at the time, as his old friend and Ashcan colleague William Glackens did in a work like Hammerstein's Roof Garden, or Everett Shinn in his numerous, Impressionist-inspired stage scenes. But, tellingly, Sloan shows us not a performer in front of his audience but a practitioner alone, in a quiet moment of preparation. Clown Making Up indicates a move away from the social into a private, enclosed, interior realm.

In these ways, Clown Making Up embodies changes taking place in Sloan's practice at the time, and perhaps even augurs changes still to come. Although he would never turn away from urban subjects completely, in the 1910s and 1920s we see him devoting himself more to rural landscapes (in Gloucester and elsewhere), which would eventually culminate in his many trips to Santa Fe, New Mexico, where he would celebrate Native American rituals and other subjects tied not to the contemporary present but to the past. Moreover, at this time his general focus on urban subject matter was in some ways beginning to be overshadowed by an exploration of the formal qualities of painting itself. In fact, as Sloan himself noted, Clown Making Up was one of the first paintings he executed using the so-called Maratta method. This method, introduced to him by Henri, was a prearranged tonal system of pigments assembled and marketed by one Hardesty G. Maratta. Sloan's embrace of a prearranged system of color signals an implicit willingness to key his paintings less to direct experience and more to intra-artistic concerns. In short, the clown making up alone, without his audience, is a fitting emblem for an artist who was to some extent uncoupling his work from its primary focus on the social and the public. The isolation of the clown, lacking his audience, also lends the picture a certain degree of melancholy. It is darker, both literally and metaphorically -- somber and brooding. Finally, it is a picture, at base, of self-creation: of a creative individual making himself into the image that he will present to the public. The costumed performer
would have been a figure with some potential for self-identification, considering Sloan's early experiences and inclination toward dressing up for amateur theatricals within his early circle in Philadelphia. On a less literal level, the articulation of a creative persona had already been a concern at the center of Sloan's work, as he explored his artistic identity by finding painterly surrogates in his urban surroundings. *Clown Making Up* is an image of an individual who is creating a new identity through painting; alternatively, one could see him as using paint to mask his identity. Whatever the case, at least for a moment Sloan had again found a motif through which to explore his own sense of himself as a painter and conjure a place for painting in the modern world, however circumscribed or provisional it may have been.

---

1 About the painting, Elzea (*Sloan's Oil Paintings*, 104) opined, “This is a very unusual painting in Sloan’s *oeuvre* in that it is an entirely posed and concocted subject and is of a sentimentality contrary to Sloan's nature.” Although I agree with Elzea’s assessment of the subject’s distinctiveness in Sloan’s body of work, I would challenge his assertion that it “is of a sentimentality contrary to Sloan's nature.” since I think it speaks to Sloan's reflection on developments in his practice. According to Elzea, the model for the figure was one Mr. Wilson, a professional model from whom Sloan had borrowed a costume for a ball and whom he hired to pose for the painting.

2 *Clown Making Up* even presages a later work by another artist, from the second half of the twentieth century, that employs much the same motif; a series of films by Bruce Nauman, in which the artist captures himself covering his face and upper torso with colored makeup. Both artworks incorporate devices of self-regard, with the film camera replacing the mirror in the later work.

3 One could even read this as an indication of profound ambivalence. The clown is a practitioner of spectacular entertainment—he's meant, after all, to be seen by a large assembled audience—yet this aspect of the figure is ultimately negated, since he's depicted here offstage, away from the clamoring crowd.

John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window

By Michael Lobel

In *Hairdresser's Window*, Sloan conjures a vivid urban vignette, one that has inspired a diverse array of scholarly interpretations. It has been related to the growth of a consumer culture oriented to women; analyzed within the theoretically derived category of panoptic vision; invoked as exemplary of a turn-of-the-century culture of urban looking; and even seen, through a psychoanalytic lens, as a way for Sloan to work through his deep-seated and ambivalent feelings about women. Some of these issues no doubt contribute, to a greater or lesser extent, to the painting's density of meanings. Yet the picture is compelling also because it served as a profound meditation on the medium that Sloan was more thoroughly embracing as his own at the time.

According to a record in Sloan's diary, the inspiration for *Hairdresser's Window* came from a scene he encountered during one of his walks in the city. On June 5, 1907, he wrote, "Walked up to Henri's studio. On the way saw a humorous sight of interest. A window, low, second story, bleached blond hair dresser bleaching the hair of a client. A small interested crowd about." To begin, it is significant that Sloan implicates Robert Henri in his account of the origin of the picture, for his entry underscores that the motif occurred to him on his way to visit another painter's studio. The following day, he recorded, "Walked out to take another look at the Hair Restorer's Window. Came back and started to paint it." His emphasis on going back to confirm his initial impression of the motif, along with the general correspondence between the painting and the first diary entry, could reasonably lead one to conclude that the resulting picture is not much more than a documentary record of the "actual" scene he had witnessed - even though Sloan's approach, as Rebecca Zurier reminds us, "was based on images seen and remembered (and sometimes written down) rather than sketched in the street...." *Hairdresser's Window* presents us with the flat facade of a building that is parallel to (one might almost say coincident with) the picture plane. That facade is studded with hand-lettered advertising signs. Through a window above we spy the hairdresser of the title, who with the help of an assistant is treating a client's long, flowing locks. On the sidewalk below, a crowd has assembled to gawk at this sight, which in bringing an otherwise private aspect of a woman's toilette into public view may very well have challenged the bounds of propriety at the time. A host of small, seemingly insignificant details contributes to the vividness and ostensibly reportorial character of the scene: the gloves worn by the hairdresser; the brightly colored flowers on the woman's hat at right; the mannequin heads in a glass display case; and the woman in profile at far left, who passes by without acknowledging the scene that draws our attention as well as that of the rest of the assembled onlookers.

If these accumulated details suggest a realist recording of an observed scene, the organization of the picture shows how much Sloan was attuned to issues of composition, carefully and self-consciously attending to the picture's formal structure. His attunement to formal concerns is evident in the complex ways that the painting plays off surface and depth. One might initially take the building as presenting a totally flat facade, almost like a stage set, with the three figures in the window directly behind it and the sidewalk viewers in front. A second look, though, reveals numerous elements that introduce additional indications of depth, although they are decidedly ambiguous. In the upper left corner is an object that looks to be a sign hanging perpendicular to the building facade, onto which it casts a long, diagonal shadow. There is also an architectural feature, something like a projecting display window or false front, visible at lower right. (It is capped by a sign reading "GOW," which one takes as an advertising sign for a store selling gowns, although the cropping leaves this identification ultimately unclear.) This feature presents us with noticeable spatial ambiguities: Are we supposed to read that standing female figure, left hand on hip, as a mannequin in a store window, or is this, rather, a flat poster or painted bulletin affixed to the building front? The picture's play with spatial ambiguity is particularly evident in the motif of the
three swatches of hair (brown, auburn, and blonde) that hang from a diagonal element to the right of the hairdresser's window. Does that wire or rod project out from the corner of the sign, into space, or is it instead meant to be read as a receding element, connected back to the building facade? Neither reading is particularly convincing: if it's the former, the orientation of the rod doesn't correspond convincingly with the overall perspectival rendering. If it's the latter, the length of each swatch doesn't make sense, since the left one should be farthest away from us and, thus, the shortest; the recession we would expect has been reversed here, as if to totally confound our expectations of how it should work.

1 On Sloan and the gendering of consumer culture, see Laura Weintraub, "Women as Urban Spectators in John Sloan's Early Work." American Art 15, no. 2 (Summer 2001); 72-83; for a (rather unconvincing) argument about the picture and panoptic vision, see Susan Fillin-Yeh, "Images as Imaginary Documents; John Sloan's Sidewalks and Thresholds," in Coyle and Schiller, John Sloan's New York, esp. 122-26; on the culture of urban looking, see Rebecca Zurier, Picturing the City: Urban Vision and the Ashcan School (Berkeley; University of California Press, 2006); and for a psychoanalytic reading of Hairdresser's Window, see Janice M. Coco, John Sloan's Women: A Psychoanalysis of Vision (Newark; University of Delaware Press, 2004), esp. chap. 3, "Looking through the Hairdresser's Window," 57-78.

2 Sloan diary, June 5, 1907. All quotations from Sloan's diaries (which range from 1906 to 1913) come from a transcribed and annotated (but unpublished) version (by Judith O'Toole in consultation with Helen Farr Sloan; further editing by Jeanette Toohey in about 1998) in the Delaware Art Museum, Wilmington, which holds the originals in its John Sloan Manuscript Collection.

3 Zurier (Picturing the City, 249-50) continues; "The effect is conceptual rather than perceptual (which Sloan denigrated as 'eyesight' painting), but usually not as pointed as a one-line cartoon. Rather, Sloan's urban 'memory' pictures create extended moments isolated from amid the flux of the changing city, in keeping with the techniques of the realist fiction and narrative movies he enjoyed in these years."
The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue

By James O'Toole & David Vogel

There is a long history of business leaders who have attempted to act virtuously. The first “conscious capitalist” may have been British textile mill owner Robert Owen. Between 1800 and 1825—the era of Dickens’s “dark satanic mills”—Owen introduced relatively short working hours, a grievance procedure, guaranteed employment during economic downturns, and contributory health, disability, and retirement plans. Owen provided clean, decent housing for his workers in a subsidized community free of controllable disease, crime, and gin shops. He took young children out of the factory and put them in a school he founded and paid for. He invented preschool, day care, and adult night school for his employees and their families. The bottom-line: Owen’s company in New Lanark, Scotland became the world’s most productive and profitable textile mill. Like John Mackey and Gary Hirshberg today, Owen then began a public crusade to try to convince other business leaders to adopt his responsible and successful business model.

However, just when Owen succeeded in winning his worker’s trust, and productivity in the mill started to soar, his co-owners began to question his practices, expressing “disapproval of the mixture of philanthropy and business.” Their complaint wasn’t that the mill was unprofitable—it clearly was—but that it could be made more profitable still if only Owen ceased treating his employee so well and, instead, increased dividends to its investors. Significantly, no other British business firm adopted Owen’s business model. By 1825, the New Lanark mills were shut down, and a dejected Owen emigrated to America. The lesson we draw from this story is not that social responsibly doesn’t pay; it clearly did at New Lanark. It is rather that virtuous capitalism is difficult to sustain.

In this regard, it is instructive to review what happened to the companies on a list of two dozen firms widely recognized for their social commitments and ethical practices published in 1985. Subsequently, six of them were acquired by companies with different philosophies, including environmentalist-oriented Atlantic-Richfield, which was acquired by BP. Two went bankrupt, including Control Data Corporation, which had been the first major American company to publicly commit to seeking profits from “doing good.” Only six of these companies—Dayton-Hudson (now Target), Cummins, Xerox, W.L. Gore, and Herman Miller—still exist, are still financially successful, and still practice something like their original virtuous behaviors. However, (with the notable exception of Gore) some of these companies (Johnson & Johnson and Herman Miller) had their commitments to virtue severely tested over the years, or saw those commitments considerably weakened (Cummins and Xerox) when new CEOs entered their respective executive suites.

Likewise in green consciousness, Toyota’s introduction of the hybrid Prius in 1997 was applauded by environmentalists and became a major commercial success. Toyota quickly gained a reputation as the world’s “greenest” car company. In 2009, however, several of Toyota’s models were discovered to have safety defects—including, ironically, the Prius. Much like the situation at Johnson & Johnson’s tylenol poisoning, a wave of recalls—25 in only 30 weeks in 2010—rapidly undermined Toyota’s long-established reputation for quality control, leading to a reduced market share and a decline in shareholder value.
BP (British Petroleum) suffered a similar fall from virtue. In 1997, it became the first global energy firm publicly to acknowledge the risks of global climate change, and prominently featured its commitment to sustainability by changing its name to BP (Beyond Petroleum). The corporation pledged to reduce its greenhouse gas emissions by 10 percent from 1990 levels by 2010—a goal it achieved nine years ahead of schedule—and substantially increased its investment in solar energy. In 2005, BP was named the Financial Times’ “most respected energy company,” and Business Week ranked it in second place on its list of the “greenest companies of the decade.” Yet, in 2005, an explosion at the company’s refinery in Texas attributed to inadequate maintenance resulted in 15 deaths and, a year later, inadequate maintenance of its pipelines in Alaska led to several oil spills.

