

a means to enrich their reading of texts and their interpretation of cultures. Caroline Ralston in turn emphasizes the need for women's specificities to be taken into consideration in all historical situations, as she traces her own recognition of the utility of gender analysis through an important study of Maori women.

Finally, Sione Latukefu's chapter, "The Making of the First Tongan-born Professional Historian," makes compelling reading for understanding the intellectual journey of a scholar whose kin and community background are representative of the objects of Pacific historians' inquiry. In particular, he confronts his readers with their secular assumptions about the impact of Christian faith and practices on indigenous Pacific peoples, a corrective echoing some of David Hanlon's concerns. With all the constructive writing the collection contains, this insightful contribution from a Polynesian island scholar looks distinctly solitary. No one should deny any historian the right to research subjects across ethnic or racial divides, but one would feel more comfortable if white voices were heard amid those of a comparable number of Pacific peoples. That must be an urgent agenda for the politics of research and publication on the Pacific over the next decade.

PATRICIA GRIMSHAW
University of Melbourne

* * *

Footsteps in the Sea: Christianity in Oceania to World War II, by John Garrett. Geneva: World Council of Churches; Suva: Institute of Pacific Studies, University of the South Pacific, 1992. ISBN 982-02-0068-7, xvi + 514 pp, maps, photographs, glossary, notes, bibliography, index. US\$15; F\$8.

Until the 1970s, books about missionaries in Oceania were usually of an "inspirational" kind. The regular appearance of such books caused no reaction other than surprise at there being purchasers who would enjoy reading them enough to want to buy them. In the meantime, during the South Pacific's educational boom years before independence, a host of images about missionaries arose among academic newcomers confronting Pacific societies that had long since yielded to Christianity. There was much criticism of the alleged lack of missionary respect for traditional cultures. The habit of mind, during an age of religious decline in the sixties, was to downplay theological depth, preferring the portrayal of missionary religion as a kind of metaphor for European political or economic domination and little else.

In 1978 Kenelm Burridge's biting essay, "Missionary Occasions," blasted field anthropologists for an ignorance of, and prejudice against, Pacific missionaries (in Boutilier, *Mission, Church, and Sect in Oceania*). Since then, an adjustment seems to have occurred in the thinking of those previously inclined to equate all missionary endeavor with a philistine chauvinism toward the cultures of other races.

What we knew to be true of so-called Fundamentalist missionaries was not necessarily so for all others, and recent studies have laid to rest the ghost of the missionary as a cultural vandal. John Barker's *Christianity in Oceania* (1990) differs from the common portrayal of traditional Pacific custom and Christianity as being in conflict, emphasizing elements of continuity between the two. Gary Trompf's *Melanesian Religion* (1991) carries an implicit disagreement with the analysis that saw western religion overwhelmingly in terms of colonialism and the imposition of western culture. And now *Footsteps in the Sea* (1992), the second in John Garrett's trilogy about the coming of missions to the Pacific, continues the story of "how it actually happened" from the first missionary landfall in 1797 to the present, this volume being concerned with the interval between European annexation of the islands in the 1880s and World War II.

A reviewer of volume 1 was critical of Garrett, whose blandness occasioned the comment that he "did not linger" over missionary shortcomings. In volume 2, let it be noted at once, Garrett neither lingers over faults, nor pulls his punches. Unedifying clashes between missionaries are fully documented; sexual and other lapses are recorded without euphemism; and Garrett's comment is unsparing when missionary motives are overlaid with material ambition, for example, with the business shrewdness that some American missionaries brought with them around Cape Horn to Hawai'i (229–231).

In less experienced hands, such a broad sketch as this might have lapsed

into a glib and trifling digest, flitting from character to character against a background of local atmosphere. But the superficial and racy brush strokes imposed on Garrett's large canvas are redeemed by the deeper hues of his main characters' theologies. The writing is certainly racy. Here we read of Bishop Louis Couppé bringing "a splash of episcopal purple to the colourful society around Ralum in Blanche Bay"; there we learn of Methodist John Goldie who "dispensed dual power" in the Solomons "as a prominent white Australian big man among the black big men"; elsewhere, the Melanesian Anglicans were "not fond of ideas about industrial mission," being members of a "sailing mission for gentlemen." Despite this facility for fast-moving glimpses, the theological wellsprings are never far away.