Then, in the spring of 2010, a drilling platform owned by BP in the Gulf of Mexico exploded, killing eleven workers and producing the largest oil spill in American history. Clean-up costs, fines, and punitive damages (which will be borne by the firm’s shareholders), currently are estimated at billions of dollars. The company has also sold off its investments in solar energy. Thus, in little more than a decade, BP went from being seen as the world’s most admired and “greenest” energy company to one widely regarded as one of the most environmentally destructive and irresponsible.

The Promise of Doing Well by Doing Good: A Review of Contributors

By James O'Toole & David Vogel

During the recent *decadus horribilis* in which, for various reasons, companies such as AIG, Goldman Sachs, Toyota, and BP dominated headlines in the business press, a few companies associated with the “Conscious Capitalism” movement have distinguished themselves by their commitments to ethical and sustainable business practices.

It is claimed that the business practices associated with Conscious Capitalism promise to address such shortcomings of corporate capitalism as currently practiced. Hence, it is not surprising that Conscious Capitalism has been widely embraced by many business leaders, academics, and MBA students who have become enticed by the prospect of integrating greater social responsibility into mainstream business practices.

While the term Conscious Capitalism is new, its underlying claim that firms can do well, or even better, by doing good is not. Between 1992 and 2003, Howard Rothman and Mary Scott published three editions of *Companies with a Conscience*, each of which featured profiles of a dozen profitable companies that exemplified the values of “caring capitalism.” A steady stream of recently published books have advised managers how to: make “doing good an integral part of doing well,” “deliver value with values,” “build value through values,” and “profit from passion and purpose.” In 2007, *Business Week* published a special report entitled “Beyond the Green Corporation” with the sub-head, “Imagine a world in which eco-friendly and socially responsible practices actually help the company’s bottom line. It’s closer than you think.” The article listed thirty global firms (including Hewlett-Packard, Sony, Marks & Spencer, Novo Nordisk, Nokia, and Dell) each of which was reported to be “doing well by doing good.”

The claim that virtue pays has recently been given even wider currency under the rubric of “sustainability.” Many advocates of corporate “greening” claim that, according to the title of a recent article published in the *Harvard Business Review*, “sustainability is now the key driver of innovation.” This theme is echoed in a steady stream of recently published books with titles such as *The Next Sustainability Wave; The Sustainable Revolution: Portrait of a Paradigm Shift; Green to Gold: How Smart Companies Use Environmental Strategy to Innovate, Create Value, and Build Competitive Advantage; Cool Companies: How the Best Businesses Boost Profits and Productivity by Cutting Greenhouse Gas Emissions; and Strategies for Sustainability: A Business Manifesto.* These books extol the imperative for firms to incorporate sustainability into their core business practices and strategies and to demonstrate the business benefits of doing so.

In a similar vein, an organization established in 2006 called the “B Lab” certifies companies that use “the power of business to solve social and environmental problems.” According to their website, “B Corporations are a new type of company which are purpose-driven and create benefit not only for shareholders, but for employees, the community, and the environment.” Some 364 companies in 54 industries with collective revenues of $1.79 billion dollars have been certified, and the B Lab predicts that “in a generation B Corporations will reach 5-7% of US GDP.”

The Conscious Capitalism movement goes a step further. For example, a recently published book of essays is titled *Be the Solution: How Entrepreneurs and Conscious Capitalists...*
Can Solve All the World’s Problems. It contains an essay by John Mackey, the CEO of highly successful Whole Foods Market, who has become the leading business advocate of Conscious Capitalism. Mackey argues that Conscious Capitalism represents a “new paradigm” for business:

Business needs to become holistic and integral with deeper comprehensive purposes. Corporations must rethink why they exist. If business owners/entrepreneurs begin to view business as a complex and evolving interdependent system and manage their business more consciously for the well-being of all their major stakeholders, while fulfilling their highest business purposes, then I believe that we would begin to see the hostility towards capitalism and business disappear.

According to two other business proponents of Conscious Capitalism, “the profit motive, not government or charity, will create the kind of socially responsible world we want our kids and grandkids to grow up in.” They add that “creating a win-win business model—with the wins being what benefits the company, its stakeholders, and the environment/society in general—is the only way to optimize value.”

Likewise, Gary Hirshberg, CEO of Stonyfield Farms, argues that firms practicing Conscious Capitalism will invariably profit from their actions. His standard lecture to business students, entrepreneurs, and managers is entitled “How to make money and save the world.” Like Mackey, Hirshberg strongly believes that a Conscious Capitalist business model both should and can be widely adopted—precisely because it represents such a sound approach to creating value.


Homelessness in the Colonies

By Roberta Ann Johnson

In the 17th century, many poor White Englishmen voluntarily sold themselves into servitude to companies such as the London Company to transport them to America. Others, including vagrants, criminals, and tens of thousands of political offenders and children, were literally kidnapped from the streets of London and put on ships to the New World (Brawley, 1970, pp. 21-23). Eventually, the Whites who came voluntarily and involuntarily would buy their way out of servitude. Black servants would not have that option.

"The first Negroes who were brought to the colonies were technically servants" (Brawley, 1970, p. 23), and "in the beginning, little social distinction was made in America on account of race" (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994, p. 157). But the colonies drifted into what was called "the sterner system" of slavery (p. 24) and by the mid-17th century large profits from the lucrative Black slave trade helped move slavery from custom to legal arrangements.

During the 17th century, town records show that White communities were far from generous to all those who were in need. In fact, White colonists condemned other colonists whom they considered undeserving to homelessness. Paupers, able-bodied men who would not work, were not assisted. They were driven out of the colony to freeze or starve (Baum & Burnes, 1993, p. 94).

Technically, Black slaves had "shelter," although agricultural slaves, according to John Hope Franklin, were "especially poor." They lived in small and dilapidated, inadequate and uncomfortable huts, with no windows and hardly any furnishings and sometimes without beds (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994). And yet although their living conditions were woefully deficient, Black slaves were considered part of the "community" (by the Whites), and, therefore, they were not considered homeless.

On the other hand, Whites generally considered free Blacks to be homeless and suspect. Their homelessness was "tantamount to a crime: homeless Black people were ‘masterless’ and, with rare exceptions, that meant they were fugitives" (Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 124).

Population records showed that the number of U.S. slaves rose steadily, and personal connection (i.e., ownership) with the slaves was widespread in the South. By 1850, 2.8 million slaves worked on farms and plantations; another 400,000 slaves lived in urban settings (Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 126).

Life was harsh, and the slave system was brutal (Brawley, 1970, p. 32). It is not surprising that many slaves committed suicide, and, in increasing numbers, many slaves ran away. Although textbooks that describe the history of American homelessness do not include them, the large number of runaway slaves should be considered an early example of American homelessness.

Native Americans often provided a safe haven for homeless Blacks who fled to the frontier to escape slavery or oppressive laws (Editors of Ebony, 1971). Runaway Blacks may also have been drawn to Indian communities to intermarry because there was a shortage of Black women in the American colonies.

There was constant Indian and Black intermingling since at least the time the first British colonies were established. In 1839, for example, William Jay, first chief justice of the United
Runaway slaves represent an important chapter in America's homeless history. When slaves ran away, they were “men, women, and children, singly, in pairs, or in groups” who organized to live in the forests, mountains, and swamps of the South (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994, p. 143). Many runaway slaves left the South altogether for freedom in the North. Some were assisted by members of Northern antislavery groups. As early as 1804 in Pennsylvania and 1815 in Ohio, White groups were helping slaves to freedom (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994, pp. 183-184; Still, 1970; Strother, 1962). The term Underground Railroad was not given to the effort until 1831 (Strother, 1962, p. 5).

It is estimated that as many as 100,000 slaves ran away during the early 19th century. Some runaways were shipped through the postal system in “boxes or chests,” and some hid in “steamers and vessels,” forced to hide under boilers and in cramped spaces that allowed for little or no movement (Still, 1970, pp. 38-44, 67-73, 289-292, 313-314, 632-635). As evidence that runaway slaves were considered by their contemporaries to be “homeless,” the earliest New York City poorhouses, the places that housed the White homeless in the mid-18th century, also housed runaway slaves (Mary Booth, History of the City of New York, 1859, p. 347, in Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 124).

1 Starting this narrative on homelessness with the White colonization allows us to include the ironic fact that many of the first American colonists had been homeless in England. According to Benjamin Brawley (1970, pp. 21-22), in Social History of the American Negro, long before the Mayflower and the first slave ships sailed to the colonies, changes in land use in England created a large homeless class. Starting in the 15th century, more and more English farms were enclosed for sheep raising, and agricultural laborers who cultivated the land were “starved out.” By the 16th century, with the establishment of the Church of England, conditions became even more acute because the old monasteries that had been the source of charitable relief for the poor were now abolished. By the 17th century, the homeless, paupers, and dissolute persons filled the English jails and workhouses. But as luck would have it, in the 17th century the English colonies desperately needed “labor,” and much of the English homeless labor force migrated to the colonies.

2 For example, according to John Hope Franklin and Alfred A. Moss (1994), in 1662 the colony of Virginia was the first to make slavery hereditary by legally establishing that “the status of a child should be determined by that of the mother” (pp. 23-24). And in 1705, a Virginia law “provided that a slave might be inventoried as real estate. As property, henceforth there was nothing to prevent his being separated from his family. Before the law he was no longer a person but a thing” (p. 26).

3 According to Henry Miller (1991, p. 26), in On the Fringe: The Dispossessed in America, providing help to those in need depended on whether the needy were actually members of the town or community and also depended on whether they were considered part of the “deserving poor.” Peter Rossi (1989, p. 17), in Down and Out in America, illustrated how closed the communities were when it came to providing help. He quoted from the minutes taken at a New England town meeting in which a vote on who could join the community was discussed. Being able to be part of a town was not automatic but was very desirable because assistance was linked to residency. For example, the community might help a member (a longtime resident) who had suffered a calamity with money. More likely, indenturing and apprenticing were offered. But none of this help was available unless you were a member of the community.

4 In 1790, there were 700,000 slaves, but by 1830, they numbered more than 2 million, according to J. H. Franklin and Moss (1994, pp. 122-123). In some states, such as South Carolina, the slaves greatly outnumbered the Whites, sometimes with a ratio as high as 3 to 1, Mary Frances Berry (1971, p. 3) wrote, and, according to Jay Mandel (1992), “By 1860 the African American population had risen to about 4.4 million, more than 90 percent of whom resided in the south” (p. 5).

5 Fully one fourth of the White Southern population owned slaves, and the bulk of the owners were small farmers. In fact, more than half the slave owners owned 5 slaves or fewer, according to J. H. Franklin and Moss (1994, p. 123).

6 It is also true, according to Berry (1971), in her book, Black Resistance White Law: A History of Constitutional Racism in America, that White colonists acted to divide Black Americans from Native Americans, for example, when they tried to recruit “selected slaves” to augment their own militia to fight the Yamassee Indians (p. 3). And it is true that some Indian tribes developed a slavery system of their own. It was widely reported that around 1860, the Seminole tribe owned 1,000 slaves and the Cherokees and Chickasaws owned about 3,000 each. But the treatment of the slaves by the Indians seems to have been radically
different from that of the White slave owners. The Native Americans freely intermarried with their slaves and required only the annual payment of a portion of their crops (see Editors of *Ebony*, 1971, p. 106).

7 In 1926, in a study conducted by Melville Hershkovitz, of 1,551 Blacks, more than one third were found to have Indian ancestry. Many famous Blacks from the Revolutionary War period, such as Crispus Attucks, Captain Paul Caffee, and Salem Poor, had their Indian ancestry documented, according to the Editors of *Ebony* (1971, p. 110).

8 Horatio Strother (1962), in *The Underground Railroad in Connecticut*, describes the term Underground Railroad's origin in the following way: A slave named Tice Davids escaped from his owner in Ripley, Ohio, and immediately disappeared. The master searched the vicinity as thoroughly as he could but found no trace of his runaway bondsman. At length he concluded ruefully, "He must have gotten away by an underground road." From "road" to "railroad" was a simple transition. . . . The terminology of railroading afforded easy names with which to mask a range of activities that lay outside the law. So the Underground Railroad—more the "name of a mode of operation than the name of a corporation"—had its "conductors" and "passengers" . . . "stations" and "stationkeepers." (p. 5)
Blacks were hit hardest by the Great Depression, which produced widespread hardship and homelessness. In 1930,

somewhere between 12 and 15 million were unemployed, one family out of seven was on public or private relief, 4,600 banks had failed, half of Michigan’s automobile factories were shut down, textile looms in the South were silent, farmers let their crops rot in the fields ... and in New England’s men and women worked for one dollar a week. (Barber, 1972, p. 233)

African Americans were hit “earliest and most severely” by the economic collapse. In many Northern cities, there were a substantial number of Black men who were homeless. “By the winter of 1932-1933, nearly one-quarter of Philadelphia’s homeless transient were black, as were one-tenth of Chicago’s sheltered men, one-fifth of Buffalo’s [non-seaman] . . . transients, and one-sixth of New York City’s public shelter clientele” (Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 124). In all these cities, the percentage of Black homeless was higher than the percentage of Blacks in the population as a whole, although, in the case of Chicago, not by much.

During this period, African Americans suffered, not just because they were poorly paid marginal workers or because they had lost their employment but because discrimination in public and private assistance prevented them from getting their fair share of aid. “Many private agencies excluded blacks altogether from their soup kitchens, and some communities gave unemployed black families less assistance than whites” or unfairly distributed relief money (E. Foner, 1970, p. 388). There was discrimination because project design and allocation of funds were in local hands. Examples abound.

New Deal programs’ discriminatory practices were pervasive and widespread. The National Recovery Act and the Tennessee Valley Authority are apt examples.

The Works Project Administration (WPA) also failed in its mission of distributing relief equitably. Southern states were allowed to redefine what unemployment meant so they could exclude from the unemployed category all sharecroppers and surplus day laborers. In 1930, 56% of the U.S. Black population still lived in rural America, and according to the census, 40% of U.S. Black wage earners were in agricultural work. Georgia, for example, though responsible for so much of the earlier Northern migration, had lost only 5% of its population to Northern cities (Hahamovitch, 1997, p. 89).

The agricultural sector of society was especially hard hit by the Depression. Although 25% of the nation’s population were farmers in 1933, they earned only 7% of the total national income (Wolters, 1970, p. 4). And rural Blacks were much worse off than were rural Whites. Based on a study of 646 cotton plantations, Blacks earned 73% of what Whites made (Wolters, 1970, p. 8). “Southern Negro farm tenants and wage laborers were the most impoverished major group of farm workers in the United States” (Wolters, 1970, p. 79). During the Depression, the average annual income for a Black sharecropping family was $295; for the Black day-laboring
family it was $175. By 1938, the huge majority of the 1.2 million displaced workers in need of some sort of relief were Black (Wolters, 1970, p. 8).

The New Deal's Agricultural Adjustment Act (AAA) program helped the White landowners, especially in the cotton belt, but it caused more Black tenant farmers to become homeless. The AAA authorized payments to farm owners who pledged to restrict their production. Reducing production forced tenant farmers off the land, and they were forced to become migrant workers and day laborers. Vast numbers of displaced tenant farmers, along with their families, had to move constantly to find work. During the 1930s, fully 192,000 Negro farm tenants were displaced (Wolters, 1970, p. 79).

Those who became day laborers became a source of extremely cheap labor for plantation owners. They required no maintenance costs such as shelter, food, and other supplies, and because there were so many day laborers they accepted miserable wages to survive. The temporary worker populations were forced into moving for seasonal work, becoming day laborers for a season, and after it was over they were forced to go on relief. But benefits from New Deal programs were inadequate because the New Deal programs such as the WPA were being administered locally, and Southern Whites controlled the rules of implementation.

Between 1933 to 1935, the White local administrators who ran the New Deal programs, provided the majority of the money to poor White farmers or workers. Blacks composed 41% of all rural families in the eastern cotton belt alone, but they represented only 35% of all rural families on relief in 1935 (M. Franklin, 1985, pp. 11-12).

---

1 According to census data, in 1930 in Philadelphia, Blacks were 11.0% of the population; in Chicago, Blacks were 6.9% of the population; in Buffalo, Blacks were 2.0% of the population; and in New York City, they composed 4.7%.

2 Leslie Fishel, describing Jacksonville Florida during the Depression, is quoted in Eric Foner's (1970) essay, "Black Reconstruction" in America's Black Past. Fishel said, Negro families on relief outnumbered white families three to one, but the money was divided according to proportions of the total city population. Thus, 15,000 Negro families received 45 percent of the funds and 5,000 white families got 55 percent. Along the Mississippi River, from Natchez to New Orleans, Negroes were passed over for skilled jobs and frequently received less than the stipulated minimum wage. . . . The state of Georgia squeezed out of the FERA administrator the right to fix hourly wages for Negroes below thirty cents an hour. (p. 395)

3 The National Recovery Act (NRA), the agency responsible for setting industrial codes, deferred to the wage and employment considerations of local areas, and the NRA exempted from their largess and jurisdiction agricultural laborers, domestic servants, service trades, and most unskilled workers.
It might surprise many Americans to find out that those television icons of the “ideal” family of the 1950s, *Father Knows Best* and *Leave It to Beaver*, were not actually family favorites when they first aired on the small screen (*Father Knows Best* managed to make the Nielsen Top 10 but only for one season). Yet LaRossa (2004) explored how television sitcoms influenced the culture of fatherhood in the decade that the TV set first became a staple in the American home. The author argued that it was through cable reruns that the shows gained their status, creating a revisionist history of what family life was like in the Eisenhower era. The programs promoted fathers’ involvement in families, to a point. Mom was still the one in the apron. Dad was the go-to guy for advice but it was not his role to be heavily involved in raising the children.

On the other hand, Pehlke and colleagues point out that this idea was more prevalent in the mid and late 1950s than earlier in the era. In the early 1950s, television images of fatherhood were actually less conforming and patriarchal. This fluctuation within the first decade of television’s reign was curiously predictive of future portrayals of TV dads. Olson and Douglas (1997) observed that the family sitcom has an established history of portraying the idiosyncratic nature of the American family and bringing it into viewers’ homes. Pehlke et al. surmise that television probably surpasses any other genre in this capacity. For their analysis, the authors focused on family sitcoms depicting a two-parent family with at least one child under 18. While acknowledging that this may not be the predominant family situation, they note that most Americans still see it as the ideal. Indeed, this was the opinion of 701 fathers who responded to a Pop’s Culture Survey of Dad’s Attitudes on Fathering (2006), virtually all agreed that, “being a father was a very important part of who they are.” The fathers’ thoughts on their own role as fathers is aligned with their perceptions of fathers on film.

The authors discerned three major themes: “Father-Child Interactions,” “Racial-Ethnic and Socioeconomic Themes in Fathering,” and “Negative Messages about Fatherhood.” A notable feature of the analysis was that the shows appeared to place more emphasis on fathers’ active involvement with their children and emotional bonds than previous studies disclosed. “Quality time” is an important issue for the new generation of TV dads. Even in mundane activities the fathers displayed playfulness and support. Positive shows of support outweighed actions deemed unsupportive or manipulative.

In his continuing exploration of sitcoms, Butsch (1992) has consistently documented the perpetuation of the stereotype of working class fathers as ineffective buffoons. Pehlke et al. confirmed that working class fathers are far less competent than their middle-class counterparts, and in particular, far less likely to be sources of emotional support for their children. An intriguing point is the intersection of ethnicity and socioeconomic class. The two African-American fathers (*My Wife and Kids* and *All of Us*) and one Latino father (*George Lopez*) were all middle-class in occupational status and fathering behaviors. Moreover, they emerged as the most supportive, enlightened fathers of all the sitcom dads. Whether this is representative of a
point in time (or the shows’ writers) or symbolic of a trend is an interesting question for future analysis.

The negative messages were embodied in scenes where the father was shown as immature, foolish, or the butt of others’ jokes. The authors emphasize that by definition, situation comedies are built on humor. They add, however, that these scenes do not do much to counteract cultural attitudes toward fathers as rather incompetent in their family roles. Whether scenes designed to produce laughter at the expense of Dad’s incompetence are a factor in the national survey on attitudes about fatherhood, fathers’ uncertainty of their own competence is a legitimate question. The authors place their study within the context of an ongoing body of research into the “mystery of fatherhood.”
Fathers in Popular Picture Books

By Molloy College

Children’s books are widely recognized as a reflection of cultural conceptions of gender roles, parenting, and family relationships. In previous work, Flannery Quinn explored the culture of fatherhood in award-winning children’s picture books from 1938-2002. Not unexpectedly, fathers in Caldecott books published after the 1960s were more involved with their children than fathers in previous generations of books. In fact, the fictional fathers of children’s literature seemed to surpass estimates of the time actual fathers spend with their children in real life. In the present study, Flannery Quinn focuses on fathers in best-selling children’s books.

For the initial analysis, Flannery Quinn examines the presence of fathers in bestselling children’s picture books featuring one protagonistic parent. Among books that meet the selection criteria, fathers are the prominent parent in four books; in contrast, mothers are the prominent parent in 10. In fact, only a scant proportion of books portrays fathers as characters, either independently or with the mother in the story. The semiotic analysis focuses on the two top sellers: *Just Me and My Dad* (1975), and *Guess How Much I Love You* (1994).

While it is tempting to say that the traditionally masculine themes and father role pervading *Just Me and My Dad* reflect its being written 30 years ago, the 1970s marked a distinct shift away from traditional gender roles. A depiction of a father and son camping and fishing trip exalts conventional notions of masculinity in an era of androgyny. Flannery Quinn uses the term “(pseudo) survival activities” to describe the activities that take place in the woods. As the day turns to night, the father shows he is patient, protective, and brave as he interacts with his naive and vulnerable young son. Flannery Quinn uses select scenes to illustrate the relationship between father and son: close and loving but constrained by cultural expectations of how a father should act.

In *Guess How Much I Love You*, the father and son are “Big Nutbrown Hare” and “Little Nutbrown Hare.” As Flannery Quinn points out, the names carry the cultural connotation that “the child is a copy of the parent,” a feature imbued with special significance in that the gender of the parent and child is not revealed until the reader has gone through several pages. The storyline is a playful competition between the son who aspires to be like his father and the father who clearly enjoys his relationship with his son (and perhaps exults in the child’s desire to be just like him). The entire story, and as Flannery Quinn observes, the cultural knowledge embedded within it, unfolds in the brief span of time that the father helps the child get ready for bed. Traditionally, the night is when a working father has time to be with his child. Not so traditionally, Big Nutbrown Hare affectionately kisses his son good night. Flannery Quinn construes this as symbolic of the “new father” who is not afraid to openly express affection. It is interesting that the kiss—and the implicit message that “it is acceptable for a masculine father to display affection to his child”—should come from an anthropomorphic hare rather than a human father.

An intriguing feature of both books (in fact, of all four best-selling books with prominent fathers) is the presence of the moon. While admitting there might be no symbolic meaning, Flannery Quinn highlights two unique features of the moon. The moon illuminates the darkness. And although it changes in shape and is not always visible, it is always with us, a reliable presence less distant and more accessible than other objects in the sky. From a child’s vantage
point, that might be how a father appears. Flannery Quinn’s thoughtful analysis elucidates similarities and differences in the two conceptions of fatherhood in the popular books. Perhaps the most striking similarity is that these books stand out as among very few children’s books that give fathers a central role.
Appendix D: Pre-test Images

Clown Making Up

Evicted...

Appendix E: Pre-Test Survey

Introduction
Thank you for participating in this study! Your time and energy is greatly appreciated. Please answer the following introduction questions and proceed through the survey by answering the questions. The survey is displayed in three different segments.

Background Information
1) What is your gender?*
   () Male
   () Female
2) In what year were you born?*
3) What is your graduate program?