Garrett apparently takes the view that the disciplined theological knowledge most missionaries possessed is at least as important as their attitudes and behaviors on arrival. Half of the treatment of the Seventh Day Adventists, for example, is concerned with their pre-Pacific cultural and theological origins in America (59–61). A knowledge of the theology of his subjects is combined with the sureness of touch of one familiar with practically all the churches in Oceania. Writing of Pacific religion, as both "outsider" and "insider," and possessing long experience in the United States, Geneva, and Suva, Garrett has an advantage over some of his Australian compatriots who are obliged to work within the restrictions of a single Australian nationality, and who also write about missionaries without knowing much

about the religion that motivated them. By skirting around theology and styles of worship, some recent Australian historical writing on missionaries does its subjects' religion less justice than it does their social and economic circumstances.

Garrett, by contrast, is able to take his readers painlessly through a wealth of religious nuance. Theology was part of the air breathed by ordained missionaries and is as natural in a book about them as, for example, what they ate or how they reacted to their surroundings. To take one example: his opening character, Johann Flierl, the pioneer Lutheran in New Guinea (arrived 1886), was "rooted in the conservative Lutheran beliefs and values of his childhood in rural Germany," whereas Christian Keysser (arrived 1899) "quickly became emotionally responsive to the corporate life and outlook of the Kate people" (3-7). Flierl's vocation was shaped by the Neuendettelsau Mission and by those like-minded Lutherans in South Australia and in the American mid-western Iowa synod, forced to emigrate as exiles from the state union of Lutherans and Calvinists imposed by the Prussian King Friedrich-Wilhelm III. Flierl's churchmanship in New Guinea reflected this blend of "Pietist intensity and high church Lutheran convictions and standards" (3-7). Such a combination of theological sensitivity and practical knowledge makes Garrett easily the most knowledgeable of all Pacific scholars over the whole range of the missionary background spanning the two-hundred-year period.

The narrative is divided for convenience into two time-slices that converge in 1920. It provides detailed glimpses of

individual missions, beginning in New Guinea, taking in a broad sweep of Polynesia, and ending in the Caroline Islands. After the study of Flierl and Keysser (1-15), readers journey around all the Pacific missions—Methodists, Seventh Day Adventists, Marists, American Board, and others—before returning to the Lutheran story at chapter 12, with Flierl's successors William Bergmann and Georg Pilhofer working in the New Guinea Highlands during the early 1930s near their Australian secular counterparts Dan Leahy and James Taylor.

The book provides not only a panorama of leaders but also of individuals of the second rank. The "family" missions are also well represented: the South Sea Evangelical Mission of the Young and Deck families, Kwato, maintained by descendants of Charles W. Abel, and the Presbyterian mission in the New Hebrides with its Scottish clan leadership of Patons, Mackenzies, Bowies, and Milnes (99). With strong individuals at the helm, conflict is inevitable: A. J. Small of the Fiji Methodist District versus Father Rougier, the bible-burning Marist; Abel versus the London Missionary Society in Papua; J. E. Moulton versus Shirley Baker in Tongatapu (383-388), followed by Queen Salote's initiatives in bringing about reconciliation forty years later. There is a touching account of the death in the Loyalty Islands of Haxen, pioneer London Missionary Society teacher in the Torres Strait, the day after the arrival in the Loyalties of the French ethnographer the Reverend Maurice Leenhardt in 1902 (111-112). A section on Te Aute College in Hawkes Bay in New Zealand deals with its trio of Maori knights, Sir Peter

Apirana Ngata, Sir Peter Buck, and Sir Maui Pomare. Since the book ends with the Japanese invasion in 1941, Pacific Islanders are inevitably overshadowed by European mission leaders.

In reading this book, one has the feeling that *denominational* Christianity, reinforcing ethnic and kinship loyalties, is the enduring legacy of the colonial age of missions. It is not markedly ecumenical. Topography, difficulties in travel, the comity of missions, and so on, all contributed to the recurrence of that phenomenon, the religious "state within a state," whose European officials rarely, if ever, met their contemporaries in other missions, and whose indigenous converts in some colonies never became acquainted. The personal faith and intellect of a Flierl of New Guinea, a de Boismenu of Papua, or an Elizabeth (or Jane) Baldwin of the Carolines, was rooted in the soil of their own national European Christianity; the "common core" made little appeal (hence the utterly different responses of various missions to the coming of war in 1942). In the period covered in Garrett's second volume, many missionaries scarcely spared a moment from their labors to consider what their Lutheran, Roman Catholic, Seventh Day, or Methodist neighbors were doing.