Evaluations of the Artist John Sloan Journal Articles
Please answer the following questions. If you feel an explanation is appropriate, feel free to write in the comment segment provided.
4) The two articles about John Sloan's paintings "Clown Making Up" and "Hairdresser's Window" are alike in content (defined as the overall theme).*
   () Strongly disagree
   () Disagree
   () Slightly disagree
   () Neutral
   () Slightly agree
   () Agree
   () Strongly agree
   Comments:

5) The two articles on John Sloan's paintings "Clowning Up" and "Hairdresser's Window" are alike in the style of writing.*
   () Strongly disagree
   () Disagree
   () Slightly disagree
   () Neutral
   () Slightly agree
   () Agree
   () Strongly agree
   Comments:

6) The two articles about John Sloan's paintings "Clown Making Up" and "Hairdresser's Window" are alike in the vocabulary used.*
   () Strongly disagree
   () Disagree
   () Slightly disagree
   () Neutral
   () Slightly agree
7) The two articles about John Sloan's paintings "Clowning Up" and "Hairdresser's Window" are alike in the vocabulary used.*
   ( ) Strongly disagree
   ( ) Disagree
   ( ) Slightly disagree
   ( ) Neutral
   ( ) Slightly agree
   ( ) Agree
   ( ) Strongly agree
   Comments:

8) The two articles about John Sloan's paintings "Clown Making Up" and "Hairdresser's Window" provoke the same level of interest to you as a reader.*
   ( ) Strongly disagree
   ( ) Disagree
   ( ) Slightly disagree
   ( ) Neutral
   ( ) Slightly agree
   ( ) Agree
   ( ) Strongly agree
   Comments:

Evaluations of the Conscious Capitalism Articles
Please answer the following questions. If you feel an explanation is appropriate, feel free to write in the comment segment provided.
9) The two articles about the business model "Conscious Capitalism" are alike in content (defined as the overall theme).*
   ( ) Strongly disagree
   ( ) Disagree
   ( ) Slightly disagree
   ( ) Neutral
   ( ) Slightly agree
   ( ) Agree
   ( ) Strongly agree
   Comments:

10) The two articles about the business model "Conscious Capitalism" are alike in the style of writing.*
    ( ) Strongly disagree
    ( ) Disagree
    ( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree
Comments:

11) The two articles about the business model "Conscious Capitalism" are alike in the vocabulary used.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree
Comments:

12) The two articles about the business model "Conscious Capitalism" are alike in the vocabulary used.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree
Comments:

13) The two articles about the business model "Conscious Capitalism" provoke the same level of interest to you as a reader.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree
Comments:

Evaluations of the History of Homelessness among African Americans Journal Articles
Please answer the following questions. If you feel an explanation is appropriate, feel free to write in the comment segment provided.
14) The two articles about the history of homeless African Americans in America are alike in content (defined as the overall theme).*
( ) Strongly disagree
15) The two articles about the history of homeless African Americans in America are alike in the style of writing.*

16) The two articles about the history of homeless African Americans in America are alike in the vocabulary used.*

17) The two articles about the history of homeless African Americans in America provoke the same level of interest to you as a reader.*
18) The two articles about the portrayal of fatherhood on television and in literature are alike in content (defined as the overall theme).*
   () Strongly disagree
   () Disagree
   () Slightly disagree
   () Neutral
   () Slightly agree
   () Agree
   () Strongly agree
   Comments:

19) The two articles about the portrayal of fatherhood on television and in literature are alike in the style of writing.*
   () Strongly disagree
   () Disagree
   () Slightly disagree
   () Neutral
   () Slightly agree
   () Agree
   () Strongly agree
   Comments:

20) The two articles about the portrayal of fatherhood on television and in literature are alike in the vocabulary used.*
   () Strongly disagree
   () Disagree
   () Slightly disagree
   () Neutral
   () Slightly agree
   () Agree
   () Strongly agree
   Comments:

21) The two articles about the business model "Conscious Capitalism" are alike in the vocabulary used.*
   () Strongly disagree
   () Disagree
   () Slightly disagree
   () Neutral
   () Slightly agree
   () Agree
   () Strongly agree
   Comments:

22) The two articles about the portrayal of fatherhood on television and in literature provoke the same level of interest to you as a reader.*
23) This image reflects harm and danger.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree
Comments:

Image Evaluations
Please review the images provided to you and best answer the questions about your perceptions of the images. If you feel an explanation is appropriate, feel free to write in the comment segment provided.

"Clown Making Up" by John Sloan

23) This image reflects harm and danger.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
24) The quality of this image has high resolution resulting in a clean picture.*

- Slightly disagree
- Disagree
- Slightly disagree
- Neutral
- Slightly agree
- Agree
- Strongly agree

"Hairdresser's Window" by John Sloan

25) This image reflects harm and danger.*

- Slightly disagree
- Disagree
- Slightly disagree
- Neutral
- Slightly agree
- Agree
- Strongly agree
26) The quality of this image has high resolution resulting in a clean picture.*

( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree

"Man Saving Child from Flood in China"

27) This image reflects harm and danger.*

( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree

28) The quality of this image has high resolution resulting in a clean picture.*

( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree
"Evicted..."

29) This image reflects harm and danger.*
   ( ) Strongly disagree
   ( ) Disagree
   ( ) Slightly disagree
   ( ) Neutral
   ( ) Slightly agree
   ( ) Agree
   ( ) Strongly agree

30) The quality of this image has high resolution resulting in a clean picture.*
   ( ) Strongly disagree
   ( ) Disagree
   ( ) Slightly disagree
   ( ) Neutral
   ( ) Slightly agree
   ( ) Agree
   ( ) Strongly agree
31) This image reflects harm and danger.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree

32) The quality of this image has high resolution resulting in a clean picture.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree
33) This image reflects harm and danger.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree

34) The quality of this image has high resolution resulting in a clean picture.*
( ) Strongly disagree
( ) Disagree
( ) Slightly disagree
( ) Neutral
( ) Slightly agree
( ) Agree
( ) Strongly agree

Concept Cataloging
35) What actions best describe a student who is educationally interested in a journal article?
Please rank the actions that best describe educational interest.
(1 being the highest ranking, 7 being the lowest)*

_____ Wanting to learn more about the subject in the article
_____ Sharing the articles with other classmates or friends
_____ Select for use and citation in a research paper
_____ Receiving a high score on a test about the journal article
_____ Recalling the information from the article at a later time
_____ Posting information learned in the article on a social network site
Appendix F: Pilot Experiment Survey

Pilot Test - Main Experiment

Introduction
Your scenario: You are assigned four (4) short essay papers in your English 101 course. The subject areas are business, sociology, art and history. Your time and energy has been spared by the teacher and two articles for each topic were already chosen for you out of a new scholarly journal *Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin*.

Please evaluate each set of articles for each subject area and select the ONE article that answers the question provided. Please do your best to explain WHY you chose this article out of the two provided. Before you begin your assignments you will be asked a few introductory questions about your background. After completing and submitting the survey you will be emailed your compensation in the form of an electronic gift card. A short follow-up survey will be required to complete a week after submitting this survey.

*Thank you for your support!*

Follow-Up Survey

You are about to complete the first segment of the survey! In about a weeks time you will receive one more very short follow-up survey. This second survey should not take more than 10 minutes of your time and will NOT require reading of articles. It is very important to my research you complete this segment.

Do you agree to complete the follow-up segment of the survey?*

( ) Yes
( ) No

How to take this Survey
How to take this survey: Embedded video

Consent Form
Please read and complete the consent form below:
If you agree to participate in this project, please select "Accept" option to proceed with the survey. If you choose not to participate please select the "Do not accept" option to opt out.*

( ) Agree
( ) Do not agree

Background Information
1) What is your unique participant code?*

( ) 010
( ) 011
( ) 012
( ) 013
( ) 014
2) What is your gender?*
   ( ) Male
   ( ) Female

3) In what year were you born?*
   ( ) 2009 ------- ( ) pre-1927

4) What is your current or future major in college?*

5) When you need information for research purposes, which sources do you usually consult? Please check all that apply. *
   [ ] Academic Databases
   [ ] Online Search Engine
   [ ] Google Scholar
   [ ] Facebook
   [ ] Library Catalog
   [ ] Ask a Librarian
   [ ] Ask a friend or family member

6) How easy is it for you to retrieve information when conducting research for courses?*
   ( ) Extremely easy
   ( ) Very easy
   ( ) Moderately easy
   ( ) Slightly easy
   ( ) Not at all easy

7) Based on your learning style, do you consider yourself an audio, visual, or sensory (hands-on) learner? Please check all that apply.*
   [ ] Audio learner
   [ ] Visual learner
   [ ] Sensory learner

Art Articles
You are beginning your research on the American artist John Sloan.

John Sloan was an American artist known for his impact on the realism movement. Born in 1871 in Lock Haven, Pennsylvania, he spent most of his life in New York, where he worked as a painter, illustrator, and teacher for the Art Students League. As part of "The Eight," Sloan rebelled against the National Academy of Design for their conservative taste. His figure, landscape, and poster paintings are among some of the best examples of works depicting the realism movement of direct observation through individual responses that reflect on everyday life in America. Sloan died in 1951.

-----Amanda Cleck (http://pabook.libraries.psu.edu/palitmap/bios/Sloan__John.html).-----
Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that follow.

**Artist John Sloan Articles**

Please answer the following questions about the John Sloan paintings:

8) You have decided to take a course in the future on art history while at the university. You are always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*

   ( ) John Sloan's "Clown Making Up"
   ( ) John Sloan's "Hairdresser's Window"

9) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

10) Which article of the two made you want to learn more about John Sloan's art work?*

   ( ) John Sloan's "Clown Making Up"
   ( ) John Sloan's "Hairdresser's Window"

11) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

12) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*

   ( ) John Sloan's "Clown Making Up"
   ( ) John Sloan's "Hairdresser's Window"

13) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

14) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use? *

   ( ) John Sloan's "Clown Making Up"
   ( ) John Sloan's "Hairdresser's Window"

15) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

**Business Articles**

You are beginning your research on the business model "Conscious Capitalism."

Conscious capitalism is an emerging philosophy based on the belief that businesses can enhance corporate performance while simultaneously improving the quality of life for all stakeholders. Conscious capitalism goes beyond corporate social responsibility by placing societal needs and their challenges at the core of the company's existence. Conscious capitalism transforms the existing notion about capitalism by changing the either/or paradigm to a both/and mentality by simultaneously creating financial and societal wealth.

-----Marie Legault-----
Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that follow.

Conscious Capitalism Articles
Please answer the following questions about the business model Conscious Capitalism:

16) You have decided to take a business course in the future while at the university. You are always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*
   ( ) "The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue"
   ( ) "The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good"

17) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

18) Which article of the two made you want to learn more Conscious Capitalism as a business model?*
   ( ) "The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue"
   ( ) "The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good"

19) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

20) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*
   ( ) "The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue"
   ( ) "The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good"

21) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

22) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use? *
   ( ) "The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue"
   ( ) "The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good"

23) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

ONLY TWO MORE ARTICLES. YOU ARE ALMOST TO YOUR GIFT CARD, KEEP GOING!

History Articles
You are beginning your research on the history of homelessness among African Americans in the United States.

The story of African Americans is usually absent from the mainstream textbook study of homeless people.

Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that follow.
Homelessness Articles
Please answer the following questions about the history of homelessness among African Americans:

24) You have decided to take a course in the future about American history while at the university. You are always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Colonies"
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal"

25) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

26) Which article of the two made you want to learn more the homeless history of African Americans? *
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Colonies"
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal"

27) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

28) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Colonies"
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal"

29) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

30) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use? *
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Colonies"
   ( ) "Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal"

31) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

Sociology Articles
You are beginning your research on the sociological impact of popular culture on the concept of "fatherhood" in America.

Since the 1970s, there has been an increased scholarly interest in fatherhood. There have been fundamental shifts in family life, gender relations, declining wage of male earners, increases in female labor force participation and in men's involvement as the primary non-maternal care provider. These cultural shifts have been mirrored in popular culture (films, television, music, and literature).

Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that follow.
Fatherhood Articles
Please answer the following questions about the influence of popular culture on fatherhood:

32) You have decided to take a sociology course in the future while at the university. You are always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*
   ( ) "Fathers in Popular Picture Books"
   ( ) "Fathers on the Small Screen"

33) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

34) Which article of the two made you want to learn more the social impact popular culture has on family dynamics?*
   ( ) "Fathers in Popular Picture Books"
   ( ) "Fathers on the Small Screen"

35) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

36) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*  
   ( ) "Fathers in Popular Picture Books"
   ( ) "Fathers on the Small Screen"

37) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

38) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use? *
   ( ) "Fathers in Popular Picture Books"
   ( ) "Fathers on the Small Screen"

39) Why would you choose this article? Please explain your motivations.*

ONE MORE SECTION TO COMPLETE. YOU ARE DONE READING ARTICLES, CONGRATULATIONS!

Overview of Favorite Journal Article
40) What is your FAVORITE article of all the journal articles you have read from Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin?*
   ( ) (Art) John Sloan: "Clown Making Up"
   ( ) (Art) John Sloan: "Hairdresser's Window"
   ( ) (Sociology) Fathers on the Small Screen
   ( ) (Sociology) Fathers in Popular Picture Books
   ( ) (Business) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
   ( ) (Business) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good
   ( ) (History) Homelessness in the Colonies
   ( ) (History) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal
41) Why is this your overall favorite article?*

42) What is the most interesting information you took away from this article?*

43) Would you like to share any other comments on the articles? Please share your thoughts and comments.

Pilot Test Articles
44) You are a member of the pilot experiment (prior to the main experiment distribution). If you have any inputs on the questions, language, or notice any errors in this survey please provide feedback.

Compensation
For your $5 compensation, please select the vendor:*
( ) Amazon.com
( ) Starbucks Gourmet Coffee

Thank You!
Thank you for taking part in this study. Your time and energy is greatly appreciated. You will receive your electronic gift card in less than 24 hours. Don't forget, about a week after you complete the survey you will receive a very short follow-up survey (it should take you less than 10 minutes). Please take the time to complete this segment as well. It is an essential part of my research. MAHALO!

Pilot Test Recall Survey

Introduction
A week ago you read eight (8) articles from the journal Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin. You will be asked a few questions about those articles. Please answer the questions to the best of your ability based only on memory and personal perceptions.

Follow-Up Survey
1) What is your unique participant code? *
   ( ) 010
   ( ) 011
   ( ) 012
   ( ) 013
   ( ) 014
   ( ) 015

   If you cannot remember titles of the articles, please describe the article to the best of your ability.
2) Off the top of your head, please name the most interesting article of the eight (8) read?*
3) Why was this article interesting?*

*If you cannot remember titles of the articles, please describe the article to the best of your ability.

4) Off the top of your head, please name the most memorable article of the eight (8) read?*

5) Why was this article memorable?*

6) Did the provided articles on the survey prompt you to do any additional research on the topics after you completed the survey?*
   ( ) Yes
   ( ) No

7) What topics did you research?

8) What made you interested in researching this topic?

Recall Information
9) Describe a moment in the history of African-Americans homelessness:* 

10) In what way was the concept of fatherhood impacted by television's popular culture? *

11) Please name one company or person that is involved in the Conscious Capitalist business model?*

12) Can you remember if any of the articles had images?*
   ( ) Yes
   ( ) No

13) Which images do you remember?

14) Why do you remember these images?

15) Do you feel you gained anything from the addition of images in the articles? Please explain in detail.

16) Are there any additional thoughts/reactions/comments you would like to add about the articles or images?

Thank You!
Thank you for completing the survey. Your responses are very important and your time is greatly appreciated.
John Sloan: Hairdresser’s Window
Michael Lobel

In Hairdresser’s Window, Sloan conjures a vivid urban vignette, one that has inspired a diverse array of scholarly interpretations. It has been related to the growth of a consumer culture oriented to women; analyzed within the theoretically derived category of panoptic vision; invoked as exemplary of a turn-of-the-century culture of urban looking; and even seen, through a psychoanalytic lens, as a way for Sloan to work through his deep-seated and ambivalent feelings about women. Some of these issues no doubt contribute, to a greater or lesser extent, to the painting’s density of meanings. Yet the picture is compelling also because it served as a profound meditation on the medium that Sloan was more thoroughly embracing as his own at the time.

According to a record in Sloan’s diary, the inspiration for Hairdresser’s Window came from a scene he encountered during one of his walks in the city. On June 5, 1907, he wrote, “Walked up to Henri’s studio. On the way saw a humorous sight of interest. A window, low, second story, bleached blond hair dresser bleaching the hair of a client. A small interested crowd about.” To begin, it is significant that Sloan implicates Robert Henri in his account of the origin of the picture, for his entry underscores that the motif occurred to him on his way to visit another painter’s studio. The following day, he recorded, “Walked out to take another look at the Hair Restorer’s Window. Came back and started to paint it.” His emphasis on going back to confirm his initial impression of the motif, along with the general correspondence between the painting and the first diary entry, could reasonably lead one to conclude that the resulting picture is not much more than a documentary record of the “actual” scene he had witnessed -- even though Sloan’s approach, as Rebecca Zurier reminds us, “was based on images seen and remembered (and sometimes written down) rather than sketched in the street.”

Hairdresser’s Window presents us with the flat facade of a building that is parallel to (one might almost say coincident with) the picture plane. That facade is studded with hand-lettered advertising signs. Through a window above we spy the hairdresser of the title, who with the help of an assistant is treating a client’s long, flowing locks. On the sidewalk below, a crowd has assembled to gawk at this sight, which in bringing an otherwise private aspect of a woman’s toilette into public view may very well have challenged the bounds of propriety at the time. A host of small, seemingly insignificant details contributes to the vividness and ostensibly reportorial character of the scene: the gloves worn by the hairdresser, the brightly colored flowers on the woman’s hat at right; the mannequin heads in a glass display case; and the woman in profile at far left, who passes by without acknowledging the scene that draws our attention as well as that of the rest of the assembled onlookers.

If these accumulated details suggest a realist recording of an observed scene, the organization of the picture shows how much Sloan was attuned to issues of composition, carefully and self-consciously attending to the picture’s formal structure. His attunement to formal concerns is evident in surface and depth. One might initially take
There is also an architectural feature, something like a projecting display window or false front, visible at lower right. (It is capped by a sign reading "GOW," which one takes as an advertising sign for a store selling gowns, although the cropping leaves this identification ultimately unclear.) This feature presents us with noticeable spatial ambiguities: Are we supposed to read that standing female figure, left hand on hip, as a mannequin in a store window, or is this, rather, a flat poster or painted bulletin affixed to the building front? The picture's play with spatial ambiguity is particularly evident in the motif of the three swatches of hair (brown, auburn, and blonde) that hang from a diagonal element to the right of the hairdresser's window. Does that wire or rod project out from the corner of the sign, into space, or is it instead meant to be read as a receding element, connected back to the building facade? Neither reading is particularly convincing; if it's the former, the orientation of the rod doesn't correspond convincingly with the overall perspectival rendering. If it's the latter, the length of each swatch doesn't make sense, since the left one should be farthest away from us and, thus, the shortest; the recession we would expect has been reversed here, as if to totally confound our expectations of how it should work.


2 Sloan diary, June 5, 1907. All quotations from Sloan's diaries (which range from 1906 to 1913) come from a transcribed and annotated (but unpublished) version by Judith G. Tovey in consultation with Helen Farr Sloan, further editing by Jeanette Tovey in about 1998, in the Delaware Art Museum, Wilmington, which holds the originals in its John Sloan Manuscript Collection.

3 Zuckier (*Focusing the City*, 249-50) continues, "The effect is conceptual rather than perceptual (which Sloan designated as 'eyesight' painting), but usually not as painted as a one-line cartoon."
John Sloan: Clown Making Up
Michael Lobel

By 1910, Sloan's interest in crowds, surrogates immobile and distracted, like chaotic, potentially violent masses, had largely passed, and things had changed significantly for him. In the years after 1907, he became more caught up in the attention to his work that had been generated by the Macbeth Galleries exhibition. As his interest in politics grew, he became more and more devoted to the cause of socialism, which would result in his vigorous involvement with the journal the Masses. His painterly technique and palette also shifted. His awareness of these changes may be reflected in a 1910 canvas, Clown Making Up. It's a relatively simple and rather somber picture, which presents a costumed clown, seated and alone, applying makeup by candlelight. The picture's subject matter, at first blush, looks far removed from the paintings by Sloan, yet it, too, yields a self-conscious reflection on the artist's practice: it is, of course, a picture of someone applying pigment -- in other words, paint -- to his face. Sloan calls attention to this activity in a number of ways: he placed the clown's head and face just about dead center in the composition and indicated the presence of the pigment-applying tool (not a brush, but likely some sort of sponge) with a bright white squiggle that appears in the figure's hand. There is also that box of makeup that sits on the table before him, which bears a close resemblance to a painter's palette.

This interior is lit not by the gas or electric lights that are evident in so many of the artist's other works, but by two humble candles. There is really no indication of the modern world at all here; instead, we are treated to a practically timeless genre scene. And this is in keeping with the subject, in that the clown could have been, in other hands or even at another point in Sloan's practice, used as a symbol or avatar of modern urban spectacle. Clearly, Sloan could have captured any one of the wide variety of entertainments available to urban audiences at the time, as his old friend and Ashcan colleague William Glacken did in a work like Hammerstein's Roof Garden, or Everett Shinn in his numerous, Impressionist-inspired stage scenes. But, tellingly, Sloan shows us not a performer in front of his audience but a practitioner alone, in a quiet moment of preparation. Clown Making Up indicates a move away from the social into a private, enclosed, interior realm.

In these ways, Clown Making Up embodies changes taking place in Sloan's practice at the time, and perhaps even augurs changes still to come. Although he would never turn away from urban subjects completely, in the 1910s and 1920s we see him devoting himself more to rural landscapes (in Gloucester and elsewhere), which would eventually culminate in his many trips to Santa Fe, New Mexico, where he would celebrate Native American rituals and other subjects tied not to the contemporary present but to the past. Moreover, at this time his general focus on urban subject matter was in some ways beginning to be overshadowed by an exploration of the formal qualities of painting itself. In fact, as Sloan himself noted, Clown Making Up was one of the first paintings he executed using the so-called Maratta method.4 This method, introduced to him by Henri, was a
Clown Making Up by John Sloan, 1910

prearranged tonal system of pigments assembled and marketed by one Hardesty G. Maratta. Sloan’s embrace of a prearranged system of color signals an implicit willingness to key his paintings less to direct experience and more to intra-artistic concerns. In short, the clown making up alone, without his audience, is a fitting emblem for an artist who was to some extent uncoupling his work from its primary focus on the social and the public. The isolation of the clown, lacking his audience, also lends the picture a certain degree of melancholy. It is darker, both literally and metaphorically—somber and brooding. Finally, it is a picture, at base, of self-creation: of a creative individual making himself into the image that he will present to the public. The costumed performer would have been a figure with some potential for self-identification, considering Sloan’s early experiences and inclination toward dressing up for amateur theatricals within his early circle in Philadelphia. On a less literal level, the articulation of a creative persona had already been a concern at the center of Sloan’s work, as he explored his artistic identity by finding painterly surrogates in his urban surroundings. 

Clown Making Up is an image of an individual who is creating a new identity through painting; alternatively, one could see him as using paint to mask his prearranged tonal system of pigments identity. Whatever the case, at least for a moment Sloan had again found a motif through which to explore his own sense of himself as a painter and conjure a place for painting in the modern world, however circumscribed or provisional it may have been.

1 About the painting, Eliza (Sloan’s Oil Paintings, 104) opined, “This is a very unusual painting in Sloan’s oeuvre in that it is an entirely posed and constructed subject and is of a sentimentality contrary to Sloan’s nature.” Although I agree with Eliza’s assessment of the subject’s distinctiveness in Sloan’s body of work, I would challenge her assertion that it “is of a sentimentality contrary to Sloan’s nature” since I think it speaks to Sloan’s reflection on developments in his practice. According to Eliza, the model for the figure was one Mr. Wilson, a professional model from whom Sloan had borrowed a costume for a ball whom he hired to pose for the painting.

2 Clown Making Up evokes prelates a later work by another artist, from the second half of the twentieth century, that employs much the same motif, a series of films by Bruce Nauman, in which the artist captures himself covering his face and upper torso with colored makeup. Both artworks incorporate devices of self-regard, with the film camera replacing the mirror in the later work.

3 One could even read this as an indication of profound ambivalence. The clown is a practitioner of spectacular entertainment—he’s meant, after all, to be seen by a large assembled audience—yet this aspect of the figure is ultimately negated, since he’s depicted here offstage, away from the damping crowd.

4 Sloan, Our Art, 222, cited in Eliza, Sloan’s Oil Paintings, 104.
The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
James O'Toole & David Vogel

There is a long history of business leaders who have attempted to act virtuously. The first "conscious capitalist" may have been British textile mill owner Robert Owen. Between 1800 and 1825—the era of Dickens's "dark satanic mills"—Owen introduced relatively short working hours, a grievance procedure, guaranteed employment during economic downturns, and contributory health, disability, and retirement plans. Owen provided clean, decent housing for his workers in a subsidized community free of controllable disease, crime, and gin shops. He took young children out of the factory and put them in a school he founded and paid for. He invented preschool, day care, and adult night school for his employees and their families. The bottom-line: Owen's company in New Lanark, Scotland became the world's most productive and profitable textile mill.