I know of one prominent Protestant missionary in Papua New Guinea, Charles W. Abel, who went regularly on twenty-thousand-kilometer journeys to Britain, the United States, and Australia. But Abel, it seems, did not once visit the headquarters of his Methodist or Anglican missionary neighbors during the whole forty years of his career, although the three missions were only six hours' sail apart. It

is interesting to see how this aloofness has affected the leading Papuan proteges of such missions. While writing this review I learned that members of the prominent Tarua family of Milne Bay, domiciled in the Kwato mission from World War I, had never encountered the Rautamara clan, a leading family on the Anglican side of the Kwato mission border, and a family that from 1914 produced three successive generations of Anglican clergy at Dogura. (A photograph of the Rautamaras is in volume 1 of Garrett's trilogy.) The three missions—London Missionary Society, Methodist, and Anglican—were established along a narrow strip of coast between the villages of the Taruas and Rautamaras. So it was that the premier mission families of two denominations, whose home villages are separated by only a day's walk, are to this day quite unknown to each other. An "iron curtain" seems to have fallen between the forefathers of the mission elites by the creation of mission boundaries.

Here lies a contrast of a sort: the relaxation of sharp doctrinal divisions in western Christianity and the appeal to "common core" religion by the World Council of Churches (the copublisher of this book), have not had time to strike deep roots among many indigenous "mission" families in Oceania. Today's Melanesian Council of Churches and Pacific Conference of Churches seem pale shadows beside the solid identity of the local denominational Christian missions.

Garrett is ill served by his printers, and occasionally seven words are rolled virtually into one by the typesetters. A pity, but still not too great a sacrifice to make for getting a major

book into readers' hands in Oceania at a reasonable price.

DAVID WETHERELL
Deakin University

* * *

Ethnographic Presents: Pioneering Anthropologists in the Papua New Guinea Highlands, edited by Terence E. Hays. Studies in Melanesian Anthropology 12. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992. ISBN 0-520-07745-8, xv + 301 pp, photographs, maps, notes, bibliography, index. US\$40.

Rarely does the primary title of a book so neatly capture both its central themes and its dilemmas. Terry Hays has cajoled a set of fieldwork reminiscences from the first wave of professional anthropologists to enter the Papua New Guinea Highlands, an exercise in salvage autobiography rendered all the more timely by the recent deaths of two of the contributors. The result is a volume charged through with a sense of history that is so often lacking in the ethnographies of the region. Hays, in an introductory chapter, draws on his encyclopedic grasp of the literature to provide a concise overview of the exploration of the Papua New Guinea Highlands by miners, missionaries, and administrators from the 1920s through to the 1950s. He summarizes neatly both the abortive prewar efforts by a handful of professional and missionary anthropologists, and the gathering of the research storm, based largely in Sydney and Canberra, that was to see almost a dozen anthropologists enter the High-

lands region between 1951 and 1955. The context for anthropological research provided by the colonial administration, deftly sketched here by Hays, emerges as a critical theme throughout the volume.

The list of the other contributors is a veritable pantheon of early Highlands ethnographers, including almost half of the anthropologists who worked in the Highlands region between the 1930s and the mid-1950s. There are chapters by Ronald Berndt, Catherine Berndt, Marie Reay, James Watson, D'Arcy Ryan, and Robert Glasse and a chapter by Reo Fortune's niece, Ann Mclean, on Fortune's two little-known field visits to the Kamano in 1935 and 1951-52. A check on the roll of those missing from the volume (among them Beatrice Blackwood, Paul Wirz, Ralph Bulmer, Richard Salisbury, and Francis Williams), throws up only three of the "first wave" who are still alive: Kenneth Read, Mervyn Meggitt, and Virginia Watson, and, of these, both Read and Meggitt might fairly claim to have published their field reminiscences elsewhere. The volume thus makes a claim to thoroughness that is well supported by the detail of the individual testimonies.

Each of these central chapters traces a route from pre-fieldwork training and expectations through to initial encounters and the mutual process of familiarization between ethnographers and local communities. Here are fascinating accounts of the sometimes halting development of the key themes known to us from the authors' publications: Glasse's description of his difficulties in understanding Huli social structure either as "an agnatic system