Like John Mackey and Gary Hirshberg today, Owen then began a public crusade to try to convince other business leaders to adopt his responsible and successful business model. However, just when Owen succeeded in winning his worker's trust, and productivity in the mill started to soar, his co-owners began to question his practices, expressing "disapproval of the mixture of philanthropy and business." Their complaint wasn't that the mill was unprofitable—it clearly was—but that it could be made more profitable still if only Owen ceased treating his employee so well and, instead, increased dividends to it's investors. Significantly, no other British business firm adopted Owen's business model. By 1825, the New Lanark mills were shut down, and a dejected Owen emigrated to America. The lesson we draw from this story is not that social responsibility doesn't pay; it clearly did at New Lanark. It is rather that virtuous capitalism is difficult to sustain.

In this regard, it is instructive to review what happened to the companies on a list of two dozen firms widely recognized for their social commitments and ethical practices published in 1985. Subsequently, six of them were acquired by companies with different philosophies, including environmentalist-oriented Atlantic Richfield, which was acquired by BP. Two went bankrupt, including Control Data Corporation, which had been the first major American company to publicly commit to seeking profits from "doing good." Only six of these companies—Dayton-Hudson (now Target), Cummins, Xerox, W.L. Gore, and Herman Miller—still exist, are still financially successful, and still practice something like their original virtuous behaviors. However, (with the notable exception of Gore) some of these companies (Johnson & Johnson and Herman Miller) had their commitments to virtue severely tested over the years, or saw those commitments considerably weakened (Cummins and Xerox) when new CEOs entered their respective executive suites.

Likewise in green consciousness, Toyota's introduction of the hybrid Prius in
1997 was applauded by environmentalists and became a major commercial success. Toyota quickly gained a reputation as the world's "greener" car company. In 2009, however, several of Toyota's models were discovered to have safety defects— including, ironically, the Prius. Much like the situation at Johnson & Johnson's tylenol poisoning, a wave of recalls—25 in only 30 weeks in 2010—rapidly undermined Toyota's long-established reputation for quality control, leading to a reduced market share and a decline in shareholder value.

BP (British Petroleum) suffered a similar fall from virtue. In 1997, it became the first global energy firm publicly to acknowledge the risks of global climate change, and prominently featured its commitment to sustainability by changing its name to BP (Beyond Petroleum). The corporation pledged to reduce its greenhouse gas emissions by 10 percent from 1990 levels by 2010—a goal it achieved nine years ahead of schedule—and substantially increased its investment in solar energy. In 2005, BP was named the Financial Times' "most respected energy company," and Business Week ranked it in second place on its list of the "greenest companies of the decade." Yet, in 2005, an explosion at the company's refinery in Texas attributed to inadequate maintenance resulted in 15 deaths and, a year later, inadequate maintenance of its pipelines in Alaska led to several oil spills.

Then, in the spring of 2010, a drilling platform owned by BP in the Gulf of Mexico exploded, killing eleven workers and producing the largest oil spill in American history. Clean-up costs, fines, and punitive damages (which will be borne by the firm's shareholders), currently are estimated at billions of dollars. The company has also sold off its investments in solar energy. Thus, in little more than a decade, BP went from being seen as the world's most admired and "greenest" energy company to one widely regarded as one of the most environmentally destructive and irresponsible.

---

The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good
James O'Toole & David Vogel

During the recent decadas horribilis (horrible decades) in which, for various reasons, companies such as AIG, Goldman Sachs, Toyota, and BP dominated headlines in the business press, a few companies associated with the “Conscious Capitalism” movement have distinguished themselves by their commitments to ethical and sustainable business practices.

It is claimed that the business practices associated with Conscious Capitalism promise to address such shortcomings of corporate capitalism as currently practiced. Hence, it is not surprising that Conscious Capitalism has been widely embraced by many business leaders, academics, and MBA students who have become enticed by the prospect of integrating greater social responsibility into mainstream business practices.

While the term Conscious Capitalism is new, its underlying claim that firms can do well, or even better, by doing good is not. Between 1992 and 2003, Howard Rothman and Mary Scott published three editions of Companies with a Conscience, each of which featured profiles of a dozen profitable companies that exemplified the values of “caring capitalism.” A steady stream of recently published books have advised managers how to: make “doing good an integral part of doing well,” “deliver value with values,” “build value through values,” and “profit from passion and purpose.” In 2007, Business Week published a special report entitled “Beyond the Green Corporation” with the sub-head, “Imagine a world in which eco-friendly and socially responsible practices actually help the company’s bottom line. It’s closer than you think.”

Some of the leading Conscious Capitalist companies have had their commitments to virtue severely tested over the years. The case of Johnson & Johnson is sobering. In the 1940s, General Robert Wood Johnson developed the company's famous “credo,” which emphasized that the firm’s first responsibility was to “the doctors, nurses and patients, the mothers, fathers were added in 1989] and all others who use our products.” Significantly, the interests of shareholders came last. That commitment was put to the test in 1982 when a psychopath placed poison cyanide in packages of the company’s most successful consumer product, Tylenol, leading to the deaths of seven people. At a cost of more than $100 million dollars, the company immediately recalled all packages of Tylenol and offered customers full refunds even if they already had used all but a few capsules. “By acting decisively, the company was able to relaunch Tylenol— in tamper-proof packaging—within three months,” and had “regained most of its market share within a year.”

J&J’s 300 word “credo” unequivocally declares that its customers come before its shareholders and its
response to the Tylenol crisis dramatically demonstrated the firm’s willingness to honor that commitment. The firm protected not just the consumers of its product, but the company’s reputation as well. In 2004, a senior J&J executive told the Financial Times that “the credo is the first thing you learn when you join the company. You learn to ask: ‘What are the credo implications of this decision?’” The Financial Times wrote admiringly that “few big U.S. corporations wear their values on their sleeves like this.” On any list of firms whose values and practices reflect the principles of Conscious Capitalism, Johnson & Johnson deserves a prominent place.

Yet, beginning in 2008, J&J found itself investigated by the FDA and the subject of numerous complaints by customers due to the poor quality of many of its consumer products. Between 2009 and 2010, J&J initiated seventeen product recalls and, as a result, in 2010 sales of its over the counter products declined by $750 million. At a Congressional hearing in May 2010, the chair of the House Committee on Oversight and Government Reform angrily informed a senior J&J executive that “the information I’ve seen during the course of our investigation raises questions about the integrity of the company. It paints a picture of a company that is deceptive, dishonest, and has risked the health of many of our children.”

Ironically, among the several products the company was forced to recall because of customer complaints and FDA investigations was Tylenol.

The widely admired response to the Tylenol poisonings by J&J’s CEO at the time, James Burke, became the subject of a Harvard Business School case study and video that were used in thousands of business school classrooms. Burke himself played a critical role in launching the Business Enterprise Trust in order to recognize other examples of responsible corporate behavior. However, in October 2010, the Harvard Business School published a case study of the firm’s behavior that offered business students a rather different lesson, namely, how a firm’s reputation and market share can be damaged by a lack of attention to quality control.

1 Mary Scott and Howard Rothman, Companies With a Conscience: Intimate Portraits of Twelve Firms that Make a Difference (Secaucus, NJ: Carol Publishing Group, 1992); Mary Scott and Howard Rothman, Companies with a Conscience: In-Depth Profiles of Businesses that Are Making a Difference (Franklin Lakes, NJ: Career Press, 2002); Howard Rothman and Mary Scott, Companies with a Conscience: Intimate Portraits of Twelve Firms that Make a Difference (Detroit, MI: The Publishing Cooperative, 2003).
5 Ibid.
6 Ibid.
9 O’Toole (1991), op. cit.
In the 17th century, many poor White Englishmen voluntarily sold themselves into servitude to companies such as the London Company to transport them to America. Others, including vagrants, criminals, and tens of thousands of political offenders and children, were literally kidnapped from the streets of London and put on ships to the New World (Brawley, 1970, pp. 21-23). Eventually, the Whites who came voluntarily and involuntarily would buy their way out of servitude. Black servants would not have that option.

"The first Negroes who were brought to the colonies were technically servants" (Brawley, 1970, p. 23), and "in the beginning, little social distinction was made in America on account of race" (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994, p. 157). But the colonies drifted into what was called "the sterner system" of slavery (p. 24) and by the mid-17th century large profits from the lucrative Black slave trade helped move slavery from custom to legal arrangements.

During the 17th century, town records show that White communities were far from generous to all those who were in need. In fact, White colonists condemned other colonists whom they considered undeserving to homelessness. Paupers, able-bodied men who would not work, were not assisted. They were driven out of the colony to freeze or starve (Baum & Burns, 1993, p. 94).

Technically, Black slaves had "shelter," although agricultural slaves, according to John Hope Franklin, were "especially poor." They lived in small and dilapidated, inadequate and uncomfortable huts, with no windows and hardly any furnishings and sometimes without beds (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994). And yet although their living conditions were woefully deficient, Black slaves were considered part of the "community" (by the Whites), and, therefore, they were not considered homeless.

On the other hand, Whites generally considered free Blacks to be homeless and suspect. Their homelessness was "tantamount to a crime: homeless Black people were 'masterless' and, with rare exceptions, that meant they were fugitives" (Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 124).

Population records showed that the number of U.S. slaves rose steadily, and personal connection (i.e., ownership) with the slaves was widespread in the South. By 1850, 2.8 million slaves worked on farms and plantations; another 400,000 slaves lived in urban settings (Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 126).

Life was harsh, and the slave system was brutal (Brawley, 1970, p. 32). It is not surprising that many slaves committed suicide, and, in increasing numbers, many slaves ran away. Although textbooks that describe the history of American homeless do not include them, the large number of runaway slaves should be considered an early example of American homelessness.

Native Americans often provided a safe haven for homeless Blacks who fled to the frontier to escape slavery or oppressive laws (Editors of Ebony, 1971). Runaway Blacks may also have been drawn to Indian communities to intermarry because there...
was a shortage of Black women in the American colonies. There was constant Indian and Black intermingling since at least the time the first British colonies were established. In 1839, for example, William Jay, first chief justice of the United States, lamented “the warfare waged against the Seminole Indians and the blacks residing among them” (Editors of Ebony, 1971, p. 35). In fact, there were so many African Americans assimilated into the Indian tribal population that a large portion of today’s American Blacks have Indian ancestry.  

Runaway slaves represent an important chapter in America’s homeless history. When slaves ran away, they were “men, women, and children, singly, in pairs, or in groups” who organized to live in the forests, mountains, and swamps of the South (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994, p. 143). Many runaway slaves left the South altogether for freedom in the North. Some were assisted by members of Northern antislavery groups. As early as 1804 in Pennsylvania and 1815 in Ohio, White groups were helping slaves to freedom (J. H. Franklin & Moss, 1994, pp. 183-184; Still, 1970; Strother, 1962). The term Underground Railroad was not given to the effort until 1831 (Strother, 1962, p. 5).

It is estimated that as many as 100,000 slaves ran away during the early 19th century. Some runaways were shipped through the postal system in “boxes or chests,” and some hid in “steamers and vessels,” forced to hide under boilers and in cramped spaces that allowed for little or no movement (Still, 1970, pp. 38-44, 67-73, 289-292, 313-314, 632-635). As evidence that runaway slaves were considered by their contemporaries to be “homeless,” the earliest New York City poorhouses, the places that housed the White homeless in the mid-18th century, also housed runaway slaves (Mary Booth, History of the City of New York, 1859, p. 347, in Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 124).

---

1 Starting this narrative on homelessness with the White colonization allows us to include the ironic fact that many of the first American colonists had been homeless in England. According to Benjamin Brawley (1970, pp. 21-22), in Social History of the American Negro, long before the Mayflower and the first slave ships sailed to the colonies, changes in land use in England created a large homeless class. Starting in the 13th century, more and more English farms were enclosed for sheep raising, and agricultural laborers who cultivated the land were “starved out.” By the 16th century, conditions became even more acute because the old monasteries that had been the source of charitable relief for the poor were now abolished. By the 17th century, the homeless, paupers, and dissolute persons filled the English jails and workhouses. But as luck would have it, in the 17th century the English colonies desperately needed “labor,” and much of the English homeless labor force migrated to the colonies.

2 For example, according to John Hope Franklin and Alfred A. Moss (1994), in 1662 the colony of Virginia was the first to make slavery hereditary by legally establishing that “the status of a child should be determined by that of the mother” (pp. 23-24). And in 1705, a Virginia law “provided that a slave might be inventoried as real estate. As property, henceforth there was nothing to prevent his being separated from his family. Before the law he was no longer a person but a thing” (p. 26).

3 According to Henry Miller (1991, p. 26), in On the Fringe: The Dispossessed in America, providing help to those in need depended on whether the needy were actually members of the town or community and also depended on whether they were considered part of the “deserving poor.” Peter Rossi (1989, p. 17), in Down and Out in America, illustrated how closed the communities were when it came to providing help. He quoted from the minutes taken at a New England town meeting in which a vote on who could join the community was discussed. Being able to be part of a town was not automatic but “very desirable to prevent his being separated from his family. Before the law he was no longer a person but a thing” (p. 26).

4 In 1790, there were 700,000 slaves, but by 1830, they numbered more than 2 million, according to J. H. Franklin and Moss (1994, pp. 122-123). In some states, such as South Carolina, the slaves greatly outnumbered the Whites, sometimes with a ratio as high as 3 to 1, Mary Frances Berry (1971, p. 3) wrote, and, according to Jay Mandel (1992), “By 1860 the African American population had risen to about 4.4 million, more than 90 percent of whom resided in the south” (p. 5).
Fully one fourth of the White Southern population owned slaves, and the bulk of the owners were small farmers. In fact, more than half the slave owners owned 5 slaves or fewer, according to J. H. Franklin and Moss (1994, p. 123).

It is also true, according to Berry (1971), in her book, Black Resistance White Law: A History of Constitutional Racism in America, that White colonists acted to divide Black Americans from Native Americans, for example, when they tried to recruit "selected slaves" to augment their own militias to fight the Yamassee Indians (p. 3). And it is true that some Indian tribes developed a slavery system of their own. It was widely reported that around 1860, the Seminole tribe owned 1,000 slaves and the Cherokees and Chickasaws owned about 3,000 each. But the treatment of the slaves by the Indians seems to have been radically different from that of the White slave owners. The Native Americans freely intermarried with their slaves and required only the annual payment of a portion of their crops (see Editors of Ebony, 1971, p. 106).

In 1926, in a study conducted by Melville Herskovitz, of 1,551 Blacks, more than one third were found to have Indian ancestry. Many famous Blacks from the Revolutionary War period, such as Crispus Attucks, Captain Paul Caffee, and Salem Poor, had their Indian ancestry documented, according to the Editors of Ebony (1971, p. 110).

Horatio Strother (1962), in The Underground Railroad in Connecticut, describes the term Underground Railroad’s origin in the following way: A slave named Tice Davids escaped from his owner in Ripley, Ohio, and immediately disappeared. The master searched the vicinity as thoroughly as he could but found no trace of his runaway bondsman. At length he concluded ruefully, "He must have gotten away by an underground road." From "road" to "railroad" was a simple transition. . . . The terminology of railroading afforded easy names with which to mask a range of activities that lay outside the law. So the Underground Railroad—more the "name of a mode of operation than the name of a corporation"—had its "conductors" and "passengers" . . . "stations" and "stationkeepers." (p. 5)
Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal

Roberta Ann Johnson

Blacks were hit hardest by the Great Depression, which produced widespread hardship and homelessness. In 1930, "somewhere between 12 and 15 million were unemployed, one family out of seven was on public or private relief, 4,600 banks had failed, half of Michigan's automobile factories were shut down, textile looms in the South were silent, farmers let their crops rot in the fields . . . and in New England's men and women worked for one dollar a week." (Barber, 1972, p. 233)

African Americans were hit "earliest and most severely" by the economic collapse.

In many Northern cities, there were a substantial number of Black men who were homeless. "By the winter of 1932-1933, nearly one-quarter of Philadelphia's homeless transient were black, as were one-tenth of Chicago's sheltered men, one-fifth of Buffalo's [non-seaman] . . . transients, and one-sixth of New York City's public shelter clientele" (Hopper & Milburn, 1996, p. 124). In all these cities, the percentage of Black homeless was higher than the percentage of Blacks in the population as a whole, although, in the case of Chicago, not by much.

During this period, African Americans suffered, not just because they were poorly paid marginal workers or because they had lost their employment but because discrimination in public and private assistance prevented them from getting their fair share of aid. "Many private agencies excluded blacks altogether from their soup kitchens, and some communities gave unemployed black families less assistance than whites" or unfairly distributed relief money (E. Foner, 1970, p. 388). There was discrimination because project design and allocation of funds were in local hands. Examples abound.

New Deal programs' discriminatory practices were pervasive and widespread. The National Recovery Act and the Tennessee Valley Authority are apt examples.

The Works Project Administration (WPA) also failed in its mission of distributing relief equitably. Southern states were allowed to redefine what unemployment meant so they could exclude from the unemployed category all sharecroppers and surplus day laborers. In 1930, 56% of the U.S. Black population still lived in rural America, and according to the census, 40% of U.S. Black wage earners were in agricultural work. Georgia, for example, though responsible for so much of the earlier Northern migration, had lost only 5% of its population to Northern cities (Hannahovitch, 1997, p. 89).

The agricultural sector of society was especially hard hit by the Depression. Although 25% of the nation's population were farmers in 1933, they earned only 7% of the total national income (Wolters, 1970, p. 4). And rural Blacks were much worse off than were rural Whites. Based on a study of 646 cotton plantations, Blacks earned 73% of what Whites made (Wolters, 1970, p. 8).
migrant workers and day laborers. Vast numbers of displaced tenant farmers, along with their families, had to move constantly to find work. During the 1930s, fully 192,000 Negro farm tenants were displaced (Wolters, 1970, p. 79).

Those who became day laborers became a source of extremely cheap labor for plantation owners. They required no maintenance costs such as shelter, food, and other supplies, and because there were so many day laborers they accepted miserable wages to survive. The temporary worker populations were forced into moving for seasonal work, becoming day laborers for a season, and after it was over they were forced to go on relief. But benefits from New Deal programs were inadequate because the New Deal programs such as the WPA were being administered locally, and Southern Whites controlled the rules of implementation.

Between 1933 to 1935, the White local administrators who ran the New Deal programs, provided the majority of the money to poor White farmers or workers. Blacks composed 41% of all rural families in the eastern cotton belt alone, but they represented only 35% of all rural families on relief in 1935 (M. Franklin, 1985, pp. 11-12).

1 According to census data, in 1930 in Philadelphia, Blacks were 11.0% of the population; in Chicago, Blacks were 6.9% of the population; in Buffalo, Blacks were 2.0% of the population; and in New York City, they composed 4.7%.

2 The National Recovery Act (NRA), the agency responsible for setting industrial codes, deferred to the wage and employment considerations of local areas, and the NRA exempted from their largess and jurisdiction agricultural laborers, domestic servants, service trades, and most unskilled workers.
Fathers on the Small Screen

Molloy College

It might surprise many Americans to find out that those television icons of the "ideal" family of the 1950s, *Father Knows Best* and *Leave It to Beaver*, were not actually family favorites when they first aired on the small screen (*Father Knows Best* managed to make the Nielsen Top 10 but only for one season). Yet LaRossa (2004) explored how television sitcoms influenced the culture of fatherhood in the decade that the TV set first became a staple in the American home. The author argued that it was through cable reruns that the shows gained their status, creating a revisionist history of what family life was like in the Eisenhower era. The programs promoted fathers' involvement in families, to a point. Mom was still the one in the apron. Dad was the go-to guy for advice but it was not his role to be heavily involved in raising the children.

On the other hand, Pehlke and colleagues point out that this idea was more prevalent in the mid and late 1950s than earlier in the era. In the early 1950s, television images of fatherhood were actually less conforming and patriarchal. This fluctuation within the first decade of television's reign was curiously predictive of future portrayals of TV dads. Olson and Douglas (1997) observed that the family sitcom has an established history of portraying the idiosyncratic nature of the American family and bringing it into viewers' homes. Pehlke et al. surmise that television probably surpasses any other genre in this capacity. For their analysis, the authors focused on family sitcoms depicting a two-parent family with at least one child under 18. While acknowledging that this may not be the predominant family situation, they note that most Americans still see it as the ideal. Indeed, this was the opinion of 701 fathers who responded to a Pop's Culture Survey of Dad's Attitudes on Fathering (2006), virtually all agreed that, "being a father was a very important part of who they are." The fathers' thoughts on their own role as fathers is aligned with their perceptions of fathers on film.

The authors discerned three major themes: "Father-Child Interactions," "Racial-Ethnic and Socioeconomic Themes in Fathering," and "Negative Messages about Fatherhood." A notable feature of the analysis was that the shows appeared to place more emphasis on fathers' active involvement with their children and emotional bonds than previous studies disclosed. "Quality time" is an important issue for the new generation of TV dads. Even in mundane activities the fathers displayed playfulness and support. Positive shows of support outweighed actions deemed unsupportive or manipulative.

In his continuing exploration of sitcoms, Butsch (1992) has consistently documented the perpetuation of the stereotype of working class fathers as ineffective buffoons. Pehlke et al. confirmed that working class fathers are far less competent than their middle-class counterparts, and in particular, far less likely to be sources of emotional support for their children. An intriguing point is the
fathers of all the sitcom dads. Whether this is representative of a point in time (or the shows' writers) or symbolic of a trend is an interesting question for future analysis.

The negative messages were embodied in scenes where the father was shown as immature, foolish, or the butt of others' jokes. The authors emphasize that by definition, situation comedies are built on humor. They add, however, that these scenes do not do much to counteract cultural attitudes toward fathers as rather incompetent in their family roles. Whether scenes designed to produce laughter at the intersection of ethnicity and socioeconomic class. The two African-American fathers (My Wife and Kids and All of Us) and one Latino father (George Lopez) were all middle-class in occupational status and fathering behaviors. Moreover, they emerged as the most supportive, enlightened

Father Knows Best (television show), 1955

expense of Dad's incompetence are a factor in the national survey on attitudes about fatherhood, fathers' uncertainty of their own competence is a legitimate question. The authors place their study within the context of an ongoing body of research into the "mystery of fatherhood."
Children's books are widely recognized as a reflection of cultural conceptions of gender roles, parenting, and family relationships. In previous work, Flannery Quinn explored the culture of fatherhood in award-winning children's picture books from 1938-2002. Not unexpectedly, fathers in Caldecott books published after the 1960s were more involved with their children than fathers in previous generations of books. In fact, the fictional fathers of children's literature seemed to surpass estimates of the time actual fathers spend with their children in real life. In the present study, Flannery Quinn focuses on fathers in best-selling children's books.

For the initial analysis, Flannery Quinn examines the presence of fathers in bestselling children's picture books featuring one protagonist parent. Among books that meet the selection criteria, fathers are the prominent parent in four books; in contrast, mothers are the prominent parent in 10. In fact, only a scant proportion of books portrays fathers as characters, either independently or with the mother in the story. The semiotic analysis focuses on the two top sellers: Just Me and My Dad (1975), and Guess How Much I Love You (1994).

While it is tempting to say that the traditionally masculine themes and father role pervading Just Me and My Dad reflect its being written 30 years ago, the 1970s marked a distinct shift away from traditional gender roles. A depiction of a father and son camping and fishing trip exalts conventional notions of masculinity in an era of androgyny. Flannery Quinn uses the term "(pseudo) survival activities" to describe the activities that take place in the woods. As the day turns to night, the father shows he is patient, protective, and brave as he interacts with his naive and vulnerable young son. Flannery Quinn uses select scenes to illustrate the relationship between father and son: close and loving but constrained by cultural expectations of how a father should act.

In Guess How Much I Love You, the father and son are "Big Nutbrown Hare" and "Little Nutbrown Hare." As Flannery Quinn points out, the names carry the cultural connotation that "the child is a copy of the parent," a feature imbued with special significance in that the gender of the parent and child is not revealed until the reader has gone through several pages. The story line is a playful competition between the son who aspires to be like his father and the father who clearly enjoys his relationship with his son (and perhaps exults in the child's desire to be just like him). The entire story, and as Flannery Quinn observes, the cultural knowledge embedded within it, unfolds in the brief span of time that the father helps the child get ready for bed. Traditionally, the night is when a working father has time to be with his child. Not so traditionally, Big Nutbrown Hare affectionately kisses his son good night. Flannery Quinn construes this as symbolic of the "new father" who is not afraid to openly express affection. It is interesting that the kiss—and the implicit message that "it is acceptable for a masculine father to display affection to his
child"—should come from an anthropomorphic hare rather than a human father.

An intriguing feature of both books (in fact, of all four best-selling books with prominent fathers) is the presence of the moon. While admitting there might be no symbolic meaning, Flannery Quinn highlights two unique features of the moon. The moon illuminates the darkness. And although it changes in shape and is not always visible, it is always with us, a reliable presence less distant and more accessible than other objects in the sky. From a child's vantage point, that might be how a father appears. Flannery Quinn’s thoughtful analysis elucidates similarities and differences in the two conceptions of fatherhood in the popular books. Perhaps the most striking similarity is that these books stand out as among very few children’s books that give fathers a central role.
Appendix H: Main Experiment Survey

Main Experiment - First Survey Segment

Journal Article Euphoria: A Study into How Undergraduate Students Select Journal Articles

Introduction
Journal Article Euphoria: A Study into How Undergraduate Students Select Journal Articles
Your scenario: You are assigned four (4) short essay papers in your English 101 course. The subject areas are business, sociology, art and history. Your time and energy has been spared by the teacher and two articles for each topic were already chosen for you out of a new scholarly journal Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin.

Please evaluate each set of articles for each subject area and select the ONE article that answers the question provided. Please do your best to explain WHY you chose this article out of the two provided. Before you begin your assignments you will be asked a few introductory questions about your background. A short follow-up survey will be required a week after submitting this survey.

You will not be able to save and return to this survey once started.

Thank you for your support!

Follow-Up Survey Agreement
You are about to complete the first segment of the survey! In about a weeks time you will receive one more very short follow-up survey. This second survey should not take more than 10 minutes of your time and will NOT require reading of articles. It is very important to my research you complete this segment.

Do you agree to complete the follow-up segment of the survey?*
( ) Yes
( ) No

How to Take this Survey:
How to take this survey: Embedded video

Consent Form
Please read and complete the consent form below:
If you agree to participate in this project, please select "Accept" option to proceed with the survey. If you choose not to participate please select the "Do not accept" option to opt out.*
( ) Agree
( ) Do not agree

Background Information
1) What is your unique participant code?*
( ) 020 – ( ) 79

2) First Name:*

3) Email address used for the follow-up survey:*

4) What is your gender?*
( ) Male
( ) Female

5) In what year were you born?*
( ) 2009 – ( ) Pre-1927

6) What is your current or future major in college?*

7) What is your current year in college?*
( ) Freshman (first year)
( ) Sophomore (second year)
( ) Junior (third year)
( ) Senior (fourth year or more)

8) When you need information for research purposes, which sources do you usually consult? Please check all that apply.*
[ ] Academic Databases
[ ] Online Search Engine
[ ] Google Scholar
[ ] Facebook
[ ] Library Catalog
[ ] Ask a Librarian
[ ] Ask a friend or family member

9) How easy is it for you to retrieve information when conducting research for courses?*
( ) Extremely easy
( ) Very easy
( ) Moderately easy
( ) Slightly easy
( ) Not at all easy

10) Each person prefers different learning styles and techniques. What kind of learning style is your dominant style?*
( ) Aural learner: You prefer using sound and music.
( ) Logical learner: You prefer using logic, reasoning and systems.
( ) Physical learner: You prefer using your body, hands and sense of touch.
( ) Verbal learner: You prefer using words, both in speech and writing.
( ) Visual learner: You prefer using pictures, images, and spatial understanding.
You are beginning your research on the American artist John Sloan. John Sloan was an American artist known for his impact on the realism movement. Born in 1871 in Lock Haven, Pennsylvania, he spent most of his life in New York, where he worked as a painter, illustrator, and teacher for the Art Students League. As part of "The Eight," Sloan rebelled against the National Academy of Design for their conservative taste. His figure, landscape, and poster paintings are among some of the best examples of works depicting the realism movement of direct observation through individual responses that reflect on everyday life in America. Sloan died in 1951.

-----Amanda Cleek (http://pabook.libraries.psu.edu/palitmap/bios/Sloan__John.html).-----

Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that follow.

Art: John Sloan Questions

Please answer the following questions about the John Sloan paintings:

11) You have decided to take a course in the future on art history while at the university. You are always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*
   () John Sloan: Clown Making Up
   () John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window

12) Why would you choose this article to save? Please explain your motivations.*

13) Which article of the two made you want to learn more about John Sloan's art work?*
   () John Sloan: Clown Making Up
   () John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window

14) Why did this article make you want to learn? Please explain your motivations.*

15) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*
   () John Sloan: Clown Making Up
   () John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window

16) Why is this article least interesting? Please explain your motivations.*

17) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use?*
   () John Sloan: Clown Making Up
   () John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window

18) Why would you choose this article as a reference? Please explain your motivations.*

19) Aside from the content, did you like the presentation of the articles (i.e. readability, format, style, etc.)? Please explain in your own words.*
Business: Conscious Capitalism
You are beginning your research on the business model "Conscious Capitalism."
Conscious capitalism is an emerging philosophy based on the belief that businesses can enhance
corporate performance while simultaneously improving the quality of life for all stakeholders.
Conscious capitalism goes beyond corporate social responsibility by placing societal needs and
their challenges at the core of the company's existence. Conscious capitalism transforms the
existing notion about capitalism by changing the either/or paradigm to a both/and mentality by
simultaneously creating financial and societal wealth.
-----Marie Legault-----
Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that
follow.

Business: Conscious Capitalism Questions
Please answer the following questions about the business model Conscious Capitalism:

20) Which article of the two made you want to learn more Conscious Capitalism as a business
model?*
( ) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
( ) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good

21) Why did this article make you want to learn? Please explain your motivations.*

22) You have decided to take a business course in the future while at the university. You are
always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for
future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you
need a reference?*
( ) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
( ) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good

23) Why would you choose this article to save? Please explain your motivations.*

24) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper.
Which article of the two would you prefer to use?*
( ) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
( ) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good

25) Why would you choose this article as a reference? Please explain your motivations.*

26) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*
( ) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
( ) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good

27) Why is this article least interesting? Please explain your motivations.*

28) Aside from the content, did you like the presentation of the articles (i.e. readability, format,
style, etc.)? Please explain in your own words.*
Only two more articles. You are almost done, keep going!

History: Homelessness in America
You are beginning your research on the history of homelessness among African Americans in the United States.
The story of African Americans is usually absent from the mainstream textbook study of homeless people.
Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that follow.

History: Homelessness in America Questions
Please answer the following questions about the history of homelessness among African Americans:

29) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use?*
   ( ) Homelessness in the Colonies
   ( ) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal

30) Why would you choose this article as a reference? Please explain your motivations.*

31) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*
   ( ) Homelessness in the Colonies
   ( ) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal

32) Why do you find this article least interesting? Please explain your motivations.*

33) You have decided to take a course in the future about American history while at the university. You are always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*
   ( ) Homelessness in the Colonies
   ( ) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal

34) Why would you choose this article to save? Please explain your motivations.*

35) Which article of the two made you want to learn more the homeless history of African Americans?*
   ( ) Homelessness in the Colonies
   ( ) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal

36) Why did this article make you want to learn? Please explain your motivations.*

37) Aside from the content, did you like the presentation of the articles (i.e. readability, format, style, etc.)? Please explain in your own words.*
Sociology: Fatherhood
You are beginning your research on the sociological impact of popular culture on the concept of "fatherhood" in America. Since the 1970s, there has been an increased scholarly interest in fatherhood. There have been fundamental shifts in family life, gender relations, declining wage of male earners, increases in female labor force participation and in men's involvement as the primary non-maternal care provider. These cultural shifts have been mirrored in popular culture (films, television, music, and literature).

Please read the two articles provided to you by the professor and answer the questions that follow.

Fatherhood Articles
Please answer the following questions about the influence of popular culture on fatherhood:

38) Which article of the two do you consider LEAST interesting? Boring?*
   ( ) Fathers in Popular Picture Books
   ( ) Fathers on the Small Screen

39) Why is this article least interesting? Please explain your motivations.*

40) You have decided to take a sociology course in the future while at the university. You are always thinking ahead when it comes to projects and try to save interesting scholarly articles for future use. Which article of the two would you SAVE on your personal computer in case you need a reference?*
   ( ) Fathers in Popular Picture Books
   ( ) Fathers on the Small Screen

41) Why would you choose this article to save? Please explain your motivations.*

42) Which article of the two made you want to learn more the social impact popular culture has on family dynamics?*
   ( ) Fathers in Popular Picture Books
   ( ) Fathers on the Small Screen

43) Why did this article make you want to learn? Please explain your motivations.*

44) You are required to pick one article of the two to use as a reference in your research paper. Which article of the two would you prefer to use?*
   ( ) Fathers in Popular Picture Books
   ( ) Fathers on the Small Screen

45) Why would you choose this article as a reference? Please explain your motivations.*

46) Aside from the content, did you like the presentation of the articles (i.e. readability, format, style, etc.)? Please explain in your own words.*
Overview of Journal Articles

47) What is your favorite article on a personal level you read from Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin?*

( ) (Sociology) Fathers on the Small Screen
( ) (Sociology) Fathers in Popular Picture Books
( ) (Art) John Sloan: Clown Making Up
( ) (Art) John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window
( ) (Business) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
( ) (Business) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good
( ) (History) Homelessness in the Colonies
( ) (History) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal

48) Why is this your overall favorite article?*

49) Which article do you think is the most interesting article on an educational level you read from Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin?*

( ) (Business) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue
( ) (Business) The Promises and Trials of Doing Well by Doing Good
( ) (Sociology) Fathers on the Small Screen
( ) (Sociology) Fathers in Popular Picture Books
( ) (History) Homelessness in the Colonies
( ) (History) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal
( ) (Art) John Sloan: Clown Making Up
( ) (Art) John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window

50) What is the most interesting information you took away from this article?*

51) Would you like to share any other comments on the articles? Please share your thoughts and opinions.

Thank You!
Main Experiment – Second Segment - Recall Survey

Journal Article Euphoria Follow Up Survey

Introduction
A week ago you read eight (8) articles from the journal Undergraduate Knowledge Bulletin. You will be asked a few questions about those articles. Please answer the questions to the best of your ability based only on memory and personal perceptions.

Follow-Up Survey
1) What is your unique participant code?*
   ( ) 020 – ( ) 079

2) First name:

3) Email address for compensation:* 

If you cannot remember titles of the articles, please describe the article to the best of your ability.
4) Off the top of your head, please name the most memorable article of the eight (8) read?*

5) Why was this article memorable?*

6) What was your favorite part of this article?*

7) Did the provided articles on the survey prompt you to do any additional research on the topics after you completed the survey?*
   ( ) Yes
   ( ) No

8) What topics did you research?

9) What made you interested in researching this topic?

Recall Information
10) Describe a moment in the history of African-Americans homelessness:* 

11) Name books and television shows that impacted the concept of fatherhood in popular culture? *

12) How has the business model conscious capitalism changed throughout the years?*

Images in Articles
13) Can you remember if any of the articles had images?*
   ( ) Yes
   ( ) No
If you remember the articles containing image please try to describe them to the best of your ability.

14) Which of the articles contained images?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article Description</th>
<th>Image in Article?</th>
<th>Image Description? Please describe if you remember an image.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Art) John Sloan: Clown Making Up</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Art) John Sloan: Hairdresser's Window</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Sociology) Fathers on the Small Screen</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Sociology) Fathers in Popular Picture Books</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(History) Homelessness in the Colonies</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(History) Homelessness in the Depression Years and New Deal</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Business) The Challenges of Sustaining Virtue</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Business) The Promise of Doing Well by Doing Good: A Review of Contributors</td>
<td>Yes*</td>
<td>( )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

15) Which image(s) are the most memorable from the articles? *

16) Why do you remember these images?*

17) Do you feel you gained anything from the addition of images in the articles? Please explain in detail.*

18) Are there any additional thoughts/reactions/comments you would like to add about the articles or images?

Thank You!
Thank you for completing the survey. Your responses are very important and your time is greatly appreciated. You will receive your eGift certificate to Starbucks immediately in your email. Please contact me if you have any issues!
Online Excel Link:
https://www.dropbox.com/s/kiaqdfesb4linrg/Vornholt%20Main%20Experiment%20Raw%20Data.xlsx
References


